A STUDY OF THE BUDDHIST SAINT
IN RELATION TO
THE BIOGRAPHICAL TRADITION OF
MILAREPA

Francis V. Tiso

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the
requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy in
the Graduate School of
Arts and Sciences

COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY

1989

© 1989

Francis V. Tiso

All Rights Reserved

ABSTRACT

A STUDY OF THE BUDDHIST SAINT IN RELATION TO THE BIOGRAPHICAL TRADITION OF MILAREPA

Francis V. Tiso

The present study explores the ideal of the holy person in Indo-Tibetan Buddhism from the dual perspective of inner realization and of public recognition or cult. Our investigation begins with the Arhat of Early Buddhism, who has cleansed away all past defilements and their effects in the present, who manifests supranormal knowledge and power, and who is a 'field of merit' worthy of veneration. With the rise of Mahâyâna Buddhism, the earlier model of holiness was subjected to criticism in the light of a new ideal, the Bodhisattva, who practices a path toward selflessness that includes commitment to a vow not to enter the supreme state of Nirvâṇa until all beings have, with his help, entered therein. The Bodhisattva ideal underwent further transformation in the context of tantric Buddhism in the remarkable figure of the Mahâsiddha during the period of the transmission of Buddhism to Tibet. The Buddhist tantras provide us with an exemplary figure, Vajradhara, who represents the state of supreme Enlightenment. Vajradhara is a powerful symbol for the assimilation of the Saint, the Guru, and the ritual hierophant into a single object of devotion by which the practitioner may strive to attain the highest spiritual state 'in a single body, in one lifetime.'

Using a thirteenth century account of Vajradhara as a theoretical framework for holiness in the tradition of the Buddhist tantras, we present an historical, doctrinal, and literary analysis of the biographical tradition of Milarepa, a Tibetan poet and Saint (1040?-1123), taking into account works earlier than the well-known rnam thar and mgur 'bum by gTsang smyon Heruka (ca. 1488). Translations of the account of Vajradhara and of the biography of Milarepa by rGyal Thang pa, a thirteenth century bKa' brgyud pa master, constitute Part III of the dissertation.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Part I

Chapter 1 The Arhat as a Buddhist Saint.......... 1

Chapter 2 The Bodhisattva Ideal.................... 42

Chapter 3 The Saint in the Buddhist Tantras...... 84

Chapter 4 Who is Vajradhara? 113

Part II

Chapter 5 Historical Context of the Biographies of Milarepa............................156

Chapter 6 The Doctrinal Tradition: Bka' brgyud pa Spirituality...........................177

Chapter 7 Literary Aspects of the Biographies of Milarepa............................218

Part III

Chapter 8 A Translation of the Biography of Vajradhara by rGyal Thang pa.........273

Chapter 9 Transliteration of the Tibetan Text of the Vajradhara rnam thar.........308

Chapter 10 A Translation of the Biography of Milarepa by rGyal Thang pa...........323

Chapter 11 Transliteration of the Tibetan Text of the Milarepa rnam thar............437

Works Consulted....................................520

Appendices:

1. Tables of Parallel Texts from the works of rGyal Thang pa and gTsang smyon.....546

2. An Essay on Saints in Comparative Perspective...........................565

3. rGyal Thang pa's texts in dbu-med script..584

4. Works cited in the texts translated.......609

Abbreviations:

ADK La Vallée Poussin, Louis de, translator. L'Abhidharmakośa de Vasubandhu. (Bruxelles: Institut Belge des Hautes Études Chinoises. 1923-31).

BA Roerich, George N., translator. The Blue Annals. Second Edition. (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1976).

HVT Snellgrove, David L., translator and editor. The Hevajratantra: A Critical Study. Two Volumes. (London: Oxford University Press, 1959).

Hist.Relig. Historia Religionum II (Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1971).

IsMEO Publisher, Istituto Italiano per il Medio ed Estremo Oriente.

ITB Snellgrove, David L. Indo-Tibetan Buddhism. Two Volumes. (Boston: Shambhala, 1987).

JAOS Journal of the American Oriental Society

JASB Journal of the Asiatic Society of Bengal

JRAS Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society

Lessing and Wayman: Lessing, F. D. and Wayman, A. Introduction to the Buddhist Tantric Systems. (New York: Samuel Weiser, 1980).

LM Lhalungpa, Lobsang P., translator. The Life of Milarepa. (Boulder: Shambhala, 1984).

LTWA Publisher, Library of Tibetan Works and Archives

MPP-Ś Le Traité de la Grande Vertue de Sagesse de Nâgârjuna (Mahâprajñâpâramitâ-śâstra). É. Lamotte, translator.

RTH rGyal Thang pa bDe Chen rDo rJe. dKar brgyud gSer 'Phreng. (Palampur, Tashijong, 1973)

Songs Chang, Garma C. C., translator. The Hundred Thousand Songs of Milarepa. Two Volumes. (Boulder: Shambhala, 1977).

SUNY Publisher, The State University of New York Press

Takpo Lhalungpa, Lobsang P., translator. Mahâmudrâ:

The Quintessence of Mind and Meditation, by Takpo Tashi Namgyal. (Boston: Shambhala, 1986).

YGT Wayman, Alex. Yoga of the Guhyasamâja Tantra: The Arcane Lore of Forty Verses. A Buddhist Tantra Commentary. (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1977).

â û î Conventions adopted for transliterations of Sanskrit long vowels ā, ū, ī.

IN LUMINE TUO VIDEBIMUS LUMEN

Acknowledgment

Citations from Indo-Tibetan Buddhism by David Snellgrove, © 1987. Reprinted by arrangement with Shambhala Publications, Inc., 300 Massachusetts Avenue, Boston, MA 02115.

Part I

Chapter 1 The Arhat as a Buddhist `Saint'

Translation of the Sanskrit (Pâli: arahan) word Arhat as `Saint' began with the earliest efforts of Western scholars to understand Buddhist texts.[1] In the present century, the Pali Text Society translations use `Saint' for Arahan, but also for bhaddekaratta[2] In French, the term `saint bouddhique' is found regularly,[3] although Vallée Poussin retained the word Arhat in his translation of the Vijñaptimâtratâsiddhi; he used Saint for Arhat in the Abhidharmakośa (for example, in Chapter VIII, The Paths and the Saints). In La Concentration de la Marche Héroique, Lamotte left the term Arhat for the Chinese cheng hing (Tib. 'phags pa), but put `saint' in brackets to indicate a general concept.[4]

[1] See, for example, Matteo Ricci's use of sheng in China; Chandra Das' translation of 'phags pa in the phrase 'phags pa'i nor bdun: "the seven riches of a Buddhist Saint," p. 846.; Childers, A Dictionary of the Pali Language, pp. 53-54; The Pali Text Society Dictionary avoids the word Saint, offering "one who has attained the Summum Bonum of religious aspiration (Nibbâna)", s.v. Arahant; similarly, Edgerton's BHS Dictionary gives: "The ideal personage in Hînayâna Buddhism," s.v. Arahant.

[2] In the Majjhima-nikâya, The True Saint, 131,132, 133.

[3] See J. Rahder, "La Carrière du Saint Bouddhique."

[4] See, for example p. 253. In this case the text is treating the apparently paradoxical superiority of the `sinner' over the Saint: "entré dans la détermination (avakrânta-niyâma) et à l'Arhat qui a détruit les impuretés."

The tendency to use Saint for the stages of arhattva (Pâli: arahatta)[5] and for the ârya pudgala in general, extending to the twenty types of Saint cataloged in the Large Sûtra on Perfect Wisdom[6] and elsewhere suggests that careful Western scholars such as Lamotte have understood the term Saint in a generic sense, referring to a person who has undertaken the practices productive of virtuous conduct and who is showing evidence of some success in attaining the goal. This practice is quite adequate when the original Sanskrit, Pâli, Chinese, or Tibetan appear in footnotes or parentheses, as we find frequently in the work of Lamotte and de La Vallée Poussin. Inevitably, however, there is some peril in the generic use of the term Saint, since this word has strong connotations in Western religious traditions that need to be examined and sifted. In effect, the term Saint may mislead the Western reader connotatively, if used without qualification.

H. Delehaye has provided a thorough analysis of the terms 'ágios and sanctus in classical and early Christian literature[7]. Christian usage, in particular the specific

5 See fn. 299, pp. 246f., Śûramgamasamâdhi Sûtra.

6 "The decisive experience of a Buddhist takes place when he `wins the path'. He then ceases to be a common man (pṛthag-jana) and becomes a Saint or ârya (Tib. 'phags pa)." The twenty types of Saints are given pp. 66ff, based on the Abhisamayâlankâra. (Conze trans.)

7 Hippolyte Delehaye, S.J., Sanctus: Essai sur le Culte des Saints dans l'Antiquité (Bruxelles: Société des Bollandistes, 1927), chapter I. See also, Kittell: Theological Dictionary of the New Testament, S.v. 'âgios for the Judaic, Hellenistic, and early Christian context. The most recent fascicle of La Dictionnaire de Spiritualité, 14,

tradition of the canonized Saint of Roman Catholicism, has left an indelible mark on the way the term Saint is used and understood. This linguistic fact makes contemporary scholars cautious in using the term `Saint' in a Buddhist context. Christian usage owes more to the Biblical text and to church history than to classical antiquity for its appropriation of the term `Saint'[8]. The theological meaning of a Saint refers to a person who has been made holy by cooperation with the grace of God in the context of Catholic Christian faith. Such sanctity is a participation in God's holiness, since strictly speaking, God alone is holy. Holiness in the Judeo-Christian common tradition is predicated of persons, places, and things to the extent that they are set apart for divine use, whether for some historic salvific purpose (as in the case of prophetic revelation), or in the setting of the repeatable cult (the Temple, the priesthood, the sacred vessels, etc.).

XCI (Paris: Beauchesne, 1988), S.v. _sainteté/ sanctification de l'homme_, is most elucidating of the aspects of interiority and virtue applicable to the sanctified person. S.v. Saints, there is an extended historical survey, including the most recent revisions of the process of canonization, and statistics.

[8] Even though the _structure_ (if not the theology) of late classical Roman apotheosis seems to parallel the process of formal canonization. In fact, the first pages of the great work of Benedict XIV on beatification and canonization address just this difficulty, in an effort to distinguish Roman Catholic canonization from Late Antique apotheosis. See Prosperi Cardinalis de Lambertinis (Benedicti XIV), _Opus de Servorum Dei Beatificatione et Beatorum Canonizatione_. In Septem Volumina Distributm (Prati: Typographia Aldina, MDCCCXXXIX), pp. 1-8.

It is the Roman Catholic tradition that has shaped this terminology of holiness as applied to specific persons most extensively. In this tradition, the Saint is understood to have attained moral perfection, avoiding both mortal and venial sin. The Saint practices all the virtues without exception to an heroic degree, is united to God by the intense practice of contemplative prayer, and is particularly characterized by the efflorescence of an unlimited charity, i.e. altruistic love for God and neighbor. The Saint's inner attainment is to be attuned so perfectly to the inspirations of grace that evil is entirely avoided, and more than the obligatory good is performed. Such a person manifests a personality that is `Christ-like', which is evidence of the deep transformation of personality that the practice of charity, prayer, and penitence bring about. For official canonization, such a person must have acquired in life a reputation for holiness (i.e. the realization of perfection)[9]. Such a `Servant of God' may become the focus of a local, popular cult in which the faithful ask for his or her particular intercessory prayers for their various needs both spiritual and material. Official investigation of the case procedes with:
1. ascertainment of authentic holiness of life, and the presence of virtue to an heroic degree; 2. orthodoxy of his

[9] For this the common expression is `to have died in odor (or reputation) of sanctity'. Having a corpse that does not decay or that exudes a floral aroma even long after death is one of the signs of possible sanctity, so the expression `odor' is both intended literally and metaphorically.

or her writings, etc.; 3. verification of any miracles claimed to have been obtained through the intercession of the Servant of God.

Various degrees of dignity may be accorded the cult of any particular Servant of God in the course of the process of canonization. For example, the title `Venerable' may be accorded in order to encourage the local cult of the Servant of God. Beatification permits the local celebration of an annual Mass in honor of the Servant of God, now entitled `Blessed'; canonization grants the title `Saint' and extends the faculty of celebrating the annual Mass to the whole Church as an option. Further entitlements may make the annual Mass obligatory for the whole Church; for a Saint whose writings are deemed of particular value in the history of authoritative dogma, the title `Doctor of the Church' may be accorded. All these phases in the process refer to the public cult permitted by the Church to a particular person who has died with a reputation for holiness. None of the entitlements refer to or represent the specific degree of interior perfection that may have been reached by the Saint, under grace, in the course of his or her lifetime.[10]

Since this dissertation is not primarily a study in comparative religion, it is important to establish that our use of the term `Saint' is not intended to compare, equate,

[10] See good general surveys in the Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church, S.v. Saints, devotion to the, and in the New Catholic Encyclopedia, Vol. XII, S.v. Saint; and Saints, devotion to the. One of the best recent presentations may be found in Sacramentum Mundi, Vol. V, S.v. Saints.

or contrast the Buddhist Saint and the Roman Catholic canonized Saint. The thousands of instances of the latter type have inevitably established a collectivity of models[11] that, for all the differences, do indicate some structural similarities that justify the use of the term Saint for those individuals who, having practiced some form of Buddhism, have arrived at their goal and been accorded some form of recognition by the faithful.[12]

A simple way to gather the elements of what a Saint means `structurally' is to make use of two categories that seem always to apply, no matter where the phenomenon of the Saint appears. Typically, the Saint is a person who achieves some degree of public recognition as an exemplary follower of a religious tradition. The Saint's degree of perfection makes him or her a source of mysterious power for others. Thus to be a Saint, one must have attracted some kind of public cult, the external aspect of a Saint's identity. This is the aspect of sociological importance and

[11] See J. Wach, Sociology of Religion (London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trubner & Co., 1947), pp. 365-366, where such `types' are distinguished from the `priest' or the `founder' of a religion. The same kind of useful distinction is found in Reynolds and Capps: The Biographical Process: Studies in the History and Psychology of Religion (The Hague: Mouton, 1976), "Introduction", in which `sacred biography' and `hagiography' are distinguished. pp. 4-5. Cf. Sacramentum Mundi, Volume V, pp. 395-7, where various types are discussed.

[12] John Stratton Hawley, editor. Saints and Virtues (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1987). "These collections of extraordinary and exemplary lives differ significantly from one religious community to another...but they bear family resemblances that are often striking." p. xii.

it is also the principal concern of the canonization process in Catholic Christianity. The cult of a Saint determines the function of the Saint in religious society, whether that cult is determined by popular acclamation or by authoritative proclamation.

The second category that is indispensible to the identity of the Saint is the inner religious attainment, the spiritu life of the person who comes to be regarded as a `perfected one'. This aspect refers to the practices that one undertakes to attain the goal of religions that posit a goal. Such practices are naturally in continuity with the social context that may or may not support such activity. In addition, religious traditions apply a variety of criteria for discerning the signs of success in spiritual practice, and provide models for what constitutes final realization or the ultimate attainment. Thus, our category of `inner attainment' encompasses the entire spiritual journey of an earnest follower of a particular religious tradition, and most religious persons would consider this journey the `heart of the matter.' To become a Saint is indeed the goal of religious practice, as numerous treatises in Buddhism, Christianity, and other religions, attest[13].

[13] In homage, one may revisit Merton's account of a conversation on "wanting to be a saint" with his Jewish friend Bob Lax, which took place during their years at Columbia University. See Thomas Merton: The Seven Storey Mountain (New York: Harcourt, Brace, and World, Inc., 1948), pp. 237-238.

It is well-known that many attain inner sanctification without attracting public notice.[14] Though these persons participate in the holiness associated with a particular sect, lineage, order, or community, they do not exemplify the type that we are investigating in this study.

The Arhat as a Buddhist Saint

Holiness is a characteristic that, when encountered, permits little or no doubt.[15] Degrees of sanctity, when distinguished at all, reflect the application of the norms of particular cultures. We may therefore speak of holiness as an absolute; a person, place, or thing is holy, or not. The Saint is specifically that person in whom the absolute is recognized and encountered; the holy in such a person is an unmistakable, if mysterious Presence. One `comes into' the Presence of a holy person (Tib.: _bla ma dam pa drung du bzhugs_), and one gazes upon the sight (_darśana_) of holiness embodied.

[14] This is the typical justification for the Feast of All Saints. Also, the Carthusian Order discourages public knowledge of the sanctity of individual members and has historically resisted any participation in the formal canonization of its members. There is the famous account of a Carthusian who died in reputation of sanctity whose miracles were attracting crowds, to the detriment of the silence and recollection indispensible to the atmosphere of a Charterhouse. His superior forbade him to work further miracles, and, though in heaven, he obeyed!

[15] cf. Diana L. Eck's comment in _Banaras: City of Light_ (New York: Knopf, 1982), p. 98: "In the Hindu tradition, there are two kinds of sacredness: the `auspicious' which sums up everything that is good and valuable, and the `holy' which challenges and transcends the conventional distinctions of good and bad, valuable and valueless..."

Indian civilization in particular has been liberal in recognizing as Saints persons whose doctrinal views are widely divergent. The sanctity of such persons depends on the primordial and mysterious quality of holiness, a Fire ignited by whatever means, and recognizable apart from the doctrines taught or the practices undertaken. It is this primordial quality that the people recognize in the Saint, and which inspires fervent devotion.

It is therefore no surprise that in the Buddha and among his followers the quality of sanctity should have been recognized by the people of the subcontinent. The goal sought by the Buddha was, from the beginning of his quest, to identify the root cause of human misery and thereby to liberate humanity from suffering; from the very start, this `movement' inculcated a spiritual discipline whereby the individual could tread the path already marked out by the Buddha himself. Those who succeeded in the quest were those who had `accomplished that which was to be accomplished.' These were the `noble ones', the _ârya-pudgala_, the Arahants, those free from the passions and their consequent defilements, who were poised on the edge of perfect liberation, Nibbâna (Skt.: Nirvâṇa).

The principal concern of Buddhist theorists working in the context of a spiritual discipline whose goal was liberation was, as might be expected, not the public cult of the attainer (considered as a `Saint'), but of the authenticity of his inner life. For was it not one of the

reprehensible crimes of the Vinaya to claim illegitimately the status of a `further man', of an attainer of higher spiritual states? Hence, the nature of the path to such states, the discernment of the signs of attainment, and the specific characteristics of states that might be attained, have been a fundamental concern of all forms of Buddhism, including those which presented a radical critique of the very notion of states and characteristics! All schools laid claims to the central fact of the authenticity of liberation. At the same time, public cult was accorded those who had shown signs of attainment, often in spite of theoretical doubts on the validity and merit of such cultus.

Early in Western appreciation of the Theravâda tradition, R. C. Childers completed his landmark Dictionary of the Pali Language. There he defined Nibbânam, the goal of Buddhist practice, as extinction, destruction, annihilation, annihilation of human passion, arhatship, or final sanctification, and he defined the Arhat as the attainer of that goal:[16]

> Existence is suffering. This is the first of the four Ariyasaccani, or Sublime Truths, upon which the religion of Buddha is founded. But a creed which begins by saying that existence is suffering must end by saying that release from existence is the highest good, and accordingly we find that annihilatiion is the goal of Buddhism...[However,] in the Buddhist texts two sets of expressions are used with reference to Nirvâṇa,

[16] Childers, Dictionary of the Pali Language, S.v. Nibbânam; S.v. Arahâ, Araham.

the one implying blissful existence and the other annihilation.[17]

Childers attempted to resolve this tension by claiming that the word Nibbânam is used "to designate two different things, the state of blissful sanctification called Arhatship, and the annihilation of existence in which Arhatship ends."

> Arhatship is final and perfect sanctification, it is a state in which merit and demerit, original sin, desire and attachment are rooted out, in which all that binds man to existence, all that lead to re-birth or transmigration, is wholly extinct. The Arhat is still a man, he is subject to temptation, he is subject to physical suffering, and his life is not prolonged beyond that of other mortals. But he is a man purified and exalted. However greatly tempted he cannot sin, for his heart is purged from every taint of human passion. Freed from the trammels that bind men to earth, he traverses the air and works great miracles. He scans the thought of others, he can recall his own past life in countless existences, he hears the sounds in distant spheres, he beholds with the divine eye the beings that people the universe, dying and being reborn. And in all the vicissitudes of life his mind preserves its even tenour, serene and tranquil he lives out his span of life rejoicing in the ever-present consciousness that he has triumphed over man's greatest enemy, Existence. Death comes at last, but the seed of existence has withered, the lamp of life has burnt out, the Arhat is reborn no more again, he has attained Nirvâṇa, he has ceased to exist.[18]

17 Ibid., s.v. Nibbânam. "Thus Nirvâṇa is called the Void, the Unconditioned, the Abstract, the Uncreate, the Infinite, the Eternal, the Formless, the Invisible, and so forth, and its common synonym is Nirodha, `cessation' or `destruction'. It is described as `free from all trace of the elements of being,' and in scores of places the death of an Arhat is likened to the extinction of a flame, the strongest possible was of expressing annihilation intelligibly to all."

18 Ibid., s.v. Nibbânam.

Childers went on to observe that the two sets of expressions in the early Buddhist texts about Nirvāṇa seem to contradict each other, on the one hand insisting on annihilation, and on the other blissful existence. He resolved this problem by suggesting that it is the state of the Arhat before his death that is blissful, since in Childers' reading, no early Buddhist scripture passage gives evidence of the Arhat's continued existence after death. Needless to say, any cult of an Arhat after his death would be inherently superfluous, since no assistance could ever be forthcoming.

Childers' principal contribution in this still-useful dictionary is his presentation of the goal[19] of Buddhism as Nirvāṇa. His ontological definition of Nirvāṇa as the total cessation of existence would come under fire today, although it would be difficult to deny that this is the view of some inheritors of the early Buddhist tradition.[20] In any case,

[19] In the opinion of Victoria Kennick Urubshurow, the essence of the Buddha's teaching is not its goal but precisely the path: "Identification of the moment of liberation is made not in terms of Buddha as ontic being, but in terms of the practice of a path." Thus the Dharma is a prescription for present action and "Buddha is a conventional form that discloses patterns of action on a spiritual path, not a being." Urubshurow is of course writing from the perspective of Tibetan Buddhism, but her comments seem to accord with the original meaning of the term dharmakāya, which we could define as the `corpus' of the doctrines and pratices that the Buddha himself taught in his own person. See Victoria K. Urubshurow, "Symbolic Process on the Buddhist Path: Spiritual Development in the Biographical Tradition of Milarepa." (Ph.D. dissertation, The University of Chicago, 1984) pp. 184, 185.

[20] The constant witness of the Theravāda tradition on this point would seem to favor Childers' own view. In particular, there is the veneration of the Buddha not as a

his use of Christian theological terms such as original sin would to be considered inadmissable.

However, Childers discussion of path and goal reminds us that early Buddhism was a means to an end, a set of skillfully presented formulae or patterns for the practice of the spiritual life. The authenticity of the Buddha as "the Enlightened One" only served to render these spiritual counsels more persuasive . In the classic set of questions that the Buddha refused to answer[21], we see at an early phase of the tradition an attempt to cope with the natural human curiosity about ontology, which the Buddha is presented as seeking to deflect in no uncertain terms, precisely because he considered his sole legitimate task as Buddha to be to teach humans the path that actually leads to the liberation that he himself had attained. It is this very clearly defined task that he chose, according to the biographical tradition, at the intercession of the gods, so that he would become the teacher of gods and men, thus returning to the world instead of remaining in the enlightened state until death without teaching verbally. To have remained in the enlightened state non-verbally would have constituted sanctification, i.e. the holiness of a presently-existing person, but as a supreme model for the way-faring that all humans must ultimately undertake.

[21] Wayman, Historia Religionum, p. 418: "Whether the Tathâgata exists after death, or does not, or both, or neither; is the soul identical with the body or different from it?" etc. Cf. S.N. Dube, Cross Currents in Early Buddhism (Delhi: Manohar, 1980), p. 20, and Majjhima Nikâya, Aggivacchagotta sutta.

Pratyekabuddha, but not the rank of a complete, perfectly enlightened Buddha.

The Arhat: Goal, Path, and Recognition

In early Buddhism, it is not always clear that the goal is different for the founder and for the follower. The Buddha is referred to as the "Arhat", among other titles. To the early Buddhist, however, Śâkyamuni was no mere mortal.[22] He was recognized as supramundane. Snellgrove clarifies this concept:

> There can never be any question in a real sense of 'deifying' Śâkyamuni. According to the earliest attested beliefs he was already superior to all gods, including the great god Brahma, the first and highest being to reappear in every succeeding world age, in that he had already attained the summit of existence...as a man, Śâkyamuni was mortal, but...he was also more than man, for he was a Buddha, who transcends the whole universe...[23]

The Buddha is supramundane because of his manifest omniscience; he is said to have penetrated the secret of existence, the twelve-linked chain of dependent causality (pratîtyasamutpâda), which gives rise to suffering and is activated by beings' persistent desire, anger, and

22 "The Lord is an Arhat, Perfectly Enlightened, perfect in his knowledge and his doings, the Blessed One, supreme knower of the universe, a competent charioteer who controls men, a teacher of gods and men, Buddha, the Lord. He knows this universe with its gods, with Brahma, with Mâra, the world with its ascetics and brahmans, with its men and its gods, and realizing it (for what it is) he declares it to others".... ITB, pp. 30-31.

23 ITB pp. 30-31.

ignorance. The state of omniscience, extensively addressed in the Tattvasaṃgraha of Śāntarakṣita with the commentary of Kamalaśīla[24], could only have been attained by one who had developed extraordinary merit and wisdom. The Buddha had undergone a profound transformation of the component elements of his person (dharmāḥ), so that he could see the truth and reveal it to others.

Responses to the Buddha on the part of those persons who were on the verge of awakening were swift. His realization, his doctrine, and his way of working with the intrinsic spiritual capacities of individuals gave rise to a body of literature in which followers presented accounts of their own enlightenment. The early textual and artistic record presents Buddhism as a lively religious movement focusing on the revelatory impact of the Buddha's doctrine and personal holiness. The fact that his person evoked a sense of awe is only made more emphatic by the cult of relics that grew up after his death. In the cult of the stūpa, ever-more-elaborate with the passing of centuries, we find evidence for a cult of the Saints in Buddhism, for it was not only Śākyamuni whose relics were so enshrined. Holiness came to be recognized in a variety of Buddhist personalities and there emerged not only architectural but

[24] The Tattvasaṃgraha of Śāntarakṣita with the Commentary of Kamalaśīla. Ganganatha Jha, trans. (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1986). Chapter 26, on the Omniscient Person.

also literary forms in which sanctoral veneration was cultivated.[25]

The following formulae describe the state of arhatship associated with the Buddha and with the earliest `attainers' among his followers:

-Destroyed is rebirth, lived is the good life, done is what had to be done, and now there is no more of this state of things.

-Alone, withdrawn, zealous, ardent, with a self that has striven.

-The Arahan, in whom the _âsavas_ are destroyed, who has greatly lived, who has done what ought to be done, who has shed his burden, and has won his aim (_attha_) whose bonds to becoming are now no more, is, having rightly come to know, set free.

-Knowledge arose in me; unshakable for me is the release of mind, this is my last birth, there is now no further becoming for me.[26]

-The _viññâna_ of a Saint: invisible, unlimited, and radiant.[27]

[25] See John Strong, "The Buddhist Avadânists and the Elder Upagupta," in _Tantric and Taoist Studies in Honour of R. A. Stein,_ Volume 3, edited by Michel Strickman. (Bruxelles: Melanges Chinois et Bouddhiques XXII, 1985). pp. 862-881; reference to patron Saints and their cults pp. 869-70.

[26] I. B. Horner. _The Early Buddhist Theory of Man Perfected,_ (London: Williams and Norgate Ltd., 1936), pp. 119-134, passim.

[27] _Dîgha-Nikâya_ I, 223 and _Majjhima Nikâya_ I, 326.

Subsequent testimonials to the state of arhatship were provided by a large group of both men and women in the _Theragâthâ_ and the _Therîgâthâ_, which represent a genre of spiritual autobiography in brief verses. This poetic genre will re-emerge among dramatically different personalities in later medieval Buddhism, the Mahâsiddhas, where autobiographical accounts of the attainment of the goal offer a basis for one type of hagiographical literature. Later, in the biographical tradition of Milarepa, the autobiographical song will take on new dimensions in the Tibetan setting. These verses represent the `roots' of a long literary tradition:

-Dabbo is satisfied; he has gone beyond doubt; he is a victor, truly free of his fears. Dabbo is firmly established in complete tranquility. (#5)

-The one who is calmed, self-restrained, a knower of causes and conditions (_vedagu_), is a destroyer of (his own) longings either for this world or for the next. Untainted by all the phenomena of nature, he should know the rising and the passing away of the world. (#10)

-Gavampati, who made the river Sarabhû stand still by his miraculous power, is unbound and free from desire. The gods will revere that great sage who has escaped from all attachments; his state of existence (_bhavassa_) is that of one who has crossed to the other shore (_pâragûn_). (#38)

-The Great Hero, who has passed beyond all natural phenomena, instructed (me); I, hearing his doctrine, abode

in his presence, delighted (rato; could also be sato, recollected). (Thus) the Three Knowledges have been attained (and) the instruction of the Buddha has been accomplished (i.e. made real in me). (#66)

-Then, my rationality (manasikâro) surfaced, wisely; my misery became articulate (pâturahu); renunciation was firmly established; then was the mind set free (tato cittam vimucci me). See the Doctrine which is good in its very nature. The Three Knowledges have been attained! The instruction of the Buddha has been accomplished! (#409, 410)

-Both ardent and prudent, fully understanding and recollected, attaining the fruit of a Stream-Winner, practised in the (seven) stages of the trainee-path. (Therâpadâna, #10, Ānanda).[28]

Each of these passages has some bearing on the spirituality that we will encounter in the biographies of Milarepa. Dabbo is a victor, and the same title is given to Milarepa (Tib.: rgyal po); the tantric Buddhist teaching of Mahâmudrâ seeks to go beyond not only fear, but also hope, and fully utilizes the attainment not only of tranquility but of discerning insight. Thus, a true `knower of causes and conditions' (#10) can master all phenomena as Milarepa does in order to convert hardened personalities and cosmic demons, confronting any phenomenon of this world ('jig rten, the `container of all that is perishing') without fear or

[28] The texts from the Theragâthâ and Therîgâthâ follow the translation by K.R. Norman, with my own revisions. The passage from the Therâpadana is my own translation.

longing. Gavampati's miraculous power over the river Sarabhû manifests his liberation from desire and attachment; Milarepa overcame his attachments and evil deeds by penance, and manifested his miraculous power without any further need for distinctions between attachment and non-attachment, for the 'other shore' and cyclic existence are, in the tantric and Prajñâpâramitâ perspective, non-dual.

In #66, we have a hint of Guru-yoga, which becomes a central theme in the tantras. In 409-410, we have the enlightenment of a man in desperation, a man ready to commit suicide, as Milarepa nearly did when Marpa continued to refuse to initiate him.

These descriptions of arhatship in the Theravâda tradition proclaim a permanent, irreversible state. It was precisely the irreversiblity and impeccability of the Arhat that seems to have troubled some within the Saṃgha at the time of the division into the Mahâsaṃghika and the Sthaviravâda, giving rise to the eventual formation of the 'eighteen sects'. In the centuries immediately following the Parinirvâṇa of the Buddha, his followers continued his own style of presentation as a 'systematizer' (vibbajjavâdin, an enumerator) and created ever more systematic expositions of the Doctrine. As the work of systematization progressed, there emerged the texts of the Abhidharma, representing a threefold task on the part of its several generations of compilers. First, the doctrinal topics or matrices (matṛka) that constitute Buddhist belief

had to be identified. Secondly, a method for the critical analysis of these topics had to be devised. This included such techniques as definition, the grouping of synonyms, and the classification of principles. Third, a conceptual pattern had to be shaped by which this ever more vast and intricate material might be integrated in a way that was comprehensive, organic, economical, and elegant. The very fact of ongoing debate made such a task both necessary and inevitable, for only by such means could the key doctrinal points be taught and brought forth in debate. The task itself, which in a sense can be said to have been initiated by the Buddha in his first sermon, was to take not less than a millenium to reach a sort of culmination in the monumental summa of Vasubandhu, the Abhidharmakośa.[29]

Early Buddhism said that the noble one (Pāli: ariya) is of four kinds as successive attainers of the path, namely, the one who has entered the stream (and who will be reborn at most seven more times), the one who will return once more to the world, the one who will not return, and the Saint (Arhat) as the fourth path.[30] These four paths (cattaro magga) distinguish the four attainers from the ordinary person (Pāli: puthujjana; Skt.: pṛthag-jana).[31]

[29] José Pereira and Francis Tiso. "The Evolution of Buddhist Systematics from the Buddha to Vasubandhu". Philosophy East and West, XXXVIII #2 (April, 1988): 172-186.

[30] Wayman, Historia Religionum, p. 439.

[31] Childers, op. cit., p. 225; cf. Nalinaksha Dutt, Early Monastic Buddhism, chapter XIII; ADK, Chapter 6, The Saints and the Path; and Jean Rahder, "La carrière du saint

Along with this four-fold classification of attainers, we find the means to attainment, at least for the monk, in the great compendium of Theravāda theory and practice, the Visuddhimagga, organized in three sections according to the instructions given in Samyutta-Nikāya I:

> The wise man who, firmly standing on morality, cultivates consciousness and insight, he the monk ardent and prudent, may disentangle this tangle.

Thus, the three aspects of the spiritual life that an aspirant to sanctity must cultivate are morality and the virtues, concentration in the form of contemplative practices, and understanding of the nature and structure of reality as a fruit of meditation.[32] Morality stands as the foundation; concentration and insight are the essential meditative training that brings the onset of enlightenment.

In the section of the Yogâcârabhûmi called the Cintamayi Bhûmi, Asaṅga expounds the six aspects of Morality for the monk-aspirant to arhatship:

1. He dwells with morality; 2. He is restrained by the Pratimoksa Vow; 3. He is possessed of good behavior; 4. He is possessed of lawful resort; 5. He views even minor

Bouddhique", Bulletin de la Maison Franco-Japonaise, II, #1 (1929).

[32] Wayman, Historia Religionum, p. 432ff.

sins fearfully; 6. He takes up and learns the points of instruction (*śikṣâpada*).[33]

Attaining a mastery of these comportments, the monk proceeds to the training of the mind through meditation, the 'right dwelling in *samâdhi*'. He engages in the Four Meditations based on the Four Dhyâna Heavens, which Asaṅga transmits from the tradition of ancient Buddhism:

1. In the first meditation he abides in the joy and pleasure arising from liberation from desires, sinful and unvirtuous natures, but still with general conception and specific conception (*vitarka* and *vicâra*; these may also refer to an initial mental distraction and a prolonged distraction which may draw away the meditator's attention).

2. In the second meditation, he abides in the joy and pleasure arising from the *samâdhi* free from general and specific conception; he is inwardly purified with the stream of consciousness one-pointed.

3. In the third meditation he is free from joy (i.e. ecstatic feelings); he is dispassionate and indifferent to spiritual delight; he is mindful and aware and can experience pleasure in the body.

4. In the fourth meditation he abides in the purity of indifference and mindfulness, free from both pleasure and distress; former satisfactions and dissatisfactions have vanished.

33 Wayman, *Historia Religionum*, pp. 433-4.

These four together constitute Calming, which, once attained, is followed by the development of Insight (also called clear vision, discerning analysis, and so forth). Wayman observes that "the earliest form of this seem to have been the contemplation of the five personality aggregates as empty of self and of what belongs to self, or the contemplation of aspects of the of the Four Noble Truths."[34] The latter are considered under four aspects:

1. The truth of Suffering is taken up in the light of impermanence, suffering, voidness, and non-self;

2. The truth of the Origin of Suffering is considered in relation to cause, source, production, and conditions.

3. The truth of the Cessation of Suffering is in relation to cessation, calm, excellence, and exit.

4. The truth of the Path leading to the cessation of suffering is taken up in the aspects of path, method, process, accomplishment, and the way of deliverance.[35]

With the mind empowered by the stable appropriation of Insight and Calming, it should be possible for a disciple to come to an understanding of the nature of reality in much the same way that the Buddha himself did. What is crucial for our understanding of the Saint is that such deep insight as is attained by an Arhat or a Buddha (essentially equivalent in the early scriptures) presupposes mental training. We are thus not talking about a spontaneous

[34] Ibid., p. 435.

[35] Ibid., p. 434.

awakening or a more or less prolonged period of ecstasy. Only a highly disciplined mind is capable of realizing the full import of the Dharma discovered by the Buddha himself. Thus it is not possible, even in early Buddhism, to posit the Truth in a strictly logical manner that could be grasped by any intelligent person (essentially classifiable as a pṛthag-jana) upon sufficient reflection. On the contrary, Buddhist realization of the Truth is highly conditioned by the prior discipline of spiritual training that alone makes possible such attainment. Although scholarly investigation is certainly one form of mental discipline inculcated by early Buddhism[36], it is a kind of investigation that cannot be separated from the actual practice of meditation, following the model of the Buddha himself. This approach to high spiritual and intellectual attainment never ceases to be an issue in the long history of Buddhism; in the biographies of Milarepa, it is a standard theme. The great yogin is in frequent conflict with those monks who had separated intellectual discipline from the practice of meditation.

Further practices contribute to shaping of the mind so that it becomes more flexible, more able to penetrate the farther reaches of thought, more able to eliminate habitual egoistic patterns. These contemplative practices are the `vihāras' or abodes:

36 Ibid., on the distinction between attaining arhatship by intensive insight-meditation (vipassanā-dhura) and by the method of study and knowledge (gantha-dhura/paññā-dhura).

> The Noble Abode is the voidness abode, the abode free from image, the abode free from purpose, and the abode of cessation equipoise. The first three are well known as the three gates of liberation: 'Whosoever being filled with determination, considers all constructions as impermanent, is one who attains the Imageless Liberation; whosoever being filled with tranquillity, considers all constructions as suffering, is one who attains the purposeless Liberation; whosoever being filled with Insight, considers all constructions as void, is one who attains the voidness Liberation' - [according to Asaṅga]. . ..Besides the Noble Abode, there is the Divine Abode (divya-vihâra), which is the abode of the four Dhyânas, and of the formless realm; and there is the Sublime Abode (brahma-vihâra), which is the abode in friendship (maitri), compassion (karuṇâ), sympathetic joy (muditâ), and indifference (upekṣa).[37]

Evidently, the cultivation of these attitudes systematically through daily meditation will produce new habits of mind that will also affect the practitioner's daily conduct in the moral and intellectual spheres. Since the texts that describe these practices are not 'hagiographical' we seldom see a portrait of the person who is the result of such training. In the biographies of Marpa and Milarepa, however, there are specific indications that tell the reader what to expect in the course of training the mind, to which we will refer in later chapters.

Other mental training is presented in the form of the Thirty-Seven Natures Accessory to Enlightenment (bodhipakṣyâ-dharmâḥ), which in early Buddhism consisted of:

37 Ibid., p. 434.

1. The Stations or Abodes of Mindfulness, involving tying the mind to a meditative object, and of disciplining oneself to return to the object when the mind has strayed.

2. The Four Right Elimination Exertions, which are a development of the sixth member of the Noble Eightfold Path, `right effort.'

3. The Four Bases of Magical Power, the iddhis, which may be cultivated, but which may be used only with great caution.

4. The Five Faculties and the Five Powers, which are applied to counteract tendencies to defilement.[38]

Correct application of these practices gives rise to the stages from Srotaâpanna to Arhat. There are two paths, according to Dutt's reading of the Abhidharmakośa, that amount to an application of these practices toward full

[38] They are: 1. Faith with understanding toward the three jewels, and toward the moral rules that characterize the attitude of the Noble Ones. 2. Striving, which is equivalent to the four right efforts in eliminating defilement. 3. Mindfulness, which is equivalent to the four stations of mindfulness (satipatthâna). 4. Contemplative absorption, which includes the Four Dhyânas. 5. Insight (prajñâ), consisting of the Four Noble Truths. By assiduous devotion to and repetition of these five faculties and powers, one develops roots of virtue conducive to penetration of the Truth, which include `warmth', `summits', `forebearances consistent with the truth', and `supreme mundane natures.' According to the ADK, the four degrees can only be practiced by beings in the realm of desire (gods and men). Warmth, which takes on special significance in the life of Milarepa, comes from prolonged contemplation of the four Noble Truths with their sixteen aspects; summits means the most excellent realization of those sixteen aspects. Forbearance of the dharmas (the same sixteen, with special emphasis on suffering) is promoted by them, while supreme mundane natures are restricted to the four aspects of the First Noble Truth.

realization of the Noble Truths. These two are the paths of seeing (darśana) and meditation (bhâvanâ). Bhâvanâmârga commences at the last point of the darśanamârga.[39] Dutt indicates that here darśana refers to the first glimpse of the truths which had not been visualized previously (adiṭṭha-pubba), but bhâvanâ means development of the first glimpse to a clearer view of the truth. According to the Abhidharmakośa, the darśana-mârga is divided into sixteen points (kṣaṇas, or moments) of comprehending the Truths (ADK VI, 261; VII,4). Dutt comments:

> When the practitioner has completed the fourth phase of the final realization that existence in all three dhâtus is suffering, etc., and that there is a path leading to the origin and cessation of suffering, he has completed the darśana mârga and is to be considered established as a srotâpanna. He is free from the non-material impurities...and this makes him an ârya, a person entitled to let himself flow along the stream of sanctification.[40]

At this point , the application of morality becomes crucial because it is the basis for the attainment of Srotaâpanna and Sakṛdâgâmin stages. Now the practitioner eliminates the three fetters (samyojanas) and the two inclinations (anuśaya), i.e. the wrong 'view' (Pâli: diṭṭhi) and lack of faith (vicikiccha) in the Three Jewels.

After extensive practice, a Srotaâpanna passes on to the stage of a Sakṛdâgâmi, who has only a minimum of the three hindrances of attachment, hatred, and delusion; he

39 N. Dutt, op. cit., pp 257-8.

40 Ibid., p. 260.

cultivates meditative absorption and insight (prajñâ). The two 'inclinations' of attachment and aversion (kâmarâga and pratigha) are eliminated as are the impurities arising from diṭṭhi. Desire for further becoming and remaining traces of ignorance are further undermined. The Sakṛdâgâmin is like the Ekabiji for whom one more birth is necessary before the attainment of Nibbâna.[41]

The Anâgâmin is the stage attained by a Sakṛdâgâmin once he has perfected his mental control in meditation; at this stage, there will be no further births in the realm of desire. Such an ârya has eliminated all five lower fetters along with attachment, hatred and delusion, and impurities arising from attachment to mundane objects. Impurities arising from desire for further becoming (birth) and from ignorance still remain to a slight degree. There are five sub-categories of the Anâgâmin. One of these is relevant to our study of the later tradition on Vajradhara. The Uddhamsota (Skt.: ûrdhva-srotas) Akaniṭṭhagâmi are those Anâgâmins who do not attain Parinirvâṇa while they are in the Aviha heaven but rise higher until they reach the Akaniṭṭha heaven where they attain Nirvâṇa (see ADK VI, 37, which further elaborates this type into three).

Finally, the Anâgâmin completes his acquisition of prajñâ and becomes an Arhat. The Arhat, having eliminated all fetters, afflictions, and lingering impurities, finally

[41] Ibid., p. 263.

grasps the real significance of the Four Truths, whereupon his knowledge is perfected and his mind is completely liberated. The Arhat will not return to cyclic existence, but will pass into Nirvâṇa.[42]

The two methods for attaining Arhat status are based on the choice between the intensive practice of insight meditation and the method of gaining knowledge through study. The former, according to Dutt, depends more on faith in the Triple Jewel of Buddha, Dharma and Saṃgha, and in the spiritual teacher, and seeks emancipation through meditation practices. This is the great theme of the life of Milarepa and the heart of bKa' brgyud pa spirituality. However, both categories of Arhat must incorporate mental training and intellectual acumen, "because no one can become perfect without purification of mind and perfection in knowledge."[43] And in fact, Milarepa demonstrates his command of the intellect in his debates with Dar blo, even to the point of emanating a paṇḍita who defeats Dar blo in debate and then dissolves into Milarepa! (see folios 248-249)

[42] Ibid., p. 266. Some Arhats also gain specializations in the area of knowledge, such as analytical knowledge of word-meaning (patisambhida attha), etymology (nirutti), philosophical sense (dhamma), and rhetoric (patibhana). Ibid. p. 267. This is relevant to later theories of Buddhist hermeneutics. Arhats are further distinguished by whether they have attained emancipation by two means (by perfecting himself in the eight vimokkhas) from thought-constructions and by acquisition of the highest paññā. See Dutt, pp. 267-269 for these and other further distinctions.

[43] Dutt, op. cit. pp. 270-271.

An Arhat is beyond the course of training (Tib.: _de tshe de mi slob dgra bcom_; Pâli: _aśaikṣa 'rhann asau tadâ_). The _Abhidharmakośa_ states:

> The candidate for the quality of an Arhat, as soon as this consciousness is born, has acquired the fruit of Asaiksa, the fruit of Arhat: he has no longer to apply himself (_śikṣ_) in view of obtaining a further fruit: he is thus Aśaikṣa. For the same reason, having achieved his task, in that which concerns himself, he is qualified (_arhattva_) to do good to others (_parartha-karaṇa_); he is worthy to receive cultus (_pûjârha_) from all beings still subject to desire (_sarâga_).(ADK VI, 45b.)

The Cult of the Buddhist Saints

Having described in summary fashion the interior attainments associated with the path of an Arhat, we may procede to the aspect of public recognition or cult. Buddhism places this aspect on a theoretically lower level than the actual attainment of the fruit of arhatship, since what is involved is principally the accumulation of merit, usually on the part of the Buddhist laity. Such accumulation only contributes indirectly to the attainment of the highest goal. In fact, the cult of the Saints in Buddhism is a form of the practice of 'giving' (_dâna_) that prepares the way for a fuller practice of the spiritual life in a future rebirth. The relative merit of gifts relates to how far in one's next birth such giving will 'propel' the giver. The merit of a gift is more weighted by the stature of the recipient than by the intrinsic value of the gift

itself, the best gift being that which passes from the detached to the perfect!

The recipient of dâna is considered a `field of merit', i.e. one plants the seeds of good deeds in such a person by means of donations made to one who is a worthy field of merit; the merit thus accumulated will bear fruit in a future life of the donor. The recipient of a gift should be a holy person, or the holy Community (Saṃgha). Realized persons need not make gifts because they have already attained a state in which the fruits of previous donation are being enjoyed; they make offerings or perform worship only to offer good example to others. It is appropriate for a Saint to receive gifts; it may also happen that a saintly person may make gifts to ordinary persons in order to draw them to the Dharma. For example, in the biography of Milarepa and Marpa by sGampopa, Bari Lotsawa is said to offer splendid gifts to prospective disciples: "At one time, a man of Rong Kha bZhi of Nepal came to see Mila. Not believing in him, he said: `You, Mila the yogin! There is little significance to your great fame. There is a scholar named Bari Lotsawa; he bestows gold, parasols, trumpets, etc., on whomever comes to meet him.' Saying this, he went away." This in fact is not the only instance of invidious comparison between these two contemporaries![44]

In general it was the responsibility of the laity rather than of the religieux to render honor to the relics

[44] See Peta's remarks in, LM p. 135.

of the Tathâgata. For the religieux, the appropriate categories of religious action are morality, meditative concentration, and the cultivation of wisdom. Lamotte observes that it is only as a subsidiary item that the religieux are invited to develop the infinite sensibilities (apramâṇacitta) of good-will (maitrî), of mercy (karuṇâ) and of joy (muditâ) towards all beings whether fortunate or unfortunate.[45] In fact, the voluntary poverty of the bhikṣu places him even in a practical sense outside the state within which charity or almsgiving may be offered. The monk gives teaching, thus enabling others to enter the Path.

The subsidiary nature of giving is emphasized not only because it is not an immediate antidote to errors and passions, but also because giving may have the subtle effect of reinforcing belief in a self, in a giver, a gift and a recipient. As a spiritual practice, therefore, it cannot lead to liberation. However, we know from inscriptions at Nâgârjunakoṇḍa and elsewhere that gifts to the Saṃgha were made with the goal of Nirvâṇa as the fruit to be hoped for:

> ...she who, out of compassion for śramanas, Brahmins, and those that are miserable, poor, and destitute, is wont to bestow on them a matchless and ceaseless flow of Velâmic gifts...for the attainment of welfare and happiness in both the worlds and in order to attain herself the bliss of Nirvâṇa and for the attainment of welfare and happiness by all the world, has erected this pillar.[46]

[45] Lamotte, Histoire du Bouddhisme Indien (Louvain: Institute Orientaliste, 1976), p. 698.

[46] Quoted in Elizabeth S. Rosen, "Buddhist Architecture and Lay Patronage at Nâgârjunakoṇḍa," in Dallapiccola and Lallemant, editors., The Stûpa: Its Religious, Historical,

And, since giving on the part of the laity to the religieux was a fundamental duty and an economic necessity to the recipients, there is no lack of exhortations exalting the value of this virtue. Milarepa, the great renunciate of Tibet who usually does not hesitate to speak or sing bluntly without the slightest concern for the economic consequences, could also sing the praises of donors, at least in rGyal thang pa's version: "I am Milarepa the yogin; Having patrons is a great blessing; When I practice austerities, wandering among mountain solitudes, My bodily necessities are set in order by you, male and female patrons." (folio 254)

Giving may be a corporeal or vocal act, a gesture or a word, "arising from a generous will which sacrifices one's own property out of a desire to render homage or service. Its value varies in accordance with the qualities of the giver, the importance of the object given, and the excellence of the beneficiary."[47] Early Buddhism considered that the excellence of the beneficiary was the principal determining factor in evaluating the merit that would accrue from a gift. The excellence of the 'field of merit' (puṇyakṣetra) varies according to his destiny, his good and bad qualities, etc. (Majjhima Nikâya III) Although for

and Architectural Significance. (Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner Verlag, 1980), p. 115.

47 Lamotte, op. cit. p. 700.

early Buddhism the transfer of merit was impossible, a gift may be sanctified by the giver alone, by the beneficiary alone, by both together, or by neither (!), according to the Majjhima Nikâya. And the cult (pûjâ) offered to the Buddha, the community of Saints (Saṃgha), or to a stûpa (the three superior fields of merit) is nothing but a superior form of giving. However, there is considerable debate and hesitancy among the early sects about donations and cult offered to the person of the Buddha (recalling that in the early period only symbolic or aniconic representations were permitted). In the Abhidharmakośa, cult is useful in producing merit for one who is still not detached from the world of desire (kâmadhâtu), since giving will provide future good rebirth, but only within the desire-realm. But for one who has entered upon the Path, the cult is useless for it does not bear fruit in the higher spheres.

Since a favorable destiny, even within the desire-realm, is an essential pre-requisite to entry upon the Path, the Majjhima, the Divyâvadâna, and the Kośa all agree that the Tathâgata is the supreme field of merit, leading to favorable destinies and eventually to Nirvâṇa. However, there is also great merit to be acquired by giving to the Samgha comprising the eight categories of person (pudgala) in possession of the fruits of the Path. The Majjhima asserts that gifts to the Samgha honor both the Buddha and the Saṃgha.[48] The Mahîśâsakas included the Buddha within

[48] Ibid., pp. 701-702. The whole question of whether the Buddha is to be included in the Saṃgha comes up at this

the Saṃgha, but since he has entered Nirvâṇa, a gift made to him now is less profitable than a gift made to the Saṃgha composed of living persons. On the other hand, the Dharmaguptakas did not include the Buddha in the Saṃgha; holding the view that the Buddha is supreme, without a superior, a gift made to him is of greater value than a gift made to the Saṃgha.[49] Another point of view was held by a group of the Vetullakas, who claimed that neither the Buddha nor the Saṃgha sanctify the gift; rather it is the donor who sanctifies the gift! The main point is that these diverse opinions were neither blocked by scriptural prohibitions nor anathematized by the sects who disagreed. The question of cult and of giving took shape around relations between the monastic communities and their lay supporters and it was the devotional tastes of the latter that seem to have exerted the most telling pressure in the formulation of doctrine on the relationship between giving and merit.

Thus Snellgrove shows how the cult of relics, for all the variety in theoretical interpretation, was from a very early phase of Buddhism something quite distinctive and provocative of considerable religious enthusiasm:

> The Buddhist cult of human relics, which cuts it off so markedly from more orthodox forms of Hindu

point, pp. 703-705. Elizabeth Rosen's article shows how various sects at Nâgârjunakoṇḍa attempted to resolve these differing views in the architectural layout of their respective monastic and cult-sites. See op. cit. pp. 116-119.

49 Lamotte, op. cit. p. 702.

> religion, certainly suggest that the body of a Buddha, or at least the cremated remains, were regarded as real enough for practical purposes as well as exceedingly valuable.[50]

In fact, it is Snellgrove's contention that the cult of the stûpa and of the relics that `activate' a stûpa is the basis of the elaborate Buddhalogical developments in the Mahâyâna, particularly with regard to the triple body theory. The stûpa is basically a symbol of the absolute Buddha-nature, the Dharmakâya, activated by the relics of the Body of Appearance, at the early stage in Buddhist theory simply called the rûpa-kâya.[51]

The question of giving in relation to the cult of the Buddha and of the various degrees of ârya-pudgala comes even further into focus when we take into account various debates on the limits of the state of an Arhat. Eventually, these debates gave rise to the lasting divisions that continue to this day between Mahâyâna and Theravâda Buddhism.

Taking the Buddha's Community to have been founded about 531 B.C., it lasted as an undivided body for a little over 180 years, up to 349 B.C. when, at the Third Council, the first to be held in the imperial capital of Pâtaliputra, it broke up into the Sthavira and Mahâsâṃgha sects. One of the problems debated at that time was that of the impeccability of the Arhat. The Sthaviras apparently maintained that the Arhat is impeccable; the Mahâsâṃghikas

50 ITB, p. 35.

51 ITB, p. 36.

that he is not. In the Kathâvatthu, the opponents' criticism of the Arhat is summarized as follows:

1. An Arhat may have an impure discharge (i.e. he may be subject to unconscious temptations.) (Kath. II,1)

2. The Arhat may lack knowledge, even to the extent of being an Arhat and not knowing it. (Kath. II, 2).

3. The Arhat may have doubt on matters of doctrine. (Kath. II,3).

4. The Arhat is excelled by others, i.e., one cannot attain arhatship without the help of others (Kath. II,4).[52]

S. N. Dube has presented a useful discussion of this debate in the work cited, so that it is not necessary to elaborate further within the scope of this chapter. What is significant in the debate over the Arhat is the fact that within three centuries of the Parinirvâṇa of the Buddha, the original ideal of the founder seems to have run into serious difficulty. We have here neither a dogmatic dispute over terminology nor a procedural conflict such as those which characterize the jurisprudence of the Vinaya. Rather, it is the crucial question of the nature of inner attainment that is under scrutiny.

It is not difficult to imagine that some who claimed the state of Arhat, or of one of the other 'paths', had made an honest error and soon found themselves in moral difficulty. In the perspective of the Vinaya, such a

[52] S.N. Dube. Cross Currents in Early Buddhism (New Delhi: Manohar, 1980), p. 92; discussed pp. 93-113.

failure would have been doubly scandalous, for not only would such a person be guilty of one of the most serious offenses ('defeat', pârâjika depriving him of monastic ordination without hope of return), but it would have called into question the very doctrine of the irreversibility of the Arhat. Members of the Saṃgha whose sense of justice was offended by such a situation might have found support among lay followers who refused to accept the expulsion of a monk whose error consisted simply in misjudging the implications of a powerful contemplative experience.[53] Here we have the makings of a crisis in the nature of sanctity both from the point of view of inner attainment and of public recognition.

One of the assertions of the Theravâda defense of the traditional doctrine of the Arhat is that even an Arhat who only intermittently experiences emancipation (samayavimutta arahant) is irreversible, and not just the Arhat 'emancipated all the time' (asamayavimutta). But their opponents in the Katthâvatthu assert that there are five circumstances given in the Anguttara Nikâya which "conduce to retrogression of a bhikkhu who is intermittently emancipated:

1. delight in business (kammârâmatâ)
2. delight in talk (bhassârâmatâ)
3. in sleep (niddârâmatâ)
4. in society (samganikârâmatâ)

53 I.B. Horner, Early Buddhist Theory of Man Perfected, p. 117, on 'false claimants.' See also, I. B. Horner, translator. The Book of the Discipline (Vinaya Pitaka) Volume I (Suttavibhaṅga) (London: Humphrey Milford, 1938), "Defeat," pp. 1-191, especially pp. 151-191.

5. in the absence of reflection on how his heart is emancipated (yathā vimuttaṃ cittaṃ na paccavekkhati).[54]

What is at stake in such a debate? Surely the status of the Saint before the eyes of the community of monks and above all before the devoted laity. Thus we can recognize the intense seriousness for the Buddhist community of the authenticity of inner states; such inner states truly attained warrant the public devotion of the community; their absence or reversibility diminishes the apparent efficacy of the doctrine and the reliability of the Saint's state of attainment. It is precisely as a confirmation of the doctrine itself that the state of sanctity needs to be recognized at all; for if the doctrine is 'holy' then so also should be its fruition in persons. Thus, although there is no formal canonization process in Buddhism, there is ample evidence in the texts for a practice of very serious, precise, and prolonged evaluation of the states to which one might claim to have achieved through practice.

There are Ten Individuals worthy to receive sacrifices, hospitality, gifts, and respectful salutations, according to the Anguttaranikāya (Decades, Sutta 16): 1. Buddha; 2. Pratyekabuddha; 3. The twice-liberated; 4. the one liberated by Wisdom; 5. the one who attests in the body; 6. he who has obtained the View; 7. the one convinced by faith; 8. the one pursuing the Essences; 9. the one pursuing the

[54] Dube, op. cit. p. 96; n. 57 p. 115.

faith; 10. the ordinary person destined for the state of sanctity (gotrabhu).[55]

How is an ordinary person to be expected to have the ability to recognize with certainty any of these worthy (ārya) persons? Certainly, it would be impossible. The ordinary person sees a 'Saint' in the charlatan as much as in the true Saint; the mysterious presence of the holy is as real in the tīrthika as in the orthodox Arhat. It really requires a Buddha to recognize the authenticity of the arhatship of another person. Dutt comments "Buddha wanted to admit into his Saṃgha only those persons in whom he found some merits (kuśalamūla) acquired in their previous births, as those would be helpful to them in their present spiritual life. He meant that the real benefits of his teachings could be derived by meritorious persons only, and not by any and everybody."[56] Given the difficulties in recognizing an Arhat for anyone who is not at least somewhat spiritually advanced, it became necessary to designate those persons in this life who might be safely venerated by a devotee of good intentions. Therefore, the passage on the Ten Individuals is of considerable value, since it broadens the categories beyond the four highest 'paths', thus enabling the faithful to venerate persons not on the basis of formal canonization or on the basis of knowledge which only a Buddha is likely to possess, but simply on the basis of appropriate reverence

[55] See Puggala-paññatti, p. 25.

[56] Dutt, op. cit. p. 252.

toward _potentially_ sanctified persons, i.e. those who have in some measure begun the work leading to sanctification. The basic justification for such veneration would seem to be strictly limited to the accumulation of merit. A work such as the _Puggala-paññatti_ also serves the same purpose in the Abhidharma style of presentation, 'designating' human types both saintly and non-saintly. Such a work enables one to memorize the various characteristics of persons so that one may make note of the evidence for spiritual attainment.

The early debates on persons worthy of veneration had their fullest impact on the invidious comparisons between Arhats or Śrâvakas on the one hand and Bodhisattvas on the other in many of the Mahâyâna _sûtras_ and _śâstras_. The historic 'fall' of the ideal of the Arhat seems to have opened the door to a plethora of new ideas on attainment that kept pace with the spread of Buddhism to lands beyond the confines of India.

Part I

Chapter 2 The Bodhisattva Ideal

History and Structure of Inner Attainment

The Arhat is the Buddhist Saint who has completed the path toward perfection from the point of view of the practice of purification (Pâli: visuddhimagga). Such intense concentration on the purification of body, speech, and, especially, mind, could not fail to produce some tension among those who, though attracted to so lofty an ideal, were nonetheless unable to attain it in this life. The path of the average monk or layman would necessarily be characterized by the accumulation of merit and of knowledge, in imitation of the previous lives of the Buddha himself, picturesquely elaborated in the Jâtakas. In these tales, the Buddha is described as a progressing bodhisattva whose adventures illustrate the extravagant practice of virtue that is required of all who would attain the complete illumination. Both the lay and the monastic imagination found these tales, as well as the avadânas and hagiographical accounts of the Buddha's disciples, a source of inspiration. The Bodhisattva came to acquire importance as an object of devotion in the course of the five centuries after the Parinirvâṇa of the Buddha, and eventually became the subject of extensive philosophical elaboration.[1]

[1] The emergence of a devotional piety among the religieux is discussed in Elizabeth Rosen's article on the excavations at Nâgârjunakoṇḍa, cited above. John Strong in "The Buddhist Avadânists and the Elder Upagupta," in Michel Strickmann, ed., Tantric and Taoist Studies in Honour of R. A. Stein,

Lay piety contributed to the emergence of the Bodhisattva as an object of a devotional cult. In the debate over the precise nature of the 'emergence' of the Mahâyâna form of Buddhism, it is becoming apparent that the new ideals could not have emerged exclusively in either the lay or the monastic milieux. In Akira Hirakawa's important article "The Rise of Mahâyâna Buddhism and its Relationship to the Worship of Stûpas," we learn of the appearance of a distinct non-monastic group, the bodhisattvagaṇa, which arose under the influence of lay patrons such as princes and merchants. This group appears in both the Andhra country and (perhaps even earlier) in the northwest, in Gandhâra, just as the earlier Mahâyâna texts were being produced.[2]

The transformation of Buddhism in the northwestern corner of the Indian subcontinent was the result of both historical pressures and the concomitant emergence of new avenues of critical reflection. Scholarly opinion on the exact chronology of this process is far from settled. Even before Aśoka, Buddhist monks had spread the Dharma beyond the confines of Magadha. During the Mauryan period

vol. 3 (Bruxelles, Mélanges Chinois et Bouddhiques, XXII, 1985), shows how by the time of Hsüan-tsang (629-645 A.D.), monk-specialists in various topics (the vinayadharas, suttantikas, abhidhammikas, etc.) made offerings to their respective patron saints, pp. 869-870.

2 Akira Hirakawa, "The Rise of Mahâyâna Buddhism and its Relationship to the Worship of Stûpas," Memoirs of the Research Department of the Tokyo Bunko No. 22 (Tokyo, 1963): 57-106. See also, Alex and Hideko Wayman, The Lion's Roar of Queen Śrimâla (New York: Columbia University Press, 1974), p. 8, where the information is used to date this sûtra.

(concluding ca. 230 B.C.), the Buddhist presence reached at least as far as Takṣaśīla. Subsequently, under the Śuṅgas, monks may have abandoned their centers in Magadha to go West where already existing Buddhist communities were able to receive them. The northwest was a meeting ground of Hellenistic, Indo-Parthian, Śaka (Scythian?), and other cultures in the three centuries after the fall of the Mauryas.[3] Buddhist teachers quickly set about introducing the new arrivals to the lofty doctrines of Śâkyamuni. Like the transmission of the Christian Gospel to early medieval Europe, preaching and conversion gave rise to a new civilization and new ideas.

In Europe, the invaders recognized the value of the civilization at their feet, awed perhaps by the grandeur of architecture and ceremonial as much as by the presence of forceful personalities. Taking advantage of this feeling of awe, the Buddhist monks, like their Catholic counterparts, managed to persuade the barbarians of the advantages of conversion to the religion practiced within the confines of civilization. Toiling to transform the mentality of the newly converted, they seized upon elements relatively embryonic within the tradition (e.g. the veneration of relics, <u>stūpas</u>, and sacred texts) and transmitted these as a

[3] A. L. Basham, "The Evolution of the Concept of the Bodhisattva," in Leslie S. Kawamura, ed. The Bodhisattva Doctrine in Buddhism (Ontario: Wilfred Laurier University Press, 1981), pp. 46-48. See also, Joseph E. Schwartzberg, Historical Atlas of South Asia (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1978), Plates III.B.4; III.C.1; III.C.2.

skillful means for awakening faith and devotion among the as yet less speculatively inclined invaders. This technique proved controversial within the Buddhist community and, along with the critique of the Arhat already discussed above, contributed to the formation of a distinct new theoretical position around the figure of the Bodhisattva as a spiritual ideal.

The labor of conversion and preaching on the part of those monks who undertook the great task of serving the foreigners as missionaries presented a new and concrete ideal to the Buddhist community both monastic and lay. The monk who preached effectively enough to convert the foreigners, who founded new monasteries, endowed stûpas and libraries, who gained royal and merchant patronage, soon acquired enormous value for the Saṃgha and even became in a certain sense indispensable. Such leaders could not have spent their time in solitary meditation in the forest. Their world was the ambient of large monastic establishments, the royal courts, and even the marketplace, as we know from the excavations at Taxila and in Andhra Pradesh. For these religieux, the compassionate action of teaching both king and commoner acquired the aura of sanctity, an aura rivaling that of the would-be Arhats who still sought to practice the path of purification in the reclusion of the forest.[4]

[4] Peter Brown has succinctly analyzed a similar process in the world of late Roman antiquity. See, for example, his

We must glean our evidence for the transformation of the ideal of Buddhist sanctity from the the Mahâyâna sûtras and śâstras. The emergence of the Bodhisattva as a `Saint' with a distinctive type of spiritual identity was a fruit of the historical developments associated with the conversion of new peoples in the subcontinent; the early concept of the Bodhisattva as a Buddha-in-the-making, a being on the path of accumulation, was developed systematically so as to provide a model for the conversion of the multitudes and for the formation of monks with missionary zeal.

Edward Conze's study of the early Mahâyâna sûtras illuminates the systematic side of this process. Conze basically interprets the Buddhist Saints not so much as `finished products' but as earnest practitioners who have "detached themselves from conditioned things to such an extent that they can now effectively turn to the path which leads to Nirvâṇa."[5] These are the ârya, who occupy a plane of existence distinct from that of the pṛthagjana, for, "not

The Making of Late Antiquity (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1978).

A hagiographical tale from the late fourth and early fifth century sayings of the Desert Fathers illustrates an attempt to reconcile the two types of holiness: "The abbot of a cenobium asked our holy father Cyril, bishop of Alexandria, `Who is greater in his manner of life, we who have brothers subject to us each of whom we guide in various ways toward salvation, or those who, in solitude, save only themselves?' The Bishop replied: `There is no need to distinguish between Moses and Elijah; both, in fact, are pleasing to God.'" Lisa Cremaschi, trans., Detti Inediti dei Padri del Deserto. [Magnano (VC): Edizioni Qiqajon, 1986], p. 142, #70. (my translation from the Italian).

[5] Edward Conze. Buddhist Wisdom Books (London: George Allen & Unwin, 1958), p. 38.

content with being born in the normal way, the saints have undergone a spiritual rebirth."[6] This description can apply to the Śrâvaka (the disciple on the monastic path toward Arhatship), to the Pratyekabuddha (a solitary attainer of enlightenment), and to the Bodhisattva on the pāth to supreme enlightenment as a Buddha.

The distinguishing mark of the Bodhisattva is generosity; this virtue is based on an heroic altruism that responds with great sensitivity, compassion, and self-forgetfulness to the suffering of beings in all circumstances. This ideal came to take on a life of its own, with a liturgical cult and an increasingly vast body of scriptures. The Bodhisattva as a would-be Buddha seems to have had a wider appeal than the Arhat in his highly restrained and purified pursuit of Nirvâṇa. Thus we must imagine the Bodhisattva in two aspects, as a celestial advocate and helper of human beings, and as a personal ideal for the Buddhist faithful.[7]

Among the teaching and missionary monks of increasingly Mahâyâna inclination, the Bodhisattva ideal evolved ever more explicitly as "someone destined to be a Buddha, but who, in order to help suffering creatures, selflessly

[6] Ibid.

[7] See especially, David L. Snellgrove, "Sanctified Man in Mahâyâna Buddhism," Studia Missionalia 19 (1970): 55-86, and Paul Harrison, "Who gets to Ride on the Great Vehicle? Self-Image and Identity Among the Followers of the Early Mahâyâna", The Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies, 10 #1 (1987): 67-87.

postpones his entrance into the bliss of Nirvâṇa and his escape from this world of birth and death."[8] This intention was concretized in the form of a vow.[9] Such an altruist assists the spiritual development of others principally by teaching, i.e., making a gift of Dharma. He thus relieves suffering, since to teach the Doctrine is to administer the medicine by which beings (especially humans) are cured of the disease of desire, ire, and ignorance, which constitutes the basis of all suffering. Just as the Bodhisattva refrains from full entry into Nirvâṇa after death, and returns time after time to assist beings on the path, so too in this life[10], he refrains from the thoroughgoing program of yogic discipline that would make him an Arhat. Thus, the Bodhisattva advances the presence of the Buddha-dharma in the world at his own expense even in the sphere of spiritual practice and attainment.[11] This tendency to favor an active teaching role for the selfless and compassionate Bodhisattva allowed the development of such ideas as the transfer of

8 Conze, op. cit., p. 23.

9 Basham, op. cit., p. 53, fn. 2. Also pp. 25, 27, in which the idea of vows made in previous lives, but which bear fruit in the present, is introduced.

10 Basham, op. cit., p. 28. "The doctrine of future and past Buddhas suggested also the possiblity of Bodhisattvas active in present time."

11 Gadjin M. Nagao, "The Bodhisattva Returns to This World," in Leslie S. Kawamura, ed., op. cit., p. 71: "A Bodhisattva retains the obstacle of defilement to sustain his vow to be reborn."

merit[12] and the creation of buddhakṣetras favorable to the study and practice of the Doctrine, for the great monastic centers came to be seen as earthly manifestations of heavenly realms. It is no accident that dga' ldan (Tuṣita)[13] was a popular name for Tibetan Buddhist monasteries!

The Bodhisattva came to be idealized as a `great spiritual hero' (Tib.: bcom ldan 'das)[14], a shaper of culture and civilization. Conze cites the Acintyasūtra:

> His aspirations are truly on a heroic scale. He desires to discipline all beings everywhere, to serve and honour all the Buddhas everywhere, and to purify all the Buddha-fields everywhere. He wants to retain firmly in his mind all the teachings of all the Buddhas, to have a detailed knowledge of all Buddha fields, to comprehend all the assemblies which anywhere gather around a Buddha, to plunge into the thought of all beings, to remove their defilements, and to fathom their potentialities.[15]

The path of someone so eager for heroic virtue is founded upon the `thought of enlightenment', bodhicitta, the enlightened or altruistic attitude or aspiration, without which the Bodhisattva ideal is nothing but illusion and supreme egoism. The career of the true Bodhisattva therefore consists of :

12 Basham, op. cit., pp. 32-37.

13 Chandra Das, Tibetan-English Dictionary, p. 264.

14 A word the Tibetans coined to translate Skt. bhagavat, bhagavān. See Chandra Das, p. 395 and Lokesh Chandra, p. 679.

15 Conze, Buddhist Wisdom Books, p. 23.

1. the Vow to attain enlightenment not only for himself but in the intention of benefitting others.

2. the practice of the Six Perfections (virtues).

3. the attainment of Buddhahood, conceived as distinct from mere Arhatship.[16]

The goal of Buddhahood as distinct from Arhatship came to be clarified and elaborated in terms of the fundamental philosophical perspective of Mahâyâna Buddhism, especially from the time of the great Nâgârjuna[17]. This is the doctrine and middle-way (madhyamaka) dialectic of Voidness (śûnyatâ), conceived as the `symbolum' of the chain of dependent causality (pratîtyasamutpâda). Dependent causality as realized by the Buddha, constitutes the basis of his Omniscience. "The enlightenment of a Buddha is more complete than that of [Arhats and Pratyekabuddhas], and `omniscience' is its distinguishing feature."[18] On the basis of the doctrine of Voidness, it was possible for Mahâyâna theorists to expound not only a doctrine of anâtta

[16] Conze, ibid., p. 24. The Diamond Sûtra gives his Vow as follows: "Here Subhuti, someone who has set out in the Bodhisattva path should produce a thought in this manner: `All beings I must lead to Nirvâṇa, into that realm of Nirvâṇa which leaves nothing behind; and yet, after beings have thus been led to Nirvâṇa, no being at all has been led to Nirvâṇa."

[17] See Alex Wayman, "Nâgârjuna: Moralist Reformer of Buddhism," Studia Missionalia 34 (1985): 63-95.

[18] Conze, op. cit., p. 99. Cf. The Tattvasaṃgraha of Shântarakṣita, pp. 16, 22, 23, 24; 1577, 1578. "The Buddha's goal as he sits at Vajrâsana is omniscience;" see Lamotte, trans., Le Traitê de la Grande Vertue de Sagesse de Nâgârjuna, Vol. I (Louvain: 1981), p. 228.

(non-self), but of the niḥ-svabhâva (absence of perduring substratum) of the elements or natures (dharmâḥ) that constitute phenomena.[19]

These doctrinal developments are the basis for the later bKa' brgyud pa presentation of Mahâmudrâ as a practice rooted in the Prajñâpâramitâ tradition, in the course of their debates with other Tibetan Buddhists, as we shall see in Chapter 6. For the Mahâyâna, Buddhahood itself is without a conventional substratum, though it is a perduring continuum (a series of pure dharmas, anâsravadharma saṃtâna,[20]), the Dharmakâya. According to Conze,

> It would be a mistake to suppose that Buddhahood is some real, actually existing condition produced as a result of merit gained from giving and the other perfections...the real Buddha, in his Dharmakâya is without these marks. In his true reality, the Buddha is not produced by anything, and is not marked off from anything that would be different from him.[21]

Thus any ordinary conception of the Buddha, however efficacious as a religious practice, must also do justice to

[19] See José Pereira and Francis Tiso, "A Buddhist Classification of Reality: A Translation of the First Chapter of the Abhidharmakośa of Vasubandhu," Abhidharma Research Institute 6 (1987):51-84. The spiritual conditions under which voidness may be realized are given in the Perfection of Wisdom literature as: 1. it is attained by non-attainment; 2. it is a practice carried out by a Bodhisattva, as against an Arhat who is content with a merely personal Nirvâṇa; 3. the Bodhisattva practitioner of voidness has no other reliance than the doctrine of voidness revealed by transcendental wisdom (prajñâpâramitâ). See Conze, op. cit, p. 93.

[20] Lamotte trans., L'Enseignement de Vimalakîrti (Louvain: Institut Orientaliste, 1962), fn 29, p.138.

[21] Conze, op. cit. p. 29.

Buddhahood as an unconditioned Absolute[22]. In relation to any conception of a Saint, that which seems to distinguish is to be recognized ultimately as mere apparency; in reality, the Saint is also the Dharmakâya alone:

> From the Dharma should one see the Buddhas,
> From the Dharma-bodies comes their guidance,
> Yet Dharma's true nature cannot be discerned,
> And no one can be conscious of it as an object.[23]

The delicate art of Mahâyâna religious practice is that one takes Nirvâṇa as a motivating goal by which one gains habits of aversion to evil and detachment from phenomena; thus the Absolutely Unconditioned "seems to become a kind of condition, the essentially inactive seems to do something, and that which is nowhere seems to become localized in a definite individual."[24]

The remarkable Mahâyâna sûtra known as the Vimalakîrtinirdeśa describes the production of this 'definite individual' who is inseparable from the Absolutely Unconditioned under the heading of the Body of the Tathâgata[25]. The production of the Body of the Tathâgata,

22 The "Dharma which the Tathâgata has fully known and demonstrated" is the ultimate and unconditioned reality. Ibid., p. 38.

23 Ibid., p. 63.

24 Ibid., p. 39.

25 See Robert Thurman, "Transcendence and the Sacred in the Mahâyâna Middle Way," in Transcendence and the Sacred, edited by Charles Olson (South Bend: University of Notre Dame Press, 1982), p. 113, where this title of the Buddha is translated as "The One Who Realized Thusness;...This name conveys powerfully the sacredness of any Buddha in that,

which, from the point of view of absolute truth (paramârtha-satya), is only apparent, is the result of `gnosis', i.e., the long process of accumulating merit (puṇya) and wisdom (prajñâ), the Two Accumulations.[26] The text goes on to teach how everything may be included in the Tathâgata, which is "seen as if there were nothing to be seen"; it is niḥsvabhâvatâ: it escapes time, place, causality, movement, experience, and activity; it is unknowable and undefinable; it is absolutely pure (atyanta-viśuddhitâ) not because it excludes impure dharmas, but because of its essential universality[27], an aspect of Buddhahood that remains in force in the tantric works such as the Vajradhara rnam thars. In effect, the Absolute arises from gnosis and the Saints derive their strength and glory from the Absolute Gnosis of which they are the manifestation, for they may be said to have "arisen from the Unconditioned, have been

whether coming or going in the service of living beings, he is unmoved from his realization of the transcendent Truth," a theme that will turn up again in the rnam thar of Vajradhara.

[26] Robert A. F. Thurman, trans. The Holy Teaching of Vimalakîrti (University Park, PA: The Pennsylvania State University Press, 1976) p. 22. "It is the body of Dharma, born of gnosis...born of the stores of merit and wisdom, ..of morality, meditation, wisdom, the liberations, and of the knowledge and vision of liberation, ... of love, compassion, joy, and impartiality...of the ten virtues...of mental quiescence and transcendental analysis...etc." For this and other titles of the Buddha, see Lamotte, Le Traité de la Grande Vertue de Sagesse, pp. 126, 127, 146-7 and Lamotte, trans., La Somme du Grand Véhicule d'Asaṅga, Tome II (Louvain: Institut Orientaliste, 1981), pp. 134ff.

[27] Lamotte trans., Vimalakîrti, pp. 429-430. Cf. Thurman translation, Chapter 8.

produced from it, and are brought forth by it."[28] In the Body of the Tathâgata, all the dharmas are revealed in their primordial purity. Thus the dualistic mentality of the Śrâvakas is rooted in their resistance to this comprehensive vision of Buddhahood. According to the Mahâyânasaṃgraha of Asaṅga, "When beings have attained liberation (vimukti), they seek Parinirvâṇa. But the Buddha wants them to reject the idea of Parinirvâṇa and to seek to obtain the eternal Buddha-body" (nitya-buddha-kâya)[29]. By means of this superior attainment, all highly evolved beings will be able to assist others to attain true Buddhahood. Buddhas who appear to manifest Parinirvâṇa are not actually entering a state of `complete extinction' at all; they are only creating a salvific display for the purpose of impelling others toward spiritual evolution. For example, in the Śûramgama-samâdhi-sûtra, Mañjuśrî displays Parinirvâṇa millions of times in innumerable universes![30].

This leads us to a brief summary of the so-called two kinds of Nirvâṇa. To explain the fact that Buddha attained Enlightenment but continued in the body to teach, early Buddhism spoke of Nirvâṇa with and without remainder:

[28] Conze, op. cit. pp. 36-39. asaṃskṛta-prabhâvitâ hi-âryapudgalâḥ/

[29] Lamotte trans., pp. 342-343.

[30] Lamotte, trans., La Concentration de la Marche Héroique, (Bruxelles: Institut Belge des Hautes Etudes Chinoises, 1965), pp. 242-245.

> 1. Nirvâṇa with substratum, which is attained when all defilements such as greed, ignorance, etc. are given up. The Buddha reached that at the time of his enlightenment under the Bodhi-tree. But, since he still had a physical body and mental processes, there remained to him the 'substratum' of the five skandhas. This state gave way, at his death, to: 2. the Nirvâṇa without substratum. Even the five skandhas disappeared and Nirvâṇa alone remained.[31]

G. M. Nagao explains that the Mahâyâna respected Nirvâṇa as the highest goal as much as early Buddhism, but took the distinction with- and without-remainder to apply to the new ideal of the Bodhisattva over against the Arhat. The Arhat's goal, so it was argued, is pratiṣṭha-nirvâṇa: Nirvâṇa permanently fixed in the state beyond conditioned reality. The Bodhisattva, on the other hand, refuses the liberation afforded by such a state until all sentient beings are saved. In fact, the Tathâgatas obtain the apratiṣṭha-nirvâṇa, that which is not permanently fixed in Nirvâṇa. Thus the Tathâgata, as a Bodhisattva, can return to Saṃsâra and continue to help beings.[32] In the rnam thar of Vajradhara, we will see the same ideal among the seven 'limbs' of the saṃpuṭa (yan lag bdun) and the same oscillation between absorption and active discernment, ascent and descent, Nirvâṇa and return to Saṃsâra in many texts from the Prajñâpâramitâ sûtras to the rnam thars of Marpa and Milarepa, to the analysis of Mahâmudrâ by Takpo Tashi Namgyal. The ideal of the Bodhisattva as a being

[31] Conze, op. cit., p. 26.

[32] Nagao, op. cit., p. 63.

whose goal is Buddhahood is not to exclude anything or anyone. The Perfection of Wisdom in Eight Thousand Lines states: "He has stood neither in the conditioned nor in the unconditioned, nor has he emerged from them."[33]

The Bodhisattva: Path and Attainments

In the First Bhâvanâkrama of Kamalaśîla, there is a succinct presentation of the compassionate attitude and the contemplative training that characterize the path of a Bodhisattva. The Bodhisattva takes up the practice of meditation and of the cultivation of the virtues because he has looked at the situation of sentient beings and, moved to compassion, is willing to undergo any hardship or the rigors of any discipline so as to be able to help them to relinquish their grip on Saṃsâra, and to find the peace of Nirvâṇa[34]. The practice of a Bodhisattva is called "the yoga liberating all beings from their passions"[35], by which the Bodhisattva attains the 'inconceivable liberation' that includes both self and others. However, the texts regularly present the Bodhisattva as a being-in-process, which might suggest a lingering sense of inferiority to the Arhat. "If

33 Conze, op. cit., pp. 4-7, and E. Conze, trans., The Perfection of Wisdom in Eight Thousand Lines and Its Verse Summary (San Francisco: Four Seasons Foundation, 1973), ii, 37.

34 See Giuseppe Tucci, ed., Minor Buddhist Texts, Part Two (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1986); First Bhâvanâkrama of Kamalaśîla.

35 Thurman, trans., Vimalakîrti, p. 40.

[the Bodhisattvas] were placed [in the assembly of the Saṃgha] above the Arhats, the gods and men would have been troubled by it and would have been seized by doubt."[36]

Even highly accomplished Bodhisattvas find themselves in this situation: beginner or proficient, he is not quite completely perfect and thus there may be some doubt about the term `Saint' when we speak of the Bodhisattva. As we noted in Nagao's article, the Bodhisattva is said to retain some slight impurity so as to remain in cyclic existence; it is as if the Bodhisattva avoids adhering to a rigid standard of sanctity out of compassion for other beings. Thus the Ratnagotravibhâga describes a Bodhisattva on the Sixth Bhûmi:

> ...this state is predominantly established in the sixth stage of a Bodhisattva called Abhimukhî (ready for Enlightenment, Tib.: mngon-du gyur-pa) because, [in this stage], the Bodhisattva, facing the acquisition (abhimukhî; mngon-du phyogs-pa) of the Extinction of Evil Influences through his practices of unobstructed Highest Intellect and the Great Compassion, still does never realize that acquisition in order to protect all living beings.[37]

A great deal of effort is expended to explain the purity of the Bodhisattva in spite of his tactic of holding back from entry into Nirvâṇa; yet, it is admitted that "his state is explained as `not perfectly pure'" (p. 253). There

36 Lamotte trans., Le Traitė (abbrev. MPP-Ś)

37 Jikido Takasaki, A Study on the Ratnagotravibhâga (Uttaratantra), (Roma: IsMEO, 1966), pp. 251-252.

is no doubt that the Bodhisattva is a member of the __âryagotra__:

> Having attained the position of the Saints, he is nevertheless seen among ordinary beings; therefore he is, for the friends of all the world, the Highest Means and Compassion. (Verse 70)...Having obtained this position (__gati__) the Bodhisattva becomes equal to the Tathâgata, on account of his act of conveying (__samtâraṇa__) the living beings in various worlds to the other shore (Verse 77). There is however a great difference between Bodhisattva and the Buddha, Such difference as lies between the atom and the earth. (Verse 78)[38]

The text goes on to explain that the Bodhisattva, like the __âryapudgala__, passes through four paths, with irreversibility coming at the Eighth Bhûmi. This is one of several schemes for correlating the progress of an Arhat to that of a Bodhisattva, with the intent of affirming the sanctity of the Bodhisattva over against that of the Arhat.

In __Vimalakîrti__, there is further playing with this idea of the Bodhisattva's persistent `impurity' in the discussion of gotra. The Bodhisattvas appear to fall into the same category as the __icchantikas__ (Tib: '__dod__ __chen__ __po__), who are incapable of ever entering Nirvâṇa for a lack of the roots or germs of enlightenment[39]. This analysis continues the sense of irony present throughout this text in which the layman Vimalakîrti demolishes the presuppositions of Śrâvakas and even of Bodhisattvas with the powerful logic of the Mâdhyamikas, and by miraculous manifestations that confirm

38 Ibid., p. 254.

39 Lamotte trans., __Vimalakîrti__, p. 426.

his high state of realization. Vimalakīrti's abiding realization of Voidness places him far above all other Buddhist practitioners, for unlike the members of the Śrâvaka and Pratyekabuddha gotras (who only suppress obstacles associated with the passions), he authentically manifests the gotra of anuttara-samyak-saṃbodhi, in which the obstacle to perfect gnosis is also suppressed (jñeyâvaraṇa)[40].

In fact, when we examine the texts on the greatness of the Bodhisattva, there is no doubt that the intention is to present the Bodhisattva as a superior kind of Saint whose attainment far surpasses that of the "righteousness of the Arhats"; thus the Bodhisattva should be regarded as a superior field of merit for the faithful. In the Great Treatise on the Prajñâpâramitâ attributed to Nâgârjuna, the 'greatness' of the Bodhisattvas is discussed in terms of vastness, infinity, inconceivability, and the number of beings they vow to save.[41] One could easily multiply the superlative powers, aspirations, virtues, and qualities of the Bodhisattvas in this literature[42], making them

40 Ibid., pp. 410-412, citing the Bodhisattvabhûmi. The important question of gotra is presented in David Seyfort Ruegg, La Théorie du Tathâgatagarbha et du Gotra (Paris: Ecole Française d'Extrême-Orient, 1969); cf. pp. 425-6, Lamotte, Vimalakīrti.

41 MPP-Ś, p. 312. "The Bodhisattvas are called Mahâsattvas because they make the great vow; because they wish to accomplish a great work; because they wish to attain a great place." p. 315.

42 Ibid., pp. 1611, 1982ff. Cf. also Mahâyânasaṃgraha Chapter 4.

exceptionally worthy of cult and showing them to be authentic models of the way to arrive at the true goal of complete Enlightenment.

For example, the thought of a Bodhisattva is profitable to self and others: 1. because he saves all beings; 2. because he knows the true nature of all Dharmas; 3. because he travels the Path of supreme and perfect illumination; 4. because he is praised by all the âryas.[43]

One may be called a Bodhisattva not on the basis of striking manifestations of these powers, but from the first moment of the production of the thought of Bodhi (prathama-cittotpâda):

When, at the first moment the Thought arises,
He has made the vow to become Buddha,
He has gone beyond all universes,
And merits the worship (pûjâ) of men.[44]

One is a Bodhisattva from this point until the final obstacles of the path are eliminated (at the ninth abandonment, ânantarya), when he enters the meditative absorption of the diamond (vajrasamâdhi), which constitutes the tenth Bhûmi, the stage of a Buddha.

The Bodhisattva makes progress in the course of innumerable lifetimes, practicing the perfections (pâramitâ) in accordance with examples taken from the Jâtakas:

[43] MPP-Ś, p. 242. See folios 223-224, Mi la rnam thar, where Peta has doubts about her brother's dharma practice, since it seems neither to benefit himself or others.

[44] Ibid.

1. Giving, as shown by King Śibi, who fed his own flesh to a falcon.

2. Morality, shown by King Sutasoma, who was true to his word.

3. Forbearance, shown by Bhikṣu Kṣânti, when a king unjustly cut off his limbs.

4. Energy, represented by Mahâtyâgavat, who dried up the ocean.

5. Ecstasy, comparable to that of the Ṛṣi Śankhâcârya, who sat in contemplative absorption while a bird hatched eggs on his head.

6. Wisdom, like that of the minister Govinda, who was able to divide up India into seven parts.[45]

Roughly corresponding to these perfections are the Ten Bhûmis, which are repeated in the rnam thar of Vajradhara. Har Dayal has observed that there is a development in the systematic correlations between the Bhûmis and the Pâramitâs from the early texts of the Mahâyâna to such later works as the Daśabhâmika Sûtra. "The old scheme [of six based on the three śikṣas of śîla, citta, and prajñâ] was recast and expanded in order to secure the symmetrical parallelism of the ten perfections and the ten stages."[46] The scheme of

[45] Ibid., p. 255. Note the influence of `hagiographical' typology here.
We find ten perfections in Vimalakîrti: giving, morality, forebearance, striving, ecstasy, wisdom, skill-in-means, vow, fortitude, and knowledge. (p. 99, Lamotte trans.)

[46] Har Dayal. The Bodhisattva Doctrine in Buddhist Sanskrit Literature. (New York: Samuel Weiser, 1978), p. 287. Dayal claims that the scheme of ten stages reflects Indian

Bhûmis underwent further development in later centuries and is given further attention in the notes to the *rnam thar* of Vajradhara, below.

The question of whether a Bodhisattva is capable of regression gave rise to a debate that is somewhat similar to the debate over the Arhat's impeccability. "There are two kinds of Bodhisattva," the *Great Treatise on the Perfection of Wisdom* tells us, "those who may regress and those who will not (*vaivartika*/*avaivartika*), as is the case for the Arhats who are liable to fall or not (*parihâṇadharman*/*aparihâṇadharman*)"[47]. This line of argument provided the basis for complex and elegant correlations between the attainments of Arhats and of Bodhisattvas, all very much with a concern to affirm the holiness of both, but the superiority of the latter.

The Bodhisattvas without capability of regression are called the true Bodhisattva, worthy of all the honors and ideal in terms of realization; the others, those who may regress, are called `Bodhisattvas by extension' just as those members of the Saṃgha who are vowed to the monastic life, but have not as yet entered the Four Paths (*caturvidha mârga*), are called the Saṃgha `by extension.'[48] The Great

acceptance of a decimal system some time in the third or fourth centuries A.D. See pp. 167, 270-273. Dayal's account of the stages is so widely accepted that there is no need to tabulate his findings here. See pp. 273ff.

[47] MPP-Ś, pp. 243-245; cf. ADK VI, p. 253.

[48] Ibid. cf. ADK VI, pp. 277-278.

Treatise goes on to describe the interior attainments by which a true Bodhisattva may be recognized, based on Chapter 17 of the Perfection of Wisdom in Eight Thousand Lines:

> 1. If the Bodhisattva practices or meditates only one Dharma, he is called a non-regressing Bodhisattva. What is this single Dharma? It is the constant and resolute accumulation of good Dharmas (kuśala-dharma-samuccaya). It is said that it is in resolutely accumulating the good Dharmas that the Buddhas obtained supreme and perfect illumination.
>
> 2. Moreover, the Bodhisattva who possesses one unique Dharma is non-regressing. What is this unique Dharma? It is right striving (vīrya). Thus did the Buddha ask of Ananda: "Ānanda, do you speak of striving?" "Yes, Lord." "Ānanda, do you praise striving?" Yes, Sugata!" "Ānanda, one must constantly practice, exert, and call to mind Striving until one leads men to obtain the supreme and perfect illumination."
>
> 3. Moreover, the Bodhisattva who possesses two Dharmas[49] is non-regressing. What are these two Dharmas? The knowledge that all the Dharmas are void (śūnya) and never to abandon beings. The man who acts thus is a non-regressing Bodhisattva.
>
> 4. Finally, the Bodhisattva who possesses three Dharmas is non-regressing:
>
> i. He has resolutely (ekacittena) made the vow (praṇidhâna) to become a Buddha, and this resolution is unshakable (acala) and unbreakable (aheya) like diamond.
>
> ii. His compassion (karuṇâcitta) for all beings penetrates his bones and marrow.

[49] These `Two Dharmas' are explained by Āryadeva in the Catuḥśataka XII, 23, v. 298 in relation to trikâya theory. Non-harming (or, non-abandonment of beings) gives rise to the two Form Bodies; realization of Voidness gives rise to the Dharma-kâya. See Buddhist Insight: Essays by Alex Wayman, edited by George Elder (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1984), p. 312.

iii. He has obtained the contemplative absorption of wisdom (prajñāsamādhi) and sees all the Buddhas of the present (pratyutpanna).[50]

The persistence of these categories into the tantric period is attested in many ways, but a particularly vivid example is found at the end of the biography of Milarepa in the Blue Annals:

> It is said, that some followers had once inquired from Ma-gcig Za-ma, herself a manifestation of Târâ, whether Mid-la had attained Buddhahood or not, and that she had answered them that "since his perseverance was greater than that of others, he surely should be considered to be a Buddha.[51]

Put most simply, from the perspective of the Prajñāpâramitā sūtras, irreversibility consists essentially in knowing that the dharmas are non-arising[52]. This is the inner realization that makes the Bodhisattva a Saint from the point of view of inner attainment.

Critique and Correlation of Arhat and Bodhisattva in the Mahāyāna Literature

In his recent book, Buddhist Images of Human Perfection, Nathan Katz makes a convincing case for continuity in Buddhist presentations of the ideal person or

50 MPP-Ś, p. 1803. Cf. ADK VI, p. 253, on non-regressing Arhats. Cf. also the 'Seven Grandeurs of the Mahāyāna' in the Mahāyānasūtrālaṃkara, XIX #59-60.

51 George N. Roerich, trans. The Blue Annals, second edition. (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1976), p. 436. (emphasis added.)

52 MPP-Ś, p. vi, Introduction.

Saint. Sainted Bodhisattvas, he argues, share spiritual dignity with the Arhat. He claims that Mahâyâna criticism of the Arhat is not directed against the ideal articulated in the Sûtras, rather it is the false Arhat, or rather the false ideal based on the fixations of the so-called Śrâvakas, that is attacked.[53] I would be inclined to argue in favor of a continuity of central themes from Early Buddhism into the Mahâyâna, as we have seen above in such works as the Great Treatise and Vimalakîrti. But perhaps it would be more accurate to concur with Dayal[54] that the Bodhisattva of Mahâyâna sûtras, whatever characteristics of the ârya-pudgala he retains, is something more than an Arhat; the Bodhisattva is a distinctly different ideal and a different type of Saint. The Mahâyâna insisted on this for a long time![55] A distinctive shift has occured in the description of sanctity, that which the Buddhist attainer attains. A shift in the attitude of the cult has occured: a Buddhist attainer may be worshipped not only as an act of piety productive of merit, but the merit of the Bodhisattva-saint may be transferred to the worshipper. The Bodhisattva may even intervene to 'save' the worshipper miraculously from perils.[56]

[53] Nathan Katz, Buddhist Images of Human Perfection, (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1982).

[54] Op. cit., p. 4.

[55] Ibid., p. 9.

[56] See Alex Wayman, "Buddha as Savior", Studia Missionalia 29 (1980): 191-207; and: Edward Conze, Thirty Years of Buddhist Studies: Selected Essays (Oxford: Bruno Cassirer,

Continuing the argument about the unconcern of the Bodhisattva in the face of dualistic evaluations of purity and impurity, Vimalakīrti distinguishes the domain of the Bodhisattva: "Not the domain of the ordinary individual and not the domain of the saint, such is the domain of the bodhisattva...Where one understands liberation, yet does not enter final and complete liberation, there is the domain of the bodhisattva."[57]

The Śrâvaka, following the path to Arhatship, is on a different spiritual course from the Bodhisattva, who is pursuing complete, unexcelled Enlightenment, the state of a Buddha. The two groups are listed separately in the Mahâyâna <u>sûtras</u>. The <u>Great Treatise</u> asserts:

> The Bodhisattvas are not mentioned separately in the Śrâvaka's <u>sûtras</u> because these are two paths (<u>mârga</u>): that of the Śrâvakas and that of the Bodhisattvas. Bodhisattvas are found among the other four groups and include both renunciates (<u>pravrajita</u>) and householders (<u>gṛhastha</u>).

Because:

> The Śrâvakayâna teaches the voidness of being (<u>sattva-śûnyatâ</u>); the Buddhayâna teaches both the voidness of being and of natures (<u>dharma-śûnyatâ</u>).[58]

1967), "Buddhist Saviours", pp. 33-47. See also below, our translation of the Milarepa <u>rnam thar</u>, in which devotion to the Guru rescues a disciple from the peril of wild beasts (folio 254); cf. David Templeman, trans., <u>The Origin of the Târâ Tantra</u> (Dharamsala: LTWA, 1981), passim.

57 Thurman trans., pp. 47-48.

58 MPŚ-S, pp. 238-239.

In fact, the Great Treatise was one of the first to establish a parallel between the Stages of the Bodhisattva and the acquisition of the Four Fruits of religious practice (śrâmanyaphala) by the âryapudgala.[59] Thus we find the Mahâyâna theorists wishing to establish points of contact between their system and that of Early Buddhism, always adding correctives to indicate departures and distinctions that show the Bodhisattva's moral and spiritual superiority over the Arhat. "The Bodhisattva is large and can include the Hînayâna within itself."[60]

A particularly striking example of both contact and divergence is presented in the Vimalakîrtinirdeśa. There is no doubt that the assembly of bhikṣus is great in its virtues:

> Of Bhikṣus, there were eight thousand, all saints. They were free from impurities and afflictions; all had attained self-mastery; their minds were entirely liberated by perfect knowledge; they were calm and dignified, like royal elephants; they had accomplished their work; done what they had to do; cast off their burdens; attained their goals; and totally destroyed the bonds of existence; they had all attained the utmost perfection of every form of mind control.[61]

But there is no doubt that the accompanying assembly of Bodhisattvas is greater:

> Of Bodhisattvas, there were 32,000, great spiritual heroes who were: universally acclaimed; they were dedicated through the penetrating activity of

[59] Ibid, Volume V, p. x; See Chapitre XX (2e Sèrie), La Mise en route pour le Mahâyâna, pp. 2373-2446.

[60] Ibid., p. 240.

[61] Thurman trans, p. 10.

> their great superknowledges; and were sustained by the grace of the Buddha; guardians of the city of Dharma, they upheld the true Doctrine; and their great teachings resounded like the lion's roar throughout the ten directions[62]; without having to be asked, they were the natural spiritual benefactors of all living beings[63]; they maintained unbroken the succession of the Three Jewels; conquering devils and foes; and overwhelming all critics; their mindfulness, intelligence, realization, meditation, incantation, and eloquence all were perfected; they were free of all obscurations and emotional involvements, living in liberation without impediment[64]; they were totally dedicated through the [ten] transcendences; they had attained the intuitive tolerance of the ultimate incomprehensibility of all things;...; they were expert in knowing the spiritual faculties of all living beings; ...they had gathered the great stores of merit and wisdom; and their bodies, beautiful without ornament, were adorned with all the auspicious signs and marks; ..exalted in fame and glory...; ...high resolve as hard as diamond...; ....their voices were perfect in diction and resonance....;...unequaled, they surpassed all measure; they were the best of captains for the voyage of discovery of the treasures of the Dharma,...; with their high resolve they approached the ten powers, the four fearlessnesses, and the eighteen special qualities of a Buddha; they had crossed the terrifying abyss of the bad migrations, and yet they assumed reincarnation voluntarily in all migrations for the sake of disciplining living beings;...they conferred great benefit when seen, heard, or even approached, etc.[65]

Perhaps one of the most telling difficulties of the Arhats in this <u>sûtra</u> is their inability to understand, which

[62] Clear reference to the importance of the teaching role for the way the Mahâyâna formulated the ideal of the Bodhisattva.

[63] A clear attribute of a `Saint'.

[64] See <u>rnam thar</u> of Milarepa, folios 217 (he is cleansed of defilements) and 231 (he overcomes emotional reaction to news of Marpa's death).

[65] Thurman trans., pp. 10-12. A similar set of comparisons between Arhat and Bodhisattva is given in MPP-Ś pp. 1884-1885, showing that the inner attainments of the latter surpass those of the former.

suggests that even Arhats have faults and impediments. An inability to perceive the purity of a Buddha-field indicates a lack in one's own degree of purity.[66]

Speaking always from the perspective of absolute truth[67], Vimalakīrti is able to dismay not only the Arhats, but even to confuse the Bodhisattva Maitreya on the sensitive matter of the irreversibility of the Bodhisattvas. "Therefore Maitreya, do not fool and delude these deities! No one abides in, or regresses from, enlightenment. Maitreya, you should introduce these deities to the repudiation of all discriminative constructions concerning enlightenment."[68]

Both Arhats and beginner Bodhisattvas must make further progress in order to rise to the lofty vision of Vimalakīrti. The Arhats have a serious deficiency that makes them less fortunate and slower in progressing than the beginner Bodhisattvas. "Having eliminated their personal suffering, they cannot easily empathize with other living beings and hence find it hard to be inspired with great compassion."[69] In fact, the theme of the inferiority and inadequacy of the path of the Arhats is the polemical thrust

[66] Thurman trans., p. 19. See also MPP-Ś pp. 1760ff for a presentation of the faults of the Arhats.

[67] Thurman trans., pp. 24f.

[68] Ibid., p. 35. Cf. Lamotte trans. p. 189, fn. 89. Could this be a subtle attack on Maitreya as the source of Asanga's <u>Five Treatises</u>?

[69] Thurman trans., p. 54.

of this work. However, the argument is much subtler than a merely dualistic polemic. Nirvâṇa is the pure Dharmakâya of the Tathâgata; that which realizes the Dharmakâya is the One Vehicle. In essence, there is no distinction between the thought of a Bodhisattva and of a Śrâvaka (Vim. VIII, 5); of Bodhi, no one approaches it, no one is apart from it (III,52); there is neither a good nor a bad path to Nirvâṇa (VIII, 30), nor any Vehicle to get there, because bodhi is already acquired by all beings and there is not a single being who has not already "attained" Parinirvâṇa (III, 51); since both are void, Saṃsâra and Nirvâṇa are identical (IV, 12; VIII, 13 & 29), and therefore it is in Saṃsâra that one must search for Nirvâṇa. It is not the Saint (ârya), determined to attain salvation (avakrânta-niyâma), and who has seen the Truths (dṛṣṭasatya) who can produce anuttara-samyak-saṃbodhi (VII,3), but rather the gotra of the sixty-two types of false views, passions and bad dharmas that is the true Tathâgata-gotra.[70] These ideas are foundational for the views expressed in the 'esoteric' portion of the rnam thar of Vajradhara.

Lamotte's edition of Vimalakîrti also cites the differing views among Mahâyâna theorists. For example, both the Great Treatise and the Mahâyânasûtrâlaṃkara seem to admit that all three yânas (śrâvaka, pratyekabuddha, and buddha) lead to Nirvâṇa.[71] Although the Mahâyânasaṃgraha

[70] Lamotte trans., pp. 429-430.

[71] Ibid., p. 427.

contrasts the *nirūpadhiśeṣa-nirvāṇa* of the Śrāvakas with the *apratiṣṭhita-nirvāṇa* of the Buddha, in the end "there is no difference among the *vimuktis* of the three vehicles."[72] Other Mahāyāna *sūtras* present a diametrically opposed view, asserting that the attainer of Arhat status still has a long way to go, and must eventually enter the Mahāyāna, the one truly efficacious Vehicle.[73] "To say that [the Arhats] have obtained Nirvāṇa - that is a salvific artifice on the part of the Buddha."[74] The same view is expressed in the sixth chapter of the *Saddharmapuṇḍarīka*. The most distinguished disciples of the Buddha, famed as Arhats, must now continue their spiritual development until they attain Buddhahood. Here the Sixth Bodhisattva Bhūmi is made the equivalent of the stage of an Arhat. In the eighth chapter, the Arhats are represented as confessing their faults in being content with an inferior degree and knowledge, and requesting assistance in progressing further.[75]

Various attempts to resolve the tension between arhatship and the Bodhisattva were made in the period after the appearance of the polemics of the *Saddharmapuṇḍarīka* and the *Vimalakīrtinirdeśa*. For example, in the *Sandhinirmocanasūtra*, those Śrāvakas who are receptive to

72 Ibid., p. 326; Cf. *La Somme du Grand Vèhicule d'Asaṅga*, E. Lamotte trans., (Louvain, 1938-39) pp. 256.

73 *Vimalakīrti*, Lamotte trans. p. 428.

74 Ibid.

75 *Encyclopedia of Buddhism*, Volume 2, s.v. Arahant, p. 46.

enlightenment in relation to the welfare of living beings are declared "Bodhisattvas by integration, because once released from the obstruction of the afflictions and if encouraged by the Buddha, his mind will be freed from the obstructions relating to all that should be known."[76] Snellgrove observes that it is the degree to which one is willing to undergo hardship and suffering for the sake of others that determines one's rank in the Mahâyâna perspective on supreme attainment. "Thus Milarepa's path, even though it included sin, because he readily embraced suffering for the sake of sentient beings and for the dharma, he was a superior being, a Buddha."[77]

More complex solutions to the correlation of stages of arhatship and stages of the Bodhisattva are given in the Abhidharmasamuccaya of Asaṅga and in the Vijñaptimatratâ-siddhi (attributed to Hsüan Tsang). For example, instead of classifying the âryapudgalas on the basis of a notion of 'fruit' (such persons arise as the result of previous practice coming to maturity and receiving its recompense), there is a classification based on domain (dhâtuprabheda), the kâma-realm, the rûpa-realm, and the arûpya-realm. The pṛthagjana, śaikṣa, and even the aśaikṣa (including the Pratyekabuddha) are all in the realm of desire; the Bodhisattva resides in the domains of desire and of form and

76 ITB, p. 110; Sandhinirmocana sûtra, pp. 73-4; 198.

77 Ibid., ITB p. 110.

the domain of the Tathâgata is inconceivable (*acintya*).[78] In the end, it proves misleading to equate stages on the Śrâvaka path to arhatship with precise *bhûmis* on the Bodhisattva path to Buddhahood. In the *Abhidharmasamuccaya*, Asaṅga shows that although Arhats have exceptional virtues and attainments, they do not measure up to the Bodhisattvas; in the end the Bodhisattva surpass even the Arhats in virtue, for they truly become Buddhas. Therefore, if one wishes to emulate the Buddha, one must practice the *pâramitâs*, gain merit thereby, and eventually awaken the thought of enlightenment so as to attain Buddhahood for the benefit of all sentient beings.

Asaṅga makes the following distinctions:

> Why does a Bodhisattva, who has entered the commitment of a Bodhisattva (*bodhisattvanyasavakranta*), not become a Stream-enterer? Because the Stream is imperfect with regard to the practice [of the Path]. Why doesn't he become a Once-returner? Because, having thought about it well, he has accepted an unlimited number of rebirths. Why doesn't he become a Never-Returner? Because after having sojourned in the Recollections (*dhyâna*), he takes birth again in the Domain of the Sense-Pleasures (*kâmadhâtu*). The Bodhisattva, having obtained the Truths by means of Comprehension (*abhisamaya*), cultivates the path counteracting the obstacles deriving from the Knowables (*jñeyâ-varaṇa-pratipakṣa-mârga*) by the method of the Path of mental cultivation (*bhâvanâ-mârga*) in the Ten Stages; but he does not cultivate the path counteracting the obstacles of the defilements (*kleśa-varaṇa-pratipakṣa-mârga*). Moreover, having arrived at Awakening (*bodhi*) he abandons at the same time the obstacles [posed by] the defilements and the obstacles [deriving from] the Knowables, and *he becomes an arhant, a Tathâgata*. Even though the Bodhisattva does

[78] *Le Compendium de la Super-Doctrine (Philosophie) (Abhidharmasamuccaya) d'Asaṅga*. Walpola Rahula, trans. (Paris: Ecole FranÇaise d'Extrême Orient, 1971), p. 145.

> not abandon all the defilements, he suppresses them as one suppresses poison by incantations and medicaments (mantrausadha), he does not give rise to any defilement or error, and he abandons the defilements in all the Stages like an arhant.[79]

For Asaṅga, although the distinctions between Arhat and Bodhisattva are maintained, there is no doubt that both are Saints, with the Bodhisattva possessing an `edge' because his generosity is the greater.

The Question of Cult

Our investigation of the ever-expanding claims for the Bodhisattva as a `great being' and as a locus of high spiritual attainment and salvific power leads directly to a consideration of the cult of the Bodhisattva. Is the Bodhisattva worthy of worship? In the early Buddhist tradition of the `ten persons worthy of cult,' it would seem that Bodhisattvas could be included among all but the first two categories (Buddha and Pratyekabuddha).

In the Great Treatise, the commentary observes that in the assembly, Arhats are placed above the Bodhisattvas because the latter have not destroyed all their passions as have the former.[80] It turns out that the absence of passion

[79] Ibid. p. 174. My emphasis and translation from French. For the Vijñaptimâtratâsiddhi, which builds some of its argument on this work of Asaṅga, see La Siddhi de Hiuan-Tsang, trans. Louis de La Vallée Poussin, Tome II. (Paris: Librairie Orientaliste Paul Geuthner, 1929), pp. 162-168. The Bhûmis and types of âryas are presented pp. 729-30.

[80] MPP-Ś, chapter VIII, p. 235; There is some doubt as to the purity of the Bodhisattvas because the Sûtra has to

is a disadvantage for the Arhats; Bodhisattvas, retaining some elements of passion are more available as compassionate saviors and helpers of others on the spiritual path. The wisdom of Bodhisattvas is very great, whereas that of the Arhats is relatively small.[81] The Treatise goes on to locate the Bodhisattvas of very high attainment (dharmakāya) among the viśuddhidevas along with the Buddha, Pratyekabuddhas, and Arhats. Thus we see one way the Mahāyāna included the superior Bodhisattvas among beings worthy of veneration, i.e. as 'fields of merit'.

However, since the cult of the Saints is a skillful means for drawing ordinary persons to the path, thus helping the faithful gain a right perspective on the path according to their capacities, right order demands a higher place in the assembly for the Arhats. "If [the Bodhisattvas] were placed above the Arhats, the gods and men would have been troubled by it and would have been seized by doubt."[82] It seems that the public image of the Arhat is more edifying, whereas the reality of the Bodhisattva is more salvific. Here we find the Bodhisattva esoterically taken as an equal of the Arhat (or even superior, since, as part of the Buddha-gotra, they belong immediately below the Buddha in the Assembly), but the Arhat is the Saint in the sense of

single them out for praise; not all beings "believe in their profound and pure qualities." p. 317.

81 Ibid. p. 235.

82 Ibid., pp. 235-6.

attracting public recognition, especially as a worthy field of merit. Thus the idea that the Bodhisattva 'includes' the whole of the Hînayâna within his greatness is very important for our understanding of the Bodhisattva as worthy of cult. A Bodhisattva might manifest the attributes of any of the _âryapudgala_ (as Mañjuśrî does in the _Śûramgamasamâdhi-sûtra_, taking on the traits of a Pratyekabuddha) to draw lesser beings onto the Path out of devotion to the apparent Saint. It is thus useful from a conventional point of view to maintain the due order of the Assembly, even though from the point of view of absolute truth, the Bodhisattvas are superior from the moment they produce the thought of enlightenment.[83]

We have observed with regard to the cult of the Arhat that worship is a form of generosity (_dâna_). In the _Abhidharmakośa_, generosity in any form earns abundant recompense. "From giving done to a _srotaâpannaphala-pratipannaka_ proceeds an incalculable recompense; from giving to a _srotaâpanna_ proceeds a recompense even more incalculable."[84] This is immediately followed by the observation that offerings made to father or mother, to a sick person, to a preacher, or to a Bodhisattva in his final birth (even though these might not be _âryas_) are also of incalculable recompense.

[83] At that moment he "has gone beyond all universes and merits the worship of men." Ibid., p. 242.

[84] ADK, IV, p. 240.

The Buddhist Saint is one of several possible fields of merit to whom offerings may beneficially be made. In the Mahâyâna, the Bodhisattva is seen in particular as a compassionate teacher and as a focal point of salvific power. As such, the Bodhisattva inherits the dignity of the mahâkalyânamitra who "gives the eye of wisdom to the multitudes blinded by ignorance; he proclaims that which is good and bad; he edifies the immaculate body of the Dharma; in a word he accomplishes all the work of a Buddha"[85] Snellgrove comments: "Clearly the tradition of great Bodhisattvas who preach, convert, and save with all the powers of a Buddha, is already established as one of the main distinguishing marks of Mahâyâna Buddhism."[86] On this basis the cult of the Bodhisattva took on other aspects. For the believers generally, Bodhisattvas whether celestial or terrestrial were objects of devotion. For those who would aspire to follow the career of the Bodhisattva themselves, however, there were the great treasuries of sûtra and śâstra for guidance.[87]

One of the great representatives of the later Mâdhyamika school in India was Śântideva, believed to have been a contemporary of Śântarakṣita and Kamalaśîla.[88] He

85 Ibid., verse 118. Cf. MPP-Ś Chapter XLVI, pp. 1931ff.

86 ITB, p. 60.

87 ITB, p.. 61, 63.

88 Amalia Pezzali. Śântideva e il Bodhicâryâvatâra. (Bologna: Editrice Missionaria Italiana, 1982).

discussed the problem of illusory and apparent cult, especially the cult of relics, in his Bodhicâryâvatâra. Śântideva was thoroughly favorable to the cult, for he combined a refined religious sensibility with a rigorous appropriation of critical philosophy. He made the following wish:

May they always meet with Buddhas,
And their sons the Bodhisattvas,
Then may these spiritual masters of the world
Be worshipped with endless clouds of offerings.[89]

Śântideva constructed a hypothetical debate between a Mâdhyamika and a Cittamâtrin on the cult of relics to give a rational defense of his conviction that worship has value for the Buddhist practitioner, albeit only on the level of conventional truth.

> ...How could the Buddha act for the benefit of others? ...Wish-fulfilling trees and wish granting gems, although they have no conceptual motivations, completely fulfil hopes because of their own power and the merits accumulated by people. Likewise, through the force of both the purity of the disciples' minds and the prayers a Buddha makes to work for their welfare while he is a Bodhisattva, the physical body of a Conqueror appears and benefit is forthcoming.. ...the reliquary of a Conqueror's body is formed in accordance with his actions and prayers while he was a Bodhisattva. Although the Bodhisattva has now passed beyond sorrow into the non-abiding Nirvâṇa, and his conceptual desire to accomplish the welfare of others

[89] Skt.: buddha-buddha-sutair-nityam labhantâ te samâgamam/ pûjâ meghair-anantaiśca pûjayantu jagad-gurum// Tib.: de dag rtag tu sangs rgyas dang/ sangs rgyas sras dang phrad gyur cig/ mchod pa'i sprin ni mtha' yas pas/ 'gro ba'i bla ma mchod pa shog// S. Batchelor, trans. A Guide to the Bodhisattva's Way of Life (Dharamsala: LTWA, 1979), p. 171.

> has ceased, he still accomplishes all that is of benefit for them...the merits from worshipping a Buddha while he is alive and from worshipping his relics when he has passed beyond sorrow are exactly the same.[90]

Thus, in a conventional sense, a holy person has the power to leave something behind that remains in the relatively real world as a pointer to the way beyond sorrow. Like the Buddha-kâyas themselves, this `something' is the result of votary intentions set in motion during the practice of the Bodhisattva's paths and stages. The purpose of activities such as worship is to reduce the notion of self-importance and attachment which enhance the illusions that give rise to suffering. Some practices in this apparent world are clearly more advantageous for attaining Enlightenment than are others, equally apparent. The Buddhas thus make use of the apparencies of cyclic existence to lead beings to Nirvâṇa; since they are Buddhas, they are omniscient and know which apparencies are useful and which are harmful. "If a Body (the Nirmâṇakâya) has neither bones nor blood, How can relics be found? But in order to benefit living beings, He leaves relics as a mere device."[91] Thus the cult of relics is in tension with the tradition of philosophical rigor, but the tension is a creative one and brings compassion into intellectual focus. The Saint and his relics are not for their own sake; they are devices or

90 Ibid., p. 133.

91 ITB, p. 37.

methods by which beings are led to the truth by religious means.

The historical record shows that in spite of the theoretical debate, the cult of the relics of former Buddhas, of Śâkyamuni, and of early Buddhist Saints enshrined in <u>stûpas</u> existed from before the Emperor Aśoka. Statues of Bodhisattvas existed in the first century B.C.[92] at Mathurâ and in Gandhâra. At Swat, a relic casket can be dated to 100 B.C. At Taxila, a silver scroll refers to a 'Bodhisattva chapel'[93]. The cult of Avalokiteśvara was already redolent with the extravagant claims of merit-producing efficacy by the late second century A.D., when texts referring to devotion to him and other celestial Bodhisattvas were translated into Chinese: "One act of reverence to Avalokiteśvara can produce merit equal to acts of reverence and gifts to all the Buddhas..."[94] By 286 A.D., Avalokiteśvara was found as a source of saving power in the earlier strata of the <u>Saddharmapuṇḍarîka</u>; his deeds already took the form found in the later cult of Târâ.

The concept of the transfer of merit from a Bodhisattva to a devotee gained favor in this early Mahâyâna period, even though in early Buddhism this was thought to be

92 Arthur L. Basham, "The Evolution of the Concept of the Bodhisattva", op. cit., p. 28.

93 Ibid. p. 29.

94 Ibid. p. 31.

impossible.[95] The use of the term pûjâ seems to suggest, if not of full-blown liturgical cult, at least some form of ritual and prayer involving an act of reverence toward an image or symbol.

In the reign of Kaniṣka (the Kuṣâṇa king at Puruṣapura and Mathurâ, ca. 100 A.D.), there is evidence of cult in the form of an inscription commemorating the efforts of the Monk Bala who set up statues of a Bodhisattva and of a ritual umbrella at Sarnath and Śrâvastî; at Kosambî a nun named Buddhamitrâ did the same, and she is named as an associate of Bala in her propogation of the cult. These two were perhaps promoters of a new devotional movement. They were able to collect large sums of money, they paid for and supervised the carving of the statues in the workshops of Mathurâ, and then accompanied them in bullock carts to their destinations further East.[96]

These religieux of Mathurâ were the spiritual ancestors of the great Hsüan Tsang[97] who was devoted to Maitreya and of Fa-hsien, devoted to Kwan Yin; of Asaṅga and Śântideva, and of the following devotees who, much later, set up or ornamented the stûpas of Nepal:

-wax umbrellas as votive offerings at Swayambunath .

-repair of caityas at Yotalivi and Santighata.

95 Ibid. pp. 32-37.

96 Ibid., pp. 29-30.

97 Ibid. p. 56, fn. 35.

-A ms. of the sermons of Bodhisattva Avalokiteśvara written for the welfare of deceased parents, teachers, and all sentient beings.

-A Malla-era painting of the Eighty-Four Siddhas with Vajradhara, as an offering for deceased relatives and teachers, which suggests the continuity between devotion to Bodhisattvas and Mahâsiddhas.

-Oil lamps offered to Akṣobhya Buddha.

-Offerings to Mañjuśrî.[98]

The cult in this form passed into Tibet and in the Blue Annals there are numerous references to cultic acts of devotion to the various lineage founders. In particular, relics are recovered from the ashes at the time of cremation. The sons of Marpa even sold and gambled away parts of his flesh until rNgog managed to acquire all of them to build the Great Sepulchre (gDung khang chen mo)[99]. The relics of Bya khang pa, enshrined in a small chapel at Thurla brought peace to the neighborhood.[100] A stûpa of Mahâbodhi was found among the relics after the cremation of a 'Bri khung pa master in 1267 A.D.[101] Images of Saṃvara, Hayagrîva, Târâ, Avalokiteśvara, and others were found in

98 Hemaraj Sakya and T. R. Vaidya, eds., Medieval Nepal (Colophons and Inscriptions), (Kathmandu: T. R. Vaidya, Publr., 1970), pp. xiii, xix, xxi, colophon p. 5 #3; colophon 16, pp. 32f; p. 175f, #48; #63.

99 BA, pp. 406-407.

100 BA, p. 419.

101 BA, p. 580.

the cremation ashes of 'Gro mgon 'Phags pa in 1280.[102] Milarepa is said not to have left any relics at all, and this gave rise to a great variety of Parinirvāṇa tales in the several versions of his biography.

A vast area that we will have to set aside for the purposes of this study is that of the artistic record: images and their veneration.[103] These cult-objects constitute, along with the aniconic stûpa, the supports (Tib.: rten) for devotional and liturgical practice. The body, speech, and mind of the worshipper are thus fully engaged in the process of spiritual transformation. Just as the Dharmakāya is the `support' of the Saṃbhogakāya, and the Saṃbhogakāya of the Nirmāṇakāya, so the ritual applications of body, speech, and mind, give rise to the Buddha-kāyas. This brings us to the ritual context of the tantras.

102 BA p. 581.

103 See ITB, pp. 47-57, "The Buddha Image".

Part I

Chapter 3: The Saint in the Buddhist Tantras

The tantric form of Buddhism emerged like the ear of wheat from within the folds of the Mahâyâna blade, partially participating in its language, philosophy, and ideals, and partially giving rise to a completely new approach to Buddhist practice. A new type of Saint[1], the Siddha, arose as a new manifestation of the ideal of the Bodhisattva. The Siddhas seem to have represented at least one way of bridging the widening gap between the scholastic tradition of the Indian Mahâyâna and the Buddhism (always tinged with folk religion and Hinduism) of the lay followers. Tantrism, the general term for the new practices, itself seems to have been a phenomenon that embraced both the margins and the

[1] In presenting the Siddha as a `new' type of Saint, we have in mind the reaction of the Bodhisattvas in the _Guhyasamâja tantra_ to the Buddha's assertion that "emancipation through the tantric path...is possible of attainment for all men howsoever vicious, cruel, or immoral they may be...When he had just finished his speech there was great indignation amongst the Bodhisattvas and volleys of protest...`Why, O Lord, ...are you taking recourse to these sinful utterances ...? The Lord expressed great surprise and said `O Kulaputras, do not speak thus. The conduct I have preached is known as the Bodhi conduct which is _dharmatâ_, and pure, and is considered as such by the Buddhas who have realized the true essence (_sârajñâna_)...' Immediately [as] these words were uttered, all the Bodhisattvas in the Assembly became frightened, confused and fell down senseless." Benoytosh Bhattacharyya, ed. _Guhyasamâja Tantra_ (Baroda: Oriental Institute, 1931) pp. xxii-xxiii The editor notes a tone of dissatisfaction with early Buddhism and the Mahâyâna; "they [Buddhists] wanted a method by which Nirvâṇa could be attained even in one life or even earlier; in short, a magical formula to obtain the final liberation." (p. xiv)

center throughout the religious evolution of India. The tantras include that which is most ancient (even pre-Aryan), and that which is most recent (bhakti, Shaivism, Vaiṣṇava reform movements, popular saints, folk tales and songs, and even Sufism and Sikhism). Just as in the Vedas we find vivid, colorful descriptions of gods and goddesses and a great concern with fertility and magic, so too in the tantras[2], we find an assimilation of the forms of a fertility cult with the transcendent goal postulated in the Upanisads, in all forms of Buddhism, and in the traditions of yoga and Hindu theology, i.e. mokṣa[3]. In Buddhism, tantrism is called the `quick path' for obtaining Buddhahood `in one body, in one lifetime', and seems to reflect some frustration with the seemingly interminable scholastic formulations of the gradual path of Bodhisattva bhūmis and the practice of the six pâramitâs. Tantrism seeks to cut the Gordian knot of theoretical paths to the Absolute by means that can be called radically homeopathic: the poison associated with the disease, in wisely administered doses effects the cure[4]. So desire, ignorance, and wrath are

[2] N. N. Bhattacharyya. History of the Tantric Religion (New Delhi: Manohar, 1982); Chapter 5 (pp. 158-214) "Tantrism and the Earlier Forms of Indian Religious Systems"; Chapter 8 (pp. 276-314) "Tantrism and the Religion of the Masses: The Lokâyata tradition".

[3] On moksa as a religious and philosophical goal, see Karl H. Potter, Encyclopedia of Indian Philosophies: Indian Metaphysics and Epistemology: The Tradition of Nyâya-Vaiśesika up to Gangeṣa. (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1977), pp.23-35.

[4] Hevajra Tantra II.ii.46 "With the very poison, a little of which would kill any other being, a man who understands

employed in the process of transmuting the body, mind, and speech of an ordinary person into the body, speech, and mind of a Buddha[5]. This is the message, in brief, of the life of Milarepa, which we have chosen as paradigmatic of this ideal, and which will be discussed further in the course of this study.

Snellgrove explains the distinctiveness of the tantric, or vajra-yâna, form of Buddhism in relation to its Mahâyâna roots:

> ...it is with the adoption of the term vajra (adamantine) for the absolute state, ...that tantric Buddhism becomes a separate 'way' (yâna), as distinguishable from the Mahâyâna as this is distinguishable from the so-called Hînayâna...for both the goal...and certainly the means employed to reach it are no longer the same. The followers of the Mahâyâna had advanced from the earlier goal of nirvana as achieved by an Arhat to the goal of enlightenment as achieved by a Buddha. The followers of the Vajrayâna in their turn direct their energies toward a state of enlightenment (for this term is still used) which is also referred to as Great Bliss (mahâsukha) and as the sphere of Vajrasattva (adamantine being), while those who achieve it are known as 'great adepts' (mahâsiddha)... The differences between the Vajrayâna and the earlier forms of Buddhism are extreme. The main difference derives from the Vajrayâna use of incantation and ritual as means toward the ultimate

poison would dispel another poison...." and .51 "By passion the world is bound, by passion too it is released, but by the heretical buddhists this practice of reversals is not known." D. L. Snellgrove, ed. and trans. The Hevajra Tantra: A Critical Study. (London: Oxford University Press, 1959), p. 93. This text will be abbreviated as HVT.

5 F. D. Lessing and A. Wayman. Introduction to the Buddhist Tantric Systems [Translated from Mkhas Grub rje's rgyud sde spyi'i rnam par gzhag pa rgyas par brjod] (New York: Samuel Weiser, Inc., 1980), p. 221 and fn. 14.

> goal, whereas in the earlier phases of Buddhism their use was largely peripheral.[6]

These rituals are described as the most potent means to attaining one's goal in a single lifetime. Someone like Milarepa who had devoted a considerable portion of his life to the practice of destructive magic absolutely required such a path, for without it he would have fallen immediately into one of the hells at the moment of death.

With reference to the quick path, Alex Wayman writes:

> Tantrism is also a quick path in the sense that it claims to show the way to Complete Buddhahood in one life in contrast to the old 'three incalculable aeons.' The theory here is that when one affiliates with the three 'secrets' of the Buddha, namely his Body, Speech, and Mind, by way of gestures (_mudrâ_), incantations (_mantra_), and concentration (_samâdhi_), then the principal avenues of man are free from cross-purpose and mutual cancellation, and so the entire being is lent to the purpose of achieving the goal of enlightenment, if this supreme goal, rather than a mundane fruit of occult powers, is the one aimed at.[7]

The mundane and supramundane fruits are, to some extent, a description of the tantric Saint. The supreme _siddhi_ is the enlightenment of a Buddha, expressed in various ways (Dharmakâya; Vajradhara; The Sixth Buddha; The Thirteenth Bhûmi; Mahâmudrâ; etc.) in the tantric lineages.

[6] ITB pp. 129-130.

[7] Alex Wayman, "Buddhism" _Historia Religionem_ II, (Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1971), p. 443. Prof. Wayman summarizes the ritual context of the path: "One must find a capable guru, called the 'diamond master' (_vajrâcârya_), serve him with suitable presents, and petition to be conferred the initiations (_abhiṣekha_) which mature the stream of consciousness along with taking of vows. Through the worship of the deity (_devapûjâ_) and worship of the guru (_gurupûjâ_), the mundane and supramundane fruits are made possible."(ibid.)

For example, the two terms Mahâmudrâ and rdzogs chen (Skt: mahâ-âti) are considered synonyms[8]. The definition of Mahâmudrâ in the great work of Takpo Tashi Namgyal comes from a verse of Dignâga: "Subject and object, duality and non-duality, Self and others, as well as saṃsâra and nirvâṇa- All these are discriminations. Abandon them and let the mind settle in a tranquil equipoise"[9]. This state of Mahâmudrâ is called "its [the mind's] natural, relaxed state" [10]; the author, representing the culmination of four centuries of bKa' brgyud practice, cites both the Guhyasamâja : "In elevating the mind to a non-discriminating state, One should not indulge in thought," and the Dohâ: "By completely abandoning thought and the object of thought; One should let the mind settle in the natural state of an infant...Whenever someone has quieted the mind in an undistracted state, Then he will gain liberation from the conditions of saṃsâra."[11]

This state of mind, it would seem, is the ineffable non-objectifiable, irreducible reality that is prior to and

[8] This view is presented in The Great Seal of Voidness by the First Panchen lama in Four Essential Buddhist Texts (Dharamsala: LTWA, 1982), p. 69.

[9] Takpo Tashi Namgyal, Mahâmudrâ, pp. 152-3.

[10] Ibid, p. 157.

[11] Ibid. pp. 157, 158-159. See also, H. A. Jäschke, A Tibetan English Dictionary (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1980), p. 207: rgya mtsho che la dpa long la kha gting med pa'i sgom cig gyis: "Resembling the ocean, be so lost in contemplation that you do not know any longer a difference between surface and bottom," - citing the works of Milarepa.

at the same time all-pervasive of all thought and being. It is not a thing, and we use the word `reality' only to avoid the term `state' which suggests too much a fixed, differentiated thing.

These are the so-called mahâsiddhis: the two supreme siddhis, also called arthas[12] are the same as for non-Tantric Mahâyâna Buddhism: 1. complete enlightenment for oneself; 2. helping others to Nirvâṇa.

The terminology of the tantras for the mundane siddhis is complex, since there are varying lists of eight mundane siddhis and even a three-fold categorization of siddhis, to match the three-fold division of candidates on the basis of superior, middling, and inferior capacity [13]. These are summarized in mKhas grub rje's Fundamentals of the Buddhist Tantra.

They are: 1. khaḍga, ral gri: to be invincible with the sword (in battle); 2. añjana, mig rtsi: to remove blindness, an ointment for the eyes which, when applied, enables one to see all the devas and nagas. 3. pâdâlepa, rkang pa'i 'yug pa: to be swift of foot, or the foot ointment enabling one to be so. 4. antardhâna, mi snang bar 'gyur ba: to be invisible. 5. rasarasâyana, bcud kyis len: to have the elixir of youth. 6. khecara, mkha' spyod: to walk in the sky. 7. bhûcara, zhing skyong [sic for zhing spyod]: to shape into a ball, i.e. to shape any

[12] Ibid., p. 216.

[13] Lessing and Wayman, pp. 200-201.

of the nine kinds of flesh...into the size of a thumb; and to shape any of the 'ambrosias' into the size of a barley grain.' Presumably this refers to the Upaniṣadic idea of the thumb-sized reality in the heart, also interpreted as a liṅgam, i.e. a contemplative state within the heart cakra. The barley grain may refer to the creation of sacred pills.
8. pâtâlasiddhi, sa 'og grub pa. To have dominion over the entities of the underworld.[14]

Thus we have both mundane and supramundane siddhis as a result of tantric practice, defining the inner realization of the Siddha, and setting up expectations with regard to his outward behavior. The new element in tantric practice is the idea that sanctity is the result of psychologically potent ritual activity which, according to the songs and biographies of the Mahâsiddhas, produces a most unconventional type of Saint. Snellgrove comments: "All tantras claim the power to coerce divinities, for it is by coercing them into an image or symbol that one is enabled to worship them and make them suitable offerings, and it is by coercing them into oneself that one is enabled to act with their assumed assurance (or literally, pride...) and thus achieve the objective in view..."[15]

In terms of a theoretical basis, the tantras accept the Prajñâpâramitâ teaching that Saṃsâra is not other than

[14] Lessing and Wayman, fn. 13, p. 220 (with reference to the Sâdhana-mâlâ, vol II, no. 172, p. 350, Abhayâkaragupta's Kurukullâsâdhana. Tib. trans., Toh. 3209).

[15] ITB, p. 235 and p. 130.

Nirvāṇa[16]. The doctrine of the two truths (*saṃvṛtti-satya* and *paramārtha-satya*) is also accepted. They also work with the Yogâcâra teaching on the fundamental importance of mind in the growth of a being towards enlightenment.[17] This is in fact the basis of 'skill in salvific means' (*upâya*), for it is the mind that, illuminated, perceives Saṃsâra as Nirvâṇa; this transformed perception is itself enlightenment. In continuity with the Bodhisattva vow of the renunciation of entry into Nirvâṇa there is the practice of universal supreme compassion (*mahâkaruṇâ*) in a plethora of forms characteristic of the inventiveness of the tantras. Wisdom (or insight, *prajñâ*) arises when Saṃsâra is seen as Nirvâṇa; compassion (understood to be identical with skill in salvific means) requires imaginative and disciplined self-giving for the benefit of sentient beings[18].

In order to attain the highly subtle and evolved state of mind and to possess it as a deeply personal reality that can be lived, enacted, and transmitted to others as the equal taste (*sama-rasa*) of Saṃsâra and Nirvâṇa, one must develop both calmness of mind (*śamathâ*) and discerning insight (*vipaśyanâ*), both of which are fundamental practices

[16] Snellgrove, HVT, p. 20.

[17] Per Kvaerne. *An Anthology of Buddhist Tantric Songs: A Study of the Caryâgîti* (Bangkok: White Orchid Press, 1986), p. 32.

[18] Tib. phrase often repeated in the *rnam thars*: *'gro ba sems can thams cad pa'i don tshad med pa mdzad pa'i* - see folios 257-258, rGyal Thang pa *rnam thar* of Mila ras pa.

in all forms[19] of Buddhism. In meditation, one slowly begins to recognize the feeling-quality of this reality as one masters calmness and discerning insight. In calmness, one is no longer fascinated by the feeling-energy of various thoughts as they arise naturally in the mind. In discerning insight, one follows the arising of thoughts, by means of steady awareness, to the end of the trail and there one finds `no-thing'. Instead, there is clean, alert, undifferentiated space-like voidness. It is not `mind' (citta, sems), nor is it a `self' nor is it precisely a `cause' of the thoughts that seem to pour forth from an apparent focal point, since it is neither a cause nor a focal point. Whenever Mahâmudrâ is objectified as a focus or even a `space' or zone of attention, one loses the clean, alert, voidness that is quite unmistakable. It is also interesting that, maintaining this reality in the post-meditation activities of the day, conveys a tremendous energy and presence to whatever is being done, to the extent of creating the sense that a person who has realized Mahâmudrâ is the Buddha in person. In the rnam thar of Marpa by sGampopa, it is said that "Although the great translator seemed always to abide without meditating, he remained undisturbed, always in samâdhi. He realized the

[19] Among numerous works, one can recommend Nyanaponika Thera's modern classic: The Heart of Buddhist Meditation (York Beach, Maine: Samuel Weiser 1965); For the bKa' brgyud tradition, the fundamental manual combining vipaśyanâ and śamatha with tantra is Takpo Tashi Namgyal, Mahâmudrâ: The Quintessence of Mind and Meditation. Lobsang P. Lhalungpa, trans. (Boston and London: Shambhala, 1986).

true continuum of reality (dharmatâ)."[20] Takpo elucidates this idea by citing the Dharmasaṃgîti-sûtra:

> By altering the mind to tranquil equipoise, one will reach its intrinsic purity; through perfect perception of the inherent purity of reality, a bodhisattva practices in great compassion for the sake of all sentient beings.[21]

Here there is an attempt to reconcile the early Buddhist ideal of contemplative practice (specifically śamathâ) with the ideals of the Mahâyâna, in a context that is trying to show continuity between the tantric Siddha and the Bodhisattva of the sûtras. We will notice of the Siddhas that they radically pursue the goal of enlightenment by any means whatever and, like the first Arhats, like the singers of the Thera- and Therî gâthâs, they thereby attain the sought-for goal.

In the life of Milarepa, in fact, we find the criticism that his ascetic solitude is non-Mahâyânic; it seemed to his sister[22] to be too much like the Arhat path. But

[20] See also BA, p. 404 "He appears to have continuously meditated on the Ultimate Essence, but in the eyes of ordinary people, he reared a family, quarrelled with his countrymen, and only occupied himself with agriculture and building." sGampopa's text: khong lo tstsha ba chen po dus rtag tu mi bsgom pa ltar bzhugs kyang/ rtag tu ting nge 'dzin las ma yangs [yengs?] par bzhugs pas [pa] yin / chos ñid bden pa gzigs pa yin te/

[21] Takpo, p. 11.

[22] Lhalungpa trans., The Life of Milarepa, pp. 125; 135-136. See also, folios 223-224, rGyal Thang pa Mila rnam thar: "The dharma practice of others benefits self and others, but my brother's dharma practice makes trouble for himself and for me."

precisely by pursuing meditation to the end, one becomes able to help others as a true Bodhisattva, reaching both the attainment of an Arhat[23] and the complete enlightenment of a Tathâgata. As Mila sings in the gTsang smyon version of his biography: "If I could die in solitude, the aim of this yogin will be fulfilled...With no one to ask where I have gone, with no one to say that I am here,...in this solitary cave in the mountains, may this wish about the mendicant's death be fulfilled for the benefit of all beings, thus my aim will be realized."[24] Having achieved the stillness and flexibility that are the fruits of these practices[25], one may undertake the ritual practices that are distinctly and typically tantric.

The tradition teaches that there are four branches of the tantras (kriyâ, caryâ, yoga and anuttara-yoga, according to the systematization handed on from the Indian masters such as Abhayâkaragupta, Vâgisvarakîrti, etc. and summarized in mKhas grub rje) i.e., four categories by which the

[23] According to rGyal thang pa, this attainment was reached when his penances were complete, folio 215: "These things were done by the Saint Mila, relying on the great Lord Marpa Lho Brag pa when he became the receptacle of the oral instructions, having exhausted all obscurations (las sgrib thams cad zad nas)". In the Vijñaptimâtratâsiddhi (Louis de La Vallée Poussin, trans. and ed.), we find valuable discussions of the Yogâcâra doctrine on Arhats passing on to become Bodhisattvas (pp. 162-168, 601-601) and the concept of irreversibility at the eighth bhûmi. These ideas, which attempt to harmonize Arhat and Bodhisattva attainments from a Mahâyâna point of view, are the background for the stages of the path experienced by Milarepa.

[24] LM, p. 126. Cf. BA p. 436.

[25] Takpo, pp. 272-292.

tantric works can be classified principally on the basis of the types of ritual enacted in each for the benefit of the different categories of practitioner.[26] It should be kept in mind that, for the Mahâsiddhas and also for the bKa' brgyud pa, the most important tantras are the anuttarayoga tantras. It is these (Hevajra, Guhyasamâja, Mahâmâyâ, Cakrasamvara, etc.) that are mentioned in the rnam thars. Only in the rnam thar of Vajradhara is there a reference to the Vajraśekhara Tantra, considered to be an explanatory tantra of the Yoga Tantra class[27].

Snellgrove advances our knowledge in this field of the earlier phases of Buddhist tantra considerably:

> ...those ritual works known later as Action and Performance Tantras were originally the main ritual texts which formed part of Mahâyâna religious practice at a time when later tantras were unknown ... They provided the directions and the liturgies for the worship of the regular Mahâyâna divinities and they introduced the kind of consecration ceremony for a would-be Bodhisattva of the kind we have already illustrated. Both involve the practice of yoga. No tantric vow of any kind was involved for the straightforward reason that tantric practice, as later conceived, was still unknown in these conventional Mahâyâna circles. Thus the path toward perfection remained that of the Bodhisattva, that self-sacrificing being, who undertook to run his course through aeons of existence...[28]

26 See fn. 60 p. 52, David Templeman, ed. and trans. The Origin of the Târâ Tantra by Jo Nang Târanathâ (Dharamsala: LTWA, 1981), which confirms this idea and recommends Lessing and Wayman, p. 100, fn 1, and chapters 3-7).

27 ITB, p. 460

28 ITB, pp. 233-4. Ritual with a predominantly Mahâyâna character is to be found in the so-called Kriyâ and Caryâ tantras, which Snellgrove considers essentially identical, and only distinguishable in terms of late, artificial definitions. The Yoga tantras, such as the Tattvasamgraha

Snellgrove observes:

> It is sometimes suggested that while the tantras, later classified as inferior, cater for the more mundane requirements, the superior ones are concerned with more truly religious objectives. In fact all tantras are interested in precisely the same objectives, whether supramundane or mundane. It must be remembered that from the earliest times the acquisition of miraculous powers (Skt.: ṛddhi; Tib.: rdzu 'phrul) was closely associated with the realization of enlightenment...Thus neither in the supramundane nor in the mundane sphere do tantric masters offer much else that was not also believed to be within the reach of a successful Bodhisattva who continued to operate within conventional Mahâyâna limitations. The main difference was the time factor, for what took a Bodhisattva aeons of time to acquire might be won by a tantric yogin within the course of a single birth...[29]

The aim of tantric yoga necessarily includes both mundane and supramundane siddhis because the method itself involves: "...the self-identification of the practicing yogin with the divinity he is invoking and whose powers he then appropriates."[30] Thus, a tantric Saint is going to appear to be a human being, but is in fact a human being transformed into, or self-realized as, a deity, charac-

(Symposium of Truth)(see ITB p. 136), focus on the Vajra family of Buddhas, Bodhisattvas, and deities of the maṇḍala, and hence move the practitioner more securely into the Vajrayana mode of spiritual practice. [for citations see pp. 241 and p. 242-3]: "Thus it may be fairly stated that with the appearance of the Yoga tantras we have an effective Vajrayâna. Because of the presence of this 'adamantine element,' the consecrations received in the Vajradhâtu and related maṇḍalas have a different character ... from the very similar consecrations bestowed in the maṇḍalas of Action and Performance Tantras." (ITB p. 242)

29 ITB, pp. 235-6.

30 ITB, p. 165.

terized by the appropriation of human analogues of divine power.

As we consider the Siddha as an ideal person and Saint, we must recognize that for the Buddhism of the period A.D. 500-1200, it became less and less credible to take `the Bodhisattva vow' and then settle in to a life of relative ease, studying vast texts and commentaries in the safe haven of a vihâra, often falling into faults of self-indulgence. Even if some late Mahâyâna Saints such as Śântideva[31] inculcated genuine spirituality, it was the tantrikas who emphasized a sense of urgency in the quest for enlightenment. The Siddhas perhaps represent a return to actual intensive practice in the quest for enlightenment in reaction to the `settling in' so apparent in the mentality of Mahâyâna scholasticism.[32]. This in essence is the spirit that the bKa' brgyud pa transmitted to Tibet as the `practice lineage' (grub rgyud). Takpo Tashi Namgyal in

[31] Āchârya Shântideva. A Guide to the Bodhisattva's Way of Life. Stephen Batchelor, trans. (Dharamsala: LTWA, 1979), is surely a personal testimony to the greatness of its author.

[32] The biography of Śântideva in James B. Robinson, trans., Buddha's Lions: The Lives of the Eighty-Four Siddhas (Berkeley: Dharma Publishing, 1979), pp. 145-149 (`Bhusuku') is a good example of tantric Buddhist mockery of Mahâyâna monastic/scholastic Buddhism. A more serious version of the same critical attitude by a great bKa' brgyud pa scholar is found in Takpo, pp. 9-11 "The Deficiencies Arising from Not Meditating on the True Nature of Mind:" "A Buddhist who studies only the concept of the dharma by listening and investigating will achieve only a transitory benefit and will fail to realize the ultimate liberation."

fact cites numerous Mahâyâna texts criticizing teachers who fail to practice meditation.

> The Gandhavyuha sûtra states: `One cannot achieve realization merely by listening to the perfect teachings of Buddha...Like the physician who possesses all the medicine and dies of internal disease, so the dharma is ineffective unless meditated upon...' Furthermore, if one does not meditate, one's mind will succumb to defilement, causing it to fall into the lower realms. The Mañjuśrî-vikridita-sûtra states: If the nature of the mind is not realized, it is drawn toward imaginary thoughts, and is forced to wander in the three planes and six spheres of existence.[33]

Takpo Tashi Namgyal wishes to show that his lineage's Mahâmudrâ practice is the true heir to the best of the Mahâyâna: "The Dharmasaṃgîti-sûtra says: `By altering the mind to tranquil equipoise, one will reach its intrinsic purity, through perfect perception of the inherent purity of reality, a bodhisattva practices in great compassion for the sake of all sentient beings."[34]

The importance of yoga for the attainment of the ideal state of existence for a Buddhist is already present in early Buddhism. The term yogin refers to one undergoing the process of transformation toward sanctity; the Saint is the Attainer, whatever the path that is being followed. Snellgrove locates the appropriation of the term `yogin' for Buddhist practitioner in the Mahâyâna, although the term yogâcâra is found in early Buddhism. In his view, however,

[33] Ibid., p. 10.

[34] Ibid., p. 11.

the prevalence of the term yogin tends to characterize the Vajrayâna phase of Buddhism:

> It is not without significance that whereas the early Buddhist literature refers to serious practitioners as *bhikṣus* or Arhats and the Mahâyâna literature refers to them as Bodhisattvas, already in the later Mahâyâna literature the term yogin makes its appearance, and from now on is used ever more frequently, embracing, as it does, monks as well as laymen. We find it already in the *Ratnagotravibhâga*: 'Without beginning, middle, or end, indivisible, nondual, thrice liberated [from emotional disturbance, defective knowledge, faulty meditation] pure and non-discriminating, such is the self-nature of the dharma-sphere as yogins [*yoginâḥ*] see it, who are self-collectedly intent upon it.[35]

It is well known that Tibetan Buddhism is principally rooted in the traditions of Indian Buddhism.[36] Snellgrove's discussion of the influence of Central Asian Buddhism is also particularly helpful in that he clarifies the probable evolution of Bon, which he identifies not as an ancient 'animistic' or 'shamanistic' religion of Tibet, but as a form of heretical Buddhism inherited from Central Asia west of Tibet proper[37]. For our purposes, these respective

[35] ITB, p. 125. Jikido Takasaki, *A Study on the Ratnagotravibhâga* (*Uttaratantra*) (Roma: IsMEO, 1966), p. 325 translates *yoginâḥ* as 'saints', probably understanding the term as implying 'attainer'; cf. also the contrast between 'common people' and '*yogins*' in the ninth chapter of Sântideva's *A Guide to the Bodhisattva's Way of Life* (p. 126, LTWA edition).

[36] The question of Chinese influence is taken up in ITB, pp. 429-441; in P. Demiéville, *Le concile de Lhasa* (Paris: Institut des Hautes Études Chinoises. Vol. VII, 1952); in Giuseppe Tucci, *The Religions of Tibet* (University of California Press, 1980), pp. 12-15 and idem, *Minor Buddhist Texts: Parts One and Two* (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1986, reprint edition of IsMEO, 1956), pp. 313-464.

[37] ITB pp. 399-406; see also Per Kvaerne, *Tibet Bon Religion* (Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1985), pp. 3-6, which gives a brief

influences put us convincingly in the milieu of Marpa and Milarepa, both of whom are under the influence of the Indian Mahâsiddha traditions of the anuttarayoga tantras and make use of the magical practices of the Bon pos and the meditation practices of the rNing ma pas, at the time of the so-called "Second Diffusion" of Buddhism in Tibet.[38]

Snellgrove's account of the Buddhism of medieval India is particularly helpful in locating the early bKa' brgyud pa masters. Regarding the origins of Buddhist tantras of the anuttarayoga class, he writes:

> Between the eighth and the twelfth centuries certain Buddhists began to take a special interest in forms of `violent yoga' (haṭha yoga) which were then in vogue in eastern India . Thus they frequented the places of retreat where such practices could be learned. Most of these yogins, ... lived deliberately as `outcastes' from society, rejecting its conventions and norms. However, while they were not `Hindu' in any strict Brahmanical sense, they were inevitably affected by the whole religious environment of their upbringing. Thus those who met together as masters and pupils would certainly not be all operating at the level where all distinctions are merged into a `single flavor' and all divine forms are resolved into the person of the practicing yogin... If we seek to know what kind of worship was practised by these later yogins of eastern India or at least by their less advanced followers, the answer is clearly available in the relevant tantric

and nuanced account of the way the ancient sacrificial religion of Tibet (over which priests known as bon or gshen presided) blended with some form of central Asian Buddhism to produce a distinct religion within the Tibetan cultural matrix.

38 Milarepa's ancestor was a rNing ma pa practitioner: see rGyal Thang pa rnam thar, folio 196, and Lhalungpa's trans. of the gTsang smyon version, p. 13. The close ties between Bon po and rNing ma pa practitioners are apparent in all versions of the magical training of Milarepa. See Dan Martin, "The Early Education of Milarepa" in The Journal of the Tibet Society 2 (1982): 53-76.

> texts at our disposal. They worshipped a divinity in terrible form, whether male or female, identifiable in Hindu tradition as a fierce form of Śiva or of his spouse the Great Goddess (Devî) using a variety of names, such as were adopted by the Buddhist practitioners who were associated with these groups.[39]

The Vinaya of the Mûlasarvâstivâdin sect was handed on alongside the Mahâyâna _sûtras_ and _śâstras_ and the tantras during the long and painstaking process of translation that went on from the seventh to as late as the fifteenth century. Snellgrove presents evidence that this process was not seriously interrupted by the persecution of Glang dar ma in the ninth century.[40]

The songs of the Indian Siddha-gurus such as Padmasambhava, Saraha, Kâṇha, Nâropa, Maitrîpa, Tilopa, etc., were handed on to the Tibetans who not only translated the texts from the North Indian vernaculars, but also began to compose their own quite distinctive practice-songs (_caryâgîti_ and _vajra-gîti_), adapting the Indian form and content to their Himalayan setting in a peculiar imitation of the style of the Indian Siddhas.[41] By searching through the biographies of the Indian Siddhas and their Tibetan heirs, it should be possible to shed some light on the origins and development of the Vajrayâna in Tibet. The _dohâs_ are an indispensible element in the hagiographical accounts (_rnam thar_) of the Saints, _yogins_, and Gurus of

[39] ITB p. 157.

[40] ITB p. 464.

[41] Robin Kornman, "Hidden Literary Criticism in Tibetan Biographies", paper given at the MLA, December, 1986, pp. 4-7.

Tibet, and give us a vivid account of the way such masters taught and lived the doctrine they had received.

Just who were the Mahāsiddhas? Basically, we can concur with Snellgrove's description of Buddhists and Hindus in India whose practice seems to have focused on hatha yoga.[42] Their brief songs of yogic experience communicated the esoteric message of tantric practice to disciples while simultaneously `popularizing' the vocabulary and `wonders' of arcane realization.[43]

We know from such sources as the Hevajra Tantra that they could be found at the twenty four (or thirty two) famous pilgrimage sites associated with the Great Goddess and at the great cremation grounds[44]. Both Hindu and Buddhist tantric tradition speak of these eighty-four great adepts, with considerable variations among the lists of their names. James B. Robinson, the translator of a cycle

[42] The yoga associated with these tantras "includes haṭhayoga practices to control the vital breath and the subtle psychic energies of the psycho-organism; the central concepts employed in elucidating these practices are `psychic nerves' (nāḍī), energy flows (prāṇa), and seed essence (bodhicitta, bīja, bindu) These psycho-physical realities are defined, identified, and realised through visualization in certain fulfillment processes of meditation... [by those] who were reputed to have attained extraordinary powers by means of their rituals and psycho-somatic practices." Keith Dowman, Sky Dancer: The Secret Life and Songs of the Lady Yeshe Tsogyel (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1984), p. 231. See below, Chapter Six, for a discussion of these practices, especially utpattikrama and saṃpannakrama, in the bKa' brgyud pa.

[43] Per Kvaerne, An Anthology of Buddhist Tantric Songs, op. cit., chapters 3 and 4.

[44] HVT I,vii, pp. 69-70.

of their biographies into English observes that "The eighty four siddhas, in general, represent all those throughout the ages who have, within a single lifetime, attained direct realization of the Buddha's teachings. In particular these eighty four siddhas brought about the flowering of the Tantric tradition during the later period of Indian Buddhism."[45]

In the short biographies of the eighty four Mahâsiddhas that we find in the collection by Abhayadatta and in others that may be found in the Tibetan canon and in various editions[46], we already find those brief songs (Tucci calls them `initiatic lyrics') that are sung as part of the encounter of Guru and disciple. Keith Dowman defines these dohâs as "a genre of song sung by the Indian siddhas, the content of which is mahâmudrâ precepts or anuyoga instruction in twilight language." Lacking at this phase of its evolution a systematic and coherent structure, the Buddhist tantras tended to emphasize psychological and mystical experience. In Tucci's words:

> In Mantrayâna psychological experience, individual and inexpressible, had taken the upper hand. Mantrayâna is not dialectic but...it is founded on subjective intuitions and inner flashings, eluding any systematic arrangement. Hence, in it instead of organic and doctrinal expositions, we find a long series of commentaries on the chief tantras, or, as in

[45] Buddha's Lions, p. 2.

[46] Another translation of the text of the Caturaśîti-siddha-pravṛtti by Abhayadatta has been prepared by Keith Dowman: Masters of Mahâmudrâ (State University Press of New York. 1985).

> the case of the siddhas' schools, initiatic lyrics in which the mystic, with a terminology understandable only by his spiritual brethren, sings of his ecstasies and hints, in devious terms, at his laborious and blissful conquest.[47]

A good example of this is the biography or tale of Kaṅkana, one of the eighty-four great adepts. He was the king of a prosperous kingdom who was willing to accept the teachings of a wandering yogin on the insubstantial and impermanent nature of all things. "If there is a method of practicing the Dharma which does not force me to give up the things I like, then give it to me. If there is none, well, I cannot live by eating alms and wearing patched clothes," said the king. So the yogin, warning the king of the consequences of a non-renunciate life, gave him a sâdhana in the form of a dohâ by which the king could meditate on his shining arm-bracelet with an `unattached mind'; the gleam of the bracelet is to be taken as a disclosure of the joy of the Mind, which is `radiant like a jewel.' The king attained siddhi thereby in six months, and applied the same method to initiate his subjects; he sang: "The experience of the mind itself is king; Great Bliss is the kingdom. the integration of the two is the highest enjoyment..."[48] The tale brings out the importance of a propitious encounter with a Guru and the importance of spiritual practice in

[47] Giuseppe Tucci, Tibetan Painted Scrolls (Roma: 1949), p. 226.

[48] Buddha's Lions, pp. 114-116. Cf. Dowman, pp. 176-178.

attaining final realization, which is ultimately not other than a radically detached perception of ordinary reality.

The Siddhas were also known as miracle workers. Chandra Das gives a verse in which a girl is healed of smallpox:

"By the mantras recited by the siddha (grub thob)/ the smallpox was subdued// the pustules cleared up/ and the girl's body was clean (stong pa)",[49] with the sense that stong pa is a sort of pun for `voidness' as well as being `clean' of the disease; so too, by the wisdom of voidness, we are cured of the disease of wrong or defiled perception which binds us to the `body' of cyclic existence.

Dowman gives us a convincing portrait of the Siddha that shows his rapport with the public in an interplay of miracle and mystification:

> ...a siddha is a practioner of Tantra who is successful in attaining the goal of his meditation. This achievement is known as siddhi. Siddhi is two-fold: magical power (mundane) and the Buddha's enlightenment (ultimate). Thus siddha could be rendered `saint', `magus' `magician', `adept'; but these words are feeble, failing to evoke the originality of the siddhas' tantric life-style. For the uninitiated Indian the word siddha evokes magical power above all; if a yogin can walk through walls, fly in the sky, heal the sick, turn water into wine, or even levitate and read minds, he deserves the title siddha. If that same yogin has a crazy glint in his eye, smears himself with ashes, moves himself or others to tears with his song, calms street mongrels by his presence, tears a faithful woman from her family, wears a vajra- a symbol of immutability - in his yard-long hair-knot, eats from a skull bowl, talks with the

[49] Tibetan- English Dictionary, p. 552. grub thob kyi sngags gsang rnams sbal bas/ 'brum nad bcom gyis/ 'brum bu sel te bu mo'i/ lus stong ba byung ngo//

> birds, sleeps with lepers, upbraids demagogues for moral laxity, or performs with conviction any act contrary to convention while demonstrating a `higher' reality, then he is doubly a _siddha_...[50]

Each phase in the history of Buddhism has had its scholastic `aftermath.' José Pereira and the present writer have summarized the evolution of Buddhist systematics during the Abhidharma period in a recent article[51]. The Prajñâpâramitâ _sûtras_ gave rise to extensive systematic efforts, as for example in the _Mahâprajñâpâramitâśâstra_ attributed to (though later than) Nâgârjuna.[52] Effort to systematize the tantras began in such great centers of Buddhist studies as Nâlandâ and Vikramaśîla by such figures as Vâgîśvarakîrti, Abhayâkargupta, and others whose identities and achievements call for further study. This scholarly endeavor, more or less in tandem with systems of actual meditation practice, continued in Tibet and bore fruit in the writings of Padma dkar po (1527-1592) and Dwags-po Pan-chen Bkra-shis rnam rgyal (1512,3-1587), for the bKa' brgyud pa, and for the dGe lugs pa, the incomparable Tsong kha pa (1357-1419) in his _Great Exposition of Secret Mantra_[53].

50 _Masters of Mahâmudrâ_, pp. 4-5.

51 José Pereira and Francis Tiso, "The Evolution of Buddhist Systematics from the Buddha to Vasubandhu," _Philosophy East and West_ XXXVIII, No. 2 (April, 1988): 172-186.

52 Étienne Lamotte, trans. MPP-Ś.

53 See Tsong Ka Pa, _Tantra in Tibet: The Great Exposition of Secret Mantra_ Vol. I, Jeffrey Hopkins, trans. & ed. (London: George Allen & Unwin, 1977), pp. 8-9, for a brief introduction to systematic works on the tantras in Tibetan

However, one should keep in mind, particularly in a discussion of the bKa' brgyud pa path to sanctification, that the early Vajrayâna was a true `gnosis' in the sense that it sought to cultivate an inner experience of religious awareness quite distinct from types of noesis dependent primarily on the discipline of logic. The use of caryâgîtis, vajragîtis, and dohâs facilitated this `gnostic' process of initiation and celebration of inner experience.[54] In fact, the much-debated topic of twilight language (saṃdhâ-bhâṣâ, `bhâṣâ in the manner of saṃdhi'[55]) is perhaps best understood as primarily as a poetic process, an aesthetic approach to religious experience, and only secondarily as a code for tantric technique. In the songs that form such an important part of the biographical tradition of Milarepa, it is the aesthetic mode that evokes awareness of sanctity. In fact, one of the great achievements of Milarepa and his successors was the transformation of Indian tantric Buddhist poetics into Tibetan poetics.

tradition, and pp. 228-237 for an extensive bibliography of such works in Tibet.

54 It was against the centrifugal tendencies present in certain bKa' brgyud and rNing ma pa practices that both Bu-ston and Sa-paṇ protested. See: Jared Douglas Rhoton, "A Study of the sDom gSum of Sa-paṇ." (Ph.D. dissertation, Columbia University, 1985).

55 Alex Wayman, The Buddhist Tantras: Light on Indo-Tibetan Esotericism (New York: Samuel Weiser, 1973), "Twilight Language and a Tantric Song" pp. 128-135. See also: Michael Broido, "Does Tibetan Hermeneutics Throw and Light on Sandhâbhâṣa" The Journal of the Tibet Society, 2 (1982):5-39.

Later hermeneutic theories from the Tibetan schools do not necessarily bring us any closer to the original milieu of the tantrikas and any historical-critical study of this material must account for the fact that a considerable evolution has occured between the yogic milieu of the Mahâsiddhas and the scholastic world of the fifteenth century (and later) dGe lugs pa monastic universities. In fact, one of the reasons for studying the dohâs of both Tibetan and Indian siddhas, their biographies, and the Tibetan epic tradition is to find methodological tools adequate to the study of the earliest phases of the Buddhist tantras in their historic, social, and religious milieux. In particular, we would like to know how the `gnostic' aspect of tantric religiosity persisted from the time of Nâropa and Marpa, down to gTsang smyon Heruka[56].

This is not to create an artificial conflict between the Tibetan Buddhist scholars of the tantras and the Mahâsiddha originators of tantric teachings! In fact, the degree of continuity from the Mahâsiddhas to the monastic universities is actually quite astonishing. For example, the Mahâmudrâ Upadeśa given by Tilopa to Nâropa and

56 For example, a most obscure list of lineage holders is given in the Preface to Lokesh Chandra, ed., The Life of the Saint of gTsang (New Delhi: 1969), p. 4, fn. 7, from the Ras chung sñan rgyud of the Bde mchog mkha' 'gro sñan rgyud. This lineage was extremely secret and was passed on for thirteen generations to only one lineage holder per generation. This is discussed in The Life of Marpa the Translator, Nâlandâ Translation Committee under the direction of Chögyam Trungpa (Boulder: Prajñâ Press, 1982), p. 90-91.

translated by Marpa gives in nuce the essential advice and doctrine that one will find in a thoroughly systematic work such as that of Takpo Tashi Namgyal in the 16th century[57]. However, it would be equally misleading to advance the view that the Tibetans made no contribution at all or that their scholasticism for over eight hundred years was an arid reiteration of well established and coherent Indian teachings. Even a superficial reading of the commentaries on any given tantra quickly dispells such misconceptions; there were extensive divergences among the early commentators, which can be traced in the doctrines of the later schools[58]. A fuller study of these commentaries will eventually make it possible to write a history of the evolution of Buddhist tantric systematics.

With regard to the 'gnosis' transmitted by the twilight language of Buddhist tantric literature, it should be born in mind that, for a statement to communicate a mystical message such as the unity of the relative and the Absolute, it is necessary that the disciple or listener be in some sense prepared to hear the message. This is why Candrakīrti

[57] This upadeśa is found on pp. 134-135 Peking Tibetan Tripiṭaka, Bstan H.gyur Tsi 156a-158b. A good translation is in Chögyam Trungpa, The Myth of Freedom (Berkeley & London: Shambhala, 1976), pp. 157-163. Another example of remarkable continuity is the Great Seal of Voidness by the First Panchen Lama, which discusses Mahâmudrā in relation to other saṃpannakrama practices from the lineage of Nâropa.

[58] Discussed by Alex Wayman in Yoga of the Guhyasamājatantra (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1977), pp. 84-105; idem, Chanting the Names of Mañjuśrī (Boston & London: Shambhala, 1985), pp. 5-8 and Chapter 2 on Nâropa's Commentary; and by David Snellgrove, HVT, pp. 12-19.

in the Pradīpoddyotana refers saṃdhyābhāṣā only to those tantric initiates "with keen senses and zeal for the highest siddhi"[59]- there must be a meeting not only of minds but of two deeply related streams of being. In fact, this would seem to be the essence of sacred `tradition' in Buddhism, and what we will discuss below with regard to the extremely important figure of Vajradhara. The continuity of a tradition is utterly dependent on the fragile nature of human relations and interpersonal understanding. Without an encounter between an evolved teacher on the one hand, and disciples already heavily burdened with the discipline and dogma of the received tradition, it is difficult to imagine how an apparently `spontaneous' experience of awakening could deliver sufficient impact to bring about the transformation of a personality. A disciple whose training has left him seething with doubts and questions will be more likely to be noticeably changed by an encounter with someone who can catalyze the resolution of his doubts. When a guru who is an awakened siddha whose experience had gone beyond the `first three joys'[60] which are mundane meets with a

[59] Lessing and Wayman, on the jewel-like person, pp. 218-221, esp. fn. 12. A discussion of the character of disciples and the nature of initiation is found in Alex Wayman, "Preparation of Disciples: The Meaning of Initiation" in: The Buddhist Tantras, Chapter 7. See ibid., p. 41, on the nature of the `esotericism' of these rituals: "The disciple does not know the tantric secrets, even though they are within him; and so the guru is absolutely essential to guide the disciple to knowledge, the disciple's own insight (prajñā)." This kind of knowledge is what we mean by `gnosis'.

[60] HVT pp. 34-35.

zealous, well-prepared disciple as when Tilopa met Nâropa, when Marpa met Nâropa, and Milarepa met Marpa we find our `Saint-to-be' in a milieu in which realization is possible. In each case, the hindrances of previous activities (scholasticism, acquisitiveness, and black magic rituals) had to be overcome through an arduous and bewildering series of exchanges that gradually enabled the disciple to receive the full benefit of the teachings embodied in the Guru. In fact, the tradition of biographical writing going back at least to Abhayadatta and certainly very highly developed in the works of gTsang smyon Heruka, makes use of the song cycles of the respective masters as a literary means by which the process of inner transformation is disclosed to the reader. Such disclosure discretely communicates the `gnostic' milieu within which the literary genres of rnam thar and mgur were produced. It is this tantric perspective that shapes the biographies of Milarepa and the other Saints of his lineage, so that the inner realization specific to the Vajrayâna pervades the literary genres. At the same time, the response of the populace to the realized one leaves us few doubts about using the word `Saint' for these Siddhas, however unconventional their morality may appear in relation to the expectations of other religious traditions.[61]

[61] Thus the use of rJe bTsun, "revered One" or "Person Worthy of Reverence" as a title for Milarepa and other Tibetan Siddhas, which we have translated as Saint. See also: Daniel Richard Gold, "The Lord as Guru in North Indian Religion: Hindi Sant Tradition and Universals of Religious Perception" (Ph.D. Dissertation: The University of Chicago,

1982), Chapter IV: "The Indian Master in Greater Religious Contexts" which discusses the influence of the Mahâsiddha ideal on the formation of late medieval Hindu conceptions of sanctity.

Part I

Chapter 4 Who is Vajradhara?

Our study of the tantric Saint must now address a most interesting figure: the Tathâgata, or _âdibuddha_, Vajradhara[1]. We will consider various definitions of this being, his place in tantric ritual and doctrine, and his _rnam thar_ at the beginning of more than one bKa' brgyud pa cycle of hagiographies (_gser 'phreng_). Finally, we will discuss Vajradhara in relation to the crucial topic of Guru yoga, The tendency to assimilate what we call `sanctity' to the person of the tantric hierophant and Guru is characteristic of the biographical and ritual literature of the bKa' brgyud pa. However, their theoretical writings in part resist this tendency by distinguishing the teacher and the Saint, and by taking note of the _gradual_ appearance of holiness in the person of the attainer or Saint[2].

Judith and Mervin Hanson have done the field of Buddhist studies an immense service by their discovery of the importance of Vajradhara for the Buddhist tantras. They achieved this discovery in their study of the Shangs pa lineage of the bKa' brgyud pa order of Tibetan Buddhism. The text that they studied contains a number of errors and

1 See Alex Wayman, _The Buddhist Tantras: Light on Indo-Tibetan Esotericism_ (New York: Samuel Weiser, 1973), p. 53, where Vajradhara is "the Primordial Buddha, or the final perfection of divinity, the composite of all Buddhas..." and, in the context of tantric ritual, a "_Vajramâlâ_ verse stresses Vajradhara in human form as Vajrasattva, the chief hierophant."

2 Takpo, pp. 407-408.

inconsistencies[3] which, in the context of any study of this literature, demands careful attention. In fact, carelessness on the part of some bKa' brgyud pa teachers contributed to the vigorous polemical style of Sa skya paṇḍita's (1182-1251) sDom gSum rab dbye.[4]

Most of the cycles of bKa' brgyud pa hagiographical accounts (rnam thar gser 'phreng) that are now available in photostatic editions, begin with a 'rnam thar' of Vajradhara (rDo rJe 'Chang).

Previous work such as that of Evans-Wentz[5] has called attention to the figure of Vajradhara in relation to ritual and visualization, and as 'transmitter' of the doctrines of the bKa' brgyud pa to Tilopa. However, the Hansons have

3 The Hansons worked closely with Deshung Rinpoche and Lobsang P. Lhalungpa in translating this sangs rgyas rdo rje 'chang gi rnam par thar pa by a certain rMog lcogs pa, who is probably not the rMog lcogs pa who was a close disciple of Khyung po rnal 'byor, the founder of the Shangs pa bKa' brgyud pa. They presented a preliminary translation of this rnam thar to the Tibetan Studies Seminar, Columbia University, July, 1982, but have not published it. Judith Hanson generously gave me the notes and corrections made subsequent to the Seminar while assisting in the translation of the rGyal thang pa rnam thar of Vajradhara, which seems to be considerably more precise in its formulation of Buddhist doctrine. The Hansons published an article based on their work: "Freedom and Contingency: The Concatenating Buddha: A Shangs pa rnam thar of Vajradhara," in Soundings in Tibetan Civilization, edited by Barbara Nimri Aziz and Matthew Kapstein. (New Delhi: Manohar, 1985).

4 See Douglas J. Rhoton, "The sDom gSum of Sa skya Paṇḍita" (Ph.D. dissertation, Columbia University, 1987), which is a study and translation of this important Tibetan work.

5 W. Y. Evans-Wentz, Tibetan Yoga and Secret Doctrines, Lama Kazi Dawa Samdup, trans. (London: Oxford Univeristy Press, second edition, 1958), pp. 201, 230 ('chosen as a tutelary by those who desire the highest goal' in practicing the Six Yogas of Nâropa), 266-7 (a visualization practice).

shown that Vajradhara is an archetype of the ideal of the bKa' brgyud pa, a mediator of apparent opposites, a sort of coincidentia oppositorum (in the words of Nicolas of Cusa[6]), combining the basis for Buddhahood in all beings (Skt.: tathâgatagarbha; Tib.: bde gshegs sñing po[7], but without the use of this terminology) with its actual realization in historic persons. As such, we cannot avoid a discussion of this figure if we are to understand the theoretical basis for the rnam thars of bKa' brgyud pa Saints.

In fact, Vajradhara helps us understand the telescoping structure of this dissertation. Starting at the end, we have a study and translation of biographies of Milarepa, the 11th century bKa' brgyud pa Saint. In order to understand the kind of holiness that Milarepa embodies, we have to have in hand a theoretical document, and this we find in the rnam thar of Vajradhara at the start of rGyal Thang pa's `golden rosary' of biographies. In the rdo rje 'chang rnam thar, we have a highly schematic account of the figure of Vajradhara, based on Indian Buddhist developments in kâya theory and tantric appropriations of bhûmi and pâramitâ theory from the Mahâyâna systematicians, especially Asaṅga. We have already discussed the theories of sanctity in the traditions of

6 Nicholas of Cusa, The Vision of God. Emma Gurney Salter, trans. (New York: Frederick Ungar Publishing Co., 1960), p. 44. It is Cusa's most famous turn of phrase, but of course has a long history in contemplative Christian texts.

7 See, inter alia, Jikido Takasaki, op. cit., pp. 20-33, and D. S. Ruegg, La Théorie du Tathâgatagarbha et du Gotra (Paris: 1969).

early Buddhism and the Mahâyâna, and in the footnotes to our translation of the rnam thar of Vajradhara, we have assembled exegetical cross-references that situate the relevant theories in Buddhist contexts both tantric and non-tantric. In the biography of Milarepa we have the literary matrix in which the author has incorporated the doctrinal perspective outlined in the rnam thar of Vajradhara. Quite simply, Vajradhara is the turning point of this entire dissertation.

As the Hansons tell us in relation to their Shangs-pa author:

> As our author proceeds through an analysis of Buddhahood in developing these theories [about Vajradhara as the 'concatenating Buddha'] a fairly consistent role for Vajradhara begins to emerge. Very simply, it is one of mediation, transmission or linkage. A Buddha is an individual who, having attained an utterly peaceful, open perceptual ability (chiefly through meditation), is able to act in the world for the sake of others. Such a being embodies the polar opposities of quiescence and worldly activity. In this text the gulf between these is bridged by the aspirant's identification with Vajradhara, a symbol which integrates the essential elements of each pole.[8]

As such, Vajradhara represents the tantric Saint, who has surpassed the model of the Arhat to serve as a nexus of the energies of primordial compassion. Thus Vajradhara is not best understood as the source for the transmission of the Buddhist tantric doctrines from Tilopa to the other members of the lineage (brgyud), for Buddhist scholars wish

8 Soundings, p. 298.

to avoid the tendency to conceive of Vajradhara as the <u>ādibuddha</u> understood as a sort of deity characterized by `other-ness' or extrinsic existence and action.[9] The study of the <u>rnam thars</u> makes clear that whatever transcendent characteristics Vajradhara may be imagined to possess are far less important than the immanence of Vajradhara as a completed process in the lives of the lineage-holding masters.

Based on this jewel of scholarly insight that has fallen into the palm of our hands, it is now possible to examine the <u>rnam thars</u> of Vajradhara by which we shall make the connection between all that we have said about the Arhat and Bodhisattva in Chapter Two and all that we will say about Milarepa and other Tibetan Buddhist Saints in subsequent chapters. For it is our contention that Vajradhara is the key to Buddhist Tantric sanctity, the archetype of what a Tantric Saint must be, and the very means that must be employed to the attainment of that goal.

Scholarly appreciation of the importance of Vajradhara has evolved considerably since Vinayatosha Bhattacharyya's article in the 1934 JBORS, which was the first treatment of the subject after Csoma di Körös' JASB article of 1833. Bhattacharyya states: "Up to the beinginning of the tenth century Vajradhara was an abstract idea. Vajradhara means the `Holder of the Thunderbolt' in other words, the `Holder of Śūnya (void)', that is, the god who has already merged

9 Ibid., p. 296.

himself in Śûnya or void. Naturally Vajradhara was the highest goal of the Vajrayâna Buddhists: their ultimate goal was to merge themselves in Śûnya, that is to say, to obtain Nirvâṇa, in other words, to be Vajradhara."[10] Bhattacharyya bases his dating on the supposition that the Kâlacakra tantra came to light at Nâlandâ in the early tenth century[11].

The tendency for Evans-Wentz to adopt mytho-poetical style to describe matters that other scholars prefer to communicate in philosophical terminology (whether of oriental or occidental provenance) is apparent in his quasi-theistic description of Vajradhara's role in sacred transmission: "The first of the KargyÜtpa Gurus is Dorje-Chang (Skt. Vajra-Dhâra, _sic_), the Celestial Buddha, Whom the KargyÜtpas regard as the âdi, or `Primordial' Buddha. And He, so it is believed, imparted to Tilopa, an Indian yogin, the Mahâ-mudrâ Philosophy, upon which the yogic teachings of the KargyÜtpa School, ... are chiefly based."[12] It is this style that the Hansons wish to avoid.

Bhattacharyya's definition is almost equally trouble-some when compared with the _rnam thar_ of Vajradhara from the _bKa' brgyud gser 'phreng_ of rGyal Thang Pa: "Vajradhara Buddha is all those who hold in their mental continua the

[10] Vinayatosha Bhattacharyya, "Vajradhara," JBORS, 1934, p. 115.

[11] Ibid., p. 116.

[12] _Tibetan Yoga and Secret Doctrines_, op. cit. p. 58.

realization of Dharmakâya as Voidness, being the highest truth of nature (dharmatâ)" [see translation, folio 10]. And, quoting the Vajraśekhara Tantra: "All yogins who realize the meaning of wisdom to be Vajradhara are thereby made to be the unexcelled Vajradhara, so great is the number of Vajradharas!"[folio 10, last line] There is none of the monistic language of merging oneself in the Void. Also, the use of the term `god' is problematic.[13] However, Bhattacharyya rightly concludes that Vajradhara is the personified goal of Vajrayâna practice, the `deity' that the yogin realizes.

Lobsang P. Lhalungpa, commenting on Vajradhara in the context of his translation of the biography of Milarepa, states:

> Vajradhara is the highest manifestation of enlightenment, the visual representation of the Dharmakâya....being the highest cosmic force arising from Dharmakâya's expanse, Vajradhara represents the supreme integrating force and the source of unfolding compassion. In Vajradhara all Sambhogakâya forms, their qualities and functions are unified. Hence Vajradhara is described as the all-pervasive sovereign of the attributes of Enlightenment.[14]

The Hansons, who have worked closely with Lhalungpa, have attempted to show how the reality of Vajradhara works in the contingent world. They observe: "The trikâya theory

[13] Alex Wayman's discussion of this problem in "Divinity According to the Buddhist Tantras" in his The Buddhist Tantras (New York: Samuel Weiser, 1973), pp. 45-53, is helpful because he does not try to use any Western concepts of divinity at all!

[14] LM p. 207, fn. 18.

never posits a transcendent, ontological 'real Buddha' called a _dharmakâya_ who enters the world through _avatârs_ such as Śâkyamuni or who reveals himself in glory as the great Bodhisattvas."[15] Thus they seek to distinguish the Buddhist doctrine of Buddhahood from Hindu doctrine on _âtman_ and Brahman. According to the Hansons, seeking a consistent role for Vajradhara manifesting in the human realm, the bKa' brgyud biographers describe a process of mediation, transmission, or linkage.[16]

Making the Absolute available in contingent circumstances, a Buddha operates in a Nirmâṇakâya. In the context of _trikâya_ theory[17]:

> By far the most important polarity mediated by _sambhogakâya_-Vajradhara is that of freedom-contingency. The Buddha as _dharmakâya_ is utterly open, completely free from external demands. The Buddha as _nirmâṇakâya_ is utterly bound by the needs of others, by the contingencies of the situation. The mediating communicative term which makes it possible for the Buddha to act in the world, and for the worldly Buddha to remain above worldly pressures, is the _sambhogakâya_-

[15] "Concatenating Buddha" conference paper, p. 3.

[16] Ibid.

[17] The topic of the three bodies of a Buddha (or four, or five) is immense. There is much in Étienne Lamotte, _La Somme du Grand Véhicule d'Asaṅga_ (_Mahâyânasaṃgraha_) (Louvain-La-Neuve: Institut Orientaliste, 1973), Chapitre X. Some classic articles: Louis de La Vallée Poussin "Studies in Buddhist Dogma: The Three Bodies of a Buddha (Trikâya)" _JRAS of Great Britain and Ireland 1906_ #2: 943-977; M. P. Masson-Oursel, "Les Trois Corps du Bouddha" _Journal Asiatique_ 1913 #1:581-618; to which de La Vallée Poussin replied: "Note sur les Corps du Bouddha" _Le Muséon_, N.S. XIV, 1913: 257-290; and _Hôbôgirin_ (Tôkyô: Maison Franco-Japonaise, 1930), s.v. Busshin (p. 147 col. 2 et seq.)

> Vajradhara. It translates the dharmakâya's freedom from constraint into the freedom to act within the contingent world of the nirmâṇakâya."[18]

Thus, the relative and the absolute are mediated and conditioned realities are made spiritually efficacious and even salvific.[19]

A very full discussion of Vajradhara in relation to the larger question of the history and evolution of the Vajrayâna is presented in David Snellgrove's two-volume survey, Indo-Tibetan Buddhism. He discusses Vajrapâṇi's (alias Vajradhara) rise to preeminence:

> I confess to finding him by far the most interesting divine being throughout the whole history of Buddhism for he has a personal history and considerable personal character.[20]

Vajrapâṇi first appears in the Perfection of Wisdom in Eight Thousand Lines as a sort of guardian of Śâkyamuni with

18 "Concatenating Buddha", p. 5.

19 The same kind of religio-philosophical problem may be identified in the Christian tradition: the fundamental problem of the Incarnation of the Logos as the man Jesus of Nazareth. The indispensable work on this vast topic is Aloys Grillmeier, S.J. Christ in Christian Tradition, Volume I, From the Apostolic Age to Chalcedon (451), second, revised edition. John Bowden, trans. (Atlanta: John Knox Press, 1975).

20 Snellgrove, ITB, p. 134.

the status of a yakṣa[21]. In fact, in this guise he is found in early sculptures from Gandhāra.[22]

> Furthermore Vajrapāṇi, the yakṣa, constantly follows the irreversible Bodhisattva, who is unassailable and cannot be defeated by men or ghostly beings.... He receives a rather higher position in the Saddharmapuṇḍarīka, where he is listed as one of the bodily forms that the Great Bodhisattva Avalokiteśvara may adopt in order to convert living beings, such as another Bodhisattva or a Lone Buddha (pratyekabuddha) as Brahma or Indra or a Gandharva (a heavenly musician), as Maheśvara (Śiva), as a universal monarch, as god of wealth (Kubera), as military chief, as a brahman or as Vajrapāṇi...He succeeds in coming to the fore as leader of one of the two families, those of the Lotus and the Vajra, which are ranged on either side of Śākyamuni in the maṇḍala described in the second chapter of an early tantra entitled "The Fundamental Ordinance of Mañjuśrī".[23]

This connection with Vajrapāṇi appears as late as our rnam thar of Vajradhara, [see folio 11.]

The figure of Vajradhara moves toward the position of a supreme Buddha, a consummate Buddha in the tantras. In fact he is associated with the symbol of the vajra as it grows in significance as a symbol of tantric Buddhism.

> ...the great interest shown by tantric yogins in gaining magical powers, whether aiming at the possession of 'enlightenment' (bodhi) or rather more mundane successes (siddhi), results in the predominance of the vajra symbol, the naming of the whole tantric Buddhist phase as Vajrayāna, and the creation of a

21 Edward Conze, trans. The Perfection of Wisdom in Eight Thousand Lines and Its Verse Summary (San Francisco: Four Seasons Foundation, 1973), p. 126; see also: E. Conze, trans. The Large Sūtra on Perfect Wisdom with the Divisions of the Abhisamayālaṅkāra. (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1975), p. 398.

22 ITB pp. 59-60.

23 ITB, p. 135.

> large number of divinities with Vajra names, of whom Vajrapâṇi alias Vajradhara...is inevitably regarded as chief.[24]

In the early, formative period of the Vajrayâna, the names Vajrapâṇi, Vajrasattva, and Vajradhara are often used interchangeably.[25] In the Symposium of Truth, "Vajrapâṇi is frequently referred to ...as 'Lord of All Tathâgatas'".[26] Thus Vajrapâṇi, Vajrasattva, and Vajradhara, in the early tantric period, may refer to: 1. the embodiment of the absolute ; 2. one of the Sixteen Bodhisattvas of the maṇḍala; 3. one of the set of four Bodhisattvas when he appears before Akṣobhya.[27]

The importance of ritual cannot be overstated, even if we find among the Mahâsiddhas a certain disdain for elaborate ritual, which I am inclined to regard as more or less a clarification of values for the highly advanced practitioner, and not as a characteristic of the actual daily practice of tantric Buddhists. In fact, this disdain is more a literary device in the biographies and songs than a general spiritual counsel. It indicates that the master

[24] ITB, p. 136. "One should note that in later tantric tradition as received by the Tibetans Vajrapâṇi (as Bodhisattva) and Vajradhara (as Supreme Buddha) come to be clearly distinguished iconographically, but at this earlier state there is no such distinction and Vajrapâṇi is frequently referred to as a Tathâgata (viz. Buddha)".

[25] ITB p. 221 fn. 167. See for example, Lokesh Chandra and D. L. Snellgrove. Sarva-tathâgata-tattva-saṃgraha (The Symposium of Truth) (Śatapiṭaka Series, New Delhi, 1981), p. 17.

[26] ITB p. 221, fn. 167.

[27] Ibid.

has attained the highest state and no longer needs the support of any yâna at all! The fact that the Mahâsiddhas are named as authors of extensive commentaries on the ritual tantras in the Tibetan canons (for example, Nâropa on the Mañjuśrînâmasaṃgîti and the Hevajra Tantra; Kâṇha on the Yogaratna mâla; Ḍombî Heruka wrote the Gaṇacakra-vidhi-nâma, etc.) would tend to confirm this interpretation of their supposed traditional disdain for ritual and for 'book learning'. In the biographies by gTsang smyon Heruka and in rGyal Thang pa's biography of Milarepa, we see the closest heirs of the Siddhas retaining the use of tantric ritual even in the most rigorous settings of contemplative practice. Milarepa consecrates images of Vajrayoginî and of Hevajra; he performs a miraculous 'Vase Initiation' in which the vase levitates of itself to touch the heads of the initiates; he invokes the presence of the Eighty Four Mahâsiddhas during a gaṇacakra. In this he would have been continuing the practice of Marpa, whose biography by gTsang smyon is replete with descriptions of elaborate rituals, during which lengthy Tibetanized versions of the tantric dohâs are composed.[28] The Milarepa biographies attest to the importance of these mystically transformative assemblies

[28] Tsang Nyön Heruka, The Life of Marpa the Translator. Nâlandâ Translation Committee under the direction of Chögyam Trungpa. (Boulder: Prajñâ Press, 1982), passim. And Robin Kornman, "Hidden Literary Criticism in Tibetan Biographies," a paper given at the MLA convention, New York City, December 29, 1986, pp. 5-8.

for the tantric milieux of both India and Tibet. Snellgrove observes:

> The high point of any such rite is the descent of the actual divinity (known as the wisdom-being or jñânasattva) into the symbol of the divinity (the sacramental being or samayasattva), which has been prepared for this mystical (or magical) conjuction. The practitioner is certainly taught that the divine forms are also emanations of his own mind, but they are not arbitrary imaginings and they are far more real than his own transitory personality, which is a mere flow, as we have seen, of nonsubstantial elements. In learning to produce mentally such higher forms of emanation and eventually identifying himself with them, the practitioner gradually transforms his evanescent personality into that higher state of being. Thus belief in them is essential; otherwise the means by which one would progress would dissolve before the desired `success' (siddhi) is achieved.[29]

Thus one way an ordinary person becomes a Vajradhara is to practice a tantric ritual that sacramentally brings about that transformation.

How did the state of Buddhahood and `vajra' come to be identified? Vajra meant diamond or thunderbolt; the vajra was the weapon of the Vedic god Indra, where it suggests the thunderbolt of the demon-slaying warrior god in numerous traditions. Vajrapâṇi, as a local yakṣa acting as an escort to Śâkyamuni in the early Buddhist period, seems to have inherited the power of the thunderbolt, and as such appears as chief of Bodhisattvas in several of the tantras[30].

[29] ITB p. 131.

[30] The text known as the Mahâvairocana Sûtra in the Sino-Japanese tradition is really a tantric work which appears in the Tibetan canon as the Vairocana Abhisaṃbodhi Tantra. The second chapter of this work, extant only in the Sino-Japanese versions, situates Vajrapâṇi in the center of the maṇḍala of Tathâgatas, where he serves the Buddha as a

Vajrapâṇi then comes to be referred to as Vajradhara (Thunderbolt Holder) and with this name becomes the supreme Buddha of tantric traditions. "He may also be acclaimed as Vajrasattva (Thunderbolt Being), but this is more logically understood as a general appellation of the highest state of tantric being, a term formed on the analogy of Bodhisattva (Enlightenment Being)..."[31]

Although in tantric ritual the vajra in the form of a scepter represents skillful salvific means in conjunction with the bell representing prajñâ, in the highest state, the state of union (sbyor), "the vajra comprehends both these coefficients of enlightenment (bodhi), the means and the wisdom."[32] And we can thus say that "vajra represents the Buddhist tantric absolute."[33] As the absolute, vajra thus stands for the highest state of reality, the highest truth, and is thus the equivalent of the unconditioned. Realization of the unconditioned state is the achievement of the Arhat.[34] It is to the unconditioned state that the

protector deity. The vajra he wields is not used here to slay demons (this task is assigned to the krodha deities at the periphery of the maṇḍala); rather, the vajra symbolizes the unassailable, indestructible qualities of the Buddha. Thus, it is more a thing of 'diamond' than of 'thunderbolt.' (These comments are to be developed in a forthcoming work on the Mahâvairocana Sûtra by Alex Wayman.)

[31] ITB p. 131.

[32] ITB pp. 131-2.

[33] ITB p. 133.

[34] ADK First Chapter, 5c. The unconditioned natures (asaṃskṛtadharmas) are space and the two nirodhas. See Alfonso Verdu, Early Buddhist Philosophy in the Light of the Four Noble Truths (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1985),

Bodhisattva conducts the mass of sentient beings by means tied to the doctrines of the perfection of wisdom. This unconditioned state, for the Mahâyâna, is samyaksaṃbuddha, which the tantric tradition calls Vajradhara. Those who realize this state are appropriately called saints for "they have held, or stabilized, the adamantine reality [which is the equivalent of Voidness] in their mental continua ...The nature of Vajradhara is manifested by all beings whatever who are purified as the fruit of Wisdom" (folio 12, rdo rje 'chang rnam thar).

There only remains to discuss the process by which one rises to such a state. This process, applied to the needs and capacities of the disciples, is, according to the tantras, capable of transforming an ordinary human being into a Buddha in one body, in one lifetime. Vajradhara is best thought of as the iconographic symbol of this ultimate state of attainment, for the proof of which one simply needs to examine the use of the iconographic figure of Vajradhara in various visualizations.[35]

We can now explore some of the tantric literature to see how the ritual action of these textual traditions

pp.130-133. And: José Pereira and Francis Tiso, "A Buddhist Classification of Reality: A Translation of the First Chapter of the Abhidharmakośa of Vasubandhu," Abhidharma Research Institute, #6 (1987): 51-84.

35 For example, Glenn H. Mullin, trans. Selected Works of the Dalai Lama II: The Tantric Yogas of Sister Niguma. (Ithaca, NY: Snow Lion Publications, 1985), pp. 59-60; 105-6, etc.

illuminates the sanctifying function of the iconographical symbol Vajradhara.

The idea is quite simple: "For the sake of purifying the unclean body one should meditate on a Buddha Body."[36] But in relation to Buddhist theories of reality, the process is far from easy:

> The early followers of Śâkyamuni soon began to formulate theories of two conceivable Buddha-bodies. There was the Body of Form or Maturation (rûpakâya or vipâkakâya), referring to any kind of body assumed by a Buddha in the phenomenal world, and there was the Dharma body, representing from one point of view the sum total of the Buddha-Doctrine, and from another the absolute supramundane state into which a Buddha passed on entering final Nirvâṇa. According to early Buddhist scholasticism this consisted of pure Buddha dharmas (in the sense of `elements' or `impulses'), and this theory was retained in the Mind Only school since they retained, in a rather changed form...the whole theory of dharmas...[37]

In mKhas grub rje's Fundamentals of the Buddhist Tantra, we find Vajradhara situated as the equivalent of the `tantra of effect' in the sense that Vajradhara is the `rank' of `supreme attainment'[38] This rank is the second in a triad: the tantras of ground, effect, and of means (or path). Nâropa maintains that the tantra of ground is the `jewel-like person' who is the chief among the candidates for the high goal of the anuttarayoga tantra. Śântipa and Abhayâkara maintain that it is the True Nature of the Mind

36 Tsong-kha-pa. Tantra in Tibet: The Great Exposition of Secret Mantra Vol. 1. Jeffrey Hopkins, trans. and ed. (London: George Allen & Unwin, 1977), p. 130.

37 ITB p. 115.

38 Lessing and Wayman, pp. 266-268.

(*cittodharmatâ*), intrinsically pure but possessed of adventitious defilments. rGyal thang pa follows the latter tradition in stating that all sentient beings are intrinsically Buddhas, though this reality is obscured by the accumulation of adventitious defilements (see folio 11)[39]

'Tantra of effect' is the rank of Vajradhara understood as the supreme attainment. The terminology used to describe this state of realization is 'pair combined beyond learning' (*aśaikṣa-yuganaddha*) and 'rank possessing the seven members of the *saṃpuṭa*', which expressions are understood to be equivalent.[40] We find this in the second of the seven factors, or 'limbs' of the *saṃpuṭa* (*yan lag bdun*) in the rGyal Thang pa *rnam thar* of Vajradhara: "[the second] factor is the indivisable embrace [of wisdom and compassion] [called *yuganaddha*] (folio 6)" [41]

[39] see HVT II iv 69. This topic gave rise to considerable controversy for which see D. S. Ruegg, *The Life of Bu Ston Rin Po che* (Roma: IsMEO, 1966), pp. 152-154, fn 1, on the debate over whether the *Saṃdhinirmocana sûtra* is of relative or ultimate meaning. In relation to the Buddha-nature of all beings, the Jo nang pa (a branch of the bKa' brgyud pa) not only maintained that the *vijñaptimâtra sûtras* were of ultimate meaning, but that the *tathâgatagarbha* and the *svabhâvakâya* are of identical reference (*don gcig pa*) and that they exist from beginningless time in the mental continua of all beings, though covered with various defilements.

[40] Lessing and Wayman pp. 266-268, esp. fn. 16.

[41] See also Daniel Cozort, *Highest Yoga Tantra*, (Ithaca,NY: Snow Lion Publications, 1986): "The final union, 'that of a non-learner' has seven exalted features: 1. one's complete enjoyment body has the thirty-two major and eighty minor marks of a Buddha; 2. one's complete enjoyment body is embracing a Wisdom Seal; 3. one's mind always remains in a state of great bliss; 4. that bliss is always mixed with

The tantra of Means or of Path comprises the `steps' utpattikrama and niṣpannakrama/saṃpannakrama), along with their members (aṅga), of the path which is the means of attaining that supreme attainment (the rank of Vajradhara).[42] These three classifications "clarify the definition of Tantra as continuous series. Apparently what is meant is that the Tantra shows the continuous progress of a superior candidate (Tantra of Ground, or Cause) along the Tantric path (Tantra of Means) to the high goal of Vajradhara (Tantra of Fruit, or Effect)."[43]

What is to be remembered here is that we are as much in the realm of tantric ritual as in the world of the meditative realizer (or the scholastic disputant for that matter); in fact, we will see in the following section that the figures of hierophant, adept, and Saint converge.

Vajradhara is treated in tantric visualization in the context of Guru-yoga. "Buddha Vajradhara is simply the

cognition of emptiness; 5. one's mind never wavers from great compassion for all sentient beings; 6. the continuum of one's body never ceases; and 7. one's emanations pervade the universe ceaselessly performing activities for the benefit of others. These are the incomparable qualities of a Buddha Superior." pp. 112-113. But this comes from an eighteenth century dGe lugs pa work.

[42] Lessing and Wayman, pp. 266-268.

[43] Alex Wayman, Yoga of the Guhyasamâjatantra (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1977), p. 61. On the same basis, the tantric Nâgârjuna (in his Aṣṭâdaśa-paṭala-vistara-vyâkhyâ) sets forth three kinds of Vajradhara: causal, fruitional, and methodological. "The causal Vajradhara is Mahâvajradhara, the âdinâtha. The fruitional Vajradhara is Akṣobhya and the other Tathâgatas. The Vajradhara of the means is of three kinds: guarding of the place, guarding of oneself, and guarding of yoga" (Ibid., p. 62).

tantric name of Buddha Śâkyamuni. Whenever the name Vajradhara is mentioned, the implication is that the teaching being discussed is from a tantric lineage."[44] In the tradition of the `Six Yogas' transmitted by both Nâropa and Niguma, Guru yoga is a `completion stage' method (!) along with heat yoga, both of which use a visualization of Vajradhara whose face is the face of the Guru.[45]

The rNingma pa tradition is quite blunt, not to say enthusiastic, about the identification of Guru and Vajradhara: "The Guru is Vajradhara" says the king of Tibet about Padmasambhava.[46] Tsogyel, a noblewoman and yoginî, praises Guru Rinpoche (Padmasambhava) as Vajradhara `Stem of the Mysteries.'[47]

Jamgon Kongtrul (1813-1899), a bKa' brgyud pa lama who was also an initiate of the rNing ma pa and of Bon (he was one of the initiators of the ris-med movement), compiled three works on the four preliminary practices that are prerequisites to tantric practice[48]. One of his works on

[44] Glen Mullin, trans. Selected Works of the Dalai Lama II/Tantric Teachings of Niguma, pp. 59-60.

[45] Ibid., pp. 105-6, 110. The idea that `Guru-yoga' is a completion stage method is reiterated in the rGyal thang pa rnam thar of Milarepa, where the Saint lists Guru yoga alongside skyed rdzogs and rtsa lung, (see folio 234).

[46] Keith Dowman, Sky Dancer: The Secret Life and Songs of the Lady Yeshe Tsogyel. (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1984), p. 34.

[47] Ibid., p. 44. Cf. pp. 77, 87-88.

[48] One of which is translated by Judith Hanson in Jamgon Kongtrul, The Torch of Certainty (Boulder and London: Shambhala, 1977). pp. 1, 6-7. The life of Kongtrul is presented in Lokesh Chandra, ed. Kongtrul's Encyclopaedia of

the 'four foundations', the Nges-don sgron-me, is available in English and has a chapter on Guru Yoga with extensive quotations from rituals giving many instances in which the Guru is identified in actual practice with Vajradhara. The Guru is of course also the initiating Lama, i.e., the hierophant of the rite.[49] In the tantric milieux we cannot restrict the role of Guru to that of a teacher and preacher of the doctrine[50]; the Guru, even as he teaches, initiates, and convokes, has a sacred, metamorphic function as the catalyst of the illumination of the disciple/ initiate.

This brings us to the assimilation of the roles of Guru, Hierophant, and Saint. Particularly in Tibet, this meant the combination of the two theoretically separate

Indo-Tibetan Culture (New Delhi: International Academy of Indian Culture, 1970), with an introduction by E. Gene Smith that sets the ris-med movement in historical context.

49 Judith Hanson, The Torch of Certainty, see esp. pp. 2, 16, 54, 119, and 136 n. 27. See also Alex Wayman, "The Ritual in Tantric Buddhism of the Disciple's Entry in the Mandala," Studia Missionalia 23 (1974), p. 56: "The preceptor is equivalent to Indra, since the disciple must be convinced that the maṇḍala Lord and the guru are not separate."

50 T. W. and C. A. F. Rhys Davids, trans. Dialogues of the Buddha, Part II (London: Henry Frowde, Oxford University Press, 1910), p. 30. The Buddha Vipassa, in the account of this 'archetypal' Buddha's life, is tempted not to teach what he has realized in solitude. In effect, he is tempted to become a Pratyekabuddha. But to be a true Buddha, he must teach those beings whose 'eyes are nearly free from dust, who are perishing from not hearing the Truth'. It is through the intercessory prayer of Great Brahmâ that Vipassa finally decides to teach, for though an Arahant and Buddha Supreme, with his Buddha Eye he looked down over the world with a sense of mercy toward all beings.(p. 31) It seems that even in early Buddhism, as a model for the 'Saint,' a true Buddha is not only free from defilement, but also endowed with compassion and a desire to teach.

meant the combination of the two theoretically separate roles of Guru/preceptor and Saint; this combination is absolutely necessary because of the initiatic nature of tantric ritual and because of the `gnostic' character of that initiation, as we have seen to be the case in the tantric songs. The Tantric Guru, in his role as initiating hierophant, is assimilated to the ideal of sanctity. He is the Buddha in person and the process of sanctification is inefficacious without the disciple's fervent recognition of this fact. In the Life of Marpa, for example, "The guru Marpa was seen as the Buddha in person by the Prince of Lokya."[51] This, and much else, is the significance of Guru-yoga (or even: guru-pûjâ) and it is the reason why the rnam thar occupies such an important place in the literature of Tibetan Buddhism. The rnam thar gser 'phreng is a literary form confirming the continuing realization of the state of Vajradhara in the lineage of Gurus. Marpa boasts that he is more than a teacher, that a special `energy' from the lineage passes through him to worthy disciples.[52]

As Snellgrove comments :

> In tantric Buddhism [the preeminent position that is given to the Teacher] becomes so central that it is

[51] Life of Marpa, p. 48.
[52] LM, p. 48. "In my lineage an enlightening energy is transmitted which has no similarity to that of others." Again, in the gTsang smyon corpus, in the mgur 'bum we read: "To be honored as the Chief Lama in the group, you require Realization and Merits." (Songs, p. 618). See also, Songs, pp. 137f; 140, 168 (Guru Marpa is Vajradhara); 586 (Marpa is Buddha); 577-78, 581 (Buddha = Guru= Dharmakâya); 583 (Guru = Vajradhara).

> not enough to explain it as the natural development of earlier Buddhist practice. In all religions, teachers are essential and in this respect they play an equally essential part in early Buddhism and throughout the whole Mahâyâna period. The teacher is thus a quite proper means to an end which transcends him as much as it transcends the pupil. In certain forms of tantric Buddhism he is not only the essential means, but also effectively the end, and thus in keeping with the Mahâyâna `dogma' of the Perfection of Wisdom, he is identified with the Void out of which he becomes, in a certain sense, manifest to his pupil.[53] [italics added]

It is the function of the rnam thar to illustrate concretely in the life of a Saint the manifestation of a true Vajradhara. From the point of view of the Mahâmudrâ teachings of the Bka' brgyud pa, it is insufficient to regard the Guru only in his role as hierophant as Vajradhara. In fact, the Guru is Vajradhara in person all the time[54]. According to the Mahâmudrâ perspective, true success in the practice of the spiritual life (i.e. yoga) consists not in being able to maintain a state of meditative absorption during the act of meditating alone, but must also include an all-embracing awareness of the noumenal in the post-meditative state. At the end of sGampopa's biography of Marpa we read: "Although the Great Translator seemed always to abide without meditating, he remained undisturbed, always in samâdhi. He realized the true continuum of

[53] ITB pp. 178-179. cf also Shashibhusan Dasgupta, Obscure Religious Cults, (Calcutta: Firma KLM Private Ltd., 1976) pp. 87-88, and H. V. Guenther, The Life and Teaching of Nâropa, (London: Oxford University Press, 1963), pp. 24ff.

[54] See BA, life of Marpa, p. 402; and The Life of Marpa the Translator, pp. 168-169. 'Brug pa kun legs, in his biography, makes a remark to this effect as well.

reality (dharmatâ)". And for Milarepa: "He did not move from samâdhi. He made no distinction between the state of meditative equipoise and post-meditation [discernment]. He realized the true continuum of reality."[55] For Marpa and Milarepa, as for 'Brug pa Kun Legs and innumerable others, conventional views of correct behavior cannot be used to evaluate the sanctity of the Siddhas. Rather, eccentric, mad or amoral conduct on their parts indicate the application of liberative technique (upâya) to particular circumstances, thus manifesting the active presence of the Dharmakâya instanced in an illusory manifestation (nirmâṇakâya) of the communicative state of Buddhahood, or Sambhogakâya Vajradhara.

This is not to contradict what scholars of the history of religions may find useful in an analysis of the typology of Saint, Guru, wonderworker, etc. The point is that the religious practice of this lineage depends upon the disciple's willingness to encounter the Guru as inseparable from the Absolute under all circumstances, however dreadful. As such, it is possible to speak of the Guru as a Saint. This enables the practitioner to recognize the Guru to be present in all phenomena, including one's own mind. As the rnam thar of Vajradhara says: "One's own mind is the bKa'

55 Tib. for Marpa: khong lo tstsha ba chen po dus rtag tu mi bsgom pa ltar bzhugs kyang/ rtag tu ting nge 'dzin las la ma yengs par bzhugs pas yin/ chos ñid bden pa gzigs pa yin te/. And for Milarepa: ting nge 'dzin las mi g.yo/ mñam gzhag dang rjes thob la khyad par mi mgna'/ chos ñid bden pa gzigs pa...yin/ For a discussion of this, with practical methodology, see Takpo, pp. 279-292.

brgyud lama". And as Milarepa says in the Songs : "My Guru is my own mind."[56] In fact, these are called "kleśa-free gurus" - i.e., Arhat-gurus. And Milarepa himself is so characterized: "These things were done by the Saint Milarepa, relying on the great Lord Marpa Lho Brag pa; having exhausted all obscurations, he became the receptacle of the oral instructions. Having in his heart all the doctrine of the practice lineage, he arrived at the goal." (folio 215.6-7, rGyal Thang pa)[57]

J. Gonda states: "In tantrism the guru stands in the place of the Lord Himself, i.e. of God or Buddha. Without initiation one cannot even begin a spiritual training." Later, Gonda explains how abhiṣeka functions at four key moments in the yogic evolution of the disciple, showing the passage from a ritual declaration of intent to the actual realization of the state of jīvanmukta[58]. So it is insufficient to see the process exclusively in terms of a ritual; the whole purpose of the ritual is to transform the ordinary person into a "deified person", which is what we encounter in the anuttarayoga tantra as the step of

[56] Songs, pp. 378-379.

[57] Here we have a hint of the idea that one attains arhatship and then one can take on the tantric precepts to proceed to Buddhahood, affirmed by A. G. S. Kariyawasam, in his article on Anuttarayoga Tantra in the Encyclopedia of Buddhism, but rejected by Daniel Cozort on pp. 163-4, fn. 58, Highest Yoga Tantra. See also, Hevajra Tantra, pp 34-35, for relations between tantric goal and arhattva.

[58] J. Gonda, Change and Continuity in Indian Religion, (New Delhi: Munshiram Manoharlal Publishers, 1985, reprint of 1965 edition), pp. 439, 443f.

generation (utpattikrama), which enables the practitioner then to undertake the mystical transforming processes of the stage of completion (saṃpannakrama). In mKhas grub rje's discussion of 'seed' and 'fruitional' Vajradhara, we have further clarification of the distinction between a glimpse of Reality (=Vajra-sattva, generated by the rite) and the stabilization of the state of sanctification (fruition, the state of Heruka, of a complete Buddha).[59]

In the biography of Milarepa by rGyal thang pa, the Saint uses the bDe mChog rite (folio 252) to provide the circumstances for a full comprehension of Truth (la la la sgom ma dgos par ñams rtogs shar nas//). Marpa was said to be able to do the same thing[60]. The meaning of this is that the hierophant, as Vajradhara, is able to impart the highest state, (i.e. Vajradhara) to favored disciples by means of rites because the hierophant is the deity in person, which means that he has attained sanctification. The assimilation of the disciples to the state of realization is further dramatized in this biography by the manifestation of the eighty-four Mahâsiddhas on folio 255. Milarepa, heir to the Siddha lineage and the embodiment of its power, is able to incorporate his disciples into the same stream of continuity. This is his role as the 'concatenating Buddha' Vajradhara; significantly, this use of ritual is very carefully qualified: the rite is nothing more than a means

59 Lessing and Wayman, p. 316.

60 BA, p. 430.

for making real what should always be real in the lives of practitioners. The rite reveals and initiates, but not apart from the actual circumstances of life. Thus, the criticism of maintaining a meditative state without the ability to retain the contemplative insight under ordinary daily circumstances is applicable to the ritual setting. One must be able to actualize the insights transmitted in the ritual under non-ritual circumstances.[61] For it is the purpose of the rite to transform the disciple, and not to glorify the Guru!

> The heart of the initiation is the Guru's revelation of himself as the Buddha and the initiates's experience of identity with this Guru/Buddha. Thereafter, the initiate's basic practice is to reproduce this ultimate experience of oneness and to assimilate it fully into his everyday life....Gradually [the initiate's] notion of the Guru expands to include all beings without exception, including himself. The siddha is a man with such a vision.[62]

In Professor Wayman's study of the Guhyasamâja Tantra, we have abundant evidence for the close link among Guru,

[61] Comment: Wayman, in conversation, criticizes the idea that vipaśyanâ and śamatha are `integrated' in Mahâmudrâ practice. Rather, the correct view is that tranquility and discernment oscillate in the mental continuum of the advanced meditator, and the perfection of this oscillation is manifest in the ability of these Siddhas to make no differentiation between the state of meditative absorption and the post-meditation state. In effect, the term `post-meditation' is misleading because it suggests something done apart from the act of meditating, but Takpo Tashi Namgyal seems to indicate (pp. 279-292) that this refers to the analytic portion of practice, i.e. vipaśyanâ, at a very high level of accomplishment, and is not restricted to the distinction between periods of sitting meditation and other daily activities. Cf. Takpo, p. 366.

[62] Keith Dowman, Masters of Mahâmudrâ, pp. 13-14.

hierophant, and Vajradhara. "Vajradhara, the revealer of all the meaning of reality, expressed the sublime secret that issues from all the best praxis (caryā)"[63]. Vajradhara is a `teacher': "...VAM is whoever the Tantra sets forth as the teacher, be he Vajradhara, Heruka, and so on..."[64] The Buddha Vajradhara is placed as the head of the lineage of transmission of the six-membered yoga of the Guhyasamāja Tantra in the Pradīpoddyotana by Candrakīrti.[65] Vajradhara also functions as the initiating hierophant:

> After the Five Buddhas have spoken, the Lord Vajradhara spoke: `One should continually and methodically worship the Buddhas with the five strands of desire (= sense objects). By the five kinds of worship he would speedily achieve Buddhahood. So spoke the Lord Vajradhara, master of the Body, Speech, and Mind diamonds of all the Tathāgatas. Then the Lord Vajradhara, ...pronounced this secret mantra of all the Tathagatas: Om sarva-tathāgata-kāya vāk citta vajra svabhāvātmako'ham; Om. I am the self-existence of the Body, Speech, and Mind diamonds of all the Tathagatas.[66]

Mahāvajradhara, principally conceived as `non-dual knowledge'[67], takes on a ritual role at the center of the maṇḍala:

> Immediately after the entrance (of the Illusory Body) into the Clear Light, the Lord Mahāvajradhara, master of the Body, Speech, and Mind of all the Tathāgatas, arousing himself, who is all the families, from

63 YGT, p. 27.

64 Ibid. pp. 28, 183.

65 Ibid. p. 36.

66 Ibid., p. 26.

67 Ibid. p. 106.

> Absolute Truth (paramârthasatya), by the intrinsic nature of `single essence' (inseparability) of the phenomenal world (the Illusory Body as samvṛtisatya) established himself in the center of the `Great Pledge Maṇḍala' of all the Tathâgatas.[68]

This tells us how the participants are to imagine themselves in the setting of the rite performed by their own Guru/hierophant. But is such a `Vajradhara' really a Saint? Takpo Tashi Namgyal is careful to distinguish the practitioner from the realized being and to clarify the identity of the Guru in responding to the criticisms of Sa skya Paṇḍita and others who accused the rNingma pa and bKa' brgyud pa of unsound reasoning and dangerous exaggerations in practice. However, we encounter throughout the bKa' brgyud pa texts intended for the training of devotees of the lineage a very strong tendency to assimilate the roles of Guru, hierophant and Saint. Why? Quite simply, Buddhahood is conceived as both the goal and the path. How is Buddhahood the path? By envisioning the teacher as the Buddha in person, one creates within oneself the conditions for the possibility of realizing the same state for oneself. The Guru is the means to the end and the end in himself; he must therefore be seen as the embodiment of the absolute, of the holy. The ordinary conduct of the Guru is assimilated to the skillful means of a rupakâya Buddha.[69] The rnam thar

68 Ibid. p. 311.

69 Snellgrove's approach to this problem: "These biographies provide us with the means of comparing a worthy lama's own estimate of his nature and powers with his followers' presentation of their leader as a predestined and perfected buddha. In Buddhist Himalaya (p. 279) I quoted ...M. Eliade that `at a certain popular level every master

of Vajradhara, having completed a quite adequate survey of the concept of a Saṃbhogakâya Buddha seems to throw caution to the winds in the final section in which the 'inner' explanation of Vajradhara is presented in distinctively bKa' brgyud pa terms:

> Vajradhara Buddha is all those who hold in their mental continua the realization of Dharmakâya as Voidness, being the highest truth of nature (dharmatâ). Thus it is stated in the Vajraśekhara Tantra: "The Buddha was asked, 'You spoke of Vajradhara. What does that mean?' [He replied]: 'Whoever is firm in bodhicitta and in the wisdom of all the Buddhas, he is the Victor, Vajradhara, the Lord of all the Tathâgatas.'" This means that whatever bodhicitta exists is the wisdom of the Buddhas. Vajradhara Buddha is what the enlightened attitude (bodhicitta) is. This is what the Buddha's wisdom is in the Vajraśekhara Tantra; knowing reality is wisdom, and it is the realization of the Dharmakâya as well. He has completely abandoned the extremes of eternalism and nihilism. Such wisdom is immortal in itself, so it is said. Now, in this way, one becomes a yogin possessing realization, and also one realizes the meaning of the wisdom of Dharmakâya. [Such a yogin] would become like Vajradhara, so some would think. Of course, we accept this for someone who has the wisdom of Vajradhara. As the same tantra states: "All yogins who realize the meaning of wisdom to be Vajradhara are thereby [made to be] the unexcelled Vajradhara. So great is the number of Vajradharas." In that case, in that way, the yogin is Vajradhara. In the [aspect of] Form, etc., of

in the spiritual life comes to join the archetype of the Great Magician, who has obtained release in this very life and is thus possessor of all powers.'(Yoga: Immortality and Freedom, p. 294) This would suggest that magical powers are a simple attribution of his credulous followers and originally unclaimed by the master himself. I doubt on present evidence if such an assumption is justified. There certainly is a marked difference between these lamas' opinions of themselves and their disciples' reinterpretation of their lives, but it seems that the possessor of magical powers is one of the few attributes on which all are agreed. The disciples merely extend the scope of these powers so as to include those which are traditionally associated with the perfection of Buddhahood." Four Lamas of Dolpo (Oxford: Bruno Cassirer, 1967), p. 12.

> the Five Grasping Aggregates (upadhânaskandha), he is shown to be an ordinary person, but it is not [really] appropriate to [think of him as such], as the Vajra-pañjara says: "Therefore, great is Vajradhara! Holding to a foolish form, having the intent of benefitting sentient beings, he remains in ordinary form". Not only these yogins but all sentient beings possess the essence of Buddhahood, though it is not recognized, having been hidden by the defilement of adventitious ignorance...(rGyal thang pa: rdo rje 'chang rnam thar, folia 11-12)

The reality known variously as Voidness, Buddhahood, Nirvâṇa, Mahâmudrâ, vajra, Dharmakâya, etc. is the Absolute, the supreme reality, which seems to be the 'wholly other', realization of which is the inner realization of the holy person. The disclosure of such realization is the problem resolved in part by the art of writing a rnam thar. It is the observer who is obstructed from seeing the ubiquity of the Absolute as it is present in sentient beings. Therefore, the Saint in the role of the Teacher and Hierophant must act skillfully to eliminate the defilement of ignorance. Skillful salvific means is not primarily intended to manifest the holiness of the Saint, for the 'cult' of the Buddhist Saint is not an end in itself. Rather, the intent is to create in the believer conditions under which he may recognize the holiness that lies mysteriously within himself and the holiness of everything, for the Absolute is not other than what truly is, dharmatâ. The purpose of the Vajradhara rnam thar is to disclose the basic truths about the universality of Buddhahood; the purpose of the gser 'phreng (golden rosary) of biographies is to illustrate in the masters of the lineage the ways in

which human beings, even sinners, have realized the adamantine state, and to alert the readers to the ways by which such a master may be recognized, so that the defilement of ignorance might be lifted.

If one views a person in a certain way, one will receive through him. So the disciple, through fervent faith, sees the master as the Buddha. In so doing, the disciple receives the teachings of the lineage and at the same time the mind stream of the disciple is transformed. However, since intrinsically all beings have Buddha nature, it is inadequate in the tantric view to speak of a `substantial' transformation, as from impure _dharmas_ to pure ones. Nor is it possible to use language suggesting the implantation (or imputation!) of holiness from the outside, from a holy Source who sanctifies the otherwise unholy believer. The tantric path must find a way to make the defilements, the impure _dharmas_, and all conditioned reality experientially pure, unconditioned, and liberating. As the biography of Vajradhara concludes:

> In this way, a being is indeed purified of defilement by means of the path, by the doctrinal system of the Secret Mantra Vajrayâna. The nature of Vajradhara is manifested by all beings whatever who are purified as the fruit of Wisdom; this is accepted. Now, from the _Hevajra Tantra_: `All beings arise from me; the three worlds arise from me; I pervade all that exists; of nought else does this world consist' (HVT I. viii, 41)...In brief, he, the Buddha, is called Vajradhara; ...Do not accept that anyone else lacks that status; if one realizes the meaning of self, one can achieve Buddhahood in the primordial (_rang ngor_) form of Vajradhara. The one who holds the succession of the bKa' brgyud pa should realize the primordial nature of oneself; Buddhas do not exist extrinsically

(zur du). In this way, the inner explanation of Vajradhara is completely finished. Having made known the nature of [vajra], [I] ask you to learn, experience, and practice! All fortunate beings have power [to be connected to the Doctrine]; Buddha is not somewhere in isolation from the self; [therefore] by this means alone one may achieve Buddhahood. All holy doctrines are in one's own mind [as bodhicitta]! You must put this into practice! All Saṃsâra and Nirvâṇa are one's primordial nature. Thus, if one gives up hatred and attachment, one will be liberated. There is no other cause and effect apart from oneself! If the mind neither accepts nor rejects virtue, nor non-virtue, there is no [distinction of] Saṃsâra and Nirvâṇa. One's own mind is the bKa' brgyud Lama. ...All the visible things that exist in Saṃsâra and Nirvâṇa are oneself. All are made by oneself. Wishing to achieve Buddhahood, or wandering in Saṃsâra, depends on one's own creations; if one does not see self and others as one, a person cannot have merit in his continuum of being...

In reading such a text, one cannot help but find in it a degree of self-reliance that seems at first admirable, but upon brief reflection, calls up our cautionary instincts. In the actual practice of these tantric lineages, the ancient tradition of reliance on a Guru is brought to its highest state of development, in the sense that the disciple is utterly dependent on the Master. Total self reliance in such spiritual matters does not produce the desired result. However, the ultimate meaning of the total self-reliance that one achieves through arduous practice is `esoteric' and not originally intended for wide distribution. The danger of misunderstanding is obviated by the difficulty of the subject matter and the secrecy vowed in the rites of tantric transmission.

The true nature of the mind escapes our inward gaze without the skillful action of a preceptor who can point out the nature of mind. Alexander Berzin observes:

> In order to practise any Buddhist teachings, and especially those of Mahâmudrâ and the advanced techniques known as the tantras, it is essential to have the close guidance of a Guru, otherwise it is very easy to go astray. But more than that, the Guru is the very heart and focal point of your practice through what is known as Guru yoga and Guru devotion. ...The role of the Guru in spiritual development is multi-levelled and faceted and should not be under-estimated...with the Mahâmudrâ technique, you become aware of the nature of the mind without deliberately ceasing rougher levels of consciousness. Instead, you see right through them. But, this abiding nature is not at all obvious to the uninitiated and can easily be mistaken for something else, in which case meditation on it would be disastrous. It requires the expertise of an especially skillful and fully realized Guru working very closely and intimately with a disciple in order to make him or her be able to recognize from personal meditative experience the very nature of the mind. Thus on a functional and didactic level the Guru is crucial and is to be regarded as a Buddha showing you the way to Enlightenment...The more profound levels of Guru yoga are indicated by Gampopa who succinctly said that when he realized the unity of his mind and his guru, Je tsun Mi la ra pa he could not see one without also seeing the other - he realized Mahâmudrâ.[70]

And the Third Karmapa continues: "...one of the main practices of Guru-yoga particularly in Mahâmudrâ and the tantra, is to realize the inseparability of your own mind with your Guru, the Buddhas and your meditational deity, who is a pure form manifestation of the Enlightened mind. Thus Guru-devotion is the root of all attainments...it was Buddha

[70] In: <u>The Mahâmudrâ: Eliminating the Darkness of Ignorance</u> (Dharamsala: LTWA, 1978) p. xiii.

Vajradhara himself who said that your Guru is to be seen as a Buddha."[71] Further commentary:

> Therefore, a disciple with the good qualities of compassion, generosity, moral self-control and patience should never regard as different his Guru and the Buddha Vajradhara. (Commentary:) Your Guru, the meditational deities and Vajradhara, the form Buddha assumes in the tantras, are all the same in nature. They are like a single person in a drama changing masks and costumes and playing different roles. The same is true if you have many Gurus. You must regard them all as Buddha, differing only in the face he wears. The ability to see your Guru as not different from Buddha Vajradhara depends on your motivation. If you have developed an Enlightened Motive of Bodhicitta, you are striving to become a Buddha yourself in order to be fully able to benefit others.[72]

These texts never cease to emphasize the importance of assimilating the human Guru and Vajradhara in the disciple's religious imagination. The idea is not simply play acting, and cannot be categorized as some sort of blind trust in a designated ritual presider.[73] The Guru must have

[71] Ibid. pp. 160-161.

[72] Ibid. pp. 173-4.

[73] "Therefore the disciple with wisdom carefully selects a qualified guru and then devotes himself in thought and action as have the great practitioners of the past, serving the master in every way conducive to the attainment of higher being, liberation, and full enlightenment."(The Second Dalai Lama, op. cit. pp 57-58) The qualifications of a Guru are given as follows: 1. his/her mindstream should be tamed by realization of higher discipline. 2. stilled with realization of higher meditation; 3. tempered with realization of higher wisdom; 4. be well versed in the scriptures to be taught; 5. have deeper insight into the meaning of emptiness; 6. have more learning and realization than does the disciple; 7. have skill and spontaneity in teaching; 8. have enthusiasm and joy in teaching; 9. have diligence and perseverance in teaching; 10. be beyond losing patience with disciples. (pp. 54-55) To a great extent, the outer traits that qualify one as a Guru disclose inner realization, and particularly the degree to which the Guru has stabilized

realization of his own identity as a Buddha. The Fourteenth Dalai Lama comments:

> The teaching to see the guru as Buddha actually comes from highest tantra. Both Hinayana and ordinary Mahayana scriptures speak of the types of gurus, the necessity of having a qualitified guru, the prerequisities needed by a guru, the attitudes to be held by the disciple, etc. These topics are also discussed in the tantric scriptures, with the exception that, in addition to the qualities mentioned in the above sûtra categories, a tantric guru must be a Buddha. He must be able to impart the teachings on the two stages of practice in accordance with his own personal experience. Especially, he must be able to give the 'fourth initiation'[74] from his own experience, which means he introduces the disciple to the 'great unions of training and beyond.' Only a Buddha Vajradhara can do this. A master actually bestowing the four levels of initiation must have realized both metaphoric and actual clear lights as well as the illusory body which is the vehicle of the mind of clear light; he must also have realized the state of great union to which the disciple is being introduced.[75]

On the basis of such claims, it would seem difficult to deny that the inner realization of a 'Saint' is required of realization. The exterior traits that one might observe in such a person (4 through 10) are strictly concerned with the Guru's ability as a teacher, and might not be incompatible with a person who would be distinguished as a 'Saint'. There is always the question of retaining an 'as if' clause: the Guru is to be revered 'as if' he were a Saint, and he is to be so considered for the sake of the salvific process going on within the disciple.

74 Tsultrim Allione, Women of Wisdom (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1984) gives a good summary of the Four Empowerments , pp. 139-140, fn. 80. See also, ITB pp. 213-277 for an extended discussion.

75 Sonam Gyatso (The Third Dalai Lama) and Tenzin Gyatso (The Fourteenth Dalai Lama), Essence of Refined Gold, Glenn Mullin, trans. (Ithaca, NY: Gabriel/Snow Lion, 1982), p. 49.

the tantric Guru/hierophant[76]. Without multiplying needlessly our citations, we present at least the following:

> From the lam rim works that belong to the tradition of Bya yul pa (1075-1138) we learn that anyone who claims that rDo rje 'chang or any other yidam exists apart from or even is superior to the bla ma will not achieve realizations...Blo bzang chos kyi rgyal mtshan,..`our spiritual friends are the very presence of Buddhahood. The Supremely Enlightened One has said in his precious Tantras and Sutras that in this degenerate age the Lord rDo rje 'Chang manifests himself in the form of spiritual friends and acts for the good of sentient beings. Accordingly, our spiritual friends, apart from merely exhibiting different aspects of being, are manifestations of the Lord rDo rje 'Chang in order to attract us who have the bad fortune of being unable to perceive Buddhahood directly.[77]

And Takpo Tashi Namgyal:

> His body unifies all the buddhas; He is the true essence of Vajradhara;... A disciple who reveres the guru should look upon him in this manner; the guru is the equal of all buddhas, he is Vajradhara for all times; Do not look upon your guru and Vajradhara as two separate entities... The Vajrapañjara states: He who is known as Vajrasattva has assumed the body of an esoteric master. Considering the well-being of all sentient beings, He manifested himself in an ordinary body.[78]

In the Buddhist tantra, Guru yoga is, in principle, the acknowledgment of the Guru as focus of sacred power; initiation communicates indispensible spiritual insight and not merely the verbalization of a body of doctrine. The Guru is a conferer of power, illumination, `grace'; he is

76 On Guru as hierophant, see ITB, pp. 170-171.

77 Herbert V. Guenther. Tibetan Buddhism in Western Perspective (Emeryville, CA: Dharma Publishing, 1977), pp. 187-189; cf. idem, Buddhist Philosophy in Theory and Practice, p. 185. And: Torch of Certainty, p. 119, 125, 126.

78 Takpo, pp. 132-137.

seen as the Buddha in person and the claim is made that in fact he is the Buddha in person not only in the general sense that all sentient beings have Buddha nature, but in the sense that the universality of Buddha nature is coming to fruition for the disciple in the moment of encounter and initiation in the presence of the Guru. Snellgrove observes:

> In the rites, of which...the teacher is clearly identified with the particular god of the _maṇḍala_, be it Heruka or whoever is chosen, and the god is but an envisaged emanation from the Void, to whose substantial being worship is conventially offered, just as to the Teacher himself. Identified with the Void, he is the end result or the so-called `fruit'. His central importance is related to the need for a series of ever higher consecrations, some of which are treated as secret, and which only he can bestow. However, he is equally important for the practice of internal yoga, and to this the enigmatic songs of tantric yogins bear full witness.[79]

Actually, such ideas were already present in Hindu tantra, and the fact that the Dalai Lama (above) refers to the `highest tantra' suggests that what we have in this type of Guru yoga is the Buddhist assimilation of practices taken over from Śaivism. We are here moving in the realm of _anuttarayoga_ tantra, which Snellgrove believes to have originated outside strictly Buddhist milieux[80]. Gonda

[79] ITB p. 179.

[80] ITB, pp. 152-160. He cites in particular _Cakrasaṃvara_, a tantra of particular importance for the bKa' brgyud pa, and mentioned in the rGyal thang pa _rnam thar_. An area that needs further exploration is that of Śaivaite tantra in relation to the doctrines of the Mahâsiddhas. The great synthesis achieved by Abhinavagupta deserves more attention from Buddhist scholars of the tantric tradition. See Raniero Gnoli, trans., _Luce delle Sacre Scritture_

comments on Hindu tantric initiation: "At the time of the initiation the Tantric guru must first establish `the life of the guru'- i.e. the vital force of the Supreme Guru - in his own body, because the divinity is supposed to inhere in it."[81]

At this point we can introduce another dimension to this problem in order to situate the tendency to assimilate these roles in what we know of the social context. This aspect relates to the `cult' of the tantric Saint, and the recognition of the Saint's presence in the context of a community.

The notion of sacred kingship is hardly original to Tibet, but the introduction of Buddhism to Tibet created political and social tensions that were resolved eventually by the creation of a hierocratic state. In a remarkably insightful article, R. A. Stein comments on the title `holy and divine' as applied to the Tibetan kings. This title, '*phrul gyi lha bcan po*, is the equivalent of the Chinese *cheng chen ts'an pou*[82]. In both China and Tibet, the Mahâyâna doctrine of the incarnation of Bodhisattvas in political settings contributed to the idea of Buddhist

(*Tantrâloka*) *di Abhinavagupta* (Torino: Unione Tipografico-Editrice Torinese, secondo edizione, 1980).

[81] Gonda, op. cit., p. 441.

[82] Rolf A. Stein, "<<Saint e Divin>>, un Titre Tibètain et Chinois des Rois Tibètains", *Journal Asiatique* (1981): 232-275.

sacred kingship. In effect, kingship participated in the aura of holiness.[83]

In Tibet, the epic tradition contributed its own peculiar ethos and imagery to this process. In effect, the political leader was 'canonized' and the Saint was 'politicized' by means of the epic. This process is quite evident in the biography of Milarepa which has superficial connections with both the Mahâbhârata (ancestors who lost everything by gambling) and the Gesar epic (in fact, the Gesar epic probably evolved into its present form in tandem with the rnam thars of Tibetan native Siddhas like Milarepa, as will be discussed below in Chapter 7). One example of the connection between Gesar and Milarepa is the unattractiveness and weakness of the hero as a youth. This aspect is decidedly in contrast to the biography of the Buddha which glories in the youthful perfection of the prince of the Śakya clan. In fact, both the gTsang smyon and the rGyal Thang pa biographies unhesitatingly present the errors of Milarepa not only as a sinful sorcerer and weak-willed youth, but even as a disciple guided by distinguished Gurus. He is said to have made mistakes in prâṇa and nâḍî practice and in reading the signs of his own supposed illumination (e.g. in the version by sGampopa)! All this demonstrates the classic epic pattern of the hero who undergoes initiatic trials and, triumphing in the end,

[83] Ibid., pp. 246-247; cheng = Saint, sanctity.

achieves a success that inspires the imagination and identity of a people.

Is the cult of a Guru and the cult offered to a Saint sufficiently similar to justify our claims that the two tend to be assimilated in Buddhist tantra? The Second Dalai Lama, under the influence of Shangs pa bKa' brgyud teachings, cites the following verse: "`Better than devotion to all the Buddhas is devotion to a single hair of one's root teacher.' Thus it is clearly said in many sûtras and tantras that there is no field of merit greater than the guru."[84]

Guru yoga thus sets up the Guru as an object of devotion and as a locus of the hcly: "All you trainees in the Vajrayâna, listen! When one does not see the Teacher, the Tathâgata entered into Parinirvâṇa, then the hierophant, the diamond guru, will serve as his teacher."[85] The need for the Guru, the hierophant, the Saint, is because of the non-presence of the Buddha Śâkyamuni, who has entered Parinirvâṇa. To the extent that we imagine the Saint as embodying the Holy, while remaining in the world, dwelling on the threshold of the Absolute, we can accept the notion of Guru and hierophant as assimilable to the Saint. To the extent that the Saint is more like an Arhat, isolated in a supramundane and incommunicable mystery, we would have to

[84] Mullin, trans., op. cit., p. 57.

[85] YGT, pp. 68-69.

make a distinction between Guru and Saint. This is the direction taken by Professor Wayman:

> It is necessary to show that a guru (literally, a 'weighty person') may or may not be a saint. One of the Sanskrit terms for a saint is mahapuruṣa (great person). Saintliness is frequently referred to by an alternate term 'holiness,' namely of a person, a religious book, or other 'sacred' entity, or an edifice. In the case of a person, it might involve certain signs ....For example, the Buddha was held to have various characteristics (lakṣaṇa) of the 'Great Person' including special marks on his foot, so that his footprint was worshipped. In the present paper the Buddha is considered only in the role of a guru, one who teaches disciples in a lineage - either starting it or continuing it. The saintly or holy is either so or not, while the guru is a better one or a lesser. The holy is incomprehensible; the guru comprehensible. The holy is a non-verbal situation of a culture; the guru uses words or comparable symbolic activity.[86]

Now for the Guru as tantric hierophant there seems to be no doubt that, for the rite to achieve its intended effect, there is little room for speculation on the relative merits of the hierophant as a Guru. As the focus and presider at a rite, either the hierophant is a sanctified being or he is not! The ritual context does not admit of gradations, even if a teaching context does. And from the point of view of the Mahâsiddha lineages, even the process of searching for the Guru encapsulizes the entire spiritual path[87]. And no wonder! For the search for the true Guru is nothing less than the search for one's own identity; the

[86] Alex Wayman, "The Guru in Buddhism," Studia Missionalia 37 (1988):p. 195.

[87] Herbert V. Guenther. The Life and Teaching of Nâropa (London: Oxford University Press, 1963), pp. 24-37, in which the search for Tilopa transforms the disciple Nâropa.

search for the true Vajradhara is the search for the adamantine reality within one-self. Thus our idea is not that distinctions are wrong when we speak of Siddha, Arhat, Bodhisattva, Guru, vidhyadhara, vajrâcârya, etc., but that we have identified in these later Buddhist tantras a process of assimilation that is characteristic of the imaginative religiosity of their practitioners. How can we miss this tendency when the exalted state of the teacher in the Guhyasamâja Tantra[88] is as "Father of all us Buddhas" and thus perhaps higher than the status of a Buddha, Arhat, etc. Guru here is an Absolute, just as Saint is an absolute category, and so they tend to blend in the religious imagination. In the words we underlined above: "The teacher...in certain forms of tantric Buddhism...is not only the essential means, but also effectively the end.[89] The tantric Guru is, in my view, seen to assimilate the role of Saint into the role of teacher; for the teacher not only transmits, but actually embodies the doctrine transmitted: this is the original idea of Dharmakâya ("Having a body that is characterized by the Doctrine," DN iii.84.24, see Edgerton, BHS Dictionary); also, the teacher is seen as Buddha himself, and even as omniscient; since the craft being taught is supreme enlightenment, the one who teaches it must be completely identified with what he teaches, even

[88] ITB, p. 178.

[89] ITB, pp. 178-179.

his apparently non-virtuous actions are substantially transformed into salvific deeds.

Part II

Chapter 5: Historical Context of the Biographies of Milarepa

The bKa' brgyud pa (lineage-practicing-the oral-transmission)[1] `sect' or `order' is really a cluster of

[1]E. Gene Smith has presented one view on the disputed orthography of the bKa' brgyud pa in fn 2, p. 2 from The Life of the Saint of Gtsang, edited by Lokesh Chandra with a preface by E. Gene Smith, New Delhi, 1969: "A note is in order regarding the two forms Dkar-brgyud-pa and Bka'brgyud-pa. The term Bka'-brgyud-pa simply applies to any line of transmission of an esoteric teaching from teacher to disciple. We can properly speak of a Jo-nang Bka'-brgyud-pa or Dge-ldan Bka'-brgyud-pa for the Jo-nang-pa and Dge-lugs-pa sects. The adherents of the sects which practice the teachings centering around the Phyag rgya chen po and the Nâ ro chos drug are properly referred to as the Dwags-po Bka'-brgyud-pa since these teachings were all transmitted through Sgam-po-pa. Similar teachings and practices centering around the Ni gu chos drug are distinctive of the Shangs-pa Bka'-brgyud-pa. These two traditions with their offshoots are often incorrectly referred to simply as Bka'-brgyud-pa.
Some of the more careful Tibetan scholars suggested that the term Dkar-brgyud-pa be used to refer to the Dwags-po Bka'-brgyud-pa, Shangs-pa Bka'-brgyud-pa and a few minor traditions transmitted by Nâropa, Mar-pa, Mi-la-ras-pa, or Ras chung and which did not pass through Sgam-po-pa. The Dkar-brgyud-pa refers to the use of the white cotton meditation garment by all of these lineages. This complex is what is normally known incorrectly as the Bka'-brgyud-pa."

In this text we will use the conventional spelling most of the time, not only for convenience and consistency with other authors, but also recognizing that the "Dkar"-brgyud-pa teachings were also transmitted to dGe-lugs-pa, rNing-ma-pa, and even Sa-skya-pa practitioners who could in no way be properly claimed as bKa'-brgyud-pa, even though they became great masters of the teachings they received. An outstanding example of these is Tsong kha pa, whose extensive text on the Nâ ro chos drug has been translated into English.

Another explanation is found in The History of the Sixteen Karmapas of Tibet by Karma Thinley (Boulder: Prajñâ Press, 1980), p. 23, based on the phrase bka' babs bzhi'i brgyud pa, the `lineages of the four commissioned ones,' which refers to 1. Guhyasamâja, Catuḥpitha, `illusory body' and `transference' ; 2. Mahâmâyâ and `dream' yoga; 3. Cakrasaṃvara and other mother tantras, and the `luminosity' yoga; and 4. Hevajra and `heat yoga', all of which passed through Tilopa. A similar explanation with bibliography is

lineages that are closely allied in history and doctrine. Along with the rNing ma pa, Sakya pa, and dGe lugs pa, they constitute the four major surviving Tibetan Buddhist orders. All the bKa' brgyud pas trace their origins back to the Indian Mahâsiddhas of the seventh to the thirteenth centuries who had popularized Vajrayâna teachings and who are immortalized in such works as the Caturaśîti-siddha-pravṛtti of Abhayadatta.

As is well-known[2] in numerous accounts of the history of the Bka' brgyud pa, the transmission to Tibet came via the Mahâsiddhas Tilopa, Nâropa, and Maitrîpa. The latter two masters were among the Gurus of Marpa, who was the Guru of Milarepa. Milarepa's principal disciples were sGam po pa and Ras chung pa[3]; the principal lineages of the Bka' brgyud

given in The Life of Marpa the Translator, Introduction, pp xxxii-xxxiii. Finally, the text itself uses bKa' brgyud; see folios 1, 2, and 12.

[2]See, inter alia, Lokesh Chandra, ed., with a foreword by E. Gene Smith. Tibetan Chronicle of Padma-dkar-po, (New Delhi: International Academy of Indian Culture, 1968), folios 216r-309v, especially 216r-256r. The Blue Annals gives this history in Book Eight, which covers the Spiritual Lineage of the Lord Translator Marpa. Also: Khetsun Sangpo, Biographical Dictionary of Tibet and Tibetan Buddhism, Volume VII, The Bka' brgyud pa Tradition, Part One. (Dharamsala, H.P., Library of Tibetan Works and Archives, 1977). Helpful articles include: Râhula Sânkṛtyâyana, "L'Origine du Vajrayâna et les 84 Siddhas" in Journal Asiatique, 1934, pp. 209-230; Li An-Che, "The Bkah-Brgyud Sect of Lamaism," in JAOS, Vol. 69, 1949, pp 51-59; H. E. Richardson, "The Karma-pa Sect. A Historical Note," in JRAS, 1958, pp. 138-164, and JRAS, 1959-61, pp. 1-18; R. A. Stein, Vie et Chants de 'Brug pa Kun legs le yogin. (Paris: G-P. Maisonneuve et Larose, 1972), Introduction, pp. 4-10 et seq.

[3] Lists of disciples are given in the BA p. 435, in rGyal thang pa on folio 258, and in gTsang smyon's version of the rnam thar in Chapter 8.

pa during the middle ages in Tibet passed through sGampopa and were known as the Dwags po Bka' brgyud pa.

A correct understanding of the pattern of sub-sect formation among the bKa' brgyud pa is given by E. Gene Smith in his introduction to the Life of the Saint of gTsang:

> The emphasis on oral transmission, on individual solitary contemplation, on intensely personal bonds between guru and disciple militated against the formation of a Dkar-brgyud-pa [sic] sect. The very nature of the Dkar-brgyud-pa teachings tended to promote constant fission. Gradually, however, noted gurus would come to attract large numbers of followers and disciples to their isolated hermitages; and, thus, Dkar-brgyud-pa monasteries came into existence. Often, a favourite nephew of one of these charismatic teachers would inherit the uncle's meditation hut which was at the center of the clustered huts of the follwers. if the nephew were intelligent, he would have an excellent chance of being acknowledged as his uncle's chief disciple and successor. Gradually, the lineage would come to be regarded as blessed and would acquire a share of the prestige and charisma that all of its members had previously commanded. In this way there emerged a hereditary religious nobility in the Dkar-brgyud-pa.[4]

Already in the lives of Marpa and Milarepa, we see this tendency emerging. The household of Marpa resembles the Indian gurukula, with the family and the inner circle of disciples mingling and sharing meals. Marpa's establishment may have been something like a small bâhâ, the tantric Buddhist establishments still extant in the Kathmandu Valley[5]. For example, when Milarepa[6] was threatened by

[4] E. Gene Smith, Preface, p.2.

[5] John K. Locke, S.J. Karunamaya: The Cult of Avalokitesvara-Matsyendranath in the Valley of Nepal

Marpa during the Hevajra initiation of rNgog ston Chos rdor of Shung, Milarepa "jumped down into the courtyard." This suggests that the initiation was taking place on the second storey of a building built around a central courtyard. The Hevajra initiation, regarded by the Nepali vajrâcâryas as being particularly secret, is performed in a shrine room on the second storey, in the center of the building directly opposite the entryway that leads into the courtyard from the street. We may imagine a similar layout for the home of Marpa.

Milarepa himself preferred the caves of the mountain ranges, but this did not prevent disciples from living with him for long periods of time, particularly towards the end of his life. rGyal thang pa mentions twelve yogis and yoginîs in the entourage of Milarepa at the time of his death (rnam thar folio 261); both Ras chung pa and sGam po pa were absent. Such clusters of disciples engaged in rigorous yogic practice would have occupied contiguous caves, or would have distributed themselves in caves and huts relatively near one another.

sGampopa eventually founded a monastery at sGam po (BA, pp. 459-462), from which is derived the name by which he is best known. The Blue Annals describes some of the other

(Kathmandu: Sahayogi Prakashan, 1980), pp. 13-19, gives a description of the layout of such buildings.

[6] See LM pp. 57-58. A photograph of the inner courtyard of a bâhâ may be found on p. 107, The Life of Marpa the Translator.

meditation caves of the great disciples and the growth of the number of their followers (see for example, the life of Dus gsum mkhyen pa, the first Karma pa, who is said to have gathered a community of a thousand monks in Tre bo of Khams)[7].

Relations with the Mongols

Among the biographies of Milarepa that have come down to us, we have at least two that may be by his direct disciples sGampopa and Ras chung pa[8]. The biographies by Rang byung rdo rje, the Third Karma pa (1284-1339), by rGyal Thang pa (ca. 1258), and by gTsang smyon Heruka (1452-1507), were all written during critical periods in the history of Tibet and of the bKa' bryud pa order. The biography by Rang byung rdo rje, in two volumes, the second of which is a collection of the songs of Milarepa, deserves extensive future study, as does the biography by Ras chung pa. For our present purposes, we will examine the

[7] BA pp. 474-480.

[8] We have prepared an edition based on three xylographs of the works of sGam po pa. The best of the three is from Selected writings of sGam po pa bsod nams rin chen (Dwags po Lha rje) with the Biography written by his descendant sGam po pa bsod nams lhun grub, Reproduced by Topden Tshering, at the Jayyed Press, Ballimaran, Delhi-6, 1974, folios 18-30. It is a manuscript from the Gemur Monastery in Lahul. (See Bibliography, ms. "C").

For the Ras chung version, see the Bde Mchog Mkha' 'gro Sñan rgyud (ras chung sñan rgyud): A manuscript collection of orally transmitted precepts focussing upon the tutelaries Cakrasamvara and Vajravârâhî, representing the yig-cha compiled by Byang Chub Bzang po, reproduced from a rare manuscript in the library of Apho Rimpoche, Volume I (New Delhi, 1973) (I-Tib-73-902914), folios 97-125.

historical context of the writing of the rGyal Thang pa version and of the more famous works of gTsang smyon.

Snellgrove and Richardson present a perspective on Tibetan relations with the Mongols that would suggest an atmosphere of crisis and competition among the Buddhist orders in Tibet of the 1250's and of the 1480's, corresponding to the writing of these two biographies of Milarepa. It would be hasty to conclude that the threat of the Mongols in the mid-thirteenth century and the possibility of a Mongol-dGe lugs pa alliance against gTsang and the Bka' brgyud pa (especially Karma pa and 'Brug pa) in the 1480's actually provoked the writing of these biographies. However, some aspects of the crises of these two periods suggest that there was in fact an atmosphere favorable to new literary propaganda and to a re-examination of fundamental values.

Political conditions of the mid-thirteenth century are summarized by Snellgrove and Richardson as follows:

> It was not until the reign of Genghiz Khan's successor, Ogodai, who became Khan in 1227, that the Mongols gave serious attention to Tibet. It seems to have fallen, as a very small part of his heritage, to Godan, the second son of the new Khan, who, far from seeking religious instruction, sent raiding parties into the country in 1239. One of them attacked and looted 'Brom ston's monastery Rva sgreng, as well as the early wealthy chapel of rGyal lug lhas. Another reached 'Bri khung, but there, according to the Tibetan accounts, the personality and magical powers of the hierarch sPyan snga so overawed the Mongol commander that the monastery escaped harm...there is evidence of continuing friendly relations between 'Bri khung and one section of the Mongols. As a result of these raids, possibly impressed by what he was told of the influence of the grand lamas, Godan summoned a Tibetan

> representative to his court. The effective choice lay between the grand lamas of 'Bri khung, sTag lung, and Sa skya, and in 1244 the Lama of Sa skya set out accompanied by two young nephews...he made full submission to Godan on behalf of Tibet...He himself was appointed regent with the duty of residing at the Khan's court and transmitting orders to officials in Tibet. His act of submission, already disliked by many Tibetans, became even more significant in its consequence when his nephew and successor 'Phags pa (1235-80) so won the confidence of Kublai Khan...that he became in effect the Mongol's vassal-ruler of Tibet, while Kublai himself became, if not a convert, at least a powerful and devoted patron of Buddhism ...on this administratively reunited Tibet the grand lamas of Sa skya may justly claim, at least from 1261 and possibly from 1254 to have had the authority of "Kings of Tibet" ...but they were bound to reside at the Mongol court and their position was by no means willingly accepted by all `lamas and lords' of Tibet.[9]

The biography of Milarepa by rGyal thang pa comes out of the 'Brug pa subsect, specifically the sTod (Upper)

[9] Snellgrove and Richardson, op. cit.,pp. 148-149. The passage continues: "The grand lamas of other great monasteries, seeing how greatly the original act of submission and residence at the Mongol court had turned to the advantage of Sa skya, now set about trying to secure a share of the patronage for themselves. The Karma pa, the mTshal pa and the 'Bri khung pa all found patrons among the great Mongol chiefs, and the support of different monasteries by different members of Genghiz' relatives and descendants infected Tibetan affairs with a new bitterness derived from involvement in the endless and internecine factions of the Mongols. Tibetan rivalries were intensified by the thought, introduced by the Mongols, that a single ruler of Tibet was again a possibility, and by the new weapon of armed foreign allies now at the disposal of the competitors. Between 1267 and 1290 Sa skya and 'Bri khung waged intermittent war with the help of their Mongol supporters, and in these and like struggles there was no room for Tibetan patriotism or thought of nationhood." (pp. 149-150). R. A. Stein, in _La Vie et Chants de 'Brug pa Kun legs le Yogin_, tends to agree with this description of the period. Cf. pp. 19f. Further emphatic support for these conditions is given in extensive detail by Turrell Wylie, "The First Mongol Conquest of Tibet Reinterpreted," _Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies_ 37 (1977): 103-133. See also: Luciano Petech, "The Mongol Census in Tibet," in the Hugh Richardson Honorary Volume, 1980.

'Brug. The location of the monastery of 'Brug pa is only a short distance from Lhasa, perhaps forty miles southwest. It therefore required only about two days for news - or troops - to arrive from the capital. The 'Brug pa were definitely among the bKa' brgyud pa subsects to have been involved in the great political disputes along with the 'Bri khung pa[10], the sTag lung pa, the Karma pa, and the Phag mo gru pa. The latter group produced the great ruler of fourteenth century Tibet, Byang chub rgyal mtshan of Phag mo gru, who triumphed over the Sa skyas in 1354 and attempted to expunge Mongol influence in Tibet.[11]

The 'Brug pa tried to preserve the primitive spirit of the early bKa' brgyud pas, adhering in particular to the Ras chung pa transmissions[12], though as disciples of Phag mo gru and of sGampopa, they formed a branch of the Dwags po bKa' brgyud. Our manuscript of the Bka' brgyud gSer 'phreng

[10] An early contact between the 'Bri khung pa and no less a figure than Genghiz Khan (1162-1227) occurred shortly after 1207, the year of the Khan's first Tangut war. The great scholar 'Bri gung chos rje 'Jig rten mgon po (1143-1217) is said to have protected the Hsi Hsia (Tanguts) from the Mongols by his magical powers. See The Collected Writings (gsung 'bum) of 'Bri-gung Chos-rje 'Jig-rten-mgon-po Rin-chen-dpal, Reproduced photographically from the 'Bri-gung Yang-re-sgar, xylographic edition by Khangsar Talku, Volume 1 (Ka) (New Delhi: 1969), with an introduction by E. Gene Smith, pp. 1-2.

[11] Snellgrove and Richardson, pg. 152.

[12] The importance of the Cakrasaṃvara ḍâkinî hearing lineage teachings, which passed through Ras chung pa's line, is discussed in the Life of Marpa the Translator, p. 90. See also pp. 194-196. Marpa's third journey to India was to get the transference of consciousness oral transmission along with this mkha' 'gro ma'i sñan rgyud. See also BA pp. 306-7.

comes from Hemis, a 'Brug pa monastery in Ladakh famous for its manuscript collections. One of the major 'Brug pa monasteries was Ra lung, south of the gTsang, towards Bhutan. Long before the success of the dGe lugs pa at the center of power, the influence of the 'Brug pa went south into Bhutan where it continues to the present day.

Evidence of 'Brug pa awareness of the Mongol danger is found in the Blue Annals, where a 'Brug pa master, 'Jam dbyangs mgon po, born in 1208, was called upon to perform a rite to avert the danger of an attack by Mongol troops[13]. This master was a contemporary of rGod tshang pa, the Guru of rGyal Thang pa.

rGod tshang pa was himself a disciple of rGya ras of Ra lung, but he also had connections with the politically active 'Bri khung pa. The Blue Annals tells us that one of his disciples, rGyal mtshan 'bum composed biographies of the bKa' brgyud pa teachers[14] and we also have a biography of Milarepa by the Mahâsiddha U rgyan pa[15], a disciple of rGod tshang pa and a contemporary of rGyal Thang pa. U rgyan pa himself is said to have been attacked by Mongols in the

[13] BA, p.679.

[14] BA, p. 696.

[15] 'Bri gung dkar brgyud yid bzhin nor bu yi 'phreng ba by Grub thob Orgyan pa [sic] Rin chen dpal (1229/30-1309), written ca. 1295-1304, folios 174-245, from the library of the Ven. Kangyur Rimpoche (I-Tib. 72-904180), Leh, 1972.

northern desert region of Tibet[16]. The lineage of the sTod 'Brug pa up to rGyal Thang pa is as follows:

Vajradhara, Tilopa, Nâropa, Marpa (1012?-1097?), Mila raspa (1040?-1123?), sGam po pa (1079-1153), Ras chung (1084-1161), Phag mo gru pa (1110-1170), Gling ras pa (1128-1188)[17], gTsang pa rGya ras (1161-1211), Sangs rgyas dbon ras dar ma seng ge (1177-1237/8)- a nephew of rgya ras, rGod tshang pa (1189-1258), U rgyan pa (1229-1309), and rGyal Thang pa bde chen rdo rje (n.d.).[18] This list locates the author of the gSer 'Phreng in the tradition of the 'Brug pa,

16 BA p. 700.

17 See Daniel Martin, "Gling ras pa and the Founding of the 'Brug pa School" in Tibet Society Bulletin, Vol. 13, June, 1979.

18 Dkar brgyud gser 'phreng: A Thirteenth Century Collection of Verse Hagiographies of the Succession of Eminent Masters of the 'Brug pa Dkar brgyud pa Tradition by rGyal Thang pa bDe chen rdo rje, reproduced from a rare manuscript from the library of Hemis Monastery by the 8th Khams sprul Don brgyud nyi ma. Sungrab Nyamso Gyunphel Parkhang Tibetan Craft Community, Tashijong, Palampur, H.P., 1973. Preface and Table of Contents. See also BA, pp. 680-702. The preface tells us that no biography of rGyal thang pa is presently available, but "it is known that he was a disciple of Rgod tshang pa Mgon po rdo rje, the last guru whose biography appears in this collection. This Dkar brgyud gser 'phreng must therefore belong to the 13th century and is thus one of the oldest surviving examples of the genre....The style of the miniatures and the script suggest that this manuscript belongs to the late 15th or early 16th century."

Ven. Khenpo Karthar Rinpoche, abbot of Karma Triyâna Dharmacakra in Woodstock, NY, says that rGyal Thang pa was a famous 'Brug pa scholar. In the three volumes of bKa' brgyud pa biography assembled by Khetsun Sangpo, there is no entry for him. rGyal Thang is in Northwestern Yunnan Province; the Chinese name is Chungtien (Zhongdian). See Claes Corlin, "The Symbolism of the House in Rgyal Thang" in Tibetan Studies in Honour of Hugh Richardson edited by Michael Aris and S. S. K. Aung (Warminster: Aris & Philips, 1980), p. 87.

during the time of the Mongol threat and the ascendancy of the rival Sa skya pa order.

On the very last line of folio 619 of this manuscript, we find the following list of names:

rGyal Thang pa bde chen rdo rje, Chos rje Thogs med pa, sLob dpon Shes rab 'byung gnas, dKa' bcu pa Sangs rgyas bkra shis, mKhas grub Chos kyi rgyal mtshan, bDag Swa sti dhwa tsha.[19] The author of the Preface (probably E. Gene Smith), considers this to be a `list of the successive gurus in the transmission up to the teacher at whose behest the present manuscript was presumably made.' This information helps us estimate the date of the manuscript itself (perhaps sixteenth century) and will make possible further research on the lineage holders of this branch of the 'Brug pa.

In view of the presence of several biographers among the 'Brug pa of this period, we might speculate on the need for a review of values that such literary activity implies. The writing not only of individual biographies, but of cycles of lineage biographies is in accordance with the devotion that a disciple owes to his master and to the lineage. Such cycles (gser 'phreng = golden rosaries[20]) assist the process of legitimation and would be of considerable value in a period in which contact with foreign

[19] i.e. Legs pa rgyal mtshan of Zur- not the successor of mKhas grub rje. Zur seems to have been founded in the late fourteenth century. See BA p.545.

[20] See a very brief one preserved in Songs, pp. 139-140. Cf. Vie et Chants de 'Brug pa Kun legs, pp. 282-287.

powers might insure the survival of monastic establishments. The fact that the rGyal Thang pa biography of Milarepa deliberately imitates[21] the sort of verse-with-prose-commentary that is known from sûtra and śâstra indicates at least in part an intention to present the lives of the Saints as an extension of scripture and in continuity with the authentic Indian Buddhist tradition.

The fourteenth and fifteenth centuries in Tibet saw the decline of Mongol influence with the rise of the Phag mo gru rulers. These gave way in 1434 to their own powerful ministers, the princes of Rin spungs, who were superceded by the governors of gTsang. By 1565, the latter had consolidated their power over Tibetan territory to such an extent that they may reasonably be referred to as the gTsang line of kings.[22] Both the Rin spungs and gTsang rulers were closely associated with the Karma pa hierarchs.

In the 1480's there was serious fighting between the forces of dBus and of gTsang. Donyo Dorje of Rin spungs was a supporter of the Karma pas in a violent struggle with the rising power of the dGe lugs pa order[23], founded by Tsong kha pa in and around Lhasa in the early fifteenth century. The area around Lhasa constituted a sort of border zone

[21] After repeating the verse in the body of the text, the author adds the words: ces pa'i don ni/ and then proceeds to recount in narrative form one or more tales about Milarepa that expand upon the content of the verse.

[22] Richardson and Snellgrove, op. cit., p. 154.

[23] Tsepon W. D. Shakabpa: Tibet, A Political History (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1967) pp. 85-90.

between the old religious rivals of Sa skya and 'Bri khung; nobles and the people joined the remnants of Phag mo gru and gDan sa mthil who welcomed the teachings of Tsong kha pa and his disciples. "The example of a religious school which was as yet taking no part in the political rivalries of the day and insisted on the observance of strict monastic discipline, may well have appealed to many who were critical of the apparent worldliness of the older established orders."[24]

The third successor of Tsong kha pa as abbot of dGa' ldan was dGe 'dun grub (1391-1475). An energetic leader, he elevated the new order to new levels of power and influence. In 1445 he founded the monastery of bKra shis lhun po near Shigatse on the border of the territory of the Rin spungs and their allies the Karma pa `Red hat' hierarch. This challenge led to conflict throughout the rest of his life and afterwards. We thus have the stage set for a branch of the bKa' brgyud pa, the Karma pa, in conflict with a new and influential religious order close to the center of Tibet and capable of attracting broad support.

Tsong kha pa himself had not been sectarian in attitude and had sought teachings from masters of the several orders. The biography of Tsong kha pa records that he received extensive teachings from the 'Bri kung hierarch, including the Six Doctrines of Nâropa, the works of Je Phag mo gru pa, and the transmissions of Marpa to Milarepa and rNgog chu rDo

[24] Snellgrove and Richardson, op. cit., pp 181-182.

rje.[25] It is interesting, though not necessarily linked to political strife, that the successor of dGe 'dun grub, dGe 'dun rgya mtsho (1475-1542) chose to study the Shangs pa Bka' brgyud pa teachings, such as the Ni gu chos drug, rather than the lineage coming through the Dwags po bKa' brgyud pa.[26] At a time when the dGe lugs pa were in conflict with a major branch of the Dwags po bKa' brgyud order, it may have seemed discrete to seek similar esoteric teachings from other branches of the Mahâsiddha lineages going back to Nâropa. This should not be surprising, since the sacred bond between a tantric Guru and disciple could not be imperiled by the possibility of violent conflict, which would send the guilty party straight to hell for eons.

In this period of aggravated strife, we find the remarkable life and works of the great `mad yogin' of gTsang, gTsang smyon Heruka. He was one of a group of tantric practitioners in late fifteenth and early sixteenth century Tibet who had acquired reputations as <u>smyon-pa</u> (mad holy men) and who produced an influential body of liturgical and hagiographical literature. Among these works, the biography of Milarepa by gTsang smyon Heruka has been acclaimed as a masterpiece of Tibetan and world literature. However, gTsang smyon was by no means a solitary figure,

[25] Robert A. F. Thurman, ed. <u>The Life and Teachings of Tsong Khapa.</u> (Dharamsala: LTWA, 1982). p. 12.

[26] See Glenn H. Mullin, ed. and trans. <u>Selected Works of the Dalai Lama II: The Tantric Yogas of Sister Niguma.</u> (Ithaca: Snow Lion Press, 1985).

neither as a smyon-pa mystic, nor as a writer of hagiographies and ritual texts.[27] The Tibet of these `mad yogins' was characterized by a number of internal tensions, both political and religious. In the older sects, there was conflict between those lamas whose spiritual authority had attracted political and material wealth, and those masters (especially in the circles of the smyon pas) who were seeking to preserve and even to dramatize the ascetical values and observances of the early Saints of the lineages. Smith observes:

> I think that the evidence is fairly conclusive that the smyon-pa phenomenon was, at least partly, a reaction against the hereditary lineages with their great prestige and wealth. It was an attempt to reinvest the Dkar-brgyud-pa tradition with some of its former religious fervor, the incandescent spirituality of the early yogis. The chief symbol of this movement was Mi-la-ras-pa who had never been a monk, the mystic poet who had founded no monastery or school, a saint who remained a legend.[28]

It seems that the writings of the smyon pas were intended to encourage the respective lineages to adhere more faithfully to the traditions of the holy founders and

[27] For information on the phenomena of madness in Tibetan social context, see John Ardussi and Lawrence Epstein, "The Saintly Madman in Tibet," in John Fisher, ed., Himalayan Anthropology (The Hague: Mouton, 1978), pp. 329-337. See also, John A. Ardussi, "Brewing and Drinking the Beer of Enlightenment in Tibetan Buddhism: The Dohâ Tradition in Tibet," in JAOS, 1977, pp.115-124. E. Gene Smith's Preface to the Life of the Saint of gTsang by rGod Thang ras pa sna tshogs rang grol, edited by Lokesh Chandra, (New Delhi, 1969), is still the indispensible discussion of this topic.
The smyon pa ideal expressed in terms of Vajradhara may be found in the Songs of Milarepa, pp. 610-613. A discussion of `yogic madness' is given on p. 189, fn 47.

[28] The Life of the Saint of Gtsang, preface, p. 3.

thereby to recover lost greatness and authenticity. Biographical works, in particular the large and detailed compilations of gTsang smyon and his followers, made eloquently clear the kind of lives led by the great Saints Tilopa, Nâropa, Marpa, Milarepa, and so on. Collections of teachings, such as the Bde mchog mkha' 'gro sñan rgyud (Ras chung sñan rgyud yig cha) compiled by the disciple and biographer of gTsang smyon, rGod tshang ras pa sna tshogs rang grol, and the Bde mchog mkha' 'gro sñan rgyud of gTsang smyon himself, represent an earnest effort to preserve and transmit rare esoteric teachings. In fact, "the complete set of all the Bde mchog mkha' 'gro sñyan rgyud (sñan rgyud yid bzhin nor bu) filled 12 or 13 volumes in the golden manuscript copied out in Gtsang-smyon's last years."[29] Gtsang-smyon and his Guru, Sha ra rab 'byams pa, belonged by sectarian affiliation to the Ras chung Bka' brgyud pa, which has now disappeared as a separate entity. The Stod 'Brug pa are now the principal practitioners of the esoteric traditions preserved in the Bde mchog mkha' 'gro sñan rgyud. As a result, gTsang smyon is considered to belong to the 'Brug pa, which of course was also the Bka' brgyud sub-sect to which rGyal Thang pa had belonged two hundred years before.[30]

The crisis in the religious aristocracy of the older sects, increasingly embarrassed by the success of the

[29] Ibid., p. 4, fn. 7.

[30] Ibid.

reformed dGe lugs pa, is further manifest in what Smith calls "perhaps the most important development in Tibet during the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries...the gradual acceptance of the priority of the rebirth (yang srid) lineage over familial claims in the transmission of accumulated religious prestige and wealth."[31] In his study of the Tibetan Chronicle of Padma dKar po, Smith finds that the late sixteenth century bKa' brgyud pa author "subtly brings out the primacy of incarnation and learning over family heritage."[32] Coming at the end of the turbulent sixteenth century, when bKa' brgyud pa power (especially of the Karma pa) was still successfully allied with the rulers of gTsang, Padma dKar po represents the heritage of a relatively reformed `Second Diffusion' order. The charismatic authority at least partly garnered by the smyon

[31] Tibetan Chronicle of Padma dKar po, edited by Lokesh Chandra with a foreword by E. Gene Smith. New Delhi, 1968.

[32] Ibid. pp. 1, 4-5. It may be that gTsang smyon's concern with early esoteric transmission was an attempt to counteract the influence of rNing ma pa doctrines and practices among the bKa' brgyud pa. These had been introduced by a number of figures, most notably by Rang byung rdo rje, (1284-1339), who was himself the author of a rnam thar and mgur 'bum of Milarepa, still available. See Dan Martin, "The Early education of Milarepa," p. 61 and fn. 57. In the mgur 'bum (Songs #39, esp. p. 457), we find a tale that sheds light on the context of the reforms advocated by gTsang smyon: the conflict of logicians versus meditators (already a lively dispute in Sa Paṇ's day, and in the life of Bu ston); an irresponsible fascination with black magic; self-styled Siddhas; and above all, the egoistic impulsiveness of the limited mind, which is the basis of all problems and suffering. The call to "keep to the tradition of the lineage" is presumably a slogan in opposition to the admixture of rNing ma pa teachings and to the transmission of bKa' brgyud teachings to dGe lugs pa sectarians.

pas of the late fifteenth century has been institutionalized in the now widespread use of the incarnation lineage system, a system that had been criticized by the radical smyon-pas[33], who inculcated above all the emulation of the lives of the great masters of the past. The political advantage of the incarnation system was that it helped the leadership of an order to avoid the manipulation of abbatial appointments by families so that promising youths might be selected as `incarnations' thus insuring that a lineage would not stagnate or be deflected towards the policy line of a particular clan. Often incarnations were found among out-of-power families, families in border areas (Padma dkar po himself was one of these), or in families connected to both sides of a dispute, thus providing (like political marriage) a convenient reason for peace making and compromise. The fact that an incarnating lama was believed to be manifesting a power achieved by those of great holiness tended to give just the right mystique to the system. In fact, the concept of an incarnating lineage was started among the Karma pas. It was adopted by the dGe lugs pa in the second half of the fifteenth century, under dGe

[33] In rGyal thang pa's Milarepa rnam thar the concept of the illusory manifestation of a pre-existent Bodhisattva is presented in verse 1 and developed in the exposition narrative on folios 194-195. There is no attempt to downplay, in this thirteenth century text, the notion of a sprul-sku as there is in the gTsang smyon version. See the Preface to the *Life of the Saint of gTsang*, p. 5.

'dun grub, who announced before his death that he would reincarnate in a successor.[34]

The actual historical circumstances under which the biography of Milarepa was written in the late 1480's (1488 for both the rnam thar and the mgur 'bum, at La stod Lho Shel phug)[35] were considerably less reassuring. The writings of gTsang smyon and his circle glorify the early bKa' brgyud pa mystics of the wilderness retreats and solitary contemplative discipline, calling for an emulation of their way of life. At the very same time, however, there was fierce fighting between dBus and gTsang. gTsang smyon's retreat in La stod, to the west of gTsang, may indicate his desire to escape the disorder arising from the fighting. The Tibetan historian Shakabpa indicated that gTsang smyon probably did not have to `escape' the war, but that his patron did `protect' him so that he was able to carry out his literary activities.[36] But among gTsang smyon's patrons we find the myriarch of Byang, the King of Gung thang, and the prince of Rin spungs[37]. All of these, and other known patrons, were involved in armed conflict, according to the

[34] Snellgrove and Richardson, p 182.

[35] E. Gene Smith, Preface, The Life of the Saint of Gtsang. pp. 7 and 11. This conflicts with the statement in the Lhalungpa translation of the rnam thar (p. 203) that gives the location of writing as Dhok Lachi Gangra (La phyi gang), but in any case, this place is away from the zone of conflict.

[36] Conversation with Shakabpa, Fall, 1986, at Columbia University.

[37] Preface, The Life of the Saint of gTsang, pp. 10-11.

biography by rGod tshang ras pa. It would seem that if gTsang smyon made an effort to collect Milarepa materials in dBus and gTsang in the 1480's he would have unavoidably run into difficulties due to the unsettled political situation. However, the only evidence for restricted research activities that has come to my attention is the fact that Amdo and Khams collections of 'oral' traditions about Milarepa were not included in the gTsang smyon redactions. These have recently been translated and published by Brian Cutillo and Lama Kunga[38].

Whatever the historical circumstances, we can find in the works of gTsang smyon a highly developed literary style that has taken earlier materials both oral and written to formulate biographies that resemble a romance and match the performance immediacy of the epic. Above all, they promote the classic doctrinal and mystical traditions of the bKa' brgyud pa, exemplified in the free and wandering life of the *smyon pa yogin* Milarepa. The fact that we find the same nostalgia for the early figures of the lineage in the works of rGyal thang pa reminds us that we cannot restrict to the *smyon pas*[39] of the fifteenth century what appears to have

[38] In *Miraculous Journey*, Lama Kunga Rimpoche and Brian Cutillo, trans. (Novato, CA: Lotsawa, 1986), and *Drinking the Mountain Stream*, (Novato, CA: Lotsawa Press, 1978), p. 33.

[39] In the rGyal thang pa version [illegible] *thar*, we find him co[illegible] a crazy *yogin* (folio 230) in the [illegible] first flight from cave to cave. The ideal and its critics existed long before gTsang smyon tried to 'revive' it.

been an enduring spirit among the more eremitical practitioners of bKa' brgyud pa spirituality.

Part II

Chapter 6 The Doctrinal Tradition: Bka' brgyud pa Spirituality

In his introduction to the translation of the Life of Milarepa, the distinguished Tibetan scholar Lobsang P. Lhalungpa makes the following observations on the concept of a 'tradition':

> ...It is not possible for any book, however great, to communicate the entire atmosphere of a tradition, including the thousand and one impulses that the teacher sets in motion by interacting with individuals who in their turn may succeed or fail in the outer expression of their understanding. It is easy to accept intellectually that a tradition is a world, but not so easy to feel what this means, especially when the very core and heart of a tradition, in this case the practice of meditation, is presented with such intuitive force. A tradition is a world. In that world, the essence of the tradition, the single movement that created it from the beginning and that continues to maintain it in the lives of all who follow it, permeates and suffuses all the forms and details of life and perhaps may never be spoken of explicitly. But when it is spoken of explicitly, and in a language that seems familiar (such as the language of psychology) it is a mistake to appropriate it as one's own without asking why all these other forms are also part of the tradition.[1]

Although this paragraph is in part a criticism of the recent transplantation of Vajrayāna teachings to the Western world, it also calls attention to the indispensably environmental character of sacred transmission. These limitations condition the process of translation not only of texts but also of ideas.

[1] LM p. xviii.

Keeping in mind a certain attitude of modesty toward the "world" of the bKa' brgyud pa Saints, we shall proceed to describe the basic teachings on spiritual practice in relation to which the biographies of Milarepa were written. Here we are speaking of `spirituality', a term first used by French Catholic writers of the seventeenth century to describe the system of practices of the religious life. Louis Bouyer observes: "Christian spirituality (or any other spirituality) is distinguished from dogma by the fact that, instead of studying or describing the objects of belief as it were in the abstract, it studies the reactions which these objects arouse in the religious consciousness."[2] It would therefore seem appropriate in interpreting the bKa' brgyud pa `tradition' for Western scholars, that we make use of this terminology.

Thus when we speak of spirituality, it is necessary not only to catalogue the beliefs and practices of a particular religious tradition, but also to describe the purpose of these practices in terms of their effects on the practitioner. bKa' brgyud pa spirituality is a form of _yoga_ that may be discussed in relation to the Indian traditions of yogic practice. Both early _upadeśas_ and _caryâgîtis_ align with the later sources available to us, showing a remarkable continuity in the spirituality of this lineage, in spite of its ability to embrace the teachings of

[2] Louis Bouyer. _The Spirituality of the New Testament and the Fathers_. (New York: The Seabury Press, 1982) p. viii.

the bKa' gdams pa (successors of Atiśa) and of the rÑing ma pa.[3] However, our sources affirm over and over again that the practices of the bKa' brgyud pa are centered on the Nâ ro chos drug (The Six Yogas of Nâropa) and Mahâmudrâ. It is the Chos Drug (Six `Practices') that Milarepa mentions in his songs on `rtsa rlung' exercises, dream/sleep practices, heat yoga, ejection of consciousness, or the bardo. Mahâmudrâ is a term that should not be restricted to a type of meditation practice; it is an expression used by bKa' brgyud pa masters to define an attitude toward life in general: everything is `marked' with the `great seal' of ultimate reality, of Dharmakâya, for those who can see.[4]

[3] The bKa' brgyud pa spirituality that we will be discussing is also presented by contemporary Western practitioners in The Life of Marpa, pp.xxix-1. In Drinking the Mountain Stream, pp. 13-31, the Six Yogas are termed `subsidiary practices' (p. 28) "to prepare for and accompany the practice of mahâmudrâ," which seems to be a deviation from the mainstream of the tradition. For a more scholarly and mainstream approach, see the Introduction by Reginald Ray and the "Historical and Theoretical Background" by David Stott in Karma Thinley, The History of the Sixteen Karmapas of Tibet (Boulder: Prajñâ Press, 1980).

[4] "The mahâmudrâ (`great seal') yogin realizes that as `buddha nature' (Skt.: tathâgatagarbha; Tib.: de gsheg sñing po) is the underlying reality of all phenomena, whatever arises is `sealed' with coemergent (Skt.: sahaja; Tib.: lhan gcig skyes pa) perfection," Karma Thinley, op. cit, p. 30.

In the BA, we find another way of describing the transmission that came through Milarepa and Ras chung pa which is in two parts: "...the class of precepts on the upâya mârga which belongs to the Tantra, and that of the precepts of the Oral Tradition which belongs to the Cycle of Initiation." (pp. 449-450) The translation may be defective here. Roerich also speaks of "Eight Doctrines of Nâropa" with hidden precepts of Marpa (Mar pa'i mgur chen brgyad). This information does not turn up in other sources that I have seen.

In The Life of Marpa the Translator we learn that: "Mahâmudrâ transmission came to Marpa from Maitrîpa, along with the ârya-Mañjuśrî-nâma-saṃgîti and the dohâs." The

To set the spirituality of the bKa' brgyud pa in full relief, it is useful to examine briefly the roots of yogic practice in ancient India. Patañjali's Yoga Sûtras

> ...give an extremely clear, precise, and detailed description of the function of the mind and its relation to the different levels of consciousness. But the Sûtras also go beyond the mind to the core of being, the Self, and so provide a spiritual dimension..[5]

In short, the Yoga Sûtras are a spirituality. The famous second sûtra is as follows: yogaś-citta-vṛtti-nirodhaḥ/ "Yoga is the suppression of the modifications of the mind." The commentary by the Samkhya-yogacharya Swami Hariharananda Aranya states:

> The suppression of the fluctuations means keeping the mind fixed on any particular desired object, i.e. acquiring by practice the power of holding the mind undisturbed in the contemplation of any particular object...When the mind acquires the power of remaining fixed, then any modification arising in the mind can also be retained to the desired extent.[6]

transmissions from Nâropa to Marpa were the `four special transmissions', the Six Yogas, and Mahâmudrâ transmission `showing the mind as innate coemergent wisdom." pp. 28-32,33. Many of the Songs of Milarepa give instructions in outline form for these practices, and the narrative context indicates that these songs were used by yogins to memorize, point by point, the overall structure of practice. Specific oral directions were also given to individual disciples, but these are absent from the Mila mgur 'bum. The rnam thar, for the most part, lacks even the kârika-type instruction verses. It is the mgur 'bum that is a repository of bKa' brgyud pa esotericism.

5 Swami Hariharananda Aranya, ed. Yoga Philosophy of Patañjali. (SUNY Press, Albany 1983) From the Foreword by Swami Gopalananda, p. vii.

6 Ibid., pp. 7-8.

The effort required to accomplish this, as anyone who has tried it knows, is formidable. Therefore, when we come across texts on Mahâmudrâ, the contemplative practice transmitted by the bKa' brgyud pa Gurus, we may be startled to read: "There are three essentials in the Mahâmudrâ practice: equilibrium, relaxation, and naturalness."[7] And also: "The core of Mahâmudrâ practice consists of two things, non-effort and non-correction." However the tradition associated with Milarepa explained this point very clearly:

> Concerning the practice of non-correction, one should understand three things: If wandering thoughts and desire-passions are not corrected, one will fall into the lower realms. If the Blissfulness, Illumination, and Non-distinction are not corrected, one will fall into the Three Realms of Saṃsāra. Only the immanent Self-mind needs no correction.[8]

Although the Mahâmudrâ teachings speak of naturalness and relaxation, an effort to avoid serious pitfalls is also necessary for correct practice. We find in the *Mila mgur 'bum*: "Easy it is to glimpse the Dharmakâya, but hard to stabilize its realization,"[9] which indicates the need to widen flashes of mystical insight, until the higher consciousness becomes a continuous way of seeing.

[7] Garma C. C. Chang, trans. and ed. *Six Yogas of Nâropa and Teachings on Mahâmudrâ*, (Ithaca: Snow Lion Publications, reprint of *Teachings of Tibetan Yoga*, Secaucus, N.J.: Citadel Press, 1963.) p. 37.

[8] Ibid. p. 42.

[9] *Songs*, p. 101.

A classic text on Mahâmudrâ may be found in the Tibetan Bstan 'gyur (TT, vol. 69, pp. 134-135). This is the Mahâmudrâ Upadeśa given by Tilopa to Nâropa on the banks of the Ganges, and translated into Tibetan by Marpa. A brief discussion of this text will put us into the world of the eleventh century North Indian Mahâsiddhas at the height of the transmission of the anuttarayoga tantras to Tibet.

The text begins:

> Mahâmudrâ cannot be made manifest (phyag rgya chen po bstan du med gyur kyang), but for you who are devoted to the Guru, who have mastered the ascetic practices, and are forbearing in suffering, intelligent Nâropa, take this to heart...[10] (dka' ba spyod cing bla ma la gus pa'i/ sdug bsngal bzod ldan blo 'gros na' ro pa/ skal ldan khyod kyi sñing la 'di ltar 'byos/)

In this verse, we are already in the world of bKa' brgyud pa `spirituality': devotion to the Guru, fearlessness and forbearance in suffering and ascetic practice, and heart-to-heart or mind-to-mind (rGyal thang pa, folio 217: thugs la thugs sprod) transmission of teachings. In the rGyal thang pa text, the terms dka' thub dang dka' spyad are used during the pregnancy of Milarepa's mother to describe her hardships and difficulties; during the adulthood of the Saint, the same words mean his practice of penance and austerity. Thus the experiences of the mother are a foreshadowing of the way of life of the son. And, as in the case of the mother (folios 197-198),

[10] I am following the translation of Chögyam Trungpa on pages 157-163 of his The Myth of Freedom. (Berkeley: Shambhala, 1976), with slight modifications based on my reading of the Tibetan text.

difficulties in dreams and in daily labor are overcome and, "afterwards, when the labor was done, very pure things were produced."

Milarepa's conversion after years of the practice of destructive magic involves a profound revulsion for his crimes and an intense fear of the karmic consequences. He begs (folio 205-6) for a "chos (dharma practice) that produces Buddhahood in one body, in one lifetime." The reason for this urgency is neither impatience with Mahâyâna methods, nor compassion for the beings he will be able to help as an Enlightened One. Rather, the motivation is fear of eons in hell (see folia 205-207; 212-213). Only later, with the direct realization of impermanence and the insubstantiality (sñing po med; niḥsvabhâva) of all things, does this fear give way to a deeper and wiser phase of renunciation, on the eve of the Saint's departure for years of solitary practice in remote mountain caves. (folio 219; verse 15, and the Saint's first mgur). Traditionally, the bKa' brgyud pa Gurus present this initial phase as the `four thoughts that turn the mind to Dharma (blo ldog nam bzhi)': 1. the precious human life; 2. death and impermanence; 3. action and result (karma); and 4. the defects of cyclic existence.[11] Returning to Tilopa:

[11] p. 31, David Stott's essay in The History of the Sixteen Karmapas. This is considered the `hînayâna' phase of bKa' brgyud pa `tri-yâna' spirituality, and is elaborated in sGampopa's Jewel Ornament of Liberation, chapters 1 & 2.

> Look at the nature of the world/ Impermanent like a mirage or a dream;/ even the mirage or dream does not exist. / Therefore, develop renunciation and abandon worldly activities.

At the start of spiritual practice, it is necessary to practice a serious form of renunciation, if only to dramatize to the human mind the fact that a radically transformative process is about to begin. The more profound motivation for renunciation is the fact of the impermanence of the things of this world. Since misery arises because one desires what is not present, or because one does not want what is present, the opposite of misery can only be obtained by renouncing dramatizations of the various passions. Concretely, this renunciation took the form of a search for the Guru in the lives of Nâropa, Marpa, and Milarepa. sGampopa, however, upon the death of his wife, embraced the monastic life, the more usual means available to the Buddhist renunciate. In effect, the message of these _rnam thars_ is that the quest for the Teacher and the quest for the Absolute are one quest and the hardships, even death, encountered in finding and learning from a true Guru constitute the renunciation without which realization is impossible. Thus:

> Renounce servants and kin, causes of passion and aggression. Meditate alone in the forest, in retreats, in solitary places.

This Milarepa accomplished by his long years in caves of Nepal and southern Tibet. He also practiced the 'tree-rootman's austerity' (one of the early Buddhist _dhûtaguṇas_)

in a jungle area in Senge ling (rGyal thang pa folio 238), where he sang a Song of Preference for Solitude to his patrons.

Then a startling recommendation, following upon the command to `meditate'(bsgoms):

> //bsgom du med pa'i dang la gnas par gyis// thob med thob na phyag rgya chen po thob//
> Stay in the `state' without meditation; if you attain non-attainment, you attain the Mahâmudrâ! The nature of cyclic existence is petty, causing passion and aggression. The things we have created (byas chos) have no substance; therefore, seek the essence (sñing po) of the ultimate (don dam). The mind, by its nature, cannot see the meaning of transcendent mind ('das don mi mthong). Action, by its nature, cannot discover the meaning of non-action (byar med don mi rñed). If you would attain the realization of transcendent mind and non-action, then cut the root of mind and let consciousness remain naked (rang sems rtsad chod rig pa gcer bur zhog). Let the polluted waters of mental activities clear. Do not seek to stop wanderings of the mind, but let them come to rest of themselves. If there is no rejecting or accepting, then you are liberated in the Mahâmudrâ. (snang ba dgag bsgrub mi bya rang sor zhig// spor len med na phyag chen por grol//

Here we have the most apparent difference between Mahâmudrâ practice and the classic practice of yoga. The spontaneously arising thoughts that occur during meditation are not to be suppressed, but are to be allowed to come to rest of their own accord. The process is not quite to ignore thoughts, since that would imply aversion, but to refuse to feed the thoughts on any latent emotional energy of rejecting or accepting. A repellent thought is not shunned or feared; an attractive thought is not pursued[12].

[12] See rGyal Thang pa, folio 238. "Having cares and worries is also unnecessary; a meditator leaves the mind alone [in its natural state]. Our need for the thoughts that rise up

This type of advice is developed in great detail in the work of Takpo Tashi Namgyal, a bKa' brgyud pa master of the sixteenth century. It continues the type of instruction in "how to dispel obstacles and make spiritual progress in solitude" given to Milarepa by Marpa (rGyal thang pa, folio 216).[13] The basis for dispelling thoughts in this way is significant; all dharmas (phenomena) are without a permanent basis; they all arise co-dependently (pratîtyasamutpâda). We are here moving into the Mahâyâna phase of the bKa' brgyud pa spiritual path, with the arising of prajñâ, which is direct insight into the voidness of phenomena and of self. United with compassion, this insight produces the essential bodhicitta, or altruistic attitude that enables one to set forth on the path of the Bodhisattva, leaving behind the narrow path of the Arhat. However, Tilopa does not present bodhicitta at this point. The evolution of this doctrine among the bKa' brgyud pa depends on the efforts of sGampopa to systematize and combine the Mahâsiddha teachings with those of the bKa' gdams pa Mahâyâna scholastics.

Tilopa follows his advice on meditation with two metaphors:

is also small. Delusions! Who needs them? The true nature [of reality] arises in the mind [of itself]."

[13] A similar discussion, contrasting rdzogs chen with the citta-nirodha goal of classic yoga, may be found in Namkhai Norbu, The Crystal and the Way of Light, John Shane, ed. (New York and London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1986), pp. 85-86.

> When trees grow leaves and branches,/ If you cut the roots, the many leaves and branches wither. / Likewise if you cut the root of mind, / The various mental activities will subside. The darkness that has collected in thousands of eons, / One torch will dispel. / Likewise, one moment's experience of luminous mind / will dissolve the veil of karmic impurities.

The Yogâcâra tradition[14] that has strongly shaped the contours of bKa' brgyud spirituality, expounds the teaching of the Daśabhûmika Sûtra : "O sons of the victorious Buddha, the three planes of existence are of the mind only." In interpreting this doctrine in the light of Tilopa's text, we are following Takpo Tashi Namgyal's traditional exposition. Citing Guru Savareśvara he affirms: "All things are but inherent phenomena of the mind. Apart from the mind nothing exists, not even the minutest particle."[15] He cites the Mañjuśrî-vikrîdita-sûtra: "If the nature of

[14] See David Stott,"Historical and Theoretical Background", p. 30. In the Songs, p. 390: "What I understand is that all manifestations [consist in] Mind, and Mind is the Illuminating Voidness without any shadow or impediment." And on p. 391: "The minds of all sentient beings are void yet illuminating. They can neither be affected by the defilments of Saṃsâra nor by the glories of Nirvâṇa. This very mind is called the Buddha of Universal Origin, or the Treasury of Buddhahood (tathâgatagarbha). It is only because we do not understand ourselves that our minds are veiled by temporal blindness; we, as a result, begin to wander in Saṃsâra and become miserable beings of desire. He who [fully] realizes his own mind is called the Enlightened One, the Pure One, or the Buddha, and he attains Nirvâṇa." The luminosity of mind is taught in rGyal thang pa, folio 229.

[15] See Takpo pp 6-11. The reason why Takpo Tashi Namgyal cites so many sûtras and śâstras is because previous critics of bKa' brgyud pa Mahâmudrâ (especially Sa skya Paṇḍita) viewed this doctrine as a heresy. See BA pp. 724-725. Sa Paṇ rejected the connection between the Perfection of Wisdom teachings and Mahâmudrâ realization. (See Douglas Rhoton, op. cit.)

mind is not realized, It is drawn toward imaginary thoughts/ and is forced to wander in the three planes / And six spheres of existence."

The notion of `cutting the root of mind' may be understood in the teaching of Takpo Tashi Namgyal:

> ...our Meditational Order ...has therefore established that the determination of the mind [as essentially Voidness] first can easily make the determination of sense objects a spontaneous self-release. This process of nullifying (the mind's clinging to the self of personality) was compared by Tilopa to the analogy of a tree. By cutting the roots of a tree first, its leaves and branches will dry up automatically.[16]

Thus, the bKa' brgyud pa, in accepting the doctrines of dharma-nairâtmya and anâtmîya, wish to include a practice that directly subverts the mind, that should simultaneously quell any clinging to phenomena or self.

The mind, in the teaching of sGampopa, consists essentially of three aspects: essence, nature, and characteristics. rJe Phag mo gru explains that `essence' means the emptiness of arising, ceasing, or conceiving; `nature' means unobstructed lucidity, and `characteristics' mean the diverse appearances on the levels of Saṃsâra and Nirvâṇa.[17] The next analogy, that of the single torch dispelling the darkness, refers to the second aspect of mind, unobstructed lucidity. Takpo Tashi Namgyal cites the

[16] See Takpo, pp. 211-212, for an extensive discussion of the problem of following the sûtras and śâstras (e.g. Dharmakîrti and Âryadeva) on first challenging sense objects with the realization that these phenomenal realities are void of `self-nature', i.e. as lacking perduring substratum.

[17] Ibid., p 214.

Jñānālokālaṃkāra-sūtra: "O Mañjuśrī, enlightenment by its innate nature consists of luminous clarity, because the mind's intrinsic nature is detached from any inner defilement and is equal to or possesses the nature of space, while encompassing space through its identical characteristics. For all these reasons it is designated as being luminous clarity."[18]

The idea that the `veil of karmic impurities' can be dissolved by a moment of experience of the luminosity of the mind is explained as follows: "As long as the mind remains clouded by transitory defilement, even though its intrinsic state is pure, the qualities of enlightenment will not crystallize themselves. They will, however, emerge spontaneously upon the elimination of the mind's defilement." [19] But this defilement is not ultimately eliminated by a laborious process of moral self-examination, for if that were the case, then the mind, "after purifying the impurity, might again be stained." Rather, "discovering the mind's intrinsic lucidity is liberation indeed. Undefiled by lust and emotional impurities, unclouded by any dualistic perceptions, this superior mind is indeed the supreme Nirvāṇa."[20]

[18] Ibid., p. 216.

[19] Ibid., p. 219.

[20] Ibid.

Tilopa's counsel to 'men of lesser intelligence who cannot grasp this'[21] (blo dam na skye bo don la mi gnas na//) is to

> concentrate your awarenss and focus on the breath.//Through different eye-gazes and concentration practices (lta stangs dang ni sems 'dzin du ma yis)//Discipline your mind until it rests naturally (rig pa ngang la mig nas (?) bar du bcun/).

This kind of discipline, which is basic to the practice of calming the mind (śamathâ), is fundamental to Mahâmudrâ practice in the sense that until the mind rests easily in a state of calm concentration, it is impossible to confront both the full range of phenomena and the mind itself as a perceiver.[22]

[21] The distinction of persons on the path to realization is discussed in Michael M. Broido, "Padma dKar-po on Tantra as Ground, Path and Goal," Journal of the Tibet Society 3 (1984): 5-46. "The cig car ba has accumulated a great deal of merit, is usually an ârya practicing the anuttarayoga-tantras, is suitable to receive the entire teaching at once, and has moments of insight (darśana, mthong-ba) which are compared with the sun shining through clouds; it is this insight which is called dngos-po'i gnas-lugs, it forms the ground upon which his path rests and, as far as it goes, does not differ from the cognition of a perfect buddha. By contrast, the rim-gyis-pa has less merit, does not receive the whole teaching at once, and does not have these moments of insight. He may still be an ârya and practice the anuttarayogatantras, but for him there is a different structuring of the upâya-mârga. He will not attain buddhahood in this lifetime, but may do so from the intermediate state between death and rebirth. Since he does not have full insight he cannot take his own defilements as the path." p. 11. These observations render a definition of the attainment of a Buddhist Saint ever more complex, for this system seems to divide âryas into cig car ba, thod rgal ba, and rim gyis pa (pp. 11-12). These problems, Broido tells us, are dealt with in a 'Brug pa cycle of works on Mahâmudrâ and related topics going back to Gtsang pa Rgya ras, found in the Phyag chen gan mdzod, 4a1.

[22] Within the limits inevitably posed by translation, it is interesting to see the same approach placed on the lips of

The notion that the mind can perceive itself as void is further compared to the notion of space (ever an analogue of the unconditioned):

> If you perceive space, //The fixed ideas of center and boundary dissolve.//Likewise, if mind perceives mind (de bzhin sems kyis sems la brtag byas na)// All mental activities will cease, you will remain in a state of non-thought,//and you will see the original nature of the Mind (bzhin mthong= dṛṣṭa)//

Conze comments on the Buddhist concept of `unsupported thought' as "the thought which the bodhisattva should produce...[which is] a completely free thought, which depends on no object or motive. It is the white heat of wisdom intent on the luminous transparency of the Void. In Tibetan terms it is Vajradhara, the âdibuddha, in union with his consort, Prajñâpâramitâ."[23] (Trungpa's translation takes sems kyi rang bzhin mthong as `bodhicitta', perhaps with the consent of the tradition.)

Christ in a Chinese Nestorian document of about the year 717: "One who constantly practices our religion does not seek for Rest and Joy, but Rest and Joy itself will naturally come to him. This may show you that there is a law which makes entity to come to existence out of non-entity." P. Y. Saeki, The Nestorian Documents and Relics in China (Tokyo: The Academy of Oriental Culture, Tokyo Institute, 1950), pp. 287-289. The last sentence turns up in Bon po creation narratives! See Per Kvaerne, "Dualism in Tibetan Cosmogonic Myths and the Question of Iranian Influence," in Christopher I. Beckwith, ed., Silver on Lapis: Tibetan Literary Culture and History (Bloomington: The Tibet Society, 1987), p. 169.

[23] E. Conze. Buddhist Wisdom Books (London: George Allen & Unwin, 1958), p. 48.

Tilopa's following stanza on the dissolution of stray thoughts carries us from the world of Indian Buddhist metaphor to later Tibetan poesis, such as that of Milarepa:

> Vapors arising from the earth become clouds and then vanish into the sky;//It is not known where the clouds go when they have dissolved.//Likewise, the waves of thoughts derived from mind //Dissolve when mind perceives mind.//

To which we can compare the following in the _Songs_ of Milarepa: "If you felt fine in meditating on the sky, so be it with the clouds- Clouds are but manifestations of the sky; Therefore, rest right in the sphere of the sky!"[24] This verse asserts that, by a different method and a different ontology, in the Mahâmudrâ one acquires the goal of yoga.

Tilopa follows with an exposition of the mind's nature so that there is no confusion about its being without characteristics, and yet in some sense `luminous'; the mind is beyond definition and localization, and only analogously like `space':

> Space has neither color nor shape; //It is changeless, it is not tinged by black or white.//Likewise, luminous mind has neither color nor shape; //It is not tinged by black or white, virtue or vice (_dge sdig dkar gnag_).// The sun's pure and brilliant essence // Cannot be dimmed by the darkness that endures for a thousand aeons. //Likewise, the luminous essence of mind (_rang sems sñing po 'od gsal_) // Cannot be dimmed by the long aeons of cyclic existence.// Though it may be said that space is empty, //Space cannot be described.// Likewise,though it may be said that mind is luminous,//Naming it does

[24] _Songs_, pp. 147-148.

not prove that it exists.//Space is completely without locality.//Likewise, Mahâmudrâ mind dwells nowhere. (de bzhin rang sems phyag chen rten yul med)//

All this material could have been in an entirely Mahâyâna context. In later stanzas, some tantric ideas are introduced, such as a hint of Guru yoga, the practice of Karmamudrâ (where at last bodhicitta is presented as the `union of skillful means and wisdom') as the basis for effective saṃpannakrama practice, and the attainment of mundane and supreme siddhis.

This hymn of Tilopa[25], both initiatic and explanatory, shows that the Mahâsiddhas were capable of versification of greater length than the caryâgîtis and dohâs. The fact that these ideas remained as the central features of bKa' brgyud spirituality is demonstrated in numerous mgur of Milarepa.[26]

[25] The song continues for another two folia, touching on themes such as the `unborn âlaya' (kun gzhi skye med); the inefficacy of texts (even tantra) and philosophy (sngags su sma dang pha rol phyin pa dang//'dul ba'i snga snod la sogs chos rnams dang// rang rang gzhung dang grub ba'i mtha' yis kyang//'od gsal phyag rgya chen po mthong mi 'gyur/) for attaining realization of Mahâmudrâ; that luminosity is veiled only by the rising of desire (zhe 'dod byung bas 'od gsal ma mthong sgribs//); that equipoised this way in meditation -without desire, without extremes - you will burn away the contamination of your misdeeds; you can thus save other beings; that the blessing of a true Guru will liberate one's mind from suffering (sdug bsngal thar 'dod bla ma mkhas ba bstan// byin brlabs zhugs pas rang sems grol bar 'gyur); that karmamudrâ practice causes the rising of bliss in the Void, along with the union of skillful means and gnosis (zabs dang shes rab) which creates the internal `maṇḍala' whose blessing-power can be distributed through the body (saṃpannakrama practices); such practice gives rise to long life, radiance, and strength as the mundane siddhis; once these have been attained, go on to attain the supreme siddhi.

[26] See, for example, "The Four Stages of Mahâmudrâ", Songs, pp. 98-99.

The *Mgur 'bum* gives the following in the chapter on Milarepa's guidance of sGampopa:

> My dear Physician Priest,//The Ultimate View is to observe one's mind//steadfastly and with determination.//If one searches for the View outside one's mind,//'Tis like a [blind] monster//Seeking in vain for gold.
>
> My dear Physician Priest,//The ultimate Practice is not to consider//Distractions[27] and drowsiness as faults.//Doing so to stave them off is like kindling a lamp in bright daylight.//
>
> My dear Physician Priest,//The Ultimate Action is to cease taking and abandoning.//To take and to abandon is to be//like a bee trapped in a net.//
>
> My dear Physician Priest,//The Ultimate Discipline is to rest//At ease in the View.//If one seeks the Discipline-Without-Rules//Outside [of one's own mind], it is like//Lifting the flood-gates of a dam. (cf. rGyal thang pa, folio 220)
>
> My dear Physician Priest,//The Ultimate Accomplishment is the full conviction of one's mind.//If one seeks elsewhere the Accomplishment of Non-being,//It is like a turtle trying // to leap into the sky.//
>
> My dear Physician Priest,//The Ultimate Guru is one's mind.//If one seeks elsewhere a Guru,//It is like trying [in vain]//To get rid of one's own mind.//In short, my good Physician Priest,//You should know that all forms //Are nothing but the mind!//[28]

The application of the fundamental `attitude' of Mahāmudrā practice to the completion stage (*saṃpannakrama*) practices of the *anuttarayoga* tantra among the bKa' brgyud pa may be seen in their teachings on the `Six Doctrines, or

[27] See R. A. Stein, *Vie et Chants de 'Brug pa Kun legs le Yogin* for bKa' brgyud pa teachings on *rnam rtog chos sku* (discursive thoughts inseparable from the Dharmakāya), p. 434.

[28] *Songs*, p. 477. cf. letter of 15 May, 1988, from Franco and Kristin Pizzi.

Yogas, of Nâropa'. In fact, the fusion of Mahâmudrâ with the Six Yogas constitutes the core of the esoteric system of the bKa' brgyud pa. In the biographies there are interesting descriptions of these practices employing the inner `veins' (nâḍî) and the currents that pass through them (prâṇa). What we are calling the attitude of Mahâmudrâ is given in the Life of Marpa the Translator: "The ordinary and extraordinary practice of bringing whatever occurs to the path" which is the third of the three Mahâmâyâ yogas taught by Kukkurîpa.[29] It is seen in Milarepa's attitude toward adversity in the first chapter of the mGur 'Bum, or facing possible death in the rGyal thang pa version, folio 232 (on La phyis), or in the face of his actual death (folios 259ff).

This very concrete attitude toward circumstances is combined with the marvellous, such as the assistance of the mkha' 'gro ma at La phyis, who advise him on the practice of the Six Yogas, thus rounding out the way Mahâmudrâ and the Completion Stage practices were present in the religious imagination of this lineage. In fact, the mkha' 'gro ma provide the context for the karmamudrâ practice that Tilopa recommends for the attainment of both mundane and supreme siddhis by means of the completion (perfecting) stage practices (see footnote on the Tilopa upadeśa).

[29] Life of Marpa, p. 19, where it is called `the yoga of ultimate dharma' (mthar thug chos kyi rnal 'byor).

Arising and Perfecting Yogas

The topic of arising and perfecting 'steps' (*krama*) or yogas is frequently mentioned in the songs of Milarepa and other bKa' brgyud pa masters. This terminology is appropriate to the *anuttarayoga* tantra, "which is radically distinct from the three lower orders [of tantra] in its emphasis on the unsurpassable all-pervading nature of buddha-energy."[30] David Stott explains with admirable succinctness:

> *Anuttarayoga* is divided into a 'development' (Tib.: *bskye rim*) and 'fulfillment' stage (Tib.: *rdzogs rim*). In the first stage the yogin identifies himself and his environment with the divine appearance of the devatâ and his palace. The fulfillment stage completes the transformation and itself possesses a twofold aspect, one based on form and one on formlessness. The former aspect is the yoga of the 'channels' (Skt.: *nâḍî*, Tib.: *rtsa*), 'breath' (Skt.: *prâṇa*, Tib.: *rlung*) and "seed" (Skt.: *bindu*, Tib.: *tig le*). The latter aspect is meditation on the 'coincident luminosity and emptiness' (Tib: *gsal stong zung 'jug*) of natural awareness.[31]

We can see that these two sets of steps parallel and presuppose the 'four aspects of initiation' for the *anuttarayoga* tantra:

1. The initiation of the Vase is the empowerment through manifestation of the *yidam*, which prepares the initiate for the inward transformation of perceptive forms (which corresponds to the *utpattikrama*, see below.)

[30] David Stott in *The Lives of the Sixteen Karmapas*, p. 34.

[31] Ibid.

2. The initiation of Concealed Union is the empowerment through the speech of the yidam, which prepares the initiate for the transformation of the energies of body, speech, and sound.

3. The initiation of supreme wisdom is the empowerment through the enlightened mind of the yidam, which prepares the initiate for the transformation of consciousness.

4. The initiation of indefinable identification is the empowerment through the ultimate nature of the yidam, which prepares the initiate for Complete Enlightenment.[32]

Garma C. C. Chang defines the two Steps (which he calls yogas) as follows:

"In the Anuttara Tantra, the `Supreme Tantra', there are two major practices: one is the Arising Yoga (skyed rim) and the other is the Perfecting Yoga (rdzogs rim)[33]. the former, ... is a preparation for the latter, and stresses the concentration and visualization practices. Its main features contain the following steps:

1. Visualizing all objects and the self-body as dissolving into the great Void.

2. Visualizing in the Void a bīja seed transforming itself into an image of the Self-patron Buddha.

3. Visualizing the Self-Patron Buddha in its en-

[32] LM, p. 214, fn. 8; For an extensive treatment of initiations and consecrations, see ITB, pp. 213-277.

[33] A simpler system is given in the Life of Marpa the Translator based on the Mahāmāyā, with Kukkurīpa's system of three yogas (see bKa' brgyud sngags mdzod Vol. 3, #1, pp. 281-293).

tirety, including the Three Main Channels and the Four Cakras.

4. Visualizing the Maṇḍala and identifying all manifestations with Buddhahood.

5. Reciting the Mantra of the Patron Buddha and applying a specific visualization for a special yogic purpose.

6. Visualizing all objects, including the Self-Patron Buddha Body, as dissolving into the bīja in the Heart cakra, and the bīja again dissolving into the great Void.

7. From the Void again projecting the Self-Patron Buddha and the Maṇḍala. This Yoga stresses visualizations and the basic yogic and spiritual training, in order to lay the groundwork for the Perfecting Yoga practice...."[34]

[34] Garma C. C. Chang. The Six Yogas of Naropa. pp. 122-3. Further explanations: p. 122, Ardussi (JAOS, 1977): "...the meditative processes alluded to in these songs are subsumed under what is termed Generation in Oneself (Tib. bdag bskyed), an aspect of the Process of Generation (utpatti-krama; Tib. bskyed rim), the first of the two-fold division of Tantric meditation according to the highest Tantra class (Anuttara-yoga tantra). Here, the practitioner visualizes from the realm of Emptiness ...an image of himself (termed the Symbolic being, the samaya-sattva) as a particular divinity accompanied by its retinue of attendants, the maṇḍala of the divinity. The locus of the visualization is the practitioner's own body (as Milarepa says: `the hearth stones of Body, Speech, and Mind,' `The Mandala of Victory which is my own body'). Having purified and empowered the visualized image by mantras, the actual divinity (termed the Knowledge Being, jñāna-sattva) is summoned from the realm of the Absolute to fuse with the visualized image, by which technique the meditator `becomes' the deity and gains its `ego' (Tib. nga rgyal)"... See also: Mullin , Dalai Lama II, pp. 104-110. And Tsong Kha pa on the Six Yogas (in Muses/Chang Chen Chi: Esoteric Teachings.

The `Perfecting Yoga' or Completion Stage (sampanna-krama or niṣpannakrama) provides a plethora of means by which the "yogin strives to fuse his now divine being with the clear light ('od gsal) and Great Bliss (bde ba chen po) of Emptiness,"[35] the main intent of which is to lead the prâṇas (interior energies associating breath and mental activity) into the central psycho-somatic channel, the `avadhûtî'. The yogin thus transforms the energies he has accumulated through karma into the light of wisdom and is empowered to realize Dharmakâya.[36] rGyal thang pa describes Milarepa's struggles with this practice on folios 221-222, comparing the blockages in the nâḍîs to a dam in a stream; visualizing the `diamond' (indestructibility, vajra) as abiding in the avadhûtî, the consciousness is liberated and the blockages are swept away.

Mkhas grub rje notes that "in the three lower Tantras (i.e., Kriyâ, Caryâ, and Yoga) there are neither the aims (artha) nor the terms (vyavahara) of the Steps of Production (utpattikrama) and the Steps of Completion (niṣpanna-

pp. 150-169): "In short, the main objective and function of the Arising Yoga - the practice of visualizing the maṇḍala- is to ripen the yogi, to bring his consciousness forth to the realization of the identity of Buddha and sentient beings." (From Tsong kha pa's Commentary on the Six Yogas of Nâropa).

35 See Ardussi, op. cit., p. 122.

36 Garma C. C. Chang. The Six Yogas of Nâropa. p. 123.

krama).[37] It is only in the anuttarayoga tantras that this terminology applies. Mkhas grub rje comments further:

> For the complete characteristics of the Steps of Completion, it does not suffice to have merely the intense contemplation of voidness of the natural state (gnas lugs) of things (dharma) and the intense contemplation of the yoga of the winds (vâyu), but it is also necessary to have three special things, ...(1) the knowledge of bliss-void (sukha-śûnya) which occurs from making the wind(s) enter, stay, and rise for leaving (ldang ba; Skt.: utthâna) in the central vein (avadhûtî); (2) the divine body which occurs from that [knowledge] ; and (3) the yoga of piercing the vital centers in the uncommon 'means' body (upâya-deha) attracted by those two (i.e. the knowledge and the divine body).[38]

The highest siddhi is attained only by those 'jewel-like persons' who "having arrived at the limit of the Steps of Production...[take] the Steps of Completion" prudently aiming at obtaining the highest siddhis.[39] In order to attain the rank of Vajradhara, one contemplates the union of the purified illusory body and the mind, conceived as the Clear Light of the Absolute Object. From continuous

[37] Lessing and Wayman, p. 157.

[38] Ibid.

[39] Ibid., pp. 218-221. See also pp. 320-323: "he contemplates and controls the samvṛti-mâyâ Steps of Completion, which are the arcane state of body, of speech, and of mind [phases] of the Steps of Completion. Also, through the 'gate' of being a fit vessel for that, he contemplates in piercing the 'centers' [i.e. lotus or cakra centers] of the body. Thus, in the time of the path, he makes the wind enter, dwell, and dissolve in the 'middle vein' (avadhûtî); from that the four Voids are produced; and through their power he accomplishes the 'illusory body' (mâyâ-deha) that is accomplished from the Winds and Mind-only. Thereby he establishes the capacity of accomplishing ultimately the fruit, which is the Sambhogakâya of the pure wind of the speech 'vein'." p. 321.

contemplation of this joining or coupling, one brings about directly the union beyond-learning, which is the rank where one has the seven members of the *saṃpuṭa*. "Hence the fourth initiation, which renders one a fit vessel for that, is conferred subsequently to the third".[40]

Mkhas grub rje explains the Steps of Completion as follows: "One takes as meditative object the winds and the drop (*bindu*) in the 'veins' of the body that is only self-produced and independent of figments by the cognition (*buddhi*). Then one contemplates so as to make the wind enter, dwell, and dissolve in the central channel (*avadhūtī*)."[41]

In a work by the Ninth Karmapa, Wang ch'ug Dor-je, we find a presentation of a full program of Mahâmudrâ training which is complementary to the work of Takpo Tashi Namgyal that we have already cited, wherein Mahâmudrâ training was related to the *sûtras* and *śâstras*. The Ninth Karmapa shows how Mahâmudrâ practice is integrated with other, explicitly tantric practices. In fact, it is appropriate to regard Mahâmudrâ as a pervasive unifying element in the entire system of bKa' brgyud pa spirituality.

For the *utpattikrama*, the Ninth Karmapa instructs:

> ...when of the four tantric initiations you receive the vase empowerment, you are then permitted to

[40] Lessing and Wayman, op. cit. p. 327 and 331f. See also the text of the *rnam thar* of Vajradhara, *infra*, for a discussion of the 'seven factors' or limbs of the *saṃpuṭa*.

[41] Ibid., p. 333.

> do the practices of the development stage and visualise yourself as a deity. Now when you think of yourself as any of the four major meditational deities and you achieve clarity in your meditation of the environment and all beings in it as deities and all sounds as mantra, take a look at the nature of this. To practise in a state of unity of the development and completing stages, free from all thoughts [of true existence] is the Mahâmudrâ of the development stage.[42]

For the sampannakrama, the text conjoins Mahâmudrâ and the subtle body visualizations in the following way:

> The completing stage, according to the Mahâmudrâ classification scheme, is divided into the stage having signs and that without signs. The former refers to the meditations on the energy systems of the subtle body within the context of the development stage visualisations and are done to direct all the energy-winds into the central channel for the blissful realization of Voidness. The latter refers to the Mahâmudrâ meditations done in this state.[43]

He goes on to observe that one should not "stray from the here and now. Be fluid and flowing without holding your body in a severe posture or holding your breath, and so forth." The commentator expands as follows: "Such methods, as found in the `Six Yogas of Nâropa' are useful for achieving the Mahâmudrâ insight, but once achieved are no longer needed."[44]

[42] The Mahâmudrâ: Eliminating the Darkness of Ignorance, by the Ninth Karmapa Wang ch'ug Dor je, with commentary by Beru Khyentze Rinpoche, p. 111.

[43] Ibid, p. 112.

[44] Ibid. p. 125. The `Mahâmudrâ insight' or attitude may be characterized in this way: "Whatever thoughts arise, virtuous, non-virtuous, or unspecified - do not block them or establish [their cessation], do not abandon [them], or adopt [opponents]. Whatever arises, do not follow out, but rather place your attention on it without any grasping."

See also, David Stott, op. cit., pp 34-36, where there is a prsentation of the traditional three aspects of Mahâmudrâ as the (1) view (lta ba) of mind as the union of

The practices that we observe in the life of Milarepa and in particular among the smyon pa imitators of the Mahâsiddhas indicate another phase in the stabilization of the Mahâmudrâ 'insight' with the saṃpannakrama practices. The Ninth Karmapa remarks:

> Further, to practice single-pointedly in a state of inseparable development and completing stages or mental quiescence and penetrative insight is [called the activity that is] all-good. When this has become stable, you may then conceal yourself in fearsome solitary places and with awareness follow the view, meditations, and activities.
>
> And further:
>
> There is no specific sign [differentiating] those who are great. But when they reach the great path of preparation and practise with the emanation of appearances, they adopt the costume of Heruka and mix in fearsome circumstances with no thoughts whatsoever of what is to be eaten or not, what is clean or dirty or what is faulty or correct. Practising in this way, they progress gradually through the path of preparation and when they reach the path of seeing they gain victory on their own part over demonic impulses of Mâra, delusions and Hînayâna [motivations]. Thus [it is called the activity bringing] victory over all directions.[45]

luminosity and voidness; (2) meditation (bsgom pa) including the rites of empowerment, the four preliminaries (sngon 'gro), śamathâ (zhi gnas), the pointing-out instructions given by the guru to the disciple (ngo bo sprod pa), and the several utpattikrama and saṃpannakrama practices, and (3) action, or practice (spyod pa), including the manifestations associated with the smyon pa siddhas, and complete openness to both internal and external obstacles.

[45] Ibid. pp. 112-113. The Commentary continues: "Heruka is a general term for any male meditational deity, or can refer specifically to Cakrasaṃvara. Those of greatest capacity, such as Tilopa and Nâropa, adopt the bone jewellery and tiger-skin costume of a Heruka when on the path of preparation. They act like crazy men, eating anything that comes their way, not unlike the pig. There are many stories of Mahâsiddhas, greatly realized masters, who would eat refuse or fish entrails. Practising in this way, they

The Six Yogas of Nâropa (Nâ ro chos drug)

The classical bKa' brgyud pa formulation of the sampannakrama is the Six Yogas of Nâropa. They may be listed as : 1. Mystic Heat Yoga (gtum mo); 2. Illusory (subtle) Body Yoga (sgyu ma lus); 3. Dream Yoga (mi lam); 4. Clear Light (luminous awareness) yoga ('od gsal); 5. Ejection (or Transference) of the stream of Consciousness ('pho ba); 6. Intermediate State (bar do) Yoga.[46] Tsong kha pa transmitted the following as being the `pith-instructions of Milarepa:'

> These six teachings are the heart-like pith-instruction of Marpa, the final teachings of the Whisper Succession. No other teachings of any Path-with-form can be found superior in essence to these. There is no other temporary or final instruction that does not belong to this teaching. The teaching of the Six Yogas is itself the Perfecting Yoga...[47]

gained victory over all superstitions, preconceptions, and grasping at inherent existence, known collectively as the `Mâra demons'. This is an extremely advanced practice to be able to gain bare perception of Voidness." Ibid., p. 114. This topic is taken up by Takpo Tashi Namgyal, p. 441, fn. 28.

46 In the Life of Marpa the Translator, discrepancies among various traditional lists are noted, p. 94. In both rGyal Thang pa (folio 230) and gTsang smyon (LM, p. 117), the Six Yogas are taught to Milarepa by the mkha' 'gro ma.

47 C. A. Muses, ed. and Chang Chen Chi, trans. Esoteric Teachings of the Tibetan Tantra (York Beach, Maine: Samuel Weiser, 1982), p. 166. Additional information and classic texts on the Six Yogas may be found in G. C. C. Chang, Six Yogas of Nâropa and Teachings on Mahâmudrâ, pp. 51-128; also in Glenn H. Mullin, trans. & ed., Selected Works of the Dalai Lama II: The Tantric Yogas of Sister Niguma, pp. 92-151; W.Y. Evans-Wentz, Tibetan Yoga and Secret Doctrines, pp. 155-274; Tsong Kha pa, in his very useful commentary on the Six Yogas (which very much needs a better edition and translation than that in Muses/Chang), observes that these

A fuller discussion of this topic would require several volumes. For our purposes, in the context of an investigation of the means by which the highest state is realized in the tradition of Bka' brgyud pa spirituality, we will survey the essential principles of the practices and their intended results.

Tsong kha pa observes, regarding the first of the six:

> We have always heard it said that the teaching of Heat Yoga of the Kargyutpa is the very best; however, this should only be understood to the effect that the primoridal and fundamental principle of the Perfecting Yoga is to make the life-prâṇa enter into the Central Channel to produce the Innate Great Bliss. Consequently, as the prime goal is reached, there is no need to pursue any other teachings of the Perfecting Yoga. By the practice of the meditation on the gTummo fire[48], the air enters into the Central Channel and goes through the progressive process of entering, remaining, and dissolving. By means of this power the Bodhi-Heart is brought under control. No more leakage of the Bodhi-Heart will occur; therefore the Yogi is able to practice the Karmayoga which provides favorable conditions for producing the Four Innate Blisses.[49] The teaching of Heat Yoga and Karmayoga is mainly needed for the purpose of producing the Innate Bliss. Relying on this Innate Blissful-Emptiness while awake,

practices of the Perfecting Yoga are quite indispensible for attaining the highest state. In fact, Tsong Kha pa cites the biographical account of the encounter of Milarepa and sGampopa to prove that the samâdhi that the latter had achieved was like \`squeezing butter from sand;' instead, sGampopa was instructed in the fundamental practice of the \`Small Ah of life energy of the Heat Yoga', the first of the Six Yogas. (see Muses/Chang, op. cit., pp. 166-168.) We would take this as evidence that some form of the forty-first chapter of the Mila mgur 'bum pre-existed the redaction of gTsang smyon.

48 See Milarepa's Song of gTummo in the remarkable version of rGyal thang pa, folios 235-236, and a comparison with the gTsang smyon version in our chapter on \`Literary Aspects.'

49 For discussion of karmamudrâ, see Takpo, p. 440-441, fn. 23, and the Mila mgur 'bum, chapter 31.

> the Yoga of Illusory Body should be practiced in the daytime. At time of sleep in the night, exercise on the Illusory Body of the dream state should be stressed.[50] To practice this, one should first exercise the Light Yoga; then one is able to enter into (and master) the dream. In order to be capable of holding the prana during the time of the (unfoldment of) the Light-of-sleeping state, one must first have the ability to gather the prâṇas during the waking state. For both of these practices, the best preparation is Heat Yoga.[51]

However, before the practitioner embarks on the Six Yogas, it is recommended that he be initiated at least into the Hevajra Tantra, and if possible into all five of the principal anuttarayoga tantra systems: Hevajra, Mahâmâyâ, Heruka Cakrasaṃvara, Vajrabhairava [Yamantaka], and Guhyasamâja. The Second Dalai Lama transmits (from the Shangs pa lineage):

> The reason for this is that the Six Yogas of Nâropa and also the Six Yogas of Sister Niguma contain completion stage [saṃpannakrama] practices relying not only upon any one specific tantric system; rather, both of these traditions gather together numerous factors from both the male and female tantric systems.[52]

It is presupposed that a practitioner will receive the prerequisite initiations into the maṇḍala, will keep the tantric precepts, and will have received the oral instructions on the utpattikrama and saṃpannakrama. The work by the Dalai Lama II on these topics is particularly

[50] See rGyal Thang pa, end of folio 227: in the daytime, he practiced illusory body yoga (sgyu lus) and at night, he worked on the clear light ('od gsal).

[51] Muses/Chang, Ibid. Thanks to gifts of food and chang, Milarepa attains realization of gtummo and 'od gsal in rGyal Thang pa, end of folio 224.

[52] Mullin., pp. 101-102.

well translated by Glenn Mullin, and is therefore recommended over the other works cited.

Evidence of Accomplishment of Steps of Arising and Perfecting: The Appearance of Sanctity

Deshung Rinpoche, in commenting on the Shangs pa _rnam thar_ of Vajradhara to the Hansons, observed that a Buddha functions on three levels:

1. The outer (_phyi_) level, exemplified in Śâkyamuni's performance of the prescribed 'Twelve Deeds,' seen by ordinary disciples.

2. The inner (_nang_) level, represented by Vajradhara or Heruka's spiritual accomplishments through the Ten Bodhisattva Stages, and perceived by Bodhisattvas.

3. The secret (_gsang ba_) level, which is his ubiquitous influence as a perfect Buddha, perceived only by other Buddhas.[53]

These three levels also correspond to the Nirmâṇakâya, the Saṃbhogakâya, and the Dharmakâya, respectively, as can be seen in the _rnam thar_ of Vajradhara (_infra_, and even more

[53] Judith Hanson, p. I, notes to her translation of the hagiography of Vajradhara. Slightly different interpretations are given by Janice Willis, "The Search for Padma-can" _The Journal of Religious Studies_ XIII (Spr. 1985), pp. 57-58. A similar interpretation is in Choegyal Gyamtso Tulku's Foreword to _The Divine Madman: The Sublime Life and Songs of Drukpa Kunley_, Keith Dowman, trans. (Clearlake, CA: The Dawn Horse Press, 1980), pp. 21-22.

The idea that a Buddha functions ubiquitously is also one of the '_yan lag bdun_' (seven limbs of the _sampuṭa_) in the _rnam thar_ of Vajradhara; see also, the Milarepa _rnam thar_ folios 256f, which show how the rJe bTsun manifested this capacity.

clearly in the Shangs-pa version). The accomplishments or attainments that are claimed as the fruit of practicing the _utpattikrama_ correspond to the well-known `mundane _siddhis_' which the Six Yogas tradition gives under two headings:

I. The Four Performances

1. The attainment of power to prevent calamities and misfortunes for oneself and others.

2. The attainment of power to increase merits and good fortune.

3. Power to attract desirable things.

4. Power to overcome all hindrances and evils.

II. The Eight _Siddhis_ (accomplishments)

1. The attainment of a mysterious sword that can grant all one's wishes.

2. The attainment of magical pills with miraculous powers of healing.

3. The attainment of a wondrous eye-salve which bestows clairvoyance.

4. The power of rapid walking.

5. A magic elixir which transforms age into youth.

6. Power to take part in the act with goddesses.

7. Power to conceal one's body among crowds.

8. Power to pass through walls, rocks, and mountains.[54]

[54] cf. Lessing and Wayman, pp. 219-220.

The Supreme Accomplishment is characterized by the combination of utpattikrama and saṃpannakrama giving rise to the four stages characteristic of this attainment:

1. He who has entered the Path and stabilized the practices and experiences of both Yogas is considered to have reached the first stage, the stage of Gathering Provisions.

2. He who can lead the prâṇa-mind into the central channel and bring forth the 'Down Coming Four Blisses' throught he descent of the pure element of prâṇa-mind, experiences the Bliss-Void directly, increases immensely the mundane merits of prâṇa and nâḍîs, and is said to have reached the second stage - the stage of Anticipation.

3. He who can pull the pure element of tig le up through the central channel, bring forth the 'upgoing four blisses,' stabilize the tig le in the head center, untie in turn the knots that bind the central channel (as in rGyal thang pa's biography of Milarepa, 'like water dammed up')...clear all blockages in the six cakras, and eliminate one after the other the twenty-one thousand six hundred karmic prâṇas, is said to have reached the third or fourth stages, which include the stages of Initial Enlightenment and of Further Enlightenment, i.e., from the first bhûmi to the twelfth.

4. He who can purify the most subtle prâṇas, nâḍîs, and bindus, transform the physical body into the rainbow body, purify the thirty two nâḍîs and the eighty discriminating thoughts, thus unfolding the wondrous thirty-two signs and the eighty splendid forms of the Buddha's body, is said to have reached the Perfect Buddhahood of the Thirteenth Bhûmi of Vajradhara. Because his prâṇa-mind is one of wisdom, and because the A and Ham syllables are perfectly united, he attains the Ultimate two-in-one Saṃbhogakâya of Buddhahood. That which is in him expresses the non-differentiation of compassion and voidness is called the Dharmakâya; that which in him expresses the infinite bliss and glory is called the Sambhogakâya; that which in him expresses the infinite forms and plays produced for the benefit of sentient beings is called the Nirmâṇakâya. The identity, or unity of these Bodies is called the Body of Dharmadhâtu (totality). With these Four Bodies he will set in

> motion the wheel of Dharma to deliver all sentient beings til the end of Saṃsâra...[55]

Thus the formation of a complete set of Buddha-kâyas is specifically a result of the sequence of utpattikrama and sampannakramas[56].

All the biographies of Tibetan masters include some details that would suggest the degree of inner attainment on the basis of some external manifestation of siddhi. The biographies of Milarepa are certainly no exception to this, but we can find considerable sensitivity to this matter in the numerous biographies collected in the Blue Annals. For example, in the life of Karmapa Rangjung Dorje, the chronicle records:

> In front of the snows of Sambu, he saw many auspicious signs of the `inner and outer' (phy nang) spheres [nang or `inner' signs include signs observed by the devotee in his own body, as for example the entry of the breath into the avadhûtî, etc. `Outer' signs include auspicious signs observed round a person

[55] G.C.C. Chang, The Six Yogas of Nâropa., pp. 117-120.
In the Milarepa rnam thar by rGyal Thang pa: (Folio 233),the rJe bTsun achieved supreme siddhi at La phyis: "Exclusively manifesting the Doctrine for his disciples, he attained the Dharmakâya, which is described as non-changing, unmovable, fully accomplished. In short, he entirely obtained both Ordinary and Supreme Accomplishments."

[56] In spite of the use of quotations from tantric works, this idea is not immediately apparent in the rnam thar of Vajradhara, which tends to rely on (late) interpretations of the teachings of Asaṅga. According to David Stott, "The actual instructions and methods of the Kagyu spiritual path derive from Gampopa's unification of the Kadam `graded path' dharma and the tantric precepts of the mahâsiddhas. Its chief philosophical base is the Uttaratantra of Maitreya and its commentary by Asaṅga. The Mahâmudrâ theme embraces all the apparent multiplicity of these precepts and practices," Karma Thinley, The History of the Sixteen Karmapas of Tibet (Boulder: Prajñâ Press, 1980), p. 30.

> practising meditation such as rainbows, etc.). ...While residing at Jo mo gangs, he had a vision of the âcârya Padma and received his blessing. While residing at 'Tshur phu kungs, he saw the planets and stars (the planets and stars of the 'inner' sphere symbolize in the Kâlacakra and other Tantras the flow of psychic energy into the centres of the body) of the 'Outer' and 'Inner' spheres agree between themselves, and composed a treatise on astrology.[57]

This distinction between inner and outer 'signs' suggests a model for the analysis of the phenomena of sanctity. When there is an absence of external omens and signs, it is difficult for the tradition to accept even an exceptionally virtuous person as a Saint. For example, the successor of Ras chung pa, rJe btsun gTsang pa, possessed the hidden precepts and was very devoted to his Guru, but Phag mo gru pa said: "He had been also [an incarnation] of a great Indian siddha, but because of the absence of auspicious omens, his benefit was not great."[58] Also, relics were important signs of final attainment:

> In this manner, 'Brog mi obtained the faculty of hearing numerous secret precepts and [developed] steadfastness in both the utpannakrama and saṃpannakrama degrees. Though he had striven to obtain Enlightenment before giving up his physical body, he assumed a cross-legged position in the sky by the force of his prâṇâyâma and plunged to death as his Path of Salvation. When his sons were performing the funeral rite [and burnt his body], the auspicious signs [of his having attained Enlightenment in his physical body] did

[57] BA, p. 491. [cf. Karma Thinley's version: "He had a visionary experience of the entire universe as contained within the body itself." p. 56, The History of the Sixteen Karmapas of Tibet.] Some interesting information on the inner zodiac may be found in Alex Wayman's "Tantric Teachings About the Inner Zodiac" in The Buddhist Tantras, op. cit., pp. 151-163.

[58] BA, p. 441.

> not manifest themselves. He attained the true realization of the Mahâmudrâ ... in the Inter-mediate State.[59]

In gTang smyon's biography of Marpa, the signs of accomplishment include the following:

1. "In general, many special experiences and realization of the unsurpassable secret mantra were born in his mind. In particular, while practicing caṇḍâlî, he actualized the unity of bliss, luminosity, and non-thought."[60]

2. "For seven days, he was unable to move the gates of body, speech, and mind, and he established confidence in this. The Ten Signs arose and in a joyful state of mind the days and nights passed."[61]

With this confidence, Marpa ready to return to Tibet to spread the Dharma, having the intention of returning to India with gold to please his Gurus.

In the rGyal Thang pa biography of Milarepa, the outward signs that began to accompany his interior

[59] BA, pp. 208-209. Same account retranslated in Snellgrove, ITB, pp. 491-492. See also, for liberation in the bardo, Michael Broido, op. cit. pp. 11-12.

[60] Life of Marpa the Translator, p. 33.

[61] Ibid. These 'ten signs' go back to the Upaniṣads (e.g. Śvetâsvataropaniṣad 2: 11). They are explained by the editors of the Life of Marpa: "(rtags bcu) Ten signs of advancement in the caṇḍâlî practice. The first five signs indicate progress in controlling prâṇa - the experience of smoke, a mirage, a glowworm, a flame, and a cloudless sky. These are the five ordinary signs. The last five 'special signs' indicate the attainment of permanent mastery or confidence in controlling prâṇa - seeing clearly sun rays, moon rays, lightning, rainbows, and finally, the combined light of the sun and the moon." p.248.

attainment gradually began to persuade people of the authenticity of his sanctity. Convinced of the presence of a holy person, they acquired faith in his teachings. . Marpa told him it would take three years of intense, solitary practice to attain siddhi (folio 216). When Milarepa was on the point of departing for meditation practice in his home territory, the Lady (Marpa's wife is not named in rGyal thang pa; in gTsang smyon's version, she is called bDag med ma = Skt. Nairâtmyâ, the consort of Hevajra) advised Milarepa on the use of miracles. Unlike the counsel of the other Buddhist scriptures, here the Saint was advised to use miracles deliberately to uphold the Dharma: "...it is suitable to raise up the victory banner of the teachings of the Practice Lineage; it is suitable to use the power to work all manner of wonders (zil gnon) and miracles (rdzu 'phrul);...it is suitable to perform great deeds of asceticism until these things come about..."(folio 218).

Soon after, Milarepa dreamt of an unfinished task (a hard, dry field half plowed), indicating that he has made progress, but has not completed his inner transformation (folio 220), so he went to White Rock Horse Tooth Cave to attain siddhi by means of saṃpannakrama practice. His first inner realization of siddhi was that of mystic heat and the illusion-body, which shows that he was performing the first and most important of the Six Yogas (gtum mo) (Folio 224). This realization was physically the result of the food and beer brought by Peta. After a while, some hunters came to

have a kind of respect for him; then some feather gatherers (folio 228) began to imitate him and actually managed to achieve some results; then a group of women become his patrons and disciples (folio 228). Milarepa then encountered ḍâkinîs who massaged him and gave him further instruction on the Six Yogas (folio 230, enabling him to complete his gtum mo attainment and to deserve the title "the cotton-clad" (ras pa) [62].

The first truly marvellous deed he performed which was visible to others was to fly (folio 230), but the the farmer who saw this (Gung po mgon po dpal) refused to have faith; to him, Milarepa was just a crazy yogin (smyon pa) who flew, not because of his sanctity, but because the sun pulled him aloft (Tib.: de 'dra mid la ras pa bya ba sñon [smyon] pa de/ kho ñi ma sñog pa'i phur ['phur] 'gro ba yin gyis zer cing mos par mi byed pa yang yod do//). It was apparent to the biographer that miracles are not enough; there must be a conjunction of the merits both of the siddha and of the potential disciple or patron. In a song to faithful patrons, Milarepa explained: "When I practice austerities, wandering among mountain solitudes, my bodily necessities are set in order by my patrons; [Thus] the right

[62] "In vajrayâna, buddhahood is directly manifested in the 'three roots' (Tib.: rtsa ba gsum) of guru (Tib.: bla ma), devatâ (Tib.: yi dam) and ḍâkinî (Tib.: mkha' 'gro) and dharmapâla (Tib.: chos skyong), which are, in effect, the tantric aspect of the three jewels....The ḍâkinîs embody the feminine energy of enlightenment as it appears in situations to guide and restore the yogin to a sense of balance." p. 33, The History of the Sixteen Karmapas.

circumstances of causes and conditions are present, and experience arises in the mind." (folio 254)[63]

This occurred dramatically at La phyis (sic; the Mila mgur 'bum spells it La phyi), when Milarepa survived for seven months in the snow ranges on a small quantity of food. The people of Sñe nam developed a faith that knew no bounds. rGyal thang pa described Mila's inner experiences in detail, showing some of the psycho-somatic difficulties that a practitioner may encounter. rGyal thang pa called the siddhi attained in that winter "tshe'i dngos grub bgyi ba" or `life-immortal', by which Milarepa overcame the bodily need for food[64]. rGyal Thang pa equated this realization with the Supreme Siddhi, the achievement of the Dharmakâya[65].

63 In the rnam thar of Marpa and Milarepa by sGampopa the same subject is treated in philosophical fashion: "A Rinpoche asked [Milarepa after seeing him rebuffed by a potential patron]: "What did you do at that time?" Mila said: "I did nothing whatsoever. [Just as] Atiśa was seen to be making circumambulation on the pinnacle of the monastery of bSam yas - did he really perform this act? Even if he didn't `do' it, as a result of dependent causality, it appeared to others that way. Thus, the Two Bodies appear to others according to their capacities. There is, however, in reality, no `doing' at all!" (sGampopa collected works, Volume I, folio 38, Kargyud Sungrab Nyamso Khang, Darjeeling, 1982) [I-Tib-82-902155].

64 Cf. "Living on the Essence of Flowers," a practice described in Selected Works of the Dalai Lama II, Glenn H. Mullin, translator, pp. 183-191.

65 [Tib.: . 'chi ba med pa tshe'i dngos grub bgyi ba/ .... phongs pa med pa zas kyi dngos grub ces pa/ sems can gyi tshogs rdzogs do ma rtogs pa/ gsol ye ma gsol dang kres pa med pa'i dngos grub dang thob bo/ 'khrul pa med pa mchog gi dngos grub ces bgyi ba/ gdul bya la chos ston pa ma rtogs/ chos kyi sku la 'pho 'gyur mi mnga' ba'i dngos grub kyang

Other miracles involved the rather farcical means he used to convert a monastery of hostile monks (folios 249-251); activities as a psychopomp (folios 244-245), whereupon his great fame spread widely and "attendants and provisions gathered like a cloud and at that time he became very popular", thus establishing fully our `outer' criteria for defining a Saint. Then Milarepa went on to convert the scholar Dar blo by manifesting emanations of himself who manage to defeat the hostile opponent in debate (folios 245-249). Further conversions of `hardened' personalities included his aunt (folios 240-241) and the Tse ring ma deities (folio 244). In fact, his aunt was converted without the use of miracles!

Finally, Milarepa performed marvellous rituals for his disciples and patrons (folios 251; 252-253; 254-255). These ritual events show that the power that the Saint acquired by means of ascetical practice can actually be transmitted to others by means of <u>mantras</u> and rites. (see parallel passages in the <u>Mila</u> <u>mgur</u> '<u>bum</u>, Chapter 47). The Saint's miraculous encounters with demons (folios 241-243; 244) are told in all the <u>rnam</u> <u>thars</u> and left a profound impression on the disciples; they represent the Saint's power to make hostile environments safe and to convert negative forces into Dharma-protectors, as Padmasambhava had done three hundred and fifty years previously.

<u>thob po// mdor na mchog thun mong gi dngos grub ma lus par thob po// (folios 232.6-233.3)]</u>

To sum up, the rGyal thang pa rnam thar of Milarepa carried on the traditional spirituality of this lineage, manifesting in the way it retold the story of the rJe bTsun such characteristic features as the process of spiritual formation by the unique rapport of Guru and disciple[66], the importance of reverent faith and service over verbalization in the formation process, the practice of asceticism and solitary meditation, commissioning a worthy disciple as a `lineage holder', and the attainment of `ubiquity' which enables a Saint to spread the Dharma through teachings and miracles to all realms of existence.

[66] Including the importance of a rnam thar in awakening previously established karmic connections, see folio 206.5.

Part II

Chapter 7 Literary Aspects of the Biographies of Milarepa

In comparing the Guru and the holy person, Alex Wayman has observed that "the holy is a non-verbal situation of a culture; the guru uses words or comparable symbolic activity."[1] With regard to the Saints, although not all who attain the inner state of holiness are recognized, those who are recognized are first apparent as Saints to the populace. In fact, the people of a given cultural setting, even if not of the same religious beliefs, seem to 'know' how to recognize a Saint. The response to Mother Teresa of Calcutta, the foundress of the Missionaries of Charity, is an example of a contemporary 'ideal type' of such recognition. In fact, the beliefs, practices and even the teachings of a particular Saint have less persuasive power over the public imagination than the simple, non-verbal fact of the presence of a holy person, who presumably arose as such as a result of fidelity to those beliefs and practices! The public seems to 'know'...

The task of hagiography in relation to the phenomenon of the recognition and cult of a Saint is the task of any narrative genre: an attempt to translate that 'knowing' into telling[2]. Narrative may take on the task of imposing a

[1] Alex Wayman, "The Guru in Buddhism," Studia Missionalia, 37 (1988). p.195.

[2] Hayden White, "The Value of Narrativity in the Representation of Reality," W.J.T. Mitchell, ed. On

kind of literary order on reality, or it may function as a way of unleashing a more or less healthy disorder. The latter is the explicit intent of such mad-yogin tale-tellers as 'Brug pa kun legs or gTsang smyon Heruka[3]. The way narratives are constructed to tell the tale of a Saint reveals much about what a particular author and his culture understand to be `holiness;' we must keep in mind, however, the aspect of mystery, of the non-verbal and inexpressible when recounting the presence of the holy in a sanctified human being; no narrative can fully convey that aspect of `knowing' or intuiting the presence of the Saint. That is the case within a particular cultural context, and it is even more so cross-culturally. A careful blending of the historic, the mythic, and the literary (i.e. style, structure, and genre) attempts to create a climate within which readers _may_ find themselves persuaded that here, indeed, holiness was made manifest, and to that suggestion,

Narrative (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1981), p. 1.

[3] R. A. Stein. _Vie et Chants de 'Brug pa Kun legs le yogin._ (Paris: G.-P. Maisonneuve et Larose, 1972), pp. 101-102. ..."Quant à la mienne (de biographie), elle est écrite cahin-caha, en prenant par le nez, en prenant par les poils. Elle n'est pas écrite pour que les événements apparaissent sous un jour admirable. Chaque fois que je me suis notoirement (couverte de honte), j'ai écrit ce dont je me souvenais (consciencieusement). D'ailleurs, dans les biographies des lamas, arrangées en fort bon ordre, c'est comme dans un carnet de créancier où il est écrit: telle année, tel mois et tel jour, j'ai reçu tel gage, aussi dois-je encaisser tant de charges d'orge ou de poix. C'est vraiment terriblement mesquin." Obviously he is criticizing biographies that sound like account books of `offerings received'!

readers may find themselves moved to true faith and devotion. As rGyal Thang pa says at the end of his narrative: "I bow down to the Saint (rJe bTsun)...who is completely liberated (rnam thar); [Tib.: rje btsun rnam thar rdzogs la gus phyag 'tshal]"[4]. This phrase can equally well be translated: "I bow down to the completed biography of the Saint," for the text merits veneration if it achieves the sacred purpose of its author!

Texts that merit veneration are generally classified as canonical or scriptural. In their widely quoted work, The Biographical Process, Reynolds and Capps make a distinction between sacred biography and hagiography. Just as the `type' of a religious Founder (Buddha, Jesus, Muhammad) can be distinguished from the Saint, who is the exemplary follower, so too, the literary forms applicable to Founder (sacred biography) and Saint (hagiography) may be distinguished. The biography of a Founder participates in and, especially, gives shape to the formation of the first communities of believers; such accounts become scripture, i.e. canonical, and hence `sacred' biography. The accounts of a Founder are in fact better read as proclamation (kerygma) than as biography, for they focus more on the events of the Founder's life as they bear upon and disclose the meaning of his religious message. The New Testament Gospels are the best example of this process. The typology

4 See the root verses, 1-26, pp. 190-194; rnam thar, i.e. biography, appears in verse 26.

breaks down in the context of Buddhism. In the case of the life of the Buddha, we can see how presumably biographical episodes were worked into etiological accounts of the Vinaya, thus legitimating and reinforcing the structures of monastic life. The Buddha's cosmo-mythic "Twelve Deeds" also function not as historic biography but as a sort of ritual by which each and every great world renouncer saves the world. However, the distinction between sacred biography and hagiography tends to blur because the Buddha himself is understood to be carrying out a pattern for this world-cycle that was already manifest in numerous previous Buddhas[5]; at the same time, biographies of Buddhist Saints such as the Sixth Ch'an patriarch take the form of scripture.[6] Even the life of Milarepa takes on the aura of sacred scripture.[7] Today one may use the biography of Milarepa as a spiritual practice in the Bka' brgyud pa by

[5] For example, the Buddha himself is said to recount the life of the Buddha Vipassi in the Dīgha Nikāya ii.1-54. T. W. and C. A. F. Rhys Davids, trans. Dialogues of the Buddha Part II (London: Henry Frowde, 1910), XIV Mahāpadāna Suttanta, pp. 4-41.

[6] Philip B. Yampolsky, trans. The Platform Sutra of the Sixth Patriarch (New York: Columbia University Press, 1967). p. 125, fn. 1: "Prior to the Platform Sutra we have no instance in which a work which was merely the record of the career and sermons of a certain Master is given the name Sutra. Strictly speaking, of course, it is not one. Thus Ch'i-sung took pains to justify its classification as such: `..[Hui-neng]...was a Bodhisattva monk, and his preaching of the Platform Sutra is basically no different from the Buddha's preaching of the sutras.'"

[7] LM, Colophon, pp. 201-203, which treats the life as a source of spiritual power precisely because the Saint depicted attain Complete Enlightenment, and is thus equal to the Buddha himself.

receiving reading permission and empowerment. In the rnam thar of Milarepa by rGyal Thang pa, we see the same attitude of devotional practice ("I bow down...."). However, in the early Buddhist tradition transmitted through the Pâli scriptures, the biographies of Arhats make distinctions between the realization of the Saints and that of the Buddha; the former are dependent on encounter with the latter.[8]

In the Blue Annals, which is predominantly a collection of the biographies of Saints and lineage-holding Gurus who practiced and transmitted various cycles of Mahâyâna and Vajrayâna teachings, we see how the controlling principle of lineage (brgyud) subordinated the hagiographical accounts to the life, attainment, and doctrine of various Founders. In the bKa' brgyud gser 'phreng of rGyal Thang pa, the rnam thar of Vajradhara comes first as a theoretical account of primordial Buddhahood; only afterwards do we read the hagiographies of those human beings who realized the `state' of Vajradhara, i.e. the tantric form of Buddhahood, the so-called âdibuddha.

In general, the biographies of Saints confirm the sacred power and efficacy of the Founder's vision to continue to transform other human lives. The function of hagiography is essentially conversion: to attract attention

[8] Stanley J. Tambiah. The Buddhist Saints of the Forest and the Cult of Amulets (Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 1984), pp. 21-24. See also: K. R. Norman, trans. The Elders' Verses: I. Theragâthâ II. Therîgâthâ (London: Pali Text Society, 1969, 1971), passim.

to an ideal and to provoke a response of faith that gives rise to a desire to imitate the practices and beliefs of the holy person.[9]

Thus, in the Songs (<u>mgur</u> '<u>bum</u>) of Milarepa:

> Having heard this song...they had all heard the Jetsun's life story and with great faith, they came this time to learn the Dharma. They asked Milarepa how he had managed to undergo the trials of probationship and had exerted himself in ascetic practice, and to recount the way through which he had finally obtained his Enlightenment...[10]

Another aspect of awakened faith at this stage is the suggestion that the patrons touched by the literary account believe that previous meritorious actions are now bearing fruit. To encounter a living Buddha indicates that one has accumulated enough merit to undertake the spiritual life in earnest, with hope of success[11]. This is what is signified

[9] BA p. 448. The life of Milarepa is told to the child rDo rje khro bo (Se ston Jo khro), who proceeds to meditate in a cave in imitation of the rJe bTsun. Cf. the life of St. Teresa of Jesus, who as a child imitated the Desert Fathers and who once ran away from home in search of martyrdom at the hands of the Moors. Kieran Kavanaugh, O.C.D. and Otilio Rodriguez, O.C.D., trans. <u>The Collected Works of St. Teresa of Avila</u>, Volume I. (Washington, D.C.: Institute of Carmelite Studies, 1976) <u>The Book of Her Life</u>, Chapter I.4-5, pp. 33-34. On conversion, see Victoria Kennick Urubshurow, "Symbolic Process on the Buddhist Path: Spiritual Development in the Biographical Tradition of Milarepa" (Ph.D. dissertation, University of Chicago, 1984), pp. 232-234.

[10] Songs, p. 100.

[11] Compare the attitude of early Christian gnosticism, which held that only those persons who possessed a 'pneumatic' soul had the capacity to respond to the Gnostic teachings. See: Kurt Rudolph. <u>Gnosis: The Nature and History of</u>

by the exaggerated numbers of persons easily liberated by various Buddhas and Bodhisattvas in Mahâyâna literature; in some sense, the `time is at hand for deliverance'. For example, it is a part of the basic life of the Buddha himself, who was implored by the gods to teach in the human realm, among whom he would find beings endowed with merit and on the verge of Awakening. The tales of the Mahâsiddhas also refer to this phenomenon, with King Indrabhûti being said to have emptied his kingdom by disseminating the tantric doctrines and enlightening thousands of persons[12].

The Life of Milarepa says: "Those disciples who achieved Complete Enlightenment were as numerous as the stars in the night; those who achieved non-return to Saṃsâra were also many, as particles of dust on the face of the earth. Those men and women who had entered the path of liberation were too numerous to be counted."[13]

In the `Grey Rock' account in the Songs of Milarepa, the most advanced teachings on Mahâmudrâ are given last, after one _yogin_ in particular has begun to experience the fruits not only of having heard the biography, but also of having put into practice the teachings of the rJe bTsun under his guidance, not so much as Saint, but as Guru, keeping in mind of course that for the bKa' brgyud the two

Gnosticism, trans. by Robert McLachlan Wilson (San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1983), pp. 90-91.

12 David Templeman, trans. _The Seven Instruction Lineages_ by Jo Nang Târanâtha (Dharamsala: LTWA, 1983) p. 25.

13 LM, op. cit. p. 197.

roles are assimilated,[14] so that one encounters the holy in a Saint, who in the role of the Guru, sets the disciple on the path until Enlightenment is reached. It is the sanctity of the Guru that makes the verbal teachings efficacious in practice.

The <u>rnam thar</u> itself has power to lead persons to the path. Just before the colophon, gTsang smyon concludes the biography by saying: "This story of liberation, the life of Milarepa, leads to the path of emancipation and supreme knowledge."[15] In the preface, the narrator set up for himself a sort of literary identity as Ras chung pa, who is bidden by celestial beings to supplicate the Master for his life story: "Venerable and precious Master,...for the sake of guiding other sentient beings on the way to liberation, tell us, O Compassionate Master, the origin of your family, tell us your story and works."[16]

[14] Songs, pp. 98-99. It is possible to attain a brief glimpse of the highest illumination early in one's practice, but one must continue to deepen the experience and stabilize realization until literally every moment of one's continuum of existence is suffused with the energy of enlightened consciousness. Marpa explained to Milarepa that such realization is not the result of teachings alone: "In my lineage an enlightening energy is transmitted which has no similarity to that of others." LM, p. 48.

[15] LM, p. 200.

[16] Ibid., p. 12. This false identity has contributed to confusion about the actual identity of the author/redactor of the mila rnam thar. gTsang smyon Heruka was not a disciple of Ras chung pa. He lived in the late fifteenth century and was a holder of the mkha' 'gro ma'i sñan brgyud transmitted by Milarepa to Ras chung pa. See: Lokesh Chandra, ed. <u>The Life of the Saint of gTsang</u> by rGod-tShang Ras pa sNa Tshogs Rang Grol (New Delhi: 1969), Preface by E. Gene Smith, pp. 3-4.

Although both Victoria K. Urubshurow and Janice Willis have insisted that the rnam thars are a form of in-depth instruction on spiritual practice, it is undeniable that these biographies do not give the kind of detail that we find for example in the First Panchen Lama's Great Seal of Voidness or in The Six Yogas of Nâropâ with Tsong Kha pa's Commentary[17]. The rnam thars function to inspire potential practitioners and to sustain the practice of those advanced disciples already initiated, in the same way as Christian hagiography. A child may find the biography of St. Francis sufficiently fascinating to want to learn more about that

[17] H.H. the XIV Dalai Lama, First Panchen Lama, Jamyang Khyentze Rinpoche, and Kalu Rinpoche. Four Essential Buddhist Texts. (Dharamsala: LTWA, 1982), pp. 59-85. C. A. Muses, ed. and Chang Chen Chi, trans. Esoteric Teachings of the Tibetan Tantra (York Beach, Maine: Samuel Weiser, Inc., 1982), pp. 123-270. See V. K. Urubshurow, pp. 19 and 20, where she emphasizes the oral explanation of the contents of rnam thars by qualified teachers. There are hints of profound teachings in the rnam thars and we even find examples in the Songs of what amount to a summary of the 'stages of the path' but detailed instructions on practice are not found in these works. The rnam thar of Milarepa by sGampopa is another example that makes quite clear the fact that the rnam thar is a sort of outline (folio A.42.4: mdzad spyod zur tsam rnam par bshad pa'o// "in mere outline form") used by a teacher who will, in appropriate circumstances, enlarge upon the practices mentioned for the benefit of the specific disciples who sit before him. Janice Willis in "The Search for Padma-can: A Study in the Interpretation of Tibetan Sacred Biography," The Journal of Religious Studies XIII (Spring, 1985, No. 1), p. 57, actually makes the assertion that "Siddha biographies in terms of content, are comparable to and complement, the Tantras and their commentaries. As such, one of the main functions of rnam-thar is the actual imparting of tantric practice instructions." But the example she gives is so veiled by symbolic allusions that only the oral instructions of a Guru would enable the disciple to know what is actually going on, much less to obtain "detailed practice instructions...to put the teachings particular to a certain Siddha into practice."

Saint's devotion to the Crucified Christ, but in order to learn how to meditate on Christ's passion and death, one has to make use of devotional manuals for the Five Sorrowful Mysteries of the Rosary, or for the *Via Crucis*. These instructions are not found in Saints' lives any more than detailed comments on the practice of heat yoga are found in any biography of Milarepa. However, in the rGyal Thang pa biography, we do find descriptions of some of the difficulties in *gtummo* practice that might sustain the efforts of an advanced bKa' brgyud pa practitioner (see folios 220-221, 232).

Studies of hagiography and sacred biography have tended to focus either on a quest for the historical figure `behind' the legend, or have sought to correlate mythic elements found cross-culturally. The Tibetan *rnam thars* present us with special challenges since they do show a concern for historicity and they seem to delight in bluntness when it comes to some apparent faults in their subjects.[18] At the same time, the mythological and marvellous abound, under the influence of Indian and Central Asian epic, tantric symbolism, and antecedents in the *sūtras*. Sorting all this out requires numerous sources. In the case of Milarepa, the past fifteen years have been generous in providing the Western scholar with numerous

[18] Robin Kornman, "Hidden Literary Criticism in Tibetan Biographies," paper delivered to the MLA in New York, December 29, 1985, pp. 1-2.

previously unavailable sources for the life and teachings of Milarepa.[19]

None of these would fall into the category of primary sources[20], since none exist as autograph manuscripts of Mila or of his immediate disciples. All represent the transmission of early texts and oral accounts more or less redacted; a thorough investigation of each source (along with the collection and evaluation of additional sources) for its relative historic value will one day give us the material necessary to write a reasonably coherent history of the life and times of Milarepa. We are a long way from that achievement, however. The present work attempts to show some of the problems and to suggest methods for evaluating the sources as we now have them.

Our problem is similar to that of the historian of late Roman antiquity who is no longer so sanguine about denying the existence of semi-legendary characters such as St. Anthony of Egypt, thanks to the dying of old polemics and the discovery of numerous literary sources.[21] We may now ask of the Milarepa _rnam thar_ by gTsang smyon Heruka to what

[19] See a brief list of sources for Marpa and Milarepa in Dan Martin, review of _The Life of Marpa the Translator_, translated by the Nālandā Translation Committee under the direction of Chogyam Trungpa, in _The Journal of the Tibet Society_, 3 (1984), pp. 83-92.

[20] As we are reminded by Helmut Eimer in "Life and Activities of Atiśa Dīpamkaraśrījñāna," _Journal of the Asiatic Society_ XXVII, #4 (1985), pp. 3-5.

[21] See Derwas J. Chitty, trans. _The Letters of St. Antony the Great_ (Fairacres, Oxford: SLG Press, 1975), p. vii.

extent this work gives us the historic Milarepa's life and doctrine and to what extent it represents an interpretation of the context of the bKa' brgyud pa in the late fifteenth century. The same question occupied Charles Van Tuyl in his 1972 dissertation[22] in which he attempted to identify an early source for the Tse ring ma chapters of the mila mgur `bum and to demonstrate Bon po influence in the early, possibly historical, Milarepan corpus. In any case, the gap of three hundred and sixty years between the death of Milarepa and the writing of the rnam thar by gTsang smyon only increases our suspicions and compounds our difficulties in tracing the strands of literary and oral tradition adhering to the life and songs of this extremely popular Saint and folk-hero. In fact, we have a multiplicity of sources and themes in the redactions accomplished by gTsang smyon, reflecting not only literary embellishment, but also historical controversy within the lineage, some of which we have already discussed in our review of bKa' brgyud pa history in Chapter 5.

Some of the differences between the biographies by rGyal Thang pa and gTsang smyon are as follows:

-rGyal Thang makes little mention of Indian sources for the doctrines of Milarepa and the training of Marpa, whereas gTsang smyon devotes considerable space in the rnam thars of

[22] Charles Van Tuyl. "An Analysis of Chapter Twenty Eight of the Hundred Thousand Songs of Milaraspa, a Buddhist Poet and Saint of Tibet" (Ph.D. Dissertation, Indiana University, 1972).

Marpa and Milarepa to the transmission of the doctrines and practices of the Mahâsiddhas to the Tibetan disciples. This concern for authenticity and for Indian origins was meant to dispell the criticism of bKa' brgyud pa practices, especially Mahâmudrâ, as being a veiled survival of the Ch'an quietism of Hwa shang[23].

-In the biographies by rGyal Thang pa and by sGam po pa, the errors of Milarepa in the early stages of practice are frankly recounted (see RTH, folio 230, for an error in the use of the mystic winds, and folio 231 for an emotional reaction to Marpa's death; in the sGampopa version, see folio B.20/A.31 for his mistaken appraisal of an experience of `luminosity.'), but no such errors are mentioned in gTsang smyon's accounts.

- Bitter anti-scholastic polemic in gTsang smyon's Chapter 34 ("The Challenge from the Logicians") in the <u>mgur 'bum</u> turns the scholar Dar blo into a demon[24]. In the version by rGyal Thang pa, Dar blo is converted; this account goes so far as to claim that his merits were equal to those of Milarepa himself (folio 245).

- In the rGyal Thang pa version, Milarepa is positively cruel to his aunt when she wishes to repent; it is Peta, Mila's sister, who intercedes for the aunt. In gTsang smyon's version, it is Peta who wishes to prevent the aunt

23 Giuseppe Tucci. <u>The Religions of Tibet</u>. Trans. by Geoffrey Samuel. (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1980), pp. 13-14.

24 Songs, p. 395.

from seeing the rJe bTsun.[25] This bears out the often repeated observation that, over time, hagiographical accounts tend to diminish the imperfections of the Saint and that in earlier versions one may find occasional `flaws' that the tradition has not yet suppressed out of devotion.[26]

The rnam thar as a literary form is meant to be an account of the `liberation' of a human being from the delusions of cyclic existence. Even if the term rnam thar has come to mean simply `a biographical account', the classical meaning (translating Sanskrit vimukti) continues to resonate in the literary form. There is a traditional three-fold typology of the rnam thar: outer, inner and secret. Outer rnam thars describe events in a person's life, a record of things said, persons encountered, initiations received, journeys undertaken in the outer world. The inner rnam thar describes the spiritual practice undertaken and the attainments acquired. The secret rnam thar, corresponding to `Buddha activity,' can mean visionary experience, but is more likely to mean external behavior that manifests Buddha nature in an unconventional way, as in the biography of 'Brug pa kun legs, for example.[27]

[25] LM, pp. 141-143; RTH folios 239-241.

[26] This idea is discussed in relation to the interplay of oral and written sources in Lama Kunga Rimpoche and Brian Cutillo, trans. Drinking the Mountain Stream: Further Stories and Songs of Milarepa (Novato, CA: Lotsawa Press, 1978), pp. 33-34.

[27] In Willis, op. cit., pp. 57-58, the three are described as corresponding to: 1. outer: the biography including details of birth, conversion, education, teachers, and external activities; 2. inner: giving the meditative

Regardless of these distinctions, the Tibetan rnam thar intensifies the reader's interest and faith with regard to the formative presence of the sacred. This is a literature of spiritual practice and experience par excellence.

The encounter of Guru and disciple, absolutely crucial to the bKa' brgyud biographical tradition, is characterized by a spontaneous and unerring awakening of faith and devotion. Dad pa, faith, is characterized as dang pa'i dad pa so ma, spontaneous faith at the first encounter with one's Lama[28]. This reaction, though auspicious, requires further discernment on the part of the disciple. Thus, Mila seeks Bre ston lha dga' for the rdzogs chen teaching in good faith, but finds that this Guru cannot help him overcome the grave obstacles he has acquired by the use of destructive magic. Indeed, in the sGampopa version, Bre ston admits that even he has been unable to make progress in the system

practices and initiations; 3. secret: describes visions and related experiences of the 'hierophant'. But a bKa' brgyud pa tulku, Dugu Choegyal Gyamtso, in his foreword to Keith Dowman and Sonam Paljor, trans., The Divine Madman: The Sublime Life and Songs of Drukpa Kunley (Clearlake, CA: The Dawn Horse Press, 1980), pp. 21-22, places visions and sampannakrama realizations under 'internal' (nang) biography and considers the 'secret' biography to reveal a Lama's life "in terms of his perfect activity, and there is no distinction made between external events and the inner life...it is called 'secret' because without having realized the Lama's state of mind, we cannot understand it..." In terms of our own categorization of the saint, the latter distinction makes more sense: outer recognition, inner contemplative experience, and finally a category 'secret' that is uniquely Buddhist.

[28] See R. A. Stein, Vie et Chants (op. cit.), p. 150 and idem, Recherches sur l'Épopée et le Barde au Tibet (Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1959), p.489.

he expounds (folio A.30). Thus, true awakened faith is a long way from blind, uncritical faith without understanding (rgyu mtshan med pa'i dad pa). A solid faith, based on understanding is rgyu mtshan yod pa'i dad pa. Milarepa shows his disciples how to come to this kind of faith when he warns of the difficulties of the life of serious contemplative practice[29]. An initial enthusiasm is not enough; one must undergo trials and must know that a radical commitment is indispensible to the attainment of siddhi through reliance on a Guru. The rGyal Thang account seems to suggest a gradual disclosure of the identity of the true Guru, from the first experiences with the sorcerers, to the rdzogs chen master, to a glimmer of experience under rNgog, to full awakening under the guidance of Marpa.

In the bKa' brgyud pa biographies, there is a heightened sense of drama and of destiny in the frequent references to promises and vows made in previous lives, or the forming of votary bonding in the present life in anticipation of a better future rebirth in the presence of the Guru. Disciples beg the Guru to be with them always, even in future lives, until enlightenment is attained; thus the Guru fulfills his Bodhisattva vow to remain in cyclic existence until all have attained Enlightenment. There is also the use of prophecy to foretell the moment of enlightenment or the path appropriate to particular disciples. The past ripens in the present and the destined

29 Songs, chapter 25.

disciple is thrilled to discover the Teacher and the practice for which his previous vows and merits have destined him.

These bKa' brgyud biographies have Indian antecedents, not only in the sources mentioned by Tambiah (fn. 8, above) and in the sources discussed by Lamotte[30], but in late Sanskrit works. Milarepa himself, in a moment of discouragement, read the story of rTag tu ngu (Bodhisattva Sadâprarudita), in the Perfection of Wisdom Sûtra in Eight Thousand Lines[31] and was thus inspired to return to Marpa and continue the rigorous penances he had imposed.[32] We know of a Sanskrit biography of Śântideva[33] and of other Mahâyâna figures such as Candragomin, Nâgârjuna, etc. The lives of the Eighty-Four Mahâsiddhas were translated from Sanskrit into Tibetan[34]. The highly repetitive pattern of these biographies, combining a narrative introduction, conversion experience, initiatic dohâ, and concluding narrative indicating successful spiritual practice and

30 E. Lamotte, Histoire du Bouddhisme Indien (Louvain-La-Neuve: Institut Orientaliste, 1976), pp. 765-775.

31 Edward Conze, trans. The Perfection of Wisdom in Eight Thousand Lines and Its Verse Summary (San Francisco: Four Seasons Foundation, 1973), Chapter XXX, pp 277-290.

32 LM, p. 59.

33 Amalia Pezzali, "Śântideva, un mistico buddhista". Studia Missionalia, 35 (1986), p. 323.

34 James B. Robinson, trans. Buddha's Lions: The Lives of the Eighty-Four Siddhas (Caturaśīti-siddhi-pravṛtti by Abhayadatta; translated into Tibetan as Grub thob brgyad cu rtsa bzhi'i lo rgyus by sMon grub Shes rab). (Berkeley: Dharma Publishing, 1979).

Bodhisattva activity, suggests the existence of a wider oral tradition and should not delude us into believing that this is all that is known of the Siddhas. In fact, the Tibetan canon is full of works written by or commented upon by these very Siddhas, who were far more learned and literate than these popular biographies would lead us to believe. There is evidence to suggest that these tales, which arose in the period from about the ninth to the thirteenth centuries, influenced the growth of Saints' biographies among the Hindu sects, a tradition which was emerging in the same historical period and geographical location[35]. It is quite possible that the concept of a Saint who manifests amoral or unconventional behavior, which is such a striking characteristic of Siddha biographies, decisively shaped medieval Hindu exegesis of the epic and puraṇic heroes such as Kṛṣṇa, with all their ambiguity, in order to find the holiness that tradition posited for these figures. Soon this allegorization of the sanctity of the behavior of heroes came to be applied to any holy man, whose strange behavior could thereby be read in transcendental terms as a disclosure of holiness. As late as Târanâtha (late sixteenth century), we find connections between the Siddha biographies and the north Indian religious traditions; for example, his life of Śântigupta, a Siddha, has many points

[35] See Daniel Richard Gold, "The Lord as Guru in North Indian Religion: Hindi Sant Tradition and Universals of Religious Perception," (Ph.D. Dissertation, The University of Chicago, 1982), especially Chapter IV, "The Indian Master in Greater Religious Contexts," and the charts on pp. 355-6.

of contact with the lives of Nâropa, Marpa, and Milarepa that are known to have come from the circle of gTsang smyon Heruka a century earlier.[36] In his study of the life and teachings of the Sant mystic Dâdû, Giuseppe Calia presents a representative of the originally Vajrayâna _sahaja_ practice re-evolved as a Hindu practice that seems to be a radically simplified kind of Mahâmudrâ. The connections between Hindu and Buddhist Siddhas in the followers of Gorakhnâth is also well-known.[37]

In these late biographies, narrative, symbol, and imagery are so intermingled that tale-telling for the purpose of edification and religious guidance prevails over historicity. One cannot but wonder if it will ever be possible to show the historical process by which a distinctly biographical tradition emerged from the religious `soup' of the Siddha environment[38]. Certainly the early Buddhist Siddha biographies, both Sanskrit and Tibetan, are

36 David Templeman, op. cit., pp. 82-97. The Siddha is said to have built a _stûpa_ on a hilltop at his Guru's command, but with the illegitimate aid of another, and thereby earning a reprimand from the Guru (pp. 87-88). The _yoginî_ Dînakarâ, his disciple, has a biography that seems to _anticipate_ the Hindi life of Mirabai! (pp. 98-100).

37 Giuseppe Calia. _Sahaja Yoga: Il metodo della realizzazione spirituale secondo la via di Dâdû_ (Roma: Ubaldini Editore, 1985.

George Weston Briggs. _Gorakhnâth and the Kânphata Yogîs_ (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass reprint edition, 1982)

38 Distinctions among such literary forms as the _avadâna_ (tales of one's own realization), the _jâtaka_ (tales of the previous lives of a Bodhisattva), and the _vimukti_ (Tib.: _rnam thar_), have not as yet proven to be a productive line of inquiry. They all fit under the category of hagio-graphical literary genres.

among the first efforts to disclose the holy in tantric categories both mythic and at least partially historical.

Survey of Sources

1. The Biographies of Marpa and Milarepa by sGampopa

I have worked with three editions of this text:

A. Collected works of sGampopa, Vol. I (I-Tib-82-902155). Reproduced from a manuscript reflecting the tradition of the Dwags lha sGam po redaction prepared through the efforts of Spyan snga Bsod nams lhun grub from the Hemis Monastery in Ladakh. (Darjeeling, West Bengal: 1982), folios 23-42.

B. Collected Works (gSung 'bum) of sGampopa bSod nams rin chen. Reproduced from a manuscript from the bKra shis chos rDzong Monastery in Miyad Lahul by Khasdrub Gyatsho Shashin. Vol. I, (Delhi: 1975), folios 16-26.

C. Selected Writings of sGam po pa bSod nams rin chen (Dwags po Lha rje) with the Biography Written by His Descendant sGam po pa bSod nams Lhun Grub. Reproduced from a rare manuscript collection from the Gemur Monastery in Lahul by Topden Tshering. (Ballimaran, Delhi - 6: The Jayyed Press, 1974), folios 18-30.

An extensive study could be done on this text which probably represents one of the oldest accounts of the lives of Marpà and Milarepa. It is substantially in accord with later versions, but is more sketchy and has some episodes that do not appear in the other versions studied. For

example: Lha dga's admission that he himself has made no progress in <u>rdzogs chen</u> practice; Mila's false appraisal of his own progress when he mistook the light from the butter lamp on his head for `luminosity'; his escape from the devotional clutches of a crowd of <u>tantrikas</u>; his veneration by three monk-scholars of La stod; his failure to keep a promise to these scholars that led to an obstacle in his own spiritual practice (even after attaining <u>siddhi</u>); his dwelling in a forest, where a prospective patron found his appearance unworthy; Mila's explanation of what `doing nothing' means using an example from the life of Atiśa; his transformation into a crystal <u>stūpa</u> that flies; his flight on the back of a lion near Rong Kha bzhi, a town in Nepal; his demonstration of foresight by telling the relatives of Dar ma brten, a traveler, that he is not dead and is on his way home; the claim that his funeral rites were performed at Brin and at Mount Ti se.

In common with other accounts, he went to dBus to learn magical power (but no description of his deeds or penances is given); he served both Marpa and rNgog; he returned to his ruined home after study with Marpa; he ate nettles and turned green; his sister helped feed him; some Lamas were envious of him and tried to dishonor him; he spent a winter miraculously at La Phyi gangs (spelling is the same as the gTsang smyon version; rGyal thang pa gives La Phyis); he sang the Song of the Staff to a merchant on the way to Nepal; he fell down a precipice and survived.

The biography is given `in outline form' and is attached integrally to that of Marpa. The text refers to `many other accounts', for example of his life as a disciple under Marpa. There are some hints of encounters with mkha' 'gro ma and of his struggles with interior practice. The mgur are mentioned but not quoted (perhaps the Lama telling the tale is supposed to sing them from memory?). There is no account of a murder attempt and the author asserts that Milarepa was an `emanation.'

2. The rnam thar of Milarepa from the dKar (sic) brgyud gser 'phreng: A Thirteenth Century Collection of Verse Hagiographies of the Succession of eminent Masters of the 'Brug-pa dKar-brgyud pa Tradition by rGyal Thang pa bDe Chen rDo rJe. Reproduced from a rare manuscript from the library of Hemis Monastery (Ladakh) by the 6th Khams-sprul Don brgyud Nyi ma. (Tashijong, Palampur, H.P.: Sungrab Nyamso Gyunphel Parkhang Tibetan Craft Community, 1973). Folios 189-265.

I have located only this one edition of the text, which is in dbu med script. On the basis of internal evidence, the collection is from the middle of the thirteenth century; the last master whose biography is given is rGod thang pa mGon po rdo rje (1189-1258). Rgyal Thang pa is not among the bKa' brgyud masters in Khetsung Zangpo's encyclopedic collection; he must have been a co-disciple of rGod tshang pa mGon po rdo rje along with U-rgyan pa and the others

mentioned in the Blue Annals[39], but his name does not appear there.

The text may be written in a south-eastern dialect[40], since the author was associated with northwestern Yunnan. However, the manuscript is probably from the sixteenth century and is written in calligraphy used, according to Pema Wangyal in the region of Sñe nam. The structure of the work is of verses with `commentary'; however, the commentary consists of narrative sections which also include excerpts from the songs of Mila himself, and of other beings. The format is reminiscent of the epic rather than of the scholastic commentaries of the Indo-Tibetan tradition. The verse amounts to a sort of devotional pause along the way, as the reader is invited to join the author in a `bow' to a scene in the life of the Saint. Such thang-ka as that of the Life of Milarepa in the Los Angeles County Museum of Art show episodes from his life around a large central figure of the Saint; rGyal Thang pa has written a biography that could easily be arranged as a thang-ka[41] with twenty-six verses illustrated by various narrative episodes.

39 See BA pp. 686-687.

40 However, on Folio 206: "But the power descending through the lineage had no effect" (Tib.: skye ru ma 'dod), which Losang Jamspal reports as Ladakhi usage.

41 Famous Christian saints such as Francis, Clare, and Nicolas were depicted in the same way; also, the Via Crucis has some features in common with this devotional pattern, including the ritual bow (or genuflection) at each `station' or episode along the way.

rGyal Thang pa also assumes that the reader or reciter of this rnam thar knows other sources. For example, the songs are usually cited with a group of initial lines, with an indication that the reciter is to continue the song to its conclusion from `memory'. One exception is the song to the scholar Dar blo. rGyal Thang pa uses this eccentric format to gather together the oral traditions that have come down to him, creating a devotional epic narrative.

3. The Blue Annals as a source for the life of Milarepa.

The Blue Annals was written by 'Gos lo tsa ba gZon nu dpal (1392-1481) between 1476 and 1478[42]; it is considered by later Tibetan historians as the principal authority among works of its kind. It is a chos-'byung, i.e., a history of religious matters and is consists almost entirely of the biographies of the most important Saints and lineage holders of Tibetan Buddhism. The accounts include data of the `outer' type and also of the `inner' with occasional references to the `secret' in the sense defined above by Choegyal Gyamtso Tulku. Each `book' is sorted out in relation to the spiritual lineages that can be grouped together. If a particular figure is associated with more than one lineage, we often find collateral references to him or her in the several collections. Usually, however, a single figure's rnam thar is given in the context of a particular lineage.

[42] George N. Roerich, trans., op. cit., p. i.

'Gos lo was a member of the dGe lugs pa order, founded by Tsong kha pa in the late fourteenth century; he was abbot of the Karma rñing Monastery[43] and was eclectic in his contacts with diverse lineages and orders. It is particularly fascinating to see that Book VIII, "The Spiritual Lineage of the Lord Translator Mar pa which was known as the Dwags po bKa' brgyud" is more than 300 pages long; pages 728-753 cover the Shangs pa bKa' brgyud teachings transmitted by Nâropa's consort Niguma, and pages 839-867 present the Mahâmudrâ lineages. Thus, of a work of over 1,000 pages, four hundred are devoted to lineages and doctrines associated with bKa' brgyud pa spirituality.

Folios 11b-16a (Book VIII) of the Tibetan text[44] give the biography of Milarepa ("the yogeśvara Mid la ras pa", pp. 427-436). This account, it should be remembered, is ten years older than the version by gTsang smyon Heruka, so well known thanks to the efforts of Bacot, Evans-Wentz, and, more recently, of Lhalungpa. 'Gos lo writes: "Up to this, I had written the life story of (Mid-la) in detail, because I had seen many spurious accounts. I believe that the above account by myself corresponds to actual facts."[45] He then proceeds to summarize another biography which includes some

43 Ibid., p. ii.

44 These are the folios in the text used by Roerich. In Lokesh Chandra's edition, the pages are 373-381. See: 'Gos Lotsawa Gzhon nu dpal (1392-1481). The Blue Annals. (New Delhi: International Academy of Indian Culture, 1974).

45 BA, p. 432.

material that we find in the *mila mgur 'bum* and in rGyal Thang pa. Of particular interest is 'Gos lo's version of the autobiographical song presented to Zi ba 'od (see BA pp. 431-432 and cf. *Songs* pp. 160-161,)[46]. Thus from the *Blue Annals* we know that there were many biographies in existence by the end of the fifteenth century, some of which are still extant. Some accounts were associated with transmissions to particular disciples such as Ras chung pa and Zi ba 'od. Evidently 'Gos lo considered some of the accounts of the deeds of Milarepa `spurious' and possibly harmful, at least to the extent of wishing to present a `factual' account. As we shall see below, establishing the textual basis for a `factual' account is far from easy!

4. The Work of gTsang smyon Heruka

One of the problems that has contributed to a lack of attention to the earlier biographies of Milarepa has been the mistaken idea that gTsang smyon was a direct disciple of Ras chung pa. If such were the case, the biographies by other bKa' brgyud pa masters would be of lesser value. It turns out that the biography that has become so well-known is actually the culmination of a long history of literary activity.

[46] The Zi ba 'od account was probably a literary (i.e. written) source already in existence before the BA were compiled. See Appendix 1 for the Tibetan texts from BA and the *mgur 'bum*.

Note that in gTsang smyon's *mila mgur 'bum* there are sung autobiographies on pp. 160-161, 207-8; 266-68; 279-281; 283; 333-334; 474-475; 533-4; 536-7; 537-8; 544-5.

H. Guenther[47] says that gTsang smyon He ru ka "according to tradition was one of the disciples of dPal Phag mo gru pa (A.D. 1110-70) who in turn was a disciple of sGam po pa (A.D. 1079-1153)." This version is perpetuated as recently as in the third volume of Mircea Eliade's History of Religious Ideas[48]. However, in 1969, E. Gene Smith had solved the puzzle of the identity of the author of this masterpiece (the rnam thar), of the Hundred Thousand Songs, and of the biography of Marpa (which Bacot had also translated), in his preface to the Life of the Saint of gTsang, edited by Lokesh Chandra. In their respective dissertations, Victoria Urubshurow and Charles Van Tuyl used the discoveries of Gene Smith to enter the literary world of Milarepa.[49]

Gene Smith observes that the smyon pa (mad holy man) "is the antithesis of the scholastic monk; yet to view the phenomenon simply as a reaction against monastic reforms and dGe lugs pa rationalism misses much of the point. The smyon pa, too, represented a force of reform...an attempt to

[47] Herbert V. Guenther. The Life and Teaching of Nâropa (London, Oxford, New York: Oxford University Press, 1963), p. xii. See Smith's critique in his foreword to Smanrtsis shesrig spendzod, Volume 11 (the Bde mchog mkha' 'gro sñan rgyud = ras chung sñan rgyud) (Leh, Ladakh: S. W. Tashigangpa, 1971), pp. 5-7.

[48] Mircea Eliade. A History of Religious Ideas: Volume 3. translated by Willard R. Trask (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1985), p.282.

[49] The Nâlandâ Translation Committee also discussed this material correctly in their Introduction to the Life of Marpa the Translator, pp. xiv-xxiv.

rededicate the Dkar (sic) brgyud pa sects to old truths and insights that were being forgotten."[50]

gTsang smyon was also responsible for a massive doctrinal collection, the Bde mchog mkha' 'gro sñan rgyud in twelve volumes. This work, completed toward the end of his life, systematizes the special transmissions from Milarepa to Ras chung pa, the ḍākinī hearing-lineage teachings on the Cakrasaṃvara cycle. The fact that gTsang smyon identified himself with the Ras chung lineage is significant for his work on the biographical tradition of Milarepa, since authentic material on Mila was transmitted by Ras chung. In two editions, we now have Bde mchog mkha' 'gro sñan rgyud biographies of Milarepa attributed to Ras chung pa, and edited by gTsang smyon.[51] Of course, in the biography of Milarepa by gTsang smyon, the `prologue in heaven' that justifies the whole enterprise is a visionary experience of Ras chung pa who visits the land of Ugyen ('o rgyan) where the Buddha Mi bskyod pa was discoursing on the lives of Tilopa, Nâropa, and Marpa.[52]

[50] Smith, Preface to the Life of the Saint of gTsang, pp. 1-2. Smith's numerous, and frequently anonymous prefaces to the publications edited by Chandra and others are a treasure trove to the Tibetologist in search of fundamental data on a wide variety of texts.

[51] See the Bde mchog sñan brgyud Biographies: reproduction of a collection of rare manuscripts from the sTag-sna Monastery in Ladakh (Darjeeling: Kargyud Sngrab Nyamso Khang, 1983), folios 133-189.

[52] Lhalungpa trans., pp. 9-11.

Victoria Urubshurow summarizes the account of the production of the life of Milarepa from the rnam thar of gTsang smyon by his disciple, rGod tshang ras pa sna tshogs rang grol.

> The mad yogin was visited, as was Rechung before him, by female celestial beings,...and was invested with a mission to bring into print the life and songs of Milarepa. Thence, Tsangnyon Heruka commissioned a search of the central provinces for stories of the great saint and his songs. In the course of this project, the mad yogi became ill and went into retreat for the duration. While in retreat the five sisters of long life, Tseringma, appeared in [his] contemplation, and pledged to help extend Kagyu teaching. The encounter with dakinis offered Tsangnyon Heruka sufficient confidence to testify that the extraordinary biographical texts composed were just as though `coming from the lama's mouth' and that his helpers `accomplished the block printings without thinking about worldly things and enjoyments.'[53]

It was my hope that one of the older sources would prove to be a literary source for the works of gTsang smyon. I was looking for a written text that would match all or at least a significant portion of a song, tale, or episode in the works of gTsang smyon. In neither the rnam thars by sGam po pa nor by rGyal Thang pa did I find such a source. Perhaps we have such a source in the Zi ba 'od cycle quoted in the Blue Annals (see appendix 1 for the Tibetan texts). The following facts have surfaced in this research:

1. There are a few lines in common between rGyal Thang pa's songs and those of the gTsang smyon version of the Mila mgur 'bum.

[53] V. K. Urubshurow, op. cit. pp. 16ff; cf. Life of the Saint of gTsang, folio 135; see complete account folios 137-164.

2. There are `parallels of meaning' in the sense that the same general stories are told, but with different vocabulary and prosody; the common vocabulary is relatively small.

3. In general, each account shows considerable independence rather than dependence on the earlier versions. Some kind of creative retelling is going on.

gTsang smyon elaborates, extends, and embroiders. I am led to suspect that the Mila corpus was for a very long time an oral tradition handed on by story-tellers who did not memorize. Rather, these poets were creative the way a bard is creative and only in the late fifteenth century were the oral tales collected and organized by a literary genius into a coherent but highly redacted romance. This genius, gTsang smyon Heruka, though thoroughly literate, must have also possessed the unique charisms of the entranced bards of the oral tradition of Tibetan epic and hagiography.

Before claiming these conclusions to be established, it seems appropriate to investigate oral forms of poetic transmission and to suggest the mechanism for the oral aspect of the biographical process that produced the _Mila rnam thar_.

The oral tradition in Tibet has been studied in depth by R. A. Stein. His observations take us into the native Tibetan milieu in which Milarepa himself lived and composed his folk-balladry combining Dharma teaching in the tradition of the Indian Mahâsiddhas with the imagery, prosody, and

native genius of the Tibetan glu and mgur.[54] Stein describes the epic (Gesar) in his introduction to the Bhutanese edition:

> The oral versions are spread by professional singers or bards (sgrung mkhan) who wander all over the country. Some may know the whole or a great many chapters of the epic, others only some of them. If invited for recitation, they can recite and sing for days and weeks. They are said to be inspired when singing, or even in a kind of rapture or trance (sgrung 'bab). In any case their attitude at that moment has largely a religious tint. They wear a special hat, the parts of which are explained in a special song (zhra-bshad) in the same way as do other specialists on other occasions. The recitation resembles that of the theatre. The main story is quickly told in prose in a kind of psalmody. It is frequently interrupted by dialogues between the persons who appear in the story.These are in reality an exchange of long songs (glu) chanted in various melodies...in which each person first presents himself as well as his weapons, his horse, etc. This is done, as in the theatre, by means of a stereotyped formula like: `Do you know me? If you don't, I am so and so...' As we know it now in all its available versions, the epic has certainly been composed by a clerical author belonging to the type of inspired poet-saint or yogin (especially in the bKa' brgyud pa and the rNying ma pa orders.).[55]

The last paragraph in particular indicates that it is a literate yogin who is able to make the transition from a purely oral recitation to a written compilation.

[54] Milarepa was known as an inspired bard, according to the mgur 'bum: "But if you are really [Milarepa], you should be able to preach the Dharma through songs. As we all know, the Jetsun Milarepa is a yogi who has completely opened the nadis of the Throat Center, and is thus capable of preaching any Dharma without the slightest hesitation or difficulty.." (p. 538, Songs). These are the attributes of the entranced bard who sings the epic, itself a sacred recitation.

[55] R. A. Stein. "Introduction to the Gesar Epic" in The Epic of Gesar, Vol. I (Thimphu, Bhutan: 1979). pp. 2-4.

It is not enough, however, to locate Milarepa in the context of the Tibetan bard. In order to establish the process of transmission from the oral poet Milarepa to his biographers, we need to know something about oral composition: the art of the bard or `singer of tales.' For this we turn to the work of A. B. Lord on the Yugoslav epic cycles:

> Oral epic song is narrative poetry composed in a manner evolved over many generations by singers of tales who did not know how to write; it consists of the building of metrical lines and half lines by means of formulas and formulaic expressions and of the building of songs by the use of themes...By formula I mean "a group of words which is regularly employed under the same metrical conditions to express a given essential idea." ...We shall see that the formulas...are capable of change and are indeed frequently highly productive of other and new formulas...we shall see that in a very real sense every performance is a separate song; for every performance is unique, and every performance bears the signature of its poet singer... The singer of tales is at once the tradition and an individual creator. His manner of composition differs from that used by a writer in that the oral poet makes no conscious effort to break the traditional phrases and incidents; he is forced by the rapidity of composition in performance to use the traditional elements... His art consists not so much in learning through repetition of the time worn formulas as in the ability to compose and recompose the phrases for the idea of the moment on the pattern established by the basic formulas.[56]

What Lord has given us is an insight into the process of oral composition during performances. "Each performance is more than a performance; it is a re-creation."[57] So the song is in a sense, `generic', a concept, a known quantity

[56] Albert B. Lord. <u>The Singer of Tales</u>. (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard Univeristy Press, 1960). pp. 4-5.

[57] Ibid., p. 101.

in the context of a particular cultural tradition; the singer of tales has to create a work of art in relation to the tale that is in some sense already on the threshold of consciousness of his audience.

Returning to Stein, we can situate this oral process in its Tibetan milieu by looking more closely at the state of mind of the singer of tales. In Yugoslav culture, the state of mind of the bard is tacitly assumed; he must be in a state of ease, of relaxation, a `natural' frame of mind, in tune with his art and with his audience. He must be recollected, but ever ready to act and to respond. This is not all that different from the frame of mind that one may observe in a Nepali vajrâcârya as he performs a homa offering at Swayambunath. Any good ritual specialist carries the flow of the rite in his psychosomatic habits; to perform well, he must have mastered the art of relaxing with the natural tension of carrying out a complex procedure under the scrutiny of the public that is, to put it bluntly, paying for the rite to be performed. Stein perhaps exaggerates or romanticizes the bard's recollection as a kind of `trance'[58]; perhaps it would be better to use the term `concentration' or `recollection' (the French term recueillement is appropriate here, and is used by De La Vallée Poussin in his translation of the Abhidharmakośa).

[58] "The bard cannot recite `cold' without being in trance or inspired." His hat is `necessary' for the trance. see. pp. 322, 333; cf. 342-47.

The religious character of the epic in Tibet is stronger than that of the epic in the Balkans, though in the latter a religious element (Christian or Muslim) is not absent. "For its efficacy, the epic must be recited exactly and completely. Thus a bard is necessary. The manner of recitation is rather a delicate matter. It brings on the real presence of the god or hero- considered to be a god."[59] The bard wears a hat that has a mirror on it that symbolizes the presence of rDo rje 'Chang (Vajradhara). In the folk idiom, such a symbol represents the 'possession' of the bard by the deity. Gesar, for example, is believed to be an emanation of the great Guru Padmasambhava, in whose headgear was a mirror that also represented Vajradhara. Like Vajradhara in the context of Saint, hierophant, and Guru, discussed in Chapter 4, the bard by the very nature of his inspiration tends to assimilate roles. Stein shows how the bard shares in the identity of psychopomp, mad yogin, warrior, athlete, sorcerer, and hero[60]. "If the recitation of the epic is a religious and magical act, he who is its specialist, the bard, is a person characterized by inspiration in every sense of the word - poet, singer, and musician, but also medium, diviner, shaman. Also his behavior and his vesture present numerous resemblances to

[59] R. A. Stein. Recherches sur l'Épopée et le Bard au Tibet. (Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1959). pp. 318-19. In fact, the process is comparable to other types of performance possession in Tibet, such as that of diviners. See pp. 335-6.

[60] Ibid. See pp. 323, 328-9, 332, 330-331.

those of various specialists of the magico-religious domain."[61] Milarepa is presented as a participant in this identity; as a Siddha, he is disconcertingly capable of assimilating diverse societal roles. Even in the sGampopa biography, we find references to Milarepa as a disconcerting presence and as a bard. In rGyal Thang pa's version, we find full-scale songs and a structure that resembles the pattern of the epic. In the rnam thar and mgur 'bum created by gTsang smyon, we find the same combination of genres: dohâ, narrative, mgur, and even drama (the ninth chapter, the Parinirvâṇa, is an elaborate liturgical pageant), such as one might expect in the assimilative environment of the epic.

Epic themes found in the sources for the life of Milarepa include:

1. Demon attacks, which place us in the milieu not only of Gesar, but of the Ramâyana and the Mahâbhârata. Magical weapons, vast arrays of demonic enemies, the aspect of illusion and deception, the boastful threat-songs, and the tendency to project the psychomachia outward onto natural phenomena situate us in the world of the South Asian epic.[62]

[61] Ibid. p. 320.

[62] Ibid., pp. 511-513. Based on the theme of conflict with the paternal uncle, Stein suggests that the life of Milarepa was an influence on the plot of the epic, but in the light of the complex literary history of the biography, it is possible that the epic may have shaped the re-telling of the life of the Saint.

2. Mila himself is presented as a bard, as an inspired and even 'possessed' instrument of the Dharma. Some aspects of his costume and behavior resemble those of the bard[63]. As a Buddhist proclaiming the Dharma, Milarepa was able to integrate his native ability as a singer of glu[64] with his illumination as a lineage-holder of the anuttarayogatantra transmitted from Nâropa to Marpa, and of the Mahâsiddha dohâ tradition transmitted by Maitrîpa to Marpa. The smyon pas and Siddhas claimed to despise learning and books (or rather: learning that merely involved verbalization and quibbling). Perhaps this was their strategy for maintaining sympathy with the people; certainly the assimilation of the identity of a folk bard was a brilliant move toward situating Buddhism firmly at the center of the indigenous cultural amalgam.[65]

The important pre-Buddhist phenomenon of shamanic possession gave a communicable shape to the message of the smyon pa rnal 'byor pa. In chapter 53 of the mgur 'bum,

[63] The nudity of Milarepa alludes not only to his detachment from worldly concepts of 'shame' but also has links to the warrior/sorcerer, according to Stein, pp. 330-331. The association of bards with pilgrimage offers a connection with Mila's determination to meditate in numerous caves and holy places. "En remontant à Mi la ras pa, nous devons constater que non seulement ces poètes ont les même attitudes et accoutrements que le jeune Gesar et le barde, leur style même est identique à celui de l'epopée (métaphores et prosodie)." Stein, p. 493 .

[64] Mila is presented as a songster from his youth; his yogic attainment completes the initiatic trials of a sacred bard so that he no longer sings glu, but rises to the dharmic themes appropriate to the mgur.

[65] See Stein, op. cit. pp. 498, 500, 506.

Mila encounters the accomplished _yogin_ Dampa Sangye and proclaims himself crazy in a lineage of crazy ones, starting with the great rDo rJe 'Chang - crazy like a sick man or one possessed by a demon, which suggests that to the popular imagination the hierophant/Saint is a `Varjadhara' because he is `possessed' by Vajradhara. This is sacred madness, which puts the saint in constant touch with Absolute Reality. One has to be both mad and divine to be adequate to the permanent vision of Truth[66].

3. Mila is the type of hero that we find in Gesar. As a boy, under the name Jo ru, the hero is ugly and mischievous. He plays very bad practical jokes, making use of his supernatural powers. Only after a series of initiatic trials is he installed as King of gLing with the name Gesar[67] (Caesar?), a _cakravartin_ subduing demons and villains in the surrounding territories[68]. As a boy,

66 Ibid., pp. 490-491.

67 Mila and Gesar even have names in common. Mila is called _bzad pa rdo rje_ (Laughing Vajra) by Marpa; Gesar is called _padma bzad pa_ (Laughing Lotus) or _bzad pa rtsal_ (Skillful Laugher). They are both called _thos pa dga'_ (Happy-Report). See Stein, Ibid., p. 505. _Thos pa dga'_ also means _euvangelion_, gospel, good-news. Is it possible that the Nestorians were able to transmit this concept to China and Central Asia to the extent that it could enter the vocabulary of epic? If Gesar (Caesar), why not Gospel? See P. Y. Saeki, _The Nestorian Documents and Relics in China_ (Tokyo: The Toho Bunkwa Gakuin, 1951), p. 274 (A-_wan chü li yung_ = _evangelium_) and p. 314 ("The Nestorian Hymn in Adoration of the Transfiguration" from A.D. 720).

68 Stein, _Introduction to the Gesar Epic_, pp. 4-5. Abnormalities and faults in epic heroes are discussed in Alf Hiltebeitel, _The Ritual of Battle: Krişna in the Mahâbhârata_. (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1976), pp. 44ff.

Milarepa is presented as powerless and a bit spoiled. His mother thinks he has no will power, so she tells the youths who accompany him to dBu to watch over him so he will persevere in his study of magic. His mother sees the son as an insult to his father's memory, unable to avenge himself on their enemies and barely able to help provide for their needs. Mila undertakes the practice of destructive magic which proves to be an initiatic trial by which he triumphs over his enemies; his remorse over his sinful vengeance gives rise to higher aspirations. Just as glu are characteristic of men's lives in the course of cyclic existence, so too are the deeds of sorcery merely the playing out of Saṃsâric themes- nasty practical jokes. However, once the karmic connection between evil doing and future consequences has become apparent, Milarepa is ready to take the right path, leading to Buddhahood, the realization of which will be manifest in his mastery of the art of mgur. First he must pass through the trials of probationship under Marpa, and of ascetic practices in the snow ranges. His combat with demons[69], with the elements, with his human despisers, and with himself, solidifies his achievement and makes permanent the realization that he initially glimpsed in the cave at Lho Brag. Along with his title rJe btsun, `the one worthy of veneration' (i.e., Saint), rGyal thang pa regularly attaches the term rgyal po

[69] Stein, Épopée et Barde, pp. 560-2; These battles can be a kind of playful sport in the epic.

(victor = <u>jina</u>, <u>narapati</u>, <u>râjan</u>; thus we have: <u>rje</u> <u>btsun</u> <u>gyi</u> <u>rgyal</u> <u>po</u> <u>mid</u> <u>la</u> <u>ras</u> <u>pa</u>), suggesting that the Saint is both world conqueror and world renouncer, a theme going back to the earliest conceptions of the Buddha.

At his death, Milarepa is reported to leave behind a hat with a mirror on it (folio 263), no doubt symbolizing the fact that its owner was not only a bard, but an embodiment of Vajradhara, a complete Buddha.[70]

We may now turn to the texts themselves, which we find not to be related word-for-word. Our summary of the work of Stein and of Lord enables us to make the following suggestions:

1. Like the Yugoslav epic, the narrative story line is quite conservative; there are consistent retellings of certain events, certain encounters, certain songs, that undergo creative reshaping in the retelling. Examples include Mila's return to his ruined house, his encounter

[70] Ibid. p. 351 and 508. The <u>sâdhana</u> of Gesar is identical in structure to any other divinity's <u>sâdhana</u>; it amounts to a type of <u>utpattikrama</u> (<u>skyed</u> <u>rim</u>). (p. 336-7, 339.) There is a definite tendency towards a kind of syncretism. "Gesar became a <u>dgra-lha</u> (warrior god) and received a cultus, inaugurated by the Third Karmapa, Rang Byung rdo rje (1284-1339)" Ibid., p. 523. This Karmapa was noted for his interest in rNing ma pa teachings and authored a two-volume work on Milarepa in the form of a <u>rnam</u> <u>thar</u> and a <u>mgur</u> '<u>bum</u>.
Gesar himself is regarded, esoterically, as an incarnation of Vajradhara. In a certain sense, the `possession' of the lineage holder (who is being held? and by whom?) by Vajradhara constitutes the holiness of the tantric Saint. This can be said, keeping in mind the perspective of Buddhist dogmatics which would deny the validity of an analogy making Buddhahood an external deity that `seizes' upon a believer to sanctify him!

with Peta, his encounter with Dar Blo, his winter in La Phyi, etc.

2. Like the Yugoslav epic, there are common formulas, used the way an oral poet composes, but they are fewer than one would expect. Apparently the literate redactor has imposed his own stylistic modifications on the oral account. For the most part the common vocabulary tends to be limited to place names, persons, and Dharma terminology.

3. Unlike the Yugoslav epic, an original `author' is known: Milarepa, himself a bard and yogin. The entire process of the formation of the biographies of Milarepa reflect an interplay of oral and written sources.

4. Unlike the Yugoslav epic, all the known transmitters of the accounts were literate and in fact quite learned. Therefore their efforts necessarily differ from the productions of inspired bards in performance as described by Perry and Lord. However, in the tradition of the bKa' brgyud pa and rNing ma pa, spontaneous song was a cultivated charism derived from both Indian tantric Buddhism and indigenous Tibetan culture. The learned authors did not abandon these sources of inspiration in the production of a unique religious literature. The literary biographies stand as `outcroppings' that give the reader a glimpse of the way bards told the tale in performance generations ago.

5. By examining such phenomena as formulas, repetition, and metric variations, we can guess which songs are fairly close to oral performance. Certainly there are

many oral patterns faithfully reproduced in the manuscripts of Gesar, as Stein has observed. The same ability to transform oral poetry into written without obscuring the `oral' style can be found in these bKa' brgyud *rnam thars*.

6. Tibetan prosody demonstrates the close relationship between written and oral style in the manuscripts of the epic and in the *rnam thars*. In *Gesar*, the verses are composed of seven syllables that form three catalectic trochees, lacking the final half-foot: __'U __'U __'U __[71].

Sometimes a monosyllabic word preceeds the verse, in `absolute position,' forming a non-accented half-foot:

__ __' U __' U __' U __

Example from *Gesar*:

yon tan mthong rgya su che yin//

__' U __' U __' U __

or:

bka' mdo brgyud ñams len ma zan na//

__ __' U __' U __' U __[72]

Let us compare the prosody of the Song of the Snow Ranges from the Third Chapter of the Songs (*mgur 'bum*) and from the *rnam thar* by rGyal thang pa (folios 231ff):

1. *mgur 'bum*:

yang stag gi lo yi lo gzug la//

__ __' U __' U __' U __

rGyal thang pa:

71 Stein, *Épopée et Barde*, p. 501.

72 Ibid., p. 502.

lo stag lo lo'i zhabs la//

__ __' U __' U __

2. mgur 'bum:

yos bu'i lo yi lo mgo la//

__' U __' U __' U __

rGyal Thang pa:

yos bu'i lo'i lo mgo la//

__ __' U __' U __ (?)

In these two verses we see in the rGyal thang pa lines a 6-syllable line, which is characteristic of the most ancient type of Tibetan poetry.[73] We suggest that these lines come directly from the 'mouth' of a poet used to the older prosody, though even these are relatively rare in the rGyal thang pa version. Among the parallel redactions in the work of gTsang smyon Heruka, no six syllable lines at all were found.

3. mgur 'bum:

'brog la phyi gangs kyi rab der//

__' U __' U __' U __

rGyal Thang pa:

ngas la phyis gangs la phyin tsa na//

__ __' U __' U __' U __

4. mgur 'bum:

lho sprin smug po 'dun mar bsdus//

__' U __' U __' U __

rGyal Thang pa:

[73] Ibid., p. 530, fn. 19.

<u>lho sprin smug po'i 'dun dmag g.yos//</u>

__' U __' U __' U __

In these two verses we find close affinities, with variations that we might expect in oral recitation. The variations observed by Lord between two Yugoslav bards reciting the same tale are given for comparison:

Bard 1:

<u>ko je bliže, ka zemlji gledaše,</u>

<u>ko je dalje, čini se ne čuje.</u>

(Translation: He who was nearby looked at the ground;
He who was farther off pretended not to hear.)

Bard 2:

<u>ko bi dalje, čini se ne čuje,</u>

<u>ko bi bliže, zemlji pogleduje.</u>

Bard 2 uses the aorist (<u>pogleduje</u>) to effect a rhyme with <u>čuje</u>; Bard 1 had used a present (<u>gledaše</u>).[74] Like gTsang smyon, who adds many lines, the Yugoslav bards may add to or reduce the number of lines depending on performance circumstances.

5. <u>mgur</u> '<u>bum</u>:

<u>ñi zla zung gcig btson du bzung//</u>

__' U __' U __' U __

rGyal Thang pa:

<u>ñi zla gñis po btson du bzung//</u>

__' U __' U __' U __

[74] Lord, op. cit., p. 64; cf. pp. 109-110.

6. mgur 'bum:

kha ba ñin dgu mtshan dgu babs//
— ' U — ' U — ' U —

rGyal Thang pa:

dgung kha ba ñin dgu mtshan dgu babs//
— — ' U — ' U — ' U —

7. mgur 'bum:

che la ñin mtshan bco brgyad babs//
— ' U — ' U — ' U —

rGyal Thang pa:

che la ñin mtshan bco brgyad babs//
— ' U — ' U — ' U —

These parallel verses show standard `lamaist' prosody of 7 or 8 syllables.

8. mgur 'bum:

dgun lo gsar sgang gi lhags pa dang//
— ' U — ' U — ' U — ' U —

rGyal Thang pa:

lo gsar sgang gi lhags pa gñis//
— ' U — ' U — ' U —

Lines of 9 syllables are not uncommon in gTsang smyon, but could not be found in the work of rGyal thang pa. This longer style comes from the learned milieu, at least in part under the influence of the prosody of the translation of the Sanskrit Buddhist scriptures and commentaries.

In the redactions by gTsang smyon and rGyal thang pa, we can also observe slight but significant variations in the way stories are told. Here is a parallel plot summary of the story of the winter on La phyi Snow Mountain.

gTsang smyon Heruka's Chapter 2 describes Milarepa subduing demons at La phyi and environs.	In rGyal Thang pa, Marpa has died and Mila is en route to Lho Brag. He stops at Sñe nam.
The people of Nya non become Mila's patrons. They invite him to stay in the village. Depressed by their worldliness, he returns to La phyi, taking flour, rice, a piece of meat, and a cut of butter. He stays in the Cave of Conquering Demons.	The villagers become his patrons, especially rNgog dor mo; Mila takes nine measures of grain and goes to La phyis (<u>sic</u>) gang.
There is a snowstorm for 18 days and nights, which cuts him off from the village for six months. Assuming him to have died, the villagers hold a ritual feast.	There is a snowstorm for 18 days without interruption; for seven months he is cut off and no one could bring him supplies. The people lament, assuming him to be dead. In the meantime, Mila, in anticipation of death, considered doing the ejection of consciousness ('<u>pho ba</u>). A <u>mkha'</u>

In late March/early April the disciples went to look for his corpse. They saw him as a snow leopard. Reaching his cave, they found him still alive; he prepared a meal for them. He admitted having supernatural powers of transformation. *mKa'* '*gro* *mas* fed him in the winter; he at meditative absorption, and

'*gro* *ma* appeared to him, instructing him to eat meditative absorption, to do the Steps of Arising and Completion, and not to fear death. He described his discomforts & meditative experiences: (lightness; rush of mystic winds; clear light) He attained the *siddhi* of immortality; he never felt hungry; he attained both Supreme and Ordinary Attainments.

Several patrons, among them rNgog dor mo, go to search for the corpse. They recite prayers for the dead.

Meanwhile, the Saint went to another spot; the searchers reach the spot where he had been. They blow a conch and make noise while searching. Mila sings; they hear him

he mystically consumed the feast prepared by the villagers in honor of his `death'.

but cannot reach him, so he flies to them. He shares his barley and some meat with them. How did he survive? "I wear the garment of mystic heat; I eat _samâdhi_; I meditate on Guru-yoga, and perform _skyed-rdzogs_ -I was helped by _mKha' `gro ma_ and deities."

The disciples force him to return to the village.
Mila dances on a rock used as a threshing floor and leaves footprints; he sings the Song of the Snowstorm, and arrives with the disciples at the village. He sings a Song of Renewal to Lesebum, and a song of View, Practice, and Illumination. To Shajaguna he sings the Song of the Six Essences of Meditative Experience.
He is acclaimed to be like the Buddhas of the Three Times; Mila urges them to practice

Dharma and sings a song of Fools and Foolishness, and then a Song of Renunciation. The villagers make offerings but he does not accept them, and their faith in him is confirmed.

All become very devoted and make full prostrations at his feet.

Conclusion: Milarepa: Saint, Buddha, and Epic Hero

With the figure of Milarepa, developed over four centuries of literary creativity in Tibet, we have attempted to fill out a description of the Buddhist Saint. In the process, it has been suggested that sanctity can be localized in two general spheres, the outer and the inner, the public recognition or cult accorded a holy person during life and after death, and the spiritual attainment that is the Saint's interior life. We have observed that the inner life that is associated with sanctity may be lived by those who are ultimately unrecognized by the `public' as Saints and whose lives are never written. On the other hand, when one focuses exclusively on hagiography, in all its literary variety, one may actually miss the essentially interior aspect of holiness for the biographies of Saints usually give us only hints of what the Saint did in his times of meditation and ascetic practice. Biographies alone rarely tell us in great detail of what constitutes the Holy in which the Saint lives and moves and has his being. With the

bKa' brgyud gser 'phreng format, at least we have the rnam thar of rDo rje 'Chang to outline the inner structure of the holiness inwardly attained by the saints of the lineage.

The recognition accorded a holy person, as suggested by Professor Hawley[75], may be seen in three areas: exemplarity, fellowship, and assistance.

Exemplarity refers to the role of the Saint as a model of virtuous behavior for others. In some cases, the behavior of the Saint is not to be imitated literally, but is meant to disclose a deeper moral orientation, a `morality beyond morality' that, when authentic, reveals to the people the presence of one who truly embodies holiness (as Keith Dowman observed of the Siddha, see above Chapter 3). In the case of Milarepa, we find that his great devotion to all his Gurus, especially Marpa, his assiduous practice of meditation, and his zealous propagation of the lineage turn up in the biographies as `imitables.' His conduct in other aspects is not really imitable by most disciples, and in fact is to be discouraged. For example, his rigid practice of solitude and his severe austerities cannot be imitated by most of his disciples[76]. His practice of karmamudrâ is not

[75] John Stratton Hawley, editor. Saints and Virtues. (Berkeley: The University of California Press, 1987) p. xii.

[76] Strict solitude is now institutionalized in the form of retreats of varying durations. The most common type is for three years, three months, and three days; group liturgical exercises, solitary sâdhanas, and consultation with the Lama are strictly regulated. These retreats are described in Thomas Merton's Asian Journal; bKa' brgyud pa centers in

recommended for everyone, and is prohibited to monks[77]. His songs are a peculiar saintly charism that, although taken up by other bKa' brgyud pa Siddhas, is not necessarily imitable by all[78]. Milarepa himself inculcated one activity above all others as being supremely necessary and supremely imitable: meditation practice. In the rnam thar by rGyal Thang pa, he manifests this explicitly by meditating right up to the point of death; his last words are given as: "At this time, it doesn't matter to me whether I meditate or not. But I am doing this for the purpose of showing you [how to behave]. I am an old man, so I am at the point of death. Even so, I meditate. If you don't meditate, you won't achieve Buddhahood. You must meditate!" With that phrase, he died ('pho ba). (Folio 262)[79]

What Hawley includes under `fellowship'[80] indicates the relationships among saintly persons and the notion of a holy

Wappinger's Falls, NY, and southeastern France (Karma Ling) offer these retreats to Westerners.

In the process of transmitting the lineage traditions to Milarepa, Marpa observed: "To impose trials on a disciple, as Tilopa did on Nâropa, or as I did on you, will be profitless for undeveloped minds. Give the teachings with discernment." pp. 91-92, LM.

77 See Takpo, p. 440 fn. 23.

78 As a practice, vajra-songs have been institutionalized in such liturgical collections as The Rain of Wisdom.

79 The famous story of how Milarepa impressed this lesson upon the mind of sGampopa by exposing his calloused buttocks is recounted in the Songs, p. 495, and in BA, p. 721.

80 Greek: koinonia, a term important in the Pachomian hagiographical tradition, see Lisa Cremaschi: Pacomio e i suoi discepoli.

community. For traditional Buddhism, this is the Saṃgha. In the lives of Milarepa, the traditional Saṃgha is highly problematic. The communities of monks, the usual focus of Saṃgha identity, are presented as hostile and even violent. Scholars, the mainstay of Mahâyâna transmission, are presented as envious, devious, and even demonic. However, the bonds between master and disciple, and the spiritual power descending through the lineage, supply what is lacking in this aspect of the Vajrayâna milieu. The sense that there is a community of persons pursuing the goal of Buddhahood together is also rather weakly presented; one must look instead for hints here and there in the texts: the close friendships of Marpa with his co-disciples in India under Nâropa; the close associations of Marpa's disciples during the time of the death of Marpa's son[81]. The dreams of the disciples are interpreted by Milarepa in terms of a great cosmic maṇḍala that presages the spread of the bKa' brgyud pa teachings.[82] In the rGyal Thang pa version of the life of Milarepa, the sense that there is a community of practitioners is evident from the time when Mila assists the Bon po who was lost in the Bardo. Thereafter, both provisions and disciples are said to have accumulated like clouds. At the end of his life, Milarepa is in the company

[81] See, The Life of Marpa the Translator, pp. 156-181; and LM, p. 82. The disciples of Marpa celebrate the first anniversary of the death of Dodebum as a group.

[82] LM, pp. 82-86 and Life of Marpa, pp. 181-196..

of twelve yogins and yoginīs engaged in intensive practice in adjacent caves near Sñe nam and Brin.

However, the most important aspect of fellowship in the lives of Milarepa and indeed in any hagiographical account is the presence of charismatic authority. Professor Hawley links this with the transmission of assistance, but it seems more apposite to place it with the practice of sharing spiritual benefits, transfer of merit, and awakening faith. Milarepa is a great bKa' brgyud pa lineage holder; he is Vajradhara in person, embodying not only the lineage itself, but the Buddhahood that is both the goal and the path of practice. From a folkloristic/epic point of view, Milarepa is a Saint continuously "possessed" by the deity Vajradhara; this is of course symbolic language to fit him in the frame of reference of archaic pre-Buddhist thought in Tibet, an aspect of cultural life that was never far from Milarepa's own consciousness, practice, and milieu.

The third aspect of public recognition is that of assistance or intercession. Here Milarepa acts as a conduit of sacred power, transmitting the contagion of sanctity by means of his songs and his mastery of ritual action. His disciples experienced high states of realization when he merely recited a single mantra; he manifested the presence of the goddess Târâ during the dedication of merit ceremony; the flowers to be strewn at the consecration of an icon flew up by themselves; the vase in a Vase Initiation moved of its own accord to bless the foreheads of the participants

individually without the need for the aged Milarepa to apply the vase manually. In all these situations, there was a tremendous outpouring of spiritual power that granted the desires of the disciples. Even hearing the name of Milarepa is thought to block the path to evil destinies; devotion to him makes available the path to supreme, perfect Buddhahood, if not in one lifetime, then very soon.[83] He was able to convert sinners, such as his own aunt, even without miracles. He was able to benefit even those who hated him and appeared after death to those who had wished him harm to bring them spiritual benefits. Even in life, the most terrible insults (such as throwing dirt in his mouth as a form of mockery or contempt) were transmuted into acts of devotion that bore fruit quickly in the lives of those who performed them.

Returning to the aspect of fellowship, we find the basis for the inseparable continuity between the outer and inner aspects of Milarepa's holiness. His relation to the Absolute, the reality called Vajradhara, is that which he has fully realized in `one body, in one lifetime.' This great achievement, the culmination of the tantric path of spiritual practice, is the basis of his holiness. Milarepa attained Arhatship through the path of penitence; he then received initiation in the path of the Bodhisattva when Marpa taught him to awaken bodhicitta[84]; through the `four

83 LM, colophon, pp. 201-202.

84 RTH, Folio 214; LM, p. 73.

foundations' practice and the initiation of the tantric path, he began the _utpattikrama_; he finally completed the _saṃpannakrama_ in solitude with the help of _ḍākinīs_. Thus he achieved the Five Paths, he traversed the Ten Stages, and attained the Five Bodies of a Complete Buddha. His attainment of Buddhahood is represented as a confirmation of the tantric path of the Mahāsiddhas, transmitted to Marpa, and fully transplanted in Tibet by the bKa' brgyud pa lamas. As a Buddha, he can engage also in the `secret' practice of unrestricted, all-pervasive and unpredictable behavior for the benefit of all types of sentient beings. This `inner attainment' is of course the fruit of practice, the indispensible following of the complete path to enlightenment (the so-called Three-Yānas). The attainment of enlightenment is what makes possible the outer deeds that gradually convince the people that the son of Mila Shes rab rgyal mtshan is truly a Siddha, and truly a Buddha. The public recognition as presented in rGyal Thang pa's account is achieved gradually, from his sister, from various denizens of the high Himalayan slopes (hunters and feather-gatherers), to the villagers of Sñe nam, to ever-increasing crowds of disciples and patrons, and finally to all realms of existence, including deities and demons. Just as his own inner experience of Awakening is presented as gradual (no results with rDzogs chen; slight results with rNgog; greater and greater realization under Marpa; and then in solitude, full realization of the supreme and ordinary _siddhis_ with

the help of the *ḍākinīs*), so too is the public recognition. At first, no one thinks much of him; in fact, he is hated by the villagers whose lives he has wrecked by means of destructive magic; his aunt hates him; his sister doubts the value of his severe ascetical practice; and even when he has mastered the inner channels and currents sufficiently to be able to fly, a farmer who sees him merely thinks he is a crazy *yogin* unworthy of veneration. It is the feather gatherers who first benefit from his teachings; then a group of lady patrons from his native region come out of curiosity and leave deeply impressed. Then there is the miracle at La phyi(s). But it is at the very end of his life, with the manifestation of `ubiquitous' activity as a Buddha that we are convinced, in the scheme of rGyal thang pa's telling of the tale, that here we indeed have a Buddha. And the tiny detail of the bard's hat with a mirror sewn upon it that is found among Milarepa's few personal possessions after death tells the tale *in nuce*: here was a true Vajradhara, who realized and transmitted the adamantine state that is beyond life and death, hope and fear, grasper and grasped.

Part III

Chapter 8: A Translation of the Biography of Vajradhara by rGyal Thang pa

This is the _rnam thar_ of Vajradhara that we find at the start of the cycle of biographies by rGyal Thang pa. The footnotes provide commentary that coordinates this tantric description of Buddhahood and the attainment of illumination with the information in Parts I and II.[1]

Folio 1

[1] Reproduced from a rare manuscript from the library of Hemis Monastery (Ladakh) by the 8th Khams-sprul Don-brGyud-nyi-ma.

"Among the precious Dkar-brgyud-pa and Rnying-ma-pa prints and manuscripts preserved in the Hemis Monastery near Leh in Ladakh is a beautifully illustrated manuscript of a group of Dkar-brgyud-pa hagiographies, a _Dkar brgyud gser 'phreng_, by one Rgyal-thang pa Bde-chen-rdo-rje. No biography of this master is immediately available, but it is known that he was a disciple of Rgod-tsang-pa Mgon-po-rdo-rje (1189-1258), the last guru whose biography appears in this collection. This _Dkar-brgyud gser 'phreng_ must therefore belong to the 13th century and is thus one of the oldest surviving examples of the genre. On the last folio we find a list of the successive gurus in the transmission up to the teacher at whose behest the present manuscript was presumably made: Rgyal-thang-pa Bde-chen rdo rje; Chos-rje Thogs med pa; Slob-dpon Shes rab 'byung gnas; Dka' bcu pa Sangs rgyas bkra shis; Mkhas grub Chos kyi rgyal mtshan; Bdag Swa sti dhwa tsha (i.e. Legs pa rgyal mtshan of Zur). The style of the miniatures and the script suggest that this manuscript belongs to the late 15th or early 16th century."

The Biographical Accounts of the Glorious Dwags Po Bka' brgyud pa.[2] This is sGyur ban's book. Auspicious![3]

Folio 2

Salutations to the glorious Guru![4] He [Vajradhara] is the master of all the Buddha-families, Chief of all the glorious ones, Master of the Doctrine of the Secret Mantra, the teacher of the Mahâyâna. He is first of the Gurus of the bKa' brgyud; holder of the doctrines of the practice lineage.[5] He is the expounder of the commentary on the oral transmission. As it says in the root text:

1. Wondrous (e-ma)! A sage, a teacher, a master of the Doctrine,

[2] This is the only version of the text that has come to light, to my knowledge and that of my Tibetan informants, Losang Jamspal and Pema Wangyal, whose assistance is gratefully acknowledged. Since many of the _bKa' brgyud gser 'phreng_ begin with a similar text (_rdo rje 'chang rnam thar_), we can make corrections in our text on the basis of these similar works in the absence of a number of mss. and xylographs that might make a critical edition possible. According to Losang Jamspal, the script is '_bru yig_, "seed-shaped letters", because the round parts looks like seed grain. It is a type of _dbu med_ (headless cursive script). This '_bru yig_ is said to be popular in Khams. Pema Wangyal suggests that it is not sufficiently pointed on the top and bottom of the letters to be called '_bru tsa_. He is of the opinion that the style is Himalayan, from the region of Sñe nam. See Appendix 3 for a photocopy of the text.

[3] In small handwriting below the title; an addition to the text, which we give here only for historical purposes, and to assist a future investigation of ms. provenance. Note also that in the left margin of each obverse folio is the word Vajra (transliterated as _vazra_); an abbreviation for Vajradhara, whose _rnam thar_ this is. In the same way, the biography of Milaraspa has Mi la in the left margin.

[4] ungrammatical Sanskrit: _Śrī guru namo_.

[5] LM, p. 207, n. 18, on the definition of Vajradhara.

Simultaneously ripening the streams of consciousness,
Of all persons of sharp senses, he is manifest as the Lord
Of the Secret Mantra:
Praise be to Vajradhara (rDo rJe 'Chang), the excellent one who fully accomplishes the aims [of sentient beings].

2. He is embodied in the perfect place, time, retinue, and so forth;
He possesses the state (*dngos*) of the Five Types of Knowledge[6]
And the Seven Factors,
Being united with the Self-arisen Consort.
Praise be to Vajradhara Saṃbhogakāya Buddha!

[6] LM, p. 206: "In tantra...the Five Defilements are to be transformed into the Five Transcendent Awarenesses through the meditation process. A yogin such as Milarepa can and does achieve enlightenment by exploiting the hidden potentialities of the human body and mind." Prof. Wayman comments (p. 392, *Hist. Relig.*): "In Mahāyāna Buddhism, Enlightenment consists of the four or five knowledges or wisdoms, the four being the 'mirror-like' (because devoid of discursive thought), the 'sameness'(of all the dharmas); the 'discriminative' (of the individual and general characteristics of all the dharmas), and the 'procedure of duty' (for the happiness and welfare of sentient beings) kinds of knowledge; and the fifth, the 'pure *dharmadhātu* knowledge' which is both the object of the other four and their basis." This material is discussed in Asaṅga's *Mahāyāna-sūtrālaṃkāra* (see S. Lévi, trans., chpt. IX #67-74, pp. 88-90, for the Four Knowledges). The idea is to reverse the thrust of the 'aggregate of perception' (*vijñāna-skandha*) so as to give rise to the Five Knowledges; tantric Buddhism optimistically embraces this Mahāyāna idea and takes it to extreme conclusions, especially in the *anuttara-yoga-tantras*. See below, folio 6.
See also, LM, p. 209, n. 5.

3. Victor possessing the Eight Sovereignties (dbang phyug brgyad ldan)

O Vajradhara,

The extraordinary Vajrayāna teachings are those which, in one lifetime, confer Buddhahood.

Praise[7] be to Vajradhara, who teaches the unsurpassable Doctrine.

4. He is on the Thirteenth Stage, which is the best among the paths (mārga) and Stages (bhūmi),

Folio 3

Vajradhara, the sixth of the perfect Buddhas, is the 'holder of the vajra;'

He is completely extraordinary, reaching the state of culmination.

Praise be to Vajradhara, Lord of the Buddha Families[8].

[7] For 'praise' of Buddhas and Bodhisattvas,. see E. Lamotte, trans., MPP-Ś, 1976. Tome IV, pp. 1976 ff.

[8] The buddha-gotras or kulas. Tibetan gives: rigs kyi bdag po. See ITB, p. 204ff for Vajrasattva as the Sixth Buddha of the maṇḍala. "Vajrasattva (Adamantine Being) is an epithet of absolute power such as pertains to Vajrapāṇi (vajra-in-hand) at the summit of his successful career when he is effectively identified with Vajradhara (Vajra-holder), a title of the sixth Buddha favored generally in tradition associated with the Eighty-Four Great Adepts." (p. 205). See also, ITB p. 221 and fn. 167. Effectively, by visualizing Vajradhara, one automatically encompasses the other five; he is All-in-One. In possessing the state of the Five Types of Knowledge (see above, verse 2), he also possesses the absolute state of all the Five Buddha Families. In the Vimalakīrti-nirdeśa, chapter 8, we find descriptions that in later tantric Buddhism were developed into visualizations of the Five Buddha Families and which also give some of the characteristics of the 84 Mahāsiddhas. See especially, in the Thurman translation, pp. 64-66 and

This is what the root text says. Now, the explanation of the root text:

The first point is that he was "a Sage, a Master of the Doctrine, etc." which means, should one wish to conjecture, "Just who is that Vajradhara, the Buddha of the sixth (drug-pa) Buddha Family? What kind of biographical account[9] does he have?" The answer, in the exoteric sense [or: in general], is in the biography of the master of this Doctrine, the Buddha Śâkyamuni, the Teacher, the Blessed One, the Victor. At that time, the Buddha manifested completely the state of an Enlightened One in accordance with the visionary capacity of the pure disciples. [At the same time] the Saṃbhogakâya, having a pure and excellent body, in a pure place, the Akaniṣṭha, the Palace of the Doctrine, became enlightened. By means of the teachings of

the poem pp. 67-72, where there are many items comparable to details in Tibetan rnam thars.

[9] A biography of an `archetype' seems strange. With Vajradhara, we are speaking of a universal Buddha, as Roerich points out in a note on p. 356-7 in BA: "Here the word Buddha does not mean the Buddhas who dwell in a particular sphere and preach individually to a group of disciples...(here a universal Buddha is meant)."

Notice how the Origin of the Târâ Tantra begins with a mythic biography of the goddess, in which she begins her path as the Princess "Moon of Wisdom." See: David Templeman, trans., The Origin of the Târâ Tantra by Jo-nang Târânâtha; LTWA, 1981; pp. 11-15, which is similar to the Buddhist `genesis myth', for which see Alex Wayman, "Buddhist Genesis and the Tantric Tradition," in The Buddhist Tantras (Samuel Weiser: NY, 1973). In some of the bKa' brgyud gser 'phreng cycles, there is also a biography of Vajrapâṇi. See, for example, The Rwa Lung Dkar Brgyud Gser 'Phreng, Volume I, Palampur, Sungrab Nyamso Gyunphel Parkhang Tibetan Craft Community, 1975. pp. 29-35.

the extraordinary Doctrine of the Vajrayâna, he came to the realization of the nature of reality as Vajradhara Buddha. Thus [too] is brought about the complete ripening of the mental continua of those disciples who are worthy vessels. Also, in accordance with the visionary capacity of impure disciples, in this impure world of human beings, he manifested in the form of a Sage in the Emanation Body (Nirmâṇakâya) so that by whatever means, disciples can be formed[10]. By means of the vehicle of ordinary teachings [`Hînayâna'] the mental continua of disciples [śrâvaka] who are worthy beings are ripened. In brief, the Buddha displays the form of a Nirmâṇakâya and a Saṃbhogakâya, in bodies both good and bad; at times both early and late, etc. He will arise in the sight of pure and impure disciples uncharacterized by [i.e. unrestricted to] a good or bad body, high or low levels, early or late times[11]

Folio 4

- at a single time, at a single place, in a single body, he is the Buddha! It is stated thus in the Laṅkâvatâra sûtra:

[10] Formed. In the sense of `spiritual formation', the term used commonly in Roman Catholic religious orders to describe the process by which persons are trained and by which they internalize their spiritual training.

[11] In their translation of the rnam thar of Vajradhara from the Shangs pa gser 'phreng by rMog-lcogs-pa, the Hansons, Deshung Rinpoche, and Lobsang Lhalungpa call these conditions the `five certainties' and state that "the sambhogakâya fulfills others' aims through the `five certainties'. They give the same quote from the Laṅkâvatâra sûtra as we give in the next sentence. Most importantly, we find the basic idea already in Asaṅga's Mahâyâna-sûtrâlaṃkâra, IX, 60-66; see also Lessing and Wayman, p. 156.

"Having abandoned pure states (śuddhâvâsa), the Buddha was enlightened in the pleasant pure place called the Akaniṣṭha in the [form of] Saṃbhogakâya Buddha. [But] here [on earth], it was an emanation that became the Buddha.

The Master of the [exoteric] Doctrine [of Buddhism], this Lord of the Sages (munîndra), Buddha the teacher, belonging to the Buddha Family of those of acute intelligence[12], is a person possessing good fortune and good previous actions, who in a single life [i.e. his last earthly lifetime], in a single body, achieves the goal, [and is able to] ripen and liberate the streams of consciousness of pure disciples. The Teacher, [esoterically] manifesting in union with the Consort (mudrâ) as Vajradhara Saṃbhoga-kâya [Buddha], master of the Doctrine of the Secret Mantra teachings, benefits superior disciples.

Then, for those of dull intellect and for those of inferior destiny as their lot in numberless eons, and for the benefit of disciples desiring the goal, the Master manifested himself in the form of the Nirmâṇakâya Sage; [by providing] disciples of little merit with the ordinary

[12] Judith Hanson translates yongs sgoms blo ldan rnams as "fully cultivated intelligent ones"- a special class of beings. See below, at the end of folio 6. See also, Alex Wayman, "Twilight Language and a Tantric Song" in The Buddhist Tantras, op. cit., p 129, citation of the commentary on the Guhyasamâja tantra by Candrakîrti (the Pradîpoddyotana): viśiṣṭaruci-sattvânâm, which he translates as "for sentient beings having superior zeal," which refers to those for whom the twilight language of the tantras and the tantric dohâs was intended. Of course, ruci may refer to desire from the point of view of sensuality, but in combination with viśiṣṭa it should be taken in the sense of a term of praise and admiration, hence `zeal'.

teachings of the Doctrine. Though he used two forms, his nature is one and indistinguishable. As the Abhisamâyâlaṃkâra says:

> This Master manifested as the perfected Saṃbhogakâya Sage, having the thirty two marks of an excellent being and the eighty [minor] marks, in order to enjoy thoroughly the Mahâyâna.[13]

To those disciples who manifested worthy appearance, the Master of this teaching, the Sage, the Teacher of the extraordinary Doctrine of the Mahâyâna manifested his own form as Vajradhara Saṃbhogakâya Buddha.

From the Root Text: [repeat Verse I]

This is the explication of the meaning.

[Now the second verse:]

Being perfect in place, time, attendants, etc.

Folio 5

In this way, the Sage manifested as a Vajradhara Saṃbhogakâya Buddha in accordance with the capacity of pure disciples. His deeds and biography appeared thus:

- The types of deeds of a Vajradhara Saṃbhogakâya Buddha;
- The place that was the most perfect of places;
- In that place, the teacher was the most perfect of teachers;

[13] See Conze translation, p. 98, VII,3 The Enjoyment Body: "The body of the Sage which possesses the thirty two marks and the eighty minor characteristics is considered as his Enjoyment Body, because it enjoys the happiness of the [dharma of the] great vehicle."

- The doctrine of that teacher was the the most perfect of Doctrines.

- The teacher of the Doctrine had attendants that [comprised] the most perfect of retinues.

All of these: retinue, Doctrine, teacher, and place, occured simultaneously; [thus] the time that was [the most] perfect of times was accomplished. Thus, his deeds fulfilled the Five Perfect Circumstances.[14]

That place, which is not inferior to any other place, possesses perfect, excellent qualities, since it is above the five pure abodes[15] and the qualities of that place and

[14] Judith Hanson translates phun sum tshogs pa lnga as `the five certainties' to indicate that of these five situations, each has an invariable element; later, the Shangs-pa text goes on to speak of five non-certainties. This certainty/non-certainty dyad reflects one of the Sanskrit equivalents of pun sum tshogs pa: praṇihita = imposed, ascertained, fixed, etc. (Lokesh Chandra, Tibetan-Sanskrit Dictionaryp. 1535).

See also, The Fourteenth Dalai Lama, Opening the Eye of New Awareness, trans. Donald S. Lopez, Jr., and Jeffrey Hopkins. (London: Wisdom Publications, 1985), pp. 100-101.

The Five `Perfections' are discussed in Lessing and Wayman, p. 156, fn. 7 in accordance with the Thob yig gsal ba'i me long, Vol. II, 72a-4, ff. as perfection of body (including possession of the seven members of the saṃpuṭa and the Characteristics and Minor Marks); perfection of merit; of retinue; of place; of affiliation.

The Five Perfect Circumstances of a Saṃbhogakâya probably originate in the work of Asaṅga; we find five characteristics of a Saṃbhogakâya in the Mahâyâna-sûtrâlaṃkâra, IX, 60-66, pp. 86-88 in S. Lèvi's trans. The Asaṅgan tradition is succinctly presented in the Awakening of Faith attributed to Aśvaghosha (Hakeda trans., pp. 69-70).

[15] The ADK discusses the rûpadhâtus in terms of deities abiding in seventeen celestial realms, according to the type of dhyâna they enjoy (ADK, chapter 3, verses 71ff.) There are four dhyânas; the Akaniṣṭha is in the fourth dhyâna, where it is the highest of eight classes.
From the point of view of the `five pure abodes' (śuddhâvâsakâyika), it is the fifth and highest class (see Edgerton BHS Dict. p. 1). In the Mahâparinirvâṇasûtra,

the way it evolves (chags tshad= is formed) would be hard for anyone to measure, so excellent is that place [the Akaniṣṭha].

Thus said the teacher, Vajradhara Saṃbhogakâya Buddha, who abides there, possessing the Seven Factors and the Eight Masteries (sovereignties), being a perfect Teacher.[16]

41.1-18, pp. 34-36 Franklin Edgerton, ed., Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit Reader, (Motilal Banarsidass, Delhi, 1972), we have an account of the death of the Buddha in which is demonstrated his ascent in contemplative absorbtion from the first dhyâna to the cessation of ideation in the arûpyadhâtu, followed by a descent to the first dhyâna. This descent is followed smoothly by re-ascent to the fourth dhyâna, still within the rûpadhâtu, from which the Buddha enters Nirvâna, and not from the cessation of ideation in the arûpyadhâtu. Subsequent development identified the highest level of the fourth dhyâna with the Akaniṣṭha heaven (that in which none is the youngest; or simply, the highest, the greatest), and it was understood that at this level of his contemplative absorbtion, the Buddha attained the highest state.

16 LM, p. 204, n. 4, calls these the Eight Perfect Attributes, which belong exclusively to the realm of a Saṃbhogakâya Buddha:
1. Attribute of formal manifestation in infinite varieties.
2. Attribute of intentional communication with others.
3. Attribute of total awareness.
4. Attribute of the power to transform into any intended form.
5. Attribute of all-encompassing mind which embraces all universes.
6. Attribute of perceiving and partaking in the sensations of the body caused by spiritual enlightenment.
7. Attribute of bringing about the fulfillment of the wishes and aspirations of all sentient beings.
8. Attribute of the power to maintain any intended form for a great length of time.

These are not the 'Eight Masteries' of the Theravâda tradition (abhibhâyatana), for which see P. V. Mahâthera, Buddhist Meditation in Theory and Practice. (Kuala Lumpur: Buddhist Missionary Society, second edition, 1975), pp. 481f. These are also found in Wayman, Buddhist Insight, pp. 90f; in the ADK viii, pp. 211-213; and in the Mahâyâna-sûtrâlaṃkâra VII, 9 (p. 58).

In the Mahâyâna-sûtrâlaṃkâra, we find the Four Sovreignties (vasitâ), which may also provide a source: 1. sovreignty over the field, by which a Buddha field is

The profound, extraordinary Doctrine of the Vajrayâna that is taught by him is difficult to measure. [It consists of] practicing with the fruit [Buddhahood] as one's path; thus one practices the Doctrine [by which] one may manifest, in one body, in one lifetime, Buddhahood. This is the perfect Teaching!

An exquisite retinue of the pure ones, including Bodhisattva Heroes and Heroines, Vajragarbha[17] and others, manifests the path and stages.

In all three times, past, present, and future, the time is the perfect time in which is proclaimed continually and tirelessly the sound of the Doctrine of the profound Secret Incantation.

Therefore, in terms of the perfect place, teacher, retinue, and time, such was Vajradhara Saṃbhogakâya.

The essence of the Five Bodies [<u>kâyas</u>] is the Five Types of Knowledge. This means that the Bodies are:

Folio 6

The Dharmakâya (the body of Natural Phenomena);

The Saṃbhogakâya (the Body of Enjoyment);

purified; 2. of non-differentiation; 3. of complete knowledge of all particulars; 4. of action in the application of the <u>abhijñâs</u>. See Chpt. XI, 46, S. Lévi trans, with chart on p. 28.

17 cf. <u>Laṅkâvatâra Sûtra</u>, chapter 2, 100, p. 88 Suzuki edn/trans. "Vajragarbha, the Bodhisattva-Mahâsattva"; see also, HVT, Vajragarbha is Hevajra's interlocutor in chapters I.i, vii, x, II.ii, iii, iv. cf. <u>Daśabhûmika sûtra</u>, "le discours sur la 6e bhûmi" in S. Lévi, <u>Vijñaptimâtratâsiddhi</u>, Vol. I, p. 43, fn. 1. Paris (Librarie Ancienne Honoré Champion) 1932. And George Elder: "The Sampuṭa Tantra", Chapter 1, pp. 161ff.

The Nirmāṇakāya (the Emanation Body);

The Svabhāvakāya (the Self-arisen Body);

and the Mahāsukhakāya (the Body of Great Pleasure)[18]

[18] See HVT, introduction p. 37-38, with the addition of a fourth kāya, known by three possible names: Self-existent Body (svabhāvikakāya), the 'Innate Body' (sahajakāya), or the 'Body of Great Bliss' (mahāsukhakāya). This would go with the fourfold understanding of the cakras inherited from the Mahāsiddhas, but might be thought deficient in relation to the Five Buddha families. (see Lessing and Wayman, p. 296).

Buddha-kāya theory is the theme of a song of Marpa (see Life of Marpa, p. 59), the Dharmakāya is presented as the 'sky' emanating clouds of Buddha-emanations: "The sky of dharmakāya is thick with rain clouds of wisdom. The continuous rain of emanations spreads over all beings...The dharmakāya like the sky is the Buddha, great Vajradhara. The thick rain clouds of wisdom are the two bodhisattvas."

Deshung Rinpoche, in notes given to the Hansons, explained that each of the three 'kāyas' acts as a sort of support (Tibetan: rten) for Buddha activity of various kinds; Buddha activities and qualities are considered to be impermanent, changing, and without essence, but they do have a basis. The Dharmakāya is the basis for the Saṃbhogakāya, and the Saṃbhogakāya is the basis for the Nirmāṇakāya. The Nirmāṇakāya is the basis for the 'Twelve Deeds' of the Buddha, and so forth.

sGampopa gives extensive descriptions of the Saṃbhogakāya in his Jewel Ornament of Liberation. He says that "as soon as we live on a high spiritual level, we can meet with the Saṃbhogakāya as a spiritual friend (kalyanamitra),"(p. 33) and that of the two 'form kāyas' (nirmāṇa and saṃbhoga), "Saṃbhogakāya is for those who require teaching, but are already purified (of the grossest ignorance)" (p. 264). The Saṃbhogakāya operates on the level of verbal communication and has eight characteristics, which sGampopa derives from the Mahāyānasūtrālaṃkāra IX, 61): 1. surroundings in which is is enjoyed are the Bodhisattvas living on the bhūmis; 2. fields where it is enjoyed are the pure Buddha realms; 3. the body by whom it is enjoyed is Vairocana and the other Buddhas [the Five Buddhas as symbols of the various aspects of transcending awareness: Vairocana, Ratnasaṃbhava, Amitābha, Amoghasiddhi, and Akṣobya]; 4. The marks accompanying the enjoyment are the 32 major and 80 minor characteristics of a Buddha (see MPP-Ś, pp. 271ff and Abhisamayālaṃkāra, VIII,12); 5. The doctrine through which it is enjoyed is the Mahāyāna teaching exclusively; 6. The activity resulting from its enjoyment is the instruction by the sons of the Victorious One; 7. Its spontaneity is its own effortlessness. It is as if the king of jewels (the wish-

This is how the Buddha abides in his own form of the Five Bodies.

The Mind consists of:

The Dharmadhâtu-jñâna (Knowledge of the Sphere of Phenomena)

Ādarśa-jñâna (Mirror-like Knowledge)

Samatâ-jñâna (Knowledge of Sameness)

Pratyavekṣaṇâ-jñâna (Knowledge of Distinctions)

Kṛtyânuṣṭhâna-jñâna (Knowledge about Accomplishing what is to be Done).

fulfilling gem) were present; 8. without a nature of its own means that though it appears in different forms it does not possess different qualities like colors, which can only be known discursively." (p. 265, Guenther translation).

Other presentations of kâya theory may be found in the MPP-Ś pp. 1906ff; in Asaṅga's Mahâyânasaṃgraha, (Dharma-k. pp. 268-314; Saṃbhoga-k.: pp. 317-323; Nirmâṇa-k.: pp. 340-343; Svabhâvika-k.: pp. 329, 331-338; Chapter X presents the tri-kâya as the fruit of gnosis: phala-jñâna, which we have presented above as being of five kinds.); Also, the Mahâyânasûtrâlaṃkâra IX, pp. 60ff. A summary is in Wayman, Hist. Relig. pp. 393-394.

Marpa's song goes on to speak of the svabhâvika-k. as the other three 'free from origin', and of the mahâsukha-k. as all four, 'beyond conditions' (Life of Marpa, p. 60). Further theoretical comment may be found in Lessing and Wayman, pp. 49-53, where svabhâva-k. is identified with tathâgatagarbha in certain sûtras, a view rejected by the dGe lugs pa school, especially in their debate with the Jo nang pa branch of the bKa' brgyud pa. Five-fold models for Buddha-kâya theory may be said to be based on the idea that rGyal thang pa expresses in the next passage to the effect that each of the Five Kinds of Knowledge corresponds to a Buddha Family which also corresponds to a Buddha-kâya: this set of three fives, should be thought of as the fruition of the reversal of the five skandhas with their corresponding defilements, each of which represents a potentiality which, by means of tantric practice, can produce complete Buddhahood. See, for example, A. Wayman, The Yoga of the Guhyasamâjatantra, charts pp. 254, 247, 231 (skandhas and Tathâgatas), 132.

Thus, the mind exists as the basis of the Five Types of Knowledge.[19] It is written in the Mañjuśrī-nāma-saṃgīti:

> A master truly possessing the five Buddha-Bodies; all pervading Lord, master of the Five Types of Knowledge; Master of the Five Buddhas, who possesses the Crest-Jewel.[20]

Now this is the meaning of his possessing the Seven Factors[21]:

[19] See HVT (pañcajñāna) Wisdom as Fivefold: p. 29, 58fn, 59 fn., 129, śloka I.viii,6-7, II. iv. 46. Wayman (in Lessing and Wayman, section on the Yoga Tantra, p. 222, fn. 17 and p. 232, fn. 28) says that there are two traditions on pañcajñāna: 1. the Vairocana tantra gives samatā as the first (cf. Avataṃsakasūtra); 2. Anuttara tantra for which the dharmadhātu is the basis and ādarśa-jñāna is first.

[20] See A. Wayman, trans. and ed.: Chanting the Names of Mañjuśrī. Boston, Shambhala, 1985, p. 79, Chapter VI, v. 18: "Buddha with five-body nature; pervading lord with five-wisdom nature; crowned with five Buddhas; bearing unhindered the five eyes." Wayman also gives a chart of the five Buddhas, five families, five bodies, five wisdoms, and five eyes. Comparison of the texts in Skt. and Tib.:
From our text: /sangs rgyas sku lnga'i bdag nyid can// khyab bdag ye shes lnga yi bdag/ sangs rgyas mnga' bdag cod pan can//
Wayman's edition: /sangs rgyas sku lnga'i bdag nyid can/khyab bdag ye shes lnga yi bdag/sangs rgyas lnga bdag cod pan can/ {spyan lnga chags pa med pa 'chang//}
Wayman's edition of the Sanskrit: pañcakāyātmanko buddho pañcajñānātmako vibhuḥ/pañcabuddhātmamakutaḥ pañcacakṣur asaṅgadhṛk//

[21] Judith Hanson calls these "Seven Aspects of Supreme Union" in her work on a Shangs-pa rnam thar of rDo rje 'Chang: "[Buddha] possesses the `seven aspects`[of supreme union], the kha-sbyor-bdun: 1. perfect enjoyment(saṃbhoga); 2. union (kha sbyor); 3. great bliss; 4. no self-nature; 5. great compassion which completely fills [space]; 6. unendingness; 7. unimpededness."

Note that our text refers to these as the yan lag bdun, for which Lokesh Chandra, p 2136, gives only saptāṅga. For kha sbyor, he gives daśanocchiṣṭa (=a kiss, a sigh) or saṃbhukta (=enjoyed; eaten), for which the former is more likely the accurate term, suggesting the bliss of union and Saṃbhoga-kāya, i.e. body-in-a-state-of-enjoyment. However,

1. One who possesses such a Buddha-body and who possesses knowledge (ye shes) is the [first] factor, thoroughly possessing the primary [32] and secondary [80] marks.

2. [the second] factor is the indivisable embrace [of wisdom and compassion][called yuganaddha: the `pair-united'].

the notion of a `kiss' is found in the songs of the Seventh Dalai Lama, for which see Glenn Mullin, trans. Songs of Spiritual Change, p. 197 ("The Seven Kisses: Seven qualities of the stage of Vajradhara, the state of Buddhahood attained through tantric practice", p. 121, and p. 131.

In BA, p. 445 we find a transmission of this teaching in the account of Mar-ston Tshul Khrims: "From Ras pa dBang nge he obtained numerous precepts of Ras chung pa, including the yan lag bdun ldan and others." BA also mentions this yan lag bdun ldan (=Saptâṅga, Tg. rGyud, No. 1888) on p. 763 in a discussion of the Kâla-cakra. This yan lag bdun should not be confused with the Seven Limbs of Enlightenment (Mahâyânasûtrâlaṃkâra XI,12; MPP-Ś, pp. 1200ff, vol. III, etc.), nor with the Seven Limbs of Religious Service.

In Lessing and Wayman, the Five Perfections of a complete Buddha have as `perfection of Body' possession of the seven members of the saṃpuṭa, decorated with the Characteristics and Minor Marks (pp. 156-157, fn. 7). "The seven members of the saṃpuṭa are as stated by the âcârya Vâgîśvarakîrti [presumably in his Saptâṅga, Toh. 1888, Derge Tanjur Rgyud]: 1. Saṃbhoga-k.; 2. saṃpuṭa; 3. Great Beatitude (mahâsukha); 4. no intrinsic nature (niḥsvabhâva); 5. state of being filled with compassion; 6. non-interruption; 7. no cessation." (pp. 266-268) That this completes the process of initiations and is the fruition of the saṃpannakrama is suggested on p. 327.

A pre-tantric basis for this set of sevens might be found in the Mahâyâna-sûtrâlaṃkâra, XIX, #59-60 (pp. 280-1) in the two verses on the grandeur of the Great Vehicle, which give seven `grandeurs': 1. an immeasurable extent of ideals and sûtras; 2. initiatives for self and others; 3. cognition of the voidness of self and of phenomena; 4. enormous perserverance and energy; 5. application of skillful means, remaining in transmigration in the absence of defilments; 6. great success in attaining the powers, assurances, and ideas of the Buddhas; 7. repeated exhibition of the deeds of Buddhas, including the attainment of Enlightenment and the Great Decease.

3. Then there is the factor of the Four Blisses [comprising] the Ultimate Great Bliss (mahâsukha).

4. Then there is the factor entailing the conclusion that the self is intrinsically unreal =[niḥsvabhâva; rang bzhin bden med].[22]

5. Then there is the factor of a fully developed Bodhicitta [in relation to] the two truths (saṃvṛtti-satya and paramârtha-satya).

6. Then there is the factor of absolutely not cutting off the continuity of compassion from the beginning [from the moment of its arising].

7. And there is the factor of not intending to rest (stop), nor to abide in Nirvâṇa [but to aid suffering beings in Saṃsâra].

[22]For a presentation of the classic Prajñâpâramitâ doctrine of niḥsvabhâva, from the Large Sûtra on Perfect Wisdom, trans. and ed.by E. Conze (U. Cal., 1984), Chapter 79, pp. 628-631: "The Exposition of the Non-existence of Own-being". This point of view is criticized in the Sandhinirmocana-sûtra; for comments on this, see J. Takasaki, A Study on the Ratnagotravibhâga (Roma:IsMEO, 1966), pp. 57-58. And: Sandhinirmocana, ed. and trans. by E. Lamotte (1935), chapter VII, 30-31. Takasaki helpfully observes (p. 59) that the Ratnagotravibhâga seems to have its own theory, independent of the Prajñâpâramitâ and the Cittamâtra traditions. "...the Ratna. never uses the expression of cittamâtra. ... In other words, the emphasis lies on the identification of gotra or garbha with the dharmakâya and any difference of the garbha or the sattvadhâtu from the dharmakâya is rather neglected." This same perspective in our bKa' brgyud pa texts can found in such passages as "The essential nature of the tri-kâya consists of the pure voidness (dharmadhâtu) detached from all discrimination." From chapter 8 of the Guhyasamâjatantra: `Dharmas which are unborn possess a distinctive nature; It has been described as awareness arising through perfect non-discrimination.' In the Shangs pa rnam thar of Vajradhara, the Dharmakâya is the support (rten) for all dharmas in Saṃsâra and Nirvâṇa."

Through the state of possessing these seven factors, having joined the Consort, in self-arisen Union, enjoying Great Bliss from the beginning in the state of culmination. There is no other Bliss!

Thus, [it is the] Saṃbhogakâya [which] possesses the Seven Factors.

From the tantra De Kho na Ñid yong su bstan pa'i (Tattva-nirdeśa tantra):[23]

"Fully possessing the major and minor marks; being united with Great Bliss; intrinsically without essence; full of bodhicitta; primordially not cutting off compassion; not intending to go beyond into Nirvâṇa; - a Saṃbhogakâya is one possessing the Seven Factors."

Perfect enjoyment and Great Bliss, indivisible Union, intrinsically without essence, full of compassion, not ceasing from continuity, this indeed is a Buddha possessing the Seven Factors. It is thus accepted [as an argument] that [Vajradhara Buddha] wishes to enjoy [a special kind of delight in the company of] fully cultivated intelligent beings.[24]

[23] We have not been able to locate this text.

[24] Translation suggested in consultation with Judith Hanson. See Snellgrove, Four Lamas of Dolpo, glossary, p. 340: tshad suggests 'wanting'. The Tib. here is: bdag 'dod tshad mas yongs sgoms blo ldan rnams dang 'dod. Thus: bdag 'dod tshad mas might indicate a desire to enjoy oneself... Another suggestion is that bdag 'dod refers to the non-dependent reality of the Tathâgatagarbha.

Acting according to this system, using the Mahâyâna doctrine, is called the Factor of Enjoyment.[25]

Folio 7

Therefore, the Factor of Union (kha-sbyor) is the state of being united with flawlessness; continuity of mind full of Great Bliss is therefore called the Factor of Great Bliss; Compassion that is immeasurable is therefore the Factor of Perfect Compassion; Possessing undivided continuity of action (mdzad pa mnga' bas na rgyun mi 'chad pa'i yan lag) is therefore the Factor of undivided continuity; ceaselessly refraining from entering Nirvâṇa for the sake of beings is therefore the Factor of Ceaselessness.[26]

Thus, a Buddha possessing the Seven Factors is accepted as a Sambhogakâya by Srî Vâgîśvarakîrti's system[27]; also, it is established by valid knowledge (pramâṇa-buddhi); thus,

[25] Note that we are dealing with a systematization of tantric doctrine and practice; see below: the system of Śrî Vâgîśvarakîrti (=ngag gi dbang phyug grags pa; see BA, p. 206).

[26] See above, Chapter 2.

[27] This tantric master, either identical with Pham thing pa (BA, p. 227) or his younger brother (p. 384), in any case was connected with Nepal (BA, p. 227) and was the Gate-Keeper Paṇḍita at the Southern Gate of Vikramaśîla (BA, p. 206). He was a Guhyasamâja expert (BA, p. 384), taught the Father-tantras (p. 869) and yogic breathing (ibid.). See Cordier, Catalogue, pp. 49, 62, 63 for works translated in the Tibetan canon with the assistance of Vâgîśvaragupta. The relevant work is his Saptâṅga. Pham thing pa is associated with the Vajrayoginî lineage and we note that her image is on folio 2 of this ms., being an important bKa' brgyud pa yidam.

Perfected Buddhas, ancient sages (blo gros dang ldan) and Saints (mkhas grub) have accepted this.

Such a Buddha, possessing the Seven Factors, joined with the self-arisen Consort, enjoying Great Bliss, is therefore called Saṃbhogakâya: perfect enjoyment Body.

He is called `vajra' (rdo rje) since the adamantine reality is held in his mind. In brief, according to our root text: "He possesses the Seven Factors, being united to the self-arisen Consort; Praise be to Vajradhara, the Perfect Saṃbhogakâya.

Now, the Victor Vajradhara is the possessor of the Eight Masteries. This is what it means:

The Sage, Vajradhara Saṃbhogakâya Buddha, possessor of the Body of Seven Factors (saptâṅga; yan lag bdun) and the Eight Masteries: Mastery of Body, of Speech, of Mind, of Miracles, of Ubiquity , of Place, of Wishing, and of Obtaining the Desirable. He is the one who is a possessor of these Eight Masteries.[28]

1. The First Mastery [of Body]: He is powerful in this body to master all phenomena, including the forms of Saṃsâra and Nirvâṇa. He is rich with the wealth of all desirable qualities combined in this body. Therefore, this is called the perfect Mastery of the Body.

2. The Mastery of Speech: He has mastered the power acquired through speech for combining all phenomena

[28] See above, note 11. The Eight Perfect Attributes in LM, p. 204, n. 4.

[dharmaḥ] with Saṃsâra and Nirvâṇa. (Tib.: 'khor 'das dbang gis bsdus pa'i chos thams cad la gsung des dbang byed pas/)[29] [Or: All the phenomena of cyclic existence are gathered together so as to make them pure, by means of his mastery of speech.]

Folio 8

By his all-inclusive speech, he is rich with the wealth of all desirable qualities. Therefore, this is his Mastery of Speech.

3. The Mastery of Mind: Similarly, he has mastery because he is able to combine all the phenomena of Saṃsâra and Nirvâṇa in his mind. He is thus rich with the wealth of all desirable qualities collected in his mind. This is his Mastery of the Mind.

4. [Now] his Mastery of Miracles: By possessing the Masteries of Body, Speech, and Mind, he is rich with the

[29] This Mastery is of special importance for Milarepa, who was a master of spontaneous tantric songs. See John Ardussi: "Brewing and Drinking the Beer of Enlightenment in Tibetan Buddhism: The Dohâ Tradition in Tibet." JAOS 1977, p. 116: "An ability that, by implication, possessed the nature of a magical attainment, resulting from their high level of yogic realization and from the great merit they had accumulated during their previous lives. Having gained control over their 'subtle physiology,' the cakras or mystical centers symbolically located along the axis of their bodies, and the winds or forces which move along the mystical 'veins', they are able to concentrate this force in the center located at their neck, usually identified with the saṃbhoga-kâya or 'Enjoyment Body' of the Buddha. The process is a meditative one, and the practitioner at this level is regarded as partaking of Buddhahood and becomes able to produce songs of the Absolute Truth spontaneously." The present translation represents an exposition of this process of 'partaking of Buddhahood' deriving from the systematic thought of the bKa' brgyud pa.

wealth of the qualities of immeasurable miracles by his power to control (dbang kha sgyur bas na dbang) the immeasurable wonders of the Body, Speech, and Mind. This is his Mastery of Miracles.

5. His Mastery of Ubiquity[30] He has mastered the power that can fulfill the aims of all beings in Saṃsâra and Nirvâṇa. He is one who is not lacking any qualities (phongs pa med par) of Saṃsâra and Nirvâṇa. He is rich with the wealth of all requisites. Therefore, this is his Mastery of Ubiquity.[31]

6. Now, his Mastery of Place[32]: The Akaniṣṭha means the noble place, a place greater than all others, overcoming all others with its excellence and power, a place most excellent among places. It is rich with whatever qualities are

[30] Could this mean: He benefits beings in every state of existence? kun 'gro'i = all destinies ? Lhalungpa has, for this fifth among the Eight Perfect Attributes: "an All-encompassing mind which embraces all universes." op. cit., p. 204. It is also possible that kun gro'i means all-pervading. See also on gati the excellent elucidation of M. Kedem: pp. 53-57 in P. Denwood and A. Piatigorsky, eds. Buddhist Studies Ancient and Modern. London: Curzon, 1983. See especially his discussion of refuges and `resorts;' of limit and non-limit; of the `final gati'(p. 56), and the father-mother `gati' related to Vajradhara, (p. 57).

[31] Probably `all-pervading.' Ubiquitous activity is given by Deshung Rinpoche as the topic of `secret' rnam thars: "A Buddha functions on three levels: the outer (phyi) level, e.g. Śâkyamuni's performance of the prescribed twelve deeds; the inner (nang) level: e.g. Vajradhara or Heruka's spiritual accomplishments through the bhûmis; the secret (gsang-ba) level: his influence as a perfect Buddha as seen by other Buddhas throughout the universe. (notes taken by Hansons, August, 1978).

[32] LM, p. 208: "Attribute of perceiving and partaking in the sensations of the body caused by spiritual enlightenment."

possessed by all other [places]. Therefore this is his Mastery over Place[s].[33]

7. His Mastery of Wishing: The Mother of all the Buddhas of the Three Times; rDo rJe sñe ma (Diamond Ear of Corn or Spike of the Wheat; Skt.: Vajra-vallarî or Mañjarî); Nairâtmyâ; Vajravârâhî; Vajra Ḍâkinî; Ratna Ḍâkinî; Padma Ḍâkinî; Karma Ḍâkinî; Buddha Ḍâkinî, etc.[34] The Secret Consort is included in the Mudrâ-Family . Instantly, the inseparable pair enter Bliss and Voidness from the state of Mahâmudrâ, [having] power to enter the balanced equipoise of desire; therefore, he is rich with the vast wealth of immeasurable wisdom and knowledge. This is his Mastery of Wishing.

[33] LM, p. 208, n. 3: mNgon dga' and 'Og min are names for the Pure Land of Buddha. mNgon dga': Perfect Joy, the Buddha realm of Akṣobhya (the Unshakable One). "When an initiate visualizes the Five Buddha Realms in his meditation, mNgon dga' is thought of as situated in the east. The term 'Og min means literally 'not being under,' hence the highest Buddha realm of Saṃbhogakâya. Sometimes 'Og min as an adjective qualifies the noun mNgon-dga' so as to present a descriptive term, 'Og min mNgon dga' - the Highest Joyful Realm." Going back to the context, p. 10, we find that this is in the setting of the opening of the rnam thar in which Ras chung pa receives a celestial vision that inspires him to request and record the biography of Milarepa(see LM p. 10). A celestial disciple of the Buddha, hearing that the life of Milarepa is even more marvellous than those of the lineage predecessors, conjectures that such an advanced Bodhisattva must now dwell in mNgon dga' or 'Og min. Indeed, this passage tells us a great deal about the importance of a rnam thar in Tibetan Buddhism.

[34] Some of these correspond to the yoginîs of the maṇḍala of Hevajra. See Snellgrove: HVT, VOl I, p. 128 and p. 74. The Inner Circle includes: Vajrâ; Gaurî; Vâriyoginî; Vajraḍâkinî; Nairâtmyâ; and the Outer Circle includes: Gaurî II; Caurî; Vetalî; Ghasmarî; Pukkasî; Savarî; Caṇḍâlî; Ḍombinî. See HVT I.viii,10.

8. The Mastery of Obtaining the Desirable: He is powerful with mastery over all qualities, possessing both supreme and ordinary siddhis (accomplishments). He is rich with riches to the extent of gaining the Accomplishments (siddhi) sought after, whether superior or ordinary. This is his Mastery of Obtaining the Desirable.[35]

Folio 9

Regarding this, it is said in the Târâ-abhyudaya tantra of the anuttara yoga tantra, and in Ravigupta's Viśudda-cûḍâ-maṇidhara:

"Rich in the Masteries of Body, Speech, and Mind, Miracles, Ubiquity, Place, etc., Mastery is not difficult for him!"

In brief, the Buddha possesses the Eight Masteries "for the benefit of disciples who are worthy vessels, the extraordinary, [by the] secret teachings of the Vajrayâna, the Buddha perfectly bestows Buddhahood in one body, in one lifetime. Praise be to Vajradhara Saṃbhogakâya, who has proclaimed the Doctrine of incomparable (anuttara) meaning."

From the root text: "O Victor, Vajradhara, possessing the Eight Masteries; the extraordinary Vajrayâna teachings are those which, in one lifetime, in one body, bestow Buddhahood." [Verse 3]

This is the explication.

[35] I.e., he transforms Saṃsâric desires into siddhis. But Lhalungpa gives "Attribute of the power to maintain any intended form for a great length of time." He does not give his source and this list does not appear in the text translated by the Hansons.

Now, the one holding the *vajra* is that one who is on the supreme among the paths and stages: the thirteenth. This means that Vajradhara Saṃbhogakâya Buddha is the Buddha of the Seven Factors and he has accomplished completely the course of the superior paths and stages, including:

The First Stage: Utterly Blissful

The Second Stage: Without Defilement

The Third Stage: Light-Creating

The Fourth Stage: Light Diffusing

The Fifth Stage: Difficult to Conquer

The Sixth Stage: Face-to-face (Tib.: *mngon du gyur pa*; Skt. *abhimukhî*)

The Seventh Stage: Far-Gone

The Eighth Stage: Unshakable

The Ninth Stage: Good in Mind

The Tenth Stage: Cloud of the Doctrine[36]

The Eleventh Stage: Fully Illumined (also called the Incomparable Ray of Light; Tib.: *dpe med* = incomparable, boundless).

The Twelfth Stage: Boundless, also called Great Wisdom

The Thirteenth Stage: Called the Stage of the Holder of the Powerbolt (*vajra*).[37]

36 See *Mahâyânasaṃgraha* V, pp. 196ff, Lamotte trans., for the ten *bhûmis* as cause and fruit. The Tibetan of our text is in the transcription, folio 9, lines 5-6. Tabulation of the Ten Stages in various texts is given by Har Dayal, pp. 273ff.

37 What is the source for the *bhûmis* higher than 10? Wayman observes, pg. 87, n. 8, *The Buddhist Tantras*, that the stage of Buddha is the eleventh stage. Evidently, this eleventh stage has been divided into three. For some of the

This, in brief, is the explanation of the Stages [of a Bodhisattva and of a Buddha].

Now, the path for all: there is the mundane path and the supramundane path, for there are two paths. The first [path] consists of the path of accumulation joined to the path of preparation. Then, [there is] the supramundane path which consists of the path of seeing, the path of

theoretical issues that may have contributed to this, see S. B. Dasgupta, An Introduction to Tantric Buddhism, pp. 184-186, et seq. "Nirvâṇa as Mahâsukha in the Buddhist Tantras." In the Jewel Ornament of Liberation, p. 113, after a pairing of the Ten Bodhisattva Stages with Ten Perfections, sGam po pa goes on to discuss three additional developments on a very high level of the evolution of an enlightened attitude (bodhicitta): "When the formation of an enlightened attitude is accompanied by the `grove of the Dharma' it is like an echo to which those who are to be educated and want liberation delight to listen; when by a path which may be followed in one direction only it is like the current of a river, always helpful to sentient beings; and when by the Dharmakâya it is like a cloud on which the good of sentient beings depends, because it illustrates the stages of the Buddha's life from his stay in the Tuṣita heaven onwards. These three types belong to the Buddha level of spirituality."(pp. 113-114). But sGampopa also elucidates thirteen spiritual levels attained through the five paths (p. 239): "the two levels of the beginner and of devoted interest and behaviour, the ten belonging to the Bodhisattvas and that of a Buddha." He identifies the Buddha level with the stage of the Path of Fulfilment (p. 251). sGampopa's chapter 20, `Perfect Buddhahood' is a possible source for bKa' brgyud thinking on the three Buddha-bodies. But how did the idea of `stages' higher than ten or eleven evolve? The fact that BA (p. 361) says that the `fourteenth stage' is that of a jñâna-kâya suggests that it is the tantric development of kâya theory that led to the creation of a system of higher stages descriptive of complete Buddhahood. In Lessing and Wayman, (p. 296) we find a discussion of the `fruitional bodies' which include Dharma, Saṃbhoga, Nirmâṇa, and Mahâsukha-kâyas; the "Bodies ...constitute achievements of the Steps of Completion" (saṃpannakrama; rdzogs rim). Further complexity is discussed in fn. 2, pp 312-313, indicating a variety of systems for accomodating the anuttarayogatantra practices to the maturation of complete Buddhahood.

meditation, and the path of no-more-to-be-learned. In sum, there are five paths of the Secret-Incantation Vajrayâna.[38]

Vajradhara, the Buddha of the Sixth Family, has realized as such [i.e., as the Five Paths] the perfect

[38] "These represent the stages of development of any practitioner of Buddhism who progresses from one to another gradually. They are the paths of accumulation, application, insight, meditation, and mastery." (p. 151, Vimalakîrti, Thurman trans.) A chart of the paths in Hînayâna and Mahâyâna is given on p. 178, Tantra in Tibet by Tsong Khapa. The paths are also discussed in the tradition of Mâdhyamika in MPP-Ś, pp. 1736ff.

In Lessing and Wayman, we find a discussion of the five paths. There are two basic paths: pâramitâ and mantra. The pâramitâ as given by mKhas grub rje seems closer to what our text refers to as `the Secret Mantra Vajrayâna': 1. Of Equipment (saṃbhâra-mârga); 2. of Training (prayoga-m.); 3. of Vision (darśana-m.); 4. of Intense Contemplation (bhâvanâ-m.); 5. Beyond Training (aśaikṣa-m.). pp. 16, 19, 21, 42, 45. Mantra has Common (sâdhâraṇa-m.) p. 321, and Uncommon (asâdhâraṇa-m.), p. 271. Another way of looking at the mantra-path is from the point of view of the two `degrees' in tantric practice, i.e. of Production and of Completion. See p. 267 for the result of the `tantra of effect' which is given as the aśaikṣa-yuganaddha. There is also a division of the mantra-path from the point of view of Action p. 230; Bodhisattva p. 70; of Entrance, p. 151; of Equipment, p. 16, 21; of Initiation, p. 271; of Liberation, p. 184, 331, which is path leading to realization, p. 45; of Maturation (vipâka-m.), p. 331; of Passion, p. 169; of Purification, p. 231. In the Jewel Ornament of Liberation by sGam po pa, we find the paths discussed as follows (pp. 112-113): The Preparatory Path (tshogs lam, Skt. saṃbhâra-mârga), which corresponds to `the formation of an enlightened attitude ... accompanied by an earnest desire,...general intention,...and ..strong inclination...three varieties on the novice's level. ...When the formation of an enlightened attitude is accompanied by an earnest application, it is like fire, consuming the veils which hide the three kinds of omniscience. This is the Path of Application (sbyor lam, Skt. prayogamârga." This is followed by a pairing of the ten Bodhisattva Stages with a system of Ten Perfections (going beyond the usual six with: beneficial expediency, aspiration, strength, and transcending awareness born from wisdom). "They have their operational field in the Path of Insight (mthong lam, Skt. darśana mârga) and the Path of Concentrated Attention (sgom lam, Skt. bhâvanâmârga)."

fulfillment of the culmination of all virtues of the Paths and Stages of the Secret-Mantra Vajrayâna.

Folio 10

He is the master of all the families of the Buddhas: the Body, Speech, and Mind, virtues, and activities. And vajra means inseparable Voidness and Wisdom/Skillful [salvific] Means. Therefore, vajra means either holding or realizing the adamantine reality [dharmatâ] in the mental continuum. This is called vajra. This means: for all disciples who are suitable receptacles for the Secret Mantra Vajrayâna [there are] three entry-ways: faith, devotion, and praise. This is the meaning of praise (bstod). Again, from the Root Text: "On the most excellent of the Paths and Stages, the Thirteenth, is the Holder of the Vajra, so as to display perfectly one who has reached the full culmination: Vajradhara, the Sixth Buddha; Praise be to Vajradhara, Lord of the Buddha Families!" [Verse 4]

In brief, Vajradhara Saṃbhogakâya is the Lord of all the Buddha Families, master of all that is glorious; possessing in himself the Seven Factors and endowed with the Eight Masteries; this is Vajradhara Buddha, so it is said. This is the explication.

Now this is the second meaning of Vajradhara Buddha: The inner (esoteric) explanation is as follows: Vajradhara Buddha is all those who hold in their mental continua the realization of Dharmakâya as Voidness, being the highest truth of nature (dharmatâ). Thus it is stated in the Vajra-

śekhara tantra[39]: "The Buddha was asked, `You spoke of Vajradhara. What does that mean?' [he replied]: `Whatever is firm in bodhicitta and in the wisdom of all the Buddhas, that is the Victor, Vajradhara, the Lord of all the Tathâgatas' [i.e., the basis of bodhicitta is the wisdom of the Buddhas]." This means that whatever (gang yin) altruistic attitude (bodhicitta) exists is the wisdom of the Buddhas. Vajradhara Buddha is what the enlightened attitude is. This is what the Buddha's wisdom is in the Vajra-śekhara-tantra; knowing reality is wisdom, and it is the realization of the Dharmakâya as well. He has completely abandoned the extremes of eternalism and nihilism. [Such] wisdom is immortal in itself. So does that mean that a yogin who meditates also realizes the meaning of the wisdom of Dharmakâya? If one were to contemplate in that way, would he become like Vajradhara? Of course, we accept this for someone who has the wisdom of Vajradhara! As the same tantra states: "All yogis who realize the meaning of wisdom to be Vajradhara are thereby [made to be] the unexcelled Vajradhara. So great is the number of Vajradharas." [40]

39 The Vajra-śikara-mahâ-guhyayoga tantra [gsang ba rnal 'byor chen po'i rgyud rdo rje rtse mo; Kg. rgyud-'bum #480]; referred to in the BA, pp. 227, 354, 355, 534. ITB, p. 460, gives a discussion of this work and the alternative spelling Vajraśekhara. See his fn. 142, p. 460 (K. Eastman, "The Eighteen Tantras of the Vajraśekhara/Mâyâjâla," in Trans. International Conference of Orientalists in Japan, no. 26, pp. 95-6.) This tantra is said to be the yoga tantra explanatory tantra for the Tattvasaṃgraha.

40 This section is the very heart of the introduction, for it gives the theoretical basis for what a `Saint' is: the Saint is identified with Vajradhara through his realization of the primordial wisdom of Dharmakâya. The number of

Folio 11

In that case, is the yogin thus Vajradhara? In the [aspect of] Form, etc., of the Five Grasping Aggregates (upadhâna-skandha), he is shown to be an ordinary person (even with a body showing signs of growing old), but it is not [really] appropriate to [think of him as such], as the Vajra-pañjara says: "Therefore great is Vajradhara! Holding to a foolish form, having the intent to benefit beings, he remains in the ordinary form" so it is said. Not only that, but all sentient beings possess the essence of Buddhahood, though it is not recognized, having been hidden by the defilement of adventitious ignorance. Thus one is, without realizing it (ma rtogs), from the beginning, a Buddha wandering in Saṃsâra. As the Hevajra Tantra says: "There is not even one sentient being in existence who is not a Buddha. It is certain that in the family of the Buddha [the Blessed One][there are those] possessing the form of ordinary living beings possessing contemplative tranquility [or: who are yogins], neither proud nor contemptible."[41] And in the same tantra: "Sentient beings

Vajradharas is as numerous as the number of truly realized yogins. The cycle of biographies to follow will illustrate the diversity of the displays of this truth in the actual lives of the lineage masters.

[41] Another translation from Snellgrove, HVT II xi, 8: "It is certain that in the family of the Blessed One, there are beings who make use of the conventional form, but who are [really] yogis neither cultivating pride nor meriting contempt."

are Buddhas, even though covered willy-nilly by defilement; such a one, if cleaned up, quickly becomes a Buddha." [42]

In this case, what sort of Buddhas are sentient beings? The Tattva-nirdeśa Tantra states: "Because there are pure and impure disciples, Buddha appeared as Saṃbhogakâya and Nirmâṇakâya; they are one reality; distinctions arise because minds are diverse. In meaning, all the Buddhas are one." [Evidently] Buddha manifests as Saṃbhogakâya and Nirmâṇakâya in accordance with the capacity of pure and impure disciples. Actually, the meaning of all Buddhas is one reality. In brief, all phenomena whatever (skyed tshad) of Saṃsâra and Nirvâṇa are pervaded by Voidness and are Vajradhara Buddha alone. This is from the viewpoint of the Vajra-śekhara Tantra: "What is held [when one holds] the vajra? The interior is essentially solidity without hollowness, not burnable (sreg med), not cuttable, not to be destroyed, not to be crushed; thus, he proclaims Voidness to be Adamantine [vajra]". Also, Vajrapâṇi (phyag na rdo

[42] cf. Snellgrove, from HVT II iv 69: "The Lord said: All beings are Buddhas, but this is obscured by accidental defilement. When this is removed, they are Buddhas at once, of this there is no doubt." See also Lessing and Wayman, p. 267, in discussing `tantra of ground': "Nâropa maintains that this is the `jewel-like person,' who is chief among the candidates for the high goal of the Anuttara [tantra]. Śântipâ and Abhayâkara maintain that it is the True Nature of Mind (citta-dharmatâ) intrinsically pure but possessed of adventitious defilements." Fn. 15: "This explanation involves a sense of the word tantra virtually equivalent to the old Buddhist terms saṃtâna, `stream of consciousness.'" See also rGyal Thang pa's use of rgyud in his version of Milarepa's songs, folio 243.7-244.1; 238.1-4.

rje)[43] is the gatherer of all the doctrines of the Secret Mantra. The Perfections (pâramitâ) [i.e. the Prajñâpâramitâ sûtras] and the doctrine of the Scriptures [sûtra] were gathered by Ānanda. Actually, these two are one in nature (ngo bo),

Folio 12

[but only] appear to be separate according to the capacity of disciples, though not fully recognized by them.
The scripture entitled the Śîtavanika[44] sûtra states: "To the learned monk (bahuśrota), to one who grasps the Secret Mantra, and to Ananda I bow and [offer] praise ."

These three [types] are, in the absolute sense, one: The Buddha, a Teacher demonstrating the Doctrine, and the Doctrine which is being demonstrated, and the gathering before which the Doctrine is displayed. From the Hevajra Tantra: "I am the teacher, and I am the doctrine, I am the disciple endowed with good qualities."[45] In short, the essence of Voidness is called vajra.

Thus, Vajradhara Buddha is whoever is called holder-of-the-powerbolt because he can hold Voidness in his mental continuum. This is the inner meaning well-explained. In this way, a being is indeed purified of defilment by means

43 See ITB, Vol. II, pp. 134-141. See also a Vajrapâṇi tantra, said to contain seven definitions of vajra; it is part of the cycle of Krîya tantras.

44 Śîtavana is the place where the Vajrayâna sûtras were revealed.

45 Snellgrove, p. 92, vol I of HVT, and George Elder's translation of the Saṃpuṭa Tantra, p. 190.

of the path, by the doctrinal system of the Secret Mantra Vajrayâna. The nature of Vajradhara is manifested by all beings whatever who are purified as the fruit of Wisdom; this is accepted. Now, from the Hevajra Tantra: "All beings arise from me; the three worlds arise from me; I pervade all that exists; of nought else does this world consist." (HVT I. viii, 41) This is what it truly means! In brief, he, the Buddha, is called Vajradhara; this is the meaning of all these [quotations]. Do not accept that any one else lacks that quality; if one realizes the meaning of self, one can achieve Buddhahood in the primordial (rang ngor) [form] of Vajradhara. The one who holds the succession of the bKa' brgyud pa[46] should realize the primordial nature of oneself; Buddhas do not exist extrinsically (zur du). In this way, the inner explanation of Vajradhara is completely finished. Having made known the nature of [vajra], [I] ask you to learn, to practice, and to experience! (ñams len la 'bad par zhu). All fortunate beings have power [to become connected with the Doctrine]; Buddha is not apart from the self; by this means alone one may achieve Buddhahood. All holy doctrines are in one's own mind [as bodhicitta]! You must put this into practice; it will be well! All Saṃsâra and Nirvâṇa are one's primordial nature. Thus, if one gives up hatred and attachment, one will be liberated.

[46] Songs, p. 266: "As one light is kindled from another, the teaching has been transmitted down from Dharmakâya, the great Dorje Chang," etc.

Folio 13

If the mind neither accepts nor rejects virtue nor non-virtue, there is neither cyclic existence nor ultimate extinction; there is no other cause and effect [apart from oneself]! (de kas dge sdig 'dor len gyis). One's own mind is the bKa' brgyud lama[47]. If one makes a request with devotion, a blessing will enter one. All the six classes of sentient beings are one's own appearance. The benefit of all these sentient beings arises through kindness and compassion. All the visible things that exist in Saṃsâra and Nirvâṇa are oneself. All are made by oneself. Wishing to achieve Buddhahood, or wandering in Saṃsâra, depends on one's own creations; if one does not see self and others as one, a person cannot have merit in his continuum of being. One should not follow along the way of non-virtue; the virtue and non-virtue of oneself and others are one and the same. [From the Avadâna Śataka:][48] "The actions of sentient beings are inexhaustible for one hundred eons; when the time arrives, [karmas] fully accumulated, become ripened as a result." The meaning of cause and result is one in essence; this is the meaning of both skillful salvific means and

[47] Songs, p. 199 fn. 12: "A tantric yogi should know that all manifestations are representations of Absolute Truth, and that the `real Guru' - the embodiment of the Absolute - is his own mind. Thus, to meditate on one's own mind is to realize the identity of the manifestations and the gurus." See also, pp. 378-379: "My guru is my own mind."

[48] See M. Léon Feer. Avadâna Śataka (Paris: Ernest Leroux, editeur, 1891), p. 6. This is a `stock phrase' appearing in over half the avadânas in this collection.

wisdom; this meaning is Mahâmudrâ.[49] This meaning is ultimate Vajradhara. This completes the exposition on the Buddha Vajradhara. Thus!

If the biography of Vajradhara Saṃbhogakâya [Buddha] were to be written in a lengthy presentation, it would be immeasurable. Since one may be afraid of a great accumulation of words, an easily understandable compilation has [herein] been composed. This presentation of Vajradhara Saṃbhogakâya Buddha, both clear and illuminating of the faith, is respectfully compiled, rich with the wealth of the learned thoughts culled from scriptures and logic [or: the precepts of the Saints and the learning of the sages.][50]

It was made upon the admonition of slob dpon 'od zer mgon po, who has great faith in the assembly of bKa' brgyud teachers, [abiding] firmly in meditative absorbtion (ting-'zin bstam na sgom la nges g.nas shing).

It was composed by rGyal Thang pa, who resides in a hermitage[51], meditating in the snow, because of his reverent devotion for the Buddha. Exemplifying those virtues which have been accumulated as merit in the three times, may I

[49] For the Great-Seal is nothing less than Ultimate reality. This is presented brilliantly in Takpo Tashi Namgyal's masterpiece, Chakchen dawai Özer (Moonbeams of Mahâmudrâ).

[50] lung rigs man ngag thos bsam nor gyis phyug. See pg. 1216, Chandra Das.

[51] This place is said (by Losang Jamspal and by Khenpo Tarchen Rinpoche) to be about a day's journey away from Lhasa, near Reting; see folio 618-619, colophon, which identifies rGyal Thang pa as `Holder of the See of the retreat center of rGod tsang pa, one who meditates in the snow'. This Vulture Cave is said still to exist.

myself and all disciples and all sentient beings achieve the excellent state of Vajradhara. Thus!

Auspicious! bliss// corrected/

Part III

Chapter 9: A Transliteration of the _rnam thar_ of Vajradhara

This is the Tibetan text of the _rnam thar_ of Vajradhara that starts the cycle of dKar brgyud pa biographies by rGyal Thang pa. (For paleographical comments, see translation, Chapter 8, footnote 1.) In this transcription, abbreviations have been expanded, with occasional reference to M. Jacques Bacot, "L'Écriture Cursive Tibétaine" in _Journal Asiatique_, Janvier-Février, 1912, and to Alexander Csoma de Korös, _A Grammar of the Tibetan Language in English_, (Calcutta: Baptist Mission Press, 1834). Emendations have been placed in brackets []. Transliteration follows the system in Turrell V. Wylie, "A Standard System of Tibetan Transcription," _Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies_ 22 (1959): 261-67, with the exception of ña for nya. The sign ^ is used for line endings.

bKa'-brgyud gSer 'Phreng of rGyal-Thang-pa

1 dpal ldan dwags po bka' brgyud pa'i rnam par thar pa bshugs lags so/ ^ sgyur ban gyi dpe kra shis/^

2. //shrî guru namo// de yang rigs thams cad kyi bdag po dpal thams cad kyi gtso bo gsang sngags bstan pa'i mnga'^ bdag theg chen kyi ston pa bka' brgyud bla ma'i thog ma bsgrub brgyud chos kyi bstan 'dzin sñan brgyud don gyi 'brel

['grel] pa bshad pa las dang ^po rtsa ba tshig bshad pa ni// // e ma bstan pa'i mnga' bdag ston pa thub pa ñid // dbang po rnon po gang zag gcig car ba'i //^ shes rgyud smin cing gsang sngags bdag por ston // mchog gi don mdzad rdo rje 'chang la bstod // (1) gnas dang 'khor dang dus sogs phun tshogs shing/ sku yi bdag-ñid ^ ye shes lnga yi dngos/ yan lag bdun ldan rang snang yum dang sbyar// longs spyod sdzogs [rdzogs] sku rdo rje 'chang la bstod// (2) dbang phyug brgyad ldan rgyal ba rdo rje 'chang/ thun mong min ^ pa'i rdo rje theg pa'i chos / tshe gcig lus la sangs rgyas ster byed pa'i/ bla med chos gsung rdo rje 'chang la bstod/ (3) sa lam mchog gyur bcu gsum rdo rje 'dzin//^

3. yongs su rdzogs na mngon dus mthar phyin pa'i/ rdzogs pa'i sangs rgyas drug pa rdo rje 'chang/ rigs kyi bdag po rdo rje 'chang la bstod// (4) // ces pa rtsa ba'i tshig gis bstod pa'i rjes su ^ don 'grel pa bshad pa ni/ de yang dang po / bstan pa'i mnga' bdag ston pa thub pa ñid/ ces sogs ni/ de yang rigs drug pa sangs rgyas rdo rje 'chang ces pa de su 'dra rang yin nam mdzad pa'i rnam ^ thar rang ji 'dra yod dam sñam na/ sangs rgyas de'i rnam thar phyi [spyi] ltar du bshad na/ sangs rgyas de ni bstan pa 'di'i mnga' bdag/ ston pa bcom ldan das rgyal ba sha' kya thub pa dngos lags te/ de yang sangs rgyas de mngon par ^ rdzogs par sangs rgyas pa'i dus/ dag pa'i gdul bya rnams kyi snang ngor/ gnas dag cing mchog tu gyur pa 'og min chos kyi pho brang du sku dag cing mchog tu gyur longs [spyod] sku/

sangs rgyas rdo rje 'chang gi ^ rang ngor byon pa thun mong min pa rdo rje theg pa'i chos kyis/ snod dang ldan pa'i gdul bya rnams kyi rgyud yongs su smin par mdzad pa yin no// yang ma dag pa'i gdul bya rnams kyi snang ngor/ gnas ma dag pa ^ mi mjed 'jig rten gyi gnas 'di ñid du/ sku gang la gang 'dul gyi sprul sku thub pa'i rang ngor byon pa/ thun mong theg pa'i chos kyis/ gdul byar 'os pa'i 'gro ba rnams kyi rgyud smin par mdzad pa yin no// mdor ^ na/ sangs rgyas de longs sku dang sprul sku'i rnam thar ston cing/ sku bzang ngan/ sa mtho dman / dus/ snga phi sogs su snang ba de/ gdul bya dag ma dag gi mthong snang du shar ba yin gyi/ don la sku bzang^

4. ngan rnams/ sa la mtho dman rnams / dus la snga phyi med par dus gcig tu sa gcig tu sku gcig tu sangs rgyas pa yin te/ de yin par lang kar bshegs pa las/ gtsang ma'i gnas dag spangs pa na// 'og·min zhes bya'i ñams dga' bar// sangs rgyas ^ longs sku der sangs rgyas// sprul pa [po] gcig 'dir sangs rgyas// ces gsungs pas/ bstan pa 'di'i bdag po/ ston pa sangs rgyas thub pa'i dbang po 'di ñid/ dbang po rnon po'i rigs can/ las dang skal bar ldan pa'i skyes bu tshe gcig lus gcig la 'bras don ^ mngon du byed pa'i/ dag pa'i gdul bya rnams shes rgyud smin pa dang grol ba'i/ gsang sngags chos kyi bdag po longs sku rdo rje 'chang/ phyag rgya yum dang byas par snang zhing bstan nas/ mchog gi gdul bya rnams kyi don mdzad pa de dang/ yang dbang po rtul po'i rigs ^ can/ las dang bskal bar dman pa

skal pa grangs med 'ga' re'i dus la/ 'bras don dngos don du 'dod pa'i gdul bya rnams kyi don du/ thun mong chos gyi bdag po/ sprul sku thub pa'i rnam par snang zhing bstan nas/ dman pa'i gdul bya rnams kyi don ^ mdzad pa de gñis/ ngo bo gcig cing tha dad med te [de]/ mngon rtogs rgyan las/ mtshan mchog sum bcu rtsa gñis dang// dpe byad brgyad cu'i bdag ñid 'di// theg chen ñe bar longs spyod phyir// thub pa longs spyod rdzogs skur bzhed// ces gsungs pas bstan pa ^ 'di'i bdag po/ ston pa sangs rgyas thub pa ñid ka/ theg pa chen po thun mongs min pa'i chos kyi gdul byar 'os pa rnams kyi snang ngor/ sangs rgyas longs sku rdo rje 'chang gi rang ngor bstan par bzhed pa'i don yin no// de ka la (r)tsa ba nas/ bstan pa'i bdag po ston ^ pa thub pa ñid/ dbang po rnon po gang zag gcig char pa'i// shes rgyud smin phyir gsang sngags bdag por stan [ston]// mchog gi don mdzad rdo rje 'chang la bstod/ ces pa'i don yin// // gnas dang khor dang dus sogs phun (sum) tshogs shing//^

5. ces pa'i don ni/ de ltar thub pa/ dag pa'i gdul bya rnams kyi snang ngor/ longs sku rdo rje 'chang du bstan cing snang nas / de'i mdzad pa dang rnam thar 'di ltar snang ngo/ de yang/ de lta bu'i longs sku sangs rgyas rdo rje 'chang de'i mdzad pa ^ rnams ni/ gnas phun sum tshogs pa'i gnas/ gnas der ston pa phun sum tshogs pa'i ston pa/ ston pa des bstan pa'i chos phun sum tshogs pa'i chos/ chos de ston pa'i 'khor phun sum tshogs pa'i 'khor/ 'khor dang/ bstan pa dang/ ston pa dang/ gnas dang ^ byas pa [bcas pa]

'dzoms pa'i/ dus phun sum tshogs pa'i dus bya ba/ phun sum tshogs pa lnga tshang ba'i mdzad pa yod de/ de yang / gnas ni gzhan gang gi yang 'og na med cing/ mchog tu rgyur pa'i yon tan phun sum tshogs pa dang ldan pa/ gtsang ma'i ring kyi ^ lnga'i gong na yod par/ gnas de'i yon tan dang/ phyag [chags] tshad dang/ rnam pa thams cad sus dang [kyang] dpag par dka' zhing tshad las 'das pa phun sum tshogs pa'i gnas mchog de'o/ gnas der ston pa longs sku rdo rje 'chang ces pa/ yan lag bdun dang ldan cing/ ^ dbang phyug brgyad dang ldan pa'i ston pa phun (sum) tshogs pa de'o/ ston pa des bstan pa'i chos rdo rje theg pa'i thun mong min pa'i chos zab cing rting [gting] dpag par dka' ba/ 'bras bu lam du byed pa'i chos ñams su blangs na tshe gcig lus gcig la sangs rgyas mngon du byed pa/^ chos phun sum tshogs pa de'o// 'khor ni byang chub sems dpa' bo dang dpa' mo rdo rje sñing po la sogs pa/ sa lam mngon du byas pa dag pa'i 'khor phun sum tshogs pa de'o/ dus ni 'das pa'i dus dang/ ma 'ongs pa'i dus dang/ da ltar ba'i dus dang/ gsum kar du ^ zab mo gsang sngags kyi chos sgra rgyun mi chad par sgrogs pa'i dus phun sum tshogs pa'o/ des na/ gnas dang/ ston pa/ bstan pa/ 'khor sogs phun sum tshogs pa'i longs sku rdo rje 'chang ces pa'o/ de ltar/ sku lnga'i bdag ñid ye shes lnga ye dngos/ ces pa'i don ni/^

6. sku chos sku/ longs sku/ sprul sku/ ngo bo ñid kyi sku/ bde ba chen po'i sku ste/ sangs rgyas sku lnga'i rang ngor bzhugs pa/ thugs chos kyi byings kyi ye shes/ me long

lta bu'i ye shes/ mñam pa ñid kyi ye shes/ so sor rtogs pa'i ye shes/ bya ba [s]grub pa'i ye shes te/ thugs ^ ye shes lnga'i dngos gzhir yod pa de yang/ rgyud las/ sangs rgyas sku lnga'i bdag ñid can// khyab bdag ye shes lnga yi bdag/ sangs rgyas mnga' bdag cod pan can// / ces gsungs pa ltar bzhugs pa'o// da/ yan lag bdun ldan ^ ces pa'i don ni/ de lta bu'i sangs rgyas sku dang ye shes su ldan pa de ñid/ mtshan dpe rab tu ldan pa'i yan lag/ kha sbyor dbyer med zung 'jug gi yan lag/ bde chen don dam dga' bzhi'i yan lag/ rang bzhin bden med tshegs [chod] pa'i yan lag/ byang sems bden gñis yongs gang gi ^ yan lag/ thugs rje nas rgyun mi chad pa'i yan lag/ dgongs pa 'gog pa med cing mya' ngan las mi 'da' ba'i yan lag ste/ yan lag bdun po de dang ldan bzhin pa'i ngang nas/ rang snang yum dang dbyer med du sbyar te/ bde ba chen po la ye nas longs spyod par ^ mthar thug pa yin pas na longs sku yan lag bdun ldan ces bya'o/ de ka la/ kho na ñid yong su bstan pa'i rgyud las/ mtshan dpe rab ldan kha sbyor bde chen ring na med/ byang chub sems yongs gang thugs rje ye nas rgyun me cad [chad?]/ ^ dgongs pa mi 'gog mdzad pa mya' ngan yong mi gda'/ yan lag bdun ldan 'di dang ldan pa'i longs sku ni// ces gsungs so/ yang na dpal ngag gi dbyang phyug grags pas/ longs spyod rdzogs dang kha sbyor bde chen rang bzhin med// sñing rdzes yongs ^ gang rgyun mi chad dang 'gog pa med// yan lag bdun dang ldan pa'i sangs rgyas 'di ñid ni/ bdag 'dod tshad mas yongs sgoms blo ldan rnams dang 'dod/ ces

gsungs / de'i lugs su byas na/ theg pa chen pa'i chos la spyod pas na longs spyod rdzogs pa'i yan [lag]^

7. // zag pa med par kha sbyor bas na kha sbyor gyi yan lag/ rgyud bden pa [bde ba] chen pos gang bas na bde ba chen po'i yan lag/ chos sku rang bzhin med pas na rang bzhin med pa'i yan lag/ sñing rje tshad med pas yong su gang bas ^ na sñing rjes yong su gang ba'i yan lag/ rgyun mi chad pa'i mdzad pa mnga' bas na rgyun mi 'chad pa'i yan lag/ 'gog pa med par 'gro ba'i don la mnga' ngan las mi 'da' bas na 'gog pa med pa'i yan lag ste/ yan lag de bdun dang ldan pa'i sangs rgyas/ ^ longs sku 'di ñid/ dpal ngag gi dbang phyug grags pa dag 'dod cing/ blo tshad mas kyang grub la / yang dag par rdzogs pa'i sangs rgyas rnams dang / sngon gyi mkhas grub blo gros dang ldan pa rnams kyang 'dod do ces pa'o/ de lta bu'i yan lag bdun ldan gyi sangs rgyas ^ de/ rang snang [=rang gyis snang ba] yum dang sbyar nas/ bde ba chen po la longs spyod pas na longs spyod rdzod pa'i sku/ chos ñid don gyi rdo rje rgyud la 'chang bas na rdo rje ste/ mdor na rtsa ba nas/ yan lag bdun ldan rang snang yum dang sbyar // long spyod rdzogs sku rdo rje 'chang la bstod/ ^ ces pa'i don to// // da dbang phyug brgyad ldan rgyal ba rdo rje 'chang/ ces sogs kyis bstan pa'i don ni/ de yang/ sangs rgyas thub pa longs sku rdo rje `chang yan lag bdun gyi sku/ dbang phyug brgyad dang ldan pa ni/ sku'i dbang phyug / gsungs gi dbang phyug/ ^ thugs kyi dbang phyug/ rdzu 'phrul gyis dbang phyug/ kun

'gro'i dbang phyug/ 'dod pa'i dbang phyug/ ci 'dod pa'i dbang phyug ste/ dbang phyug brgyad po de rnams dang ldan pa yin te/ de yang/ dang po'i dbang phyug ni/ 'khor 'das gzugs kyis bsdus ^ pa'i chos thams cad la/ sku des dbang byed pas na dbang / sku des bsdus pa'i 'dod pa'i yon tan thams cad kyis phyug pas na phyug/ des na sku'i dbang phyug te/ da / gsungs gi bdang phyug ni/ 'khor 'das dbang gis bsdus pa'i chos thams cad la gsung de[s] dbang byed pas/ ^

8. na dbang/ gsung des bsdus tshad 'dod pa'i yon tan thams cad kyis phyug pas na phyug/ des na gsung gi dbang phyug/ da / thugs kyi dbang phyug ni/ de bzhin du 'khor 'das yid kyis bsdus pa'i chos thams cad la thugs des dbang byed pas na dbang/ ^ thugs des bsdus pa'i 'dod pa'i yon tan thams cad kyis phyug pas na phyug/ des na thugs kyi dbang phyug go/ da rdzu 'phrul gyi dbang phyug ni/ sku gsung thugs kyi dbang phyug dang ldan bzhin pas/ sku gsung thugs kyi rdzu 'phrul tshad med pa la dbang kha sgyur bas na dbang rdzu 'phrul tshad med ^ pa'i yon tan gyis phyug pas na phyug/ des na rdzu 'phrul gyi dbang phyug/ da / kun 'gro'i dbang phyug ni/ de 'gro ba 'khor 'das kun gyi don mdzad pa la dbang bas na dbang/ 'khor 'das kyi yon tan gang gi phyogs nas kyang phongs nas kyang phongs pa med par ^ 'dzom[s] zhing phyug pas na phyug pa/ des na kun 'gro'i dbang phyug go/ da / gnas kyi dbang phyug ni/ 'og min ces bya ba/ 'phags pa'i gnas gzhan thams cad la gnas des dbang sgyur pas na dbang/ gnas mchog tu gyur pa'i gnas/ ^ gzhan

thams cad kyi yon tan ci yod kyis phyug pas na phyug/ des na gnas kyi dbang phyug go/ da 'dod pa'i dbang phyug ni/ dus gsum gyi sangs rgyas thams cad kyi yum/ rdo rje sñe ma/ bdag med ma/ rdo rje phag mo/ rdo rje mkha' 'gro [ma] rin chen mkha' 'gro [ma] / padma mkha' 'gro [ma]/ las kyi mkha' 'gro/ sangs rgyas mkha' 'gro la sogs pa'i gsang yum phyag rgya'i rigs su rtogs pa thams cad la/ skad cig gis dbyer med zung 'jug bde stong phyag rgya chen po'i ngang nas 'dod pa'i sñoms par 'jug pas na dbang / shes rab rig pa'i tshogs tshad med pa la phyug pas na phyug / des na 'dod pa'i ^ dbang phyug go/ da ci 'dod pa'i dbang phyug ni/ 'khor 'das gñis kyis bsdus pa'i 'dod yon mchog dang thun mong gi 'dod yon ci dang ci 'dod pa'i yon tan thams cad la dbang bas na dbang/ mchog dang thun mong dngos grub yod tshad kyis phyug pas na phyug / des ^

9. ci 'dod pa'i dbang phyug go/ de ka la sgrol ma mngon 'byung gi rgyud kyi rnal 'byor bla med kyi skabs nas gsungs pa la/ ñi ma sbas pas rnam dag gtsug nor nas/ sku dang gsungs dang thugs kyi dbang phyug/ rdzu 'phrul kun 'gro gnas la sogs pa'i/ ^ dbang phyug las la dka' ba ma yin// ces gsungs pa'i don lags so/ mdor na dbang phyug brgyad ldan pa'i sangs rgyas des/ gdul bya snod ldan pa rnams kyi don du/ thun mong ma yin pa'i gsang sngags rdo rje theg pa'i chos/ tshe gcig lus gcig la sangs rgyas mngon du ster bar ^ byed pa'i sangs rgyas/ bla med don gyi chos gsungs pa'i longs sku rdo rje 'chang la bstod ces pa'i don te/

des na/ rtsa ba nas/ dbang phyug brgyad ldan rgyal ba rdo rje 'chang/ thun mong min pa rdo rje theg pa'i chos/ tshe gcig lus gcig sangs rgyas ster byed pa'i/ bla med chos gsungs rdo rje 'chang ^ la bstod// (3) ces pa'i don to// da/ sa lam mchog gyur bcu gsum rdo rje 'dzin/ ces sogs kyi don ni/ de yang/ sangs rgyas rdo rje 'chang longs sku yan lag bdun gyi sangs rgyas de ñid/ sa dang lam mchog tu gyur pa thams cad yongs su rdzogs pa yin te/ de yang/ ^ sa dang po rab tu dga' ba/ gñis pa dri ma med pa/ gsum pa 'od byed pa/ bzhi pa 'od 'phro ba/ lnga pa sbyang dka' ba/ drug pa mngon du gyur pa/ bdun pa ring du song ba/ brgyad pa mi gyo ba/ dgu pa legs pa'i blo gros/ bcu pa chos kyi sprin/ bcu gcig [pa] kun ^ du 'od zer dpe med pa yang zer/ bcu gñis pa dpe med pa yang zer la ye shes chen po yang zer/ bcu gsum pa rdo rje 'dzin pa'i sa zer te/ mdor na sa'i bshad pa yin// da / lam thams cad la 'jig rten pa'i lam dang/ 'jig rten las 'das pa'i lam gñis las/ ^ dang po 'jig rten pa'i lam la/ tshogs kyi lam dang/ sbyor ba'i lam yin / 'jig rten las 'das pa'i lam la mthong lam dang sgom lam mi slob pa'i lam ste/ lam lnga yin/ gsang sngags rdo rje theg pa/ sa dang lam mthar phyin pa'i yon tan thams cad mngon du rdzogs pa lags so/ de lta bu rdzogs ^

10. pa'i sangs rgyas rigs drug pa rdo rje 'chang/ sku gsungs thugs yon tan phrin las te sangs rgyas kyi rigs kun gyi bdag po stong [pa] ñid dam/ thabs shes dbyer mi phyed pa'i don gyis na rdo rje/ chos ñid don gyi rdo rje de rgyud

la 'chang ba 'am rtogs pas na/ rdo rje jes pa/ de la gsang sngags rdo rje theg pa'i snod du ^ rung ba'i gdul bya thams cad kyi sgo gsum dad pa dang gus pas bstod pas na bstod do zhes pa'i don to/ da ka la rtsa ba nas/ sa lam mchog gyur bcu gsum rdo rje 'dzin/ yong su rdzogs nas mngon du mthar phyin pa'i/ rdzogs pa'i sangs rgyas drug pa rdo rje 'chang/ rigs ^ kyi bdag po rdo rje 'chang la bstod/ ces pa'i don to/ mdor na longs sku rdo rje 'chang rigs thams cad kyi bdag po/ dpal thams cad kyi gtso bo/ yan lag bdun dang ldan zhing/ dbang phyug brgyad dang ldan pa'i sangs rgyas rdo rje 'chang ces pa de rnams bshad do/ da don gñis pa sangs rgyas ^ rdo rje 'chang ces pa 'di/ nang ltar du bshad na/ chos ñid don dam pa stong pa ñid chos skur rtogs shing rgyud la 'chang ba thams cad/ sangs rgyas rdo rje 'chang yin te/ de yin par yang/ (b)rgyud rdo rje rtse mo nas/ rdo rje 'chang zhes gsungs 'di ci/ sangs rgyas kun gyi ye shes dang/ byang chub ^ sems brtan gang yin pa/ de ñid rgyal po rdo rje 'chang/ de bzhin gshegs pa kun gyi bdag/ ces gsungs pa ste/ de yang/ sangs rgyas kun gyi ye shes ces pa de/ byang chub kyi sems gang yin pa de yin/ byang chub kyi sems gang yin pa de sangs rgyas rdo rje 'chang yin/ de yang/ ^ sangs rgyas kyi ye shes zhes pa de ci 'dra la zer na/ yang rgyud rdo rje rtse mo [rtse mo] las/ de ñid shes pa ye shes te/ slar yang chos sku rtogs pa yin/ rtag chad yongs su spong byed cing/ 'chi med de bzhin ye shes yin/ ces gsungs so/ 'o na de ltar du ^ gyur na/ rtogs ldan gyi rnal 'byor pa chos sku ye shes kyi don rtogs pa rnams kyang/ rdo rje

'chang du 'gyur sñam na/ de ni los kyang 'dod de/ (b)rgyud de ñid las/ ye shes don rtogs rdo rje 'chang rnal 'byor kun gyi rtogs pa'i phyir / des na bla med rdo rje 'chang/ rdo rje 'chang rnams de sñed do [rñed pa?]/^

11. ces gsungs so/ 'o na de lta na/ rnal 'byor pa de/ rdo rje 'chang yin na/ gzugs ñer len gyi phung po lnga nas bzung nas tha mal gyi lus su ston pa de mi rigs so / sñam na rdo rje gur las/ gang phyir rdo rje 'chang chen ñid/ de ñid blun ^ po['i] gzugs bzung ste/ sems can phan btags dmigs nas su/ tha mal pa'i gzugs su gnas/ shes gsungs so/ des mi tshad 'grc ba sems can (pa) thams cad/ sangs rgyas sñing po can yin te/ de yin par ngo ma shes pas/ ma rig pa blo bur gyi dri mas bsgribs ^ nas/ 'khor bar 'khyams pa ma rtogs/ ye nas sangs rgyas rang yin te/ (b)rgyud rtag gñis las / sangs rgyas ma yin sems can ni/ gcig [kyang] yod pa ma yin no/ skye bo rnal 'byor ldan pa yis/ nga rgyal mi bcag tho mi tsham/ phal pa'i gzugs su gnas ^ nas ni/ 'di rtag bde gshegs rigs su nges/ shes pa dang/ yang rgyud de ñid las/ sems can rnams ni sangs rgyas ñid/ 'ong kyang blo bur dri [mas] bsgribs/ de ñid bsal na sangs rgyas 'gyur/ ces gsungs so/ 'o na sems can rnams sangs rgyas gang yin na/ kho na ñid stan pa'i ^ rgyud las/ gdul bya dag dang ma dag las/ sangs rgyas longs sku sprul skur snang/ dngos gcig yid ni tha dad phyir/ don la sangs rgyas thams cad gcig/ ces gsungs so/ gdul bya dag ma dag gi snang ngo las/ sangs rgyas longs sku dang sprul skur snang ba ma rtogs

[gtogs]/ don la ^ sangs rgyas ngo bo gcig go/ mdor na stong pa ñid kyis skyed tshad kyi 'khor 'das kyi chos thams cad sangs rgyas rdo rje 'chang kho na yin te/ de yin par rgyud rdo rje rtse mo las/ ci yi phyir na rdo rje 'chang / sra zhing sñing po khong stong med/ sreg med bcad du med pa dang ^ bshig cing gzhoms du med pa'i phyir/ stong pa ñid kyi rdo rje rjod/ ces gsungs so/ yang chos sdud pa po yang/ gsang sngags kyi chos sdud mkhan thams cad phyag na rdo rje yin la/ pha rol tu phyin [pa] la sogs mdo'i chos thams cad sdud mkhan kun dga' bo yin la/ don ^

12. la de gñis kyang ngo bo gcig yin pa la/ gdul bya'i snang ngor so sor snang ba ma rtogs [gtogs] don gcig ste/ bsil ba'i tsal las/ mang du thos pa gsang snags 'dzin/ kun dga' bo la phyag 'tshal bstod/ ces gsungs pa lags so / da des mi tshad chos ston mkhan gyi ston ^ pa sangs rgyas dang/ stan rgyu'i chos dang/ stan pa'i khor dang gsum yang rang bzhin gyis gcig ste/ rtag gñis las/ 'chad pa po'i chos dang nga/ rang gi tshogs ldan stan pa nga/ ces gsungs ste/ mdor na stong pa ñid kyi rang ngo de la/ rdo rje ces zer/ stong pa ñid ^ rgyud la 'chang ba de la rdo rje 'chang ces zer/ des na sangs rgyas rdo rje 'chang ces de [te]/ nang don ltar bshad na de ltar du lags so/ de ltar du yin pas ka gsang snags rdo rje theg pa'i lugs kyis/ lam gyi tri [dri] ma sbyangs pas/ sbyang 'bras sbyong mkhan gyi 'gro ^ ba gang yin pa thams cad kyis rdo rje 'chang gi rang ngo mngon du byed par 'dod te/ da kas rtag gñis las/ nga las 'gro ba

thams cad byung/ gnas gsum po yang nga las byung/ nga yis 'di kun khyab pa ste / 'gro ba'i rang bzhin gzhan ma 'thong [mthong]/ ^ ces gsungs pa'i don lags so/ mdor na de rnams thams cad kyi don rdo rje 'chang ces pa'i sangs rgyas de/ rang las gzhan na yod par mi 'dod pas/ rang gi don rtogs na rdo rje 'chang gi rang ngor sangs rgyas rñed pa lags so/ des na bka' brgyud kyi pha rabs 'dzin pa'i skyes bu ^ kun/ rang rang gi rang ngo rtogs par mdzod gcig/ sangs rgyas zur du mi ldan pa lags so/ des rdo rje 'chang gi rnam pa nang ltar du bshad pa de song tshar ro/ de de ltar du shes par byas nas/ ñams len la 'bad par zhu// // dbang ge ^ skal ldan skyes bu kun/ rang min sangs rgyas logs na med/ da kas sangs rgyas thob pa yin/ dam chos thams cad rang sems lags/ da kas [de kas] ñams len byas na legs/ 'khor 'das thams cad rang ñid lags/ da [de] kas chags sdang spangs na grol/

13. // rang las gzhan pa'i rgyu 'bras med/ de kas dge sdig 'dor len gyis/ bka' brgyud bla ma rang gi sems/ gus pa gsol btab byin rlabs 'jug/ 'gro drug sems can rang snang rang/ byams dang sñing rjes ^ 'gro don 'byung/ snang srid 'khor 'das rang ñid rang/ thams cad rang gis byed pa yin// sangs rgyas 'dod dam 'khor bar 'khyams// rang rang 'khos la rag las so// rang gzhan gñis po mi gcig na// bsod rnams rgyud la mi yong zhing// sdig pa'i rjes su mi ^ 'brang lags// rang gzhan dge sdig gcig pas na // lus can dag gi las rnams ni// skal pa brgyar [brgya par?] yang chud mi za//

tshogs zhing dus la bab pa na/ 'bras bu ñid du smin par 'gyur// de don rgyu 'bras dbyer med yin// don de thabs shes ^ zung 'jug yin// don de phyag rgya chen po yin// don de don dam rdo rje 'chang// ces pa ste/ des na sangs rgyas rdo rje 'chang ces pa'i rnam par bshad pa tshar ro// ithi// de 'ang longs sku rdo rje 'chang la/ rnam thar rgyas bshad du rjod na tshad med te/ tshig tshogs ches nas yi ges/ ^ 'jigs srid pas/ go bde bag bsdus su bkod pa lags so// // sangs rgyas longs sku rdo rje 'chang chen gyi// rnam bshad gsal ba dad pa'i gsal 'debs 'di// lung rigs man ngag thos bsam nor gyis phyug// ting nge 'dzin bstam na sgom la nges gnas shing// bka' brgyud bla ma'i tshogs la rab dad pa'i// slob dpon 'od zer mgon pos skul ba'i ngor// ri khrod gnas 'dzin gangs sgom rgyal thang pas// sangs rgyas ñid la dad cing gus pas bkod// dge ba 'dis 'tshon dus gsum bsag dge yis// ^ bdag sogs rjes 'jug 'gro ba thams cad kyis// rdo rje 'chang gi go 'phang mchog thob shog/ ithi// mangalam// dge// /zhus dag//

Part III

Chapter 10: A Translation of the Biography of Milarepa by rGyal Thang pa

Folio 189

This is the biography of the Saint (rje btsun[1]) Victor Milarepa (mid la ras pa).

Folio 190

Honor to the Guru!

For this purpose, I have written the biography of one called Saint Milarepa in which there are two categories: there is the presentation of the root-text and the explanation of its meaning in a commentary. First, there is the root verse giving the doctrine:

Honor to the Lord
Guru Victory-Banner!
The Saint-Guru, Lord Milarepa,

[1] The title rje btsun is the Tibetan equivalent of Sanskrit bhaṭṭa (=lord, learned brahman) or bhaṭṭâraka (=great lord, venerable one). The term is used of gods, learned Buddhist monks, and a class of Śaiva monks (see discussion in Giuseppe Tucci, "Buddhist Notes: A propos Avalokiteśvara," in Mélanges Chinoises et bouddhiques, 9ème Vol.(1948-1951): p. 184.

It is the title used of Nâropa, Marpa, and other Saints. In the Life of Marpa (Nâlandâ trans. Committee, p. 22; Tib. text folio 247.3), Marpa addresses the entire dharma-circle of Sântibhadra with this title. It almost becomes a name for Milarepa. It suggests Saint as much as the title Siddha does ('grub thob). Cf. mnga' bdag (Lord) as a title of Maitrîpa (Life of Marpa, folio 247), which would be a synonym for rJe. Translating rje btsun as `Saint' shows that one has attained `mastery' over inner practice and is worthy of veneration.

Who emanates an excellent manifestation-body,
By which one may be spiritually disciplined,
Which took on ordinary guise, and performed
various types of austerities;
Thus I bow down to the Lord who has attained the
virtues. (1)

In order to bring to fruition the causal
connections with previously established
aspirations,[2]
He was born in rTsa ba'i lung (grassy valley) one
of the five small towns
In the border region of South Tibet, in the human
realm;
I bow down to the place of birth of the Saint
(2)
As for the family in which Mila was born, -the
lineage of his father's ancestors-
The clan was not great

Folio 191:

He was a son of a low-caste clan (rigs gnan; or: rang bzhin phal pa'i: an essentially ordinary family),
In a family of no great repute, with few members,
and without a geneology;
I bow down to the family from which the Saint
came. (3)

2 Roots of goodness: See MPP-Ś, pp. 1969ff.

Into that setting, the Saint Milarepa
Entered the womb of his mother when she was tired;
During sleep, in a dream, she foresaw great difficulties;
I bow down to the Saint's entry into the womb. (4)

Thus, having entered the womb, when the ninth month was going on to the tenth,
on the fifteenth day of the lunar month,
there were auspicious planets and stars,
with omens and signs signifying that the Lord was to be born;
I bow down to the time of birth of the Saint. (5)

The Lord was carefully and affectionately cared for by his father:
When his father died, he was harmed and injured by all (<u>rtser</u>; '<u>tshe</u> ?);
Mother and children being impoverished,
[He] learned to sing songs and received fees from everyone (?);
I bow down to the Saint's time of troubles. (6)
The Saint, having learned to sing songs,
was able to care for his mother and sister as well,
by means of the fees earned by his excellent recitation,

(But) they were despised by all who stole (from them),
robbed (them) and afflicted (them);
I bow down to the disheartening sorrows of the
Saint.(7)
Being admonished by his mother, he went east
to the province of dBus,
where he sought for the knowledge of magical power
and received the skill of producing magical hailstorms;
By means of magic he unleashed hailstorms upon the land
of his enemies;
I bow down to the Saint, great in magic power. (8)
The magical power of hailstorms caused him dismay,
And renunciation was born in him;
True and reverent faith having arisen,
He became mindful of the divine Dharma of the Holy
One;
He relied upon the holy Lama G.yu Thog Lha dGa';

Folio 192:

I bow down to the prophecy about Saint Marpa (given to
Mila by Lha dGa'). (9)

He went before Marpa, requesting provisions and the
Dharma;
The Saint (Mila) was well-cared for by the Lady's
kindness;
The Saint (Marpa) told him that the Dharma is
difficult (to practice)

and imposed the service of heavy labor upon him;
I bow down to the difficult labor performed by the
Saint. (10)
Even though he revered and served [Marpa]
The Lady could not persuade him to bestow the Holy
Dharma;
She said: "Lama rNgog will bestow the profound Dharma
practices."
I bow down to the Saint's success in obtaining
the Dharma. (11)
Accompanying this master and his disciples,
He went before Marpa;
Having exhausted karmic obscurations,
he was (now) a vessel (worthy of) the instructions;
He mastered all the teachings and spiritual advice;
I bow down to the prophecy[3] of the Saint (his future
success in Dharma practice). (12)
Possessing the essence of the instructions,
Saint Milarepa,
having obtained all the teachings,
became mindful of his mother and sister;
He went before the Lama (Marpa) asking to return to his
own land;

3 Prophecies `from Vajradhara' may take the form of a warning; see R. A. Stein, Vie et Chants, op. cit., pp. 223-224.

I bow down to the Saint's receiving permission. (13)
Having thus obtained permission, at the point of departure,
He bowed to the father and mother and received their blessing;
Out of devotion to the Lady he placed (his head) beneath her feet seven times;
I bow down to the Saint, overcome by the (force) of sincere faith. (14)
From there he went up to rTsa in Gung Thang.
His mother was dead; the field was dried out;
the house had fallen down;
His sister had been expelled from her land;
Immeasurable sorrow (ngen-shes) arose (in him);
I bow down to the song of the arising of the (thought of) renunciation of the Saint. (15)
His sister Peta heard that the Saint had returned;
At the White Rock meditation cave,
His sister came to meet him;
The sister, having embraced him, weeping in torment,
Fell down in a faint;
I bow down to the Saint and his sister at their meeting. (16)
He (practiced) renunciation at Ling ra and other places;
He practiced meditation and severe asceticism in the six cliff-caves;

Without a companion, in solitude, he erected the
Victory Banner of striving for attainment;

Folio 193:

I bow down to the culmination of the Saint's ascetic
practice. (17)

At that time he went to Sñe-nam;

He begged from a householder-patron who provided him
with supplies,

(But) he did not reside there; he went to the snow-
mountain La Phyis (sic);

I bow down to the Saint, meditating in the snowy
ranges. (18)

After passing seven months (there) the Saint was
thought to have died;

Some people went to see [what happened] to the Saint;

Since they [found that] the Saint had not died,

They invited him to their town;

I bow down to the Saint who inspires wonder. (19)

He, the Lord, then went to meditate

In the solitude of Seng ge gling of Mon gyi kha dod;

Even there he attained immeasurable virtue;

To you, o Holy Saint, I bow down. (20)

Then, once he resided in Sñe nam brod bu;

His aunt and sister heard about his fame;

They went to see the Saint to invite him to both
households;

I bow down to the song of meeting with the Saint. (21)

He dwelt between Brin and Chu-bar;

By Tshe ring ma and innumerable attendant goddesses and demons;

Innumerable signs, omens, wonders, and warnings were made;

I bow down to the kindness[4] of the Lama that entirely destroyed them. (22)

The Lord went to the Valley of the Land of Sñe nam,

To liberate a Bon-po of Sñe Nam who was wandering in the intermediate state.

The learned scholar Dar Blo achieved true faith by his kindness;

I bow down to the One who subdued the assembly of the Nine Great Ones (cf. folio 244 where *dgu chen* becomes *dge 'dun*). (23)

Thus for the male and female patrons in Brin,

[Spiritual] understanding arose

[when] he flew down a precipice [*ñams rtogs shar dang cong la 'phur ba dang*];

The Saint Lama Bhagavân was seen as Târâ[5] [*sgrol mar mthong*]

I bow down to the Saint who possesses virtue. (24)

Thus the Saint Mila the yogin,

[4] *rjes bzung*; Skt.: *anugraha*.

[5] But see below, folio 251; later, see folio 255, where it seems that the patrons were blessed by Târâ, or perhaps by Milarepa in the form of Târa.

Not abiding in that land, went to the three provinces of Western Tibet;

In southern g.Yas Ru, north of a part of the land of gTsang, and so on;

I bow down to the wandering [of the Saint] who was without attachment to [any] hermitage [I bow down to the Saint's wandering freely amid the mountain solitudes]. (25)

In the same way the Saint Lama subdued the Four Demons

Folio 194

and possessed the Six Perfections;

Having brought his labors to completion,

He showed the way to pass away [mya ngan 'da' tshul (b)stan, the term for the death of a holy lama].

I bow down to the Saint who is completely liberated. [to the complete biography of the Saint]. (26)

Thus the verses of praise were composed.

This is the biography of the Saint-Victor Milarepa written in words of praise, prepared by rGyal Thang pa bde chen rdo rje.

Lord Milarepa, who has emanated an excellent illusory body (mchog gi skus)[6],

[6] In the Uttaratantrasâstra of Maitreya there are three types of sprul sku (nirmâṇakâya): 1. bzo (śilpa) the artistic; 2. skye ba (jâti), birth; 3. mchog gi (uttama/vara), the excellent or superior.

Who took on ordinary appearance,
I bow down to him, who has acquired immeasurable
virtue by various ascetical practices. (1)

This is the meaning:

Thus the Saint-Victor named Milarepa did this: In general, he is only an illusory manifestation (*rnam par 'phrul ba*; *vikurvâṇa*) of a Buddha. So he has come in an ordinary manner in this era of the spread of the Five Corruptions (*sñigs ma lṅa*; *kaṣâya*). Thus he also served the aims of ordinary sentient beings.

From a *Sûtra*:

The Blessed One, a perfect Buddha,
In the era of the spreading of the Five Corruptions,
By his illusory manifestation in which every means for
forming [disciples] is [found],
Accomplishes the aims of beings;
Sometimes he practices asceticism;
Somtimes he goes about in an ordinary manner, etc.

Also, it is stated in the *Vajra-pañjara*:

Even appearing as ice, he accomplishes the aims of
sentient beings;
Even appearing as a lion, he accomplishes the aims of
sentient beings;
and as a woman who sells beer,
even appearing as a prostitute, he accomplishes the aim
of sentient beings;

Even as an ordinary person and appearing in an inferior caste,

he accomplishes the aims of sentient beings.

Thus, a perfect Buddha, manifesting as an ordinary person in an impure caste, accomplishes the aims of sentient beings, so it is said.[7]

Even the Saint-Victor Milarepa, in accordance with the capacity of ordinary persons, manifested as the body of an ordinary person.

Folio 195:

Thus it is to be concluded that he came so as to achieve the aims of ordinary persons. The Saint himself said to Lama Ras chung pa [and] Zhi ba 'od: "In your opinion, who am I?" He [further] inquired: "What is your understanding? Zhi ba 'od replied: "According to my capacity for understanding, I think that you are no less than a Buddha." The Lama said to him: "This you are doing out of devotion, at this moment of time. This one ("I") was foretold by Buddha himself; I came as an illusory manifestation of Buddha himself; I was once Ācārya Ārya Nāgārjunagarbha[8]; I am an illusory manifestation of him in this birth." Then, the Saint Victor Milarepa said: "This is an illusory manifestation of Buddhahood, a true Nāgārjuna-

[7] The <u>Vimalakīrtinirdeśa</u> states: "It is always permissible for Bodhisattvas to create an oasis of a pure land in the midst of an impure land" (p. 400, Lamotte translation).

[8] BA, p. 436 says that he was <u>ācārya</u> 'Jam dpal bshes gñen (Mañjuśrīmitra).

garbha; and according to the capacity of ordinary persons, I have now emanated as the body of an ordinary person; I have come for the welfare of ordinary persons."

Thus, the Saint-Victor Milarepa was born in the ordinary Mid-la family; having been born, his ordinary body went without eating and without putting on clothes[9]. He acquired virtues through the practice of various kinds of asceticism. In this time of the spread of the Five Corruptions, he came for the sake of ordinary sentient beings. According to the capacity of ordinary persons, he, an illusory manifestation, came in the form of an ordinary man for the sake of sentient beings.

By the force[10] of aspirations co-dependently arisen in former times,
He was born in rTsa-ba'i Lung, one of the Five Small Towns,
In a border territory, in the south of Tibet, in the human realm.
I bow down to the birthplace of the Saint. (2)

This is the meaning: Then the Saint Victor Milarepa, whose ancestors were generally of the Yas

Folio 196

Cod clan according to human pedigree, in general were workers in Bar Phug. During the time of his ancestors, the

[9] I.e. his life was characterized by poverty.

[10] Stobs is not found on folio 190. The author (or transcriber) seems to have been relying on his memory of the verses.

land was lost. Thereupon, his forefather set out alone as a trader. Having made a sizable (tshad) bet (thebs) at dice (cho long = cho lo), he exhausted all his wealth, being burdened with many debts. He could not endure remaining in that place. At that time, many merchants from the northern region came down to rTsa of Gung thang [11]. (This ancestor) made a lodging for the traders. The family did business with the traders. Thus they set themselves up in rTsa of Gung thang. That country, in general, was called the Five Small Towns. These were called Ron pa, dMungs, Shag pa, dGun pa, and rTsa pa. The Saint's birthplace was called rTsa; his father went there first and having acquired (land) he founded a house on the land. These facts about the place of his birth [enable one] to recognize it.

The paternal family lineage of the Mila family (shows)
that he was the child of low caste commoners;
It was not a great family; his family was of no
Great repute, with few members and without even a

[11] This passage is a useful description of economic conditions in Tibet around the year 1050; note that already the people depend on commerce to supplement agricultural income and that the ancient habit of nomadic life is in direct continuity with the life of the wandering pedlar. Also, we note that villages had to be clustered near one another in newly pioneered regions so that if the fire went out in one house, it would be easy to rekindle the fire from a neighbor's hearth. Mila's father tried to make a new life for the family as a pioneer on new land, but his efforts were not entirely successful and there was fear that his family would fall apart in spite of his efforts. Only his wife's dream saved the marriage. The pioneering of new land suggests that the population in long-settled regions was growing; or else, that the fertility of the bottom lands was wearing out -or both - and younger men were searching for more fertile land higher in the hills.

geneology;

I bow down to the family in which took place the advent of the Saint. (3)

This is the meaning: This is the family heritage of the Mid la clan of the Saint Victor Milarepa. His grandfather was Mid la Vajra Victory Banner; his father was called Mid la Wisdom Banner. His mental continuum was good; he was friendly to all; also, he knew a small amount of the doctrine of the rNingmapa. When he attained the age of twenty, he laid claim to, acquired, and settled in the place called rTsa of Gung thang. On that occasion, in what was called the Five Small Towns there were but few who owned little portions of the land.

Folio 197:

There were only one or two family dwellings on the land. They thought: "Should the fire die out, from whom shall we obtain it? If our provisions give out, from whom shall we borrow?" It was a very sad place. He (Mila's father) received as a wife a woman of that place named Myang tsha dkar rgyan ma. They dwelt happily. There were not many people in the human lineage (of Milarepa). There was only a single son from each father; therefore, they were an object of contempt to all. (The burden of) taxes and compulsory labor (corvèe) was very great on them. Very great difficulties arose; they were at the point of giving up their land. It was then that the mother was going to abandon the father. One morning when the mother was

dreaming, a woman appeared who had the signs of ugliness.

Well, now, Listen! Lady White-Ornament (dKar legs ma);
Your true husband is Wisdom Banner;
The Mid la family is not good,
Their lineage is not great - it is ordinary;
He himself is in bad shape;
(However) To you a son with auspicious signs-
A son will soon be born-
Do not give up; be happy (by) staying;

Having said this and having patted her on the head, she disappeared.

This is an account of the paternal family heritage of the Saint.

Thus, the Saint, Milarepa,
Entered the womb of his mother when she herself was exhausted;
During sleep, in a dream, she foresaw great difficulties;
I bow down to the Saint's entry into the womb. (4)

This is the meaning:

Then the Saint, Milarepa, in the womb of the [woman] who was called Nang lam dkar legs ma[12], on the eighth day of the month Sta-pa (?), while he was abiding in the womb of his mother, she herself became very tired and while she

Folio 198:

[12] There are three versions of her name on a single page of the manuscript!

slept she had a particular dream; the dream occured just like this: One evening, with faith, the mother was fording a river both great (wide) and pure. During her crossing of the river, she was blocked; hardship and difficulty[13] without measure arose. Afterwards, however, she managed just barely to escape; thus, a dream-omen occured.

Another evening, the mother [dreamt] that she ascended a great mountain. The ascent of that mountain was accompanied by great hardship and difficulty so that she could not [proceed]; finally, she just barely managed to ascend. Another evening, (she dreamt of) a ladder going upward into the atmosphere - a long ladder that she was ascending.[14] She felt trapped on that ladder by great hardship and difficulty, but finally she just barely managed to get free... [in another dream?] The child of a lioness was being brought forth from the womb of its mother. As he was being brought up and nourished, great hardship and difficulty necessarily occured, etc. [i.e. but finally things turned out well]. It was in just this way that dream omens came to his mother during her pregnancy. Even her experiences during the day-time such as spinning, carrying

[13] dka' thub dang dka' spyad dpag tu med pa. This is the first time in the text that this phrase appears; it will characterize the entire life of Milarepa, for it means hardship and difficulty as much as austerity and penance.

[14] See R. A. Stein, Tibetan Civilization, trans. by J. E. Stapleton Driver. (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1972), p. 48, for the royal mythology of a rope leading up into heaven; the rope (dmu) is to be ascended at the king's death; heaven is the home of his maternal line.

burdens, etc., in every way whatever, she had hardships and ceaseless difficulties. But afterwards, when the labor was done, very pure things were produced. Such things involving hardship and difficulty came about during the time of her pregnancy.

In this way, the ninth month having passed,
in the first half of the tenth month of pregnancy,
on the fifteenth day of the month there were good stars
and planets,
The Lord was born accompanied by signs and portents;
I praise and revere the time of the birth
of the Saint. (5)

This is the meaning: The Saint, in the first half of the tenth lunar month, in the sheep year (lug-gi lo),[15] in the month of the Pleiades (kârtika; October-November), on the fifteenth day of the month, at the time of day when it is warm, a cow was giving birth to a calf; as soon as it was born

Folio 199:

that cow produced two and one-half gallons of creamy milk (in Gung thang?). This, being churned, produced two and one half gallons of butter of Gung thang.(?)

Inside [the house?] they had two and one-half gallons of barley and thought of fermenting beer for the invocation

[15] This would have been 1043 or 1055. The death is said to have been in a monkey year in this rnam thar, 73 years later, which would have been either 1116 or 1128.

of the deities at the birth of the little boy. They brought out the barley which increased to 500 gallons.

(Check this passage : mar ri sa srang bcu tham pa 'gor ba yod pa de/ mar khal lnga ru song ba la songs pa'i ltas bzang po dpag tu med pa dang bcas te bde bar 'khrungs so/ =? The mountain of butter produced filled up ten scales; happiness arose together with the good omen when the 500 gallons of butter were produced.)

At the time of the birth, his father, Shes rab rGyal mtshan, had gone to undertake business in the land of dGun. Someone was sent out to that place to tell the father that he had a son. They told the father: "Yesterday your wife gave birth to a son; you are requested to come up for the naming ceremony." Having smiled, the father said: "Hearing the news now [makes] this a happy report! Thus, I will name the boy right away!" So his son was given the name Happy Report (thos pa dga'). These good omens and happy events occured at the birth of the Saint.

His father protected and cherished him very much;
When his father died, he suffered, being harmed by all;
The mother and children were bereft of everything;
He learned singing so as to obtain alms from all.
I bow down and praise the Saint's time of troubles.

(6) This is the meaning:

The Lord Mila Happy Report, since he was the only son of his father, was very much protected and cherished. He

dwelt in great happiness. After three years, a daughter was also born. She was adorned with the name Peta. Thus, parents and children all dwelt together in happiness and even some enjoyment.

Folio 200

After some years, the father was stricken by a disease of the lungs. It could not be expelled by any means, so he died. All the property was taken on behalf of the father's side of the family; nothing whatever remained for the mother and the two children. Some relatives and neighbors criticized (his) faults to the mother and children. They even carried off much of the mother's property (she had a copy of the Ratnakūṭa Sūtra) (dkon rtsegs gcig). No portion of anything remained for them! Thus the mother and two children lived. At that time, the mother raised the brother and sister by working at the loom, weaving and spinning. After the father's death, their wealth exhausted, they were looked upon with contempt by all the people. They were without something to eat, without clothes to put on; the flesh of mother and the two children was emaciated.

At that time in the place there was a teacher who was a tantrika. He knew how to read and to teach reading. (Mila) went to him as an assistant for the rituals. He provided for his mother and sister with the left over food from the rituals, received as an offering for his reading. Even by this, they were not much benefited.

The Saint learned to sing a song from a bard (<u>glu mkhan</u>). He provided for his mother and sister with the fees from singing, but even that was not enough.[16]

Continuously, all the neighbors and relatives [did the following:] some of them stole; some of them carried things off; some beat [them]. The mother and her two children were not at all happy. These things gave rise in the Saint to an immeasurable sense of renunciation and compassion for the misery apparent in sentient beings.

> Admonished by his mother, he set out east for dBus,
> there to learn from a magician all about the magic
> power of producing hail storms,
> So as to bring down hail on the land of his foes;
> I bow down to the Saint, possessor of great magical
> power. (8)

This is the meaning:

Folio 201

At that time, the so-called Mid la 'Happy Report', on a street in the village was just trying to obtain fees for his singing. It happened that his mother met her son there with tears coming from her eyes. She said: "Such a son was born to me! You are unable to harm your hated enemies even with the point of a needle! You cannot benefit your beloved family with so much as the tip of a hair! What a rotten son has been born to Mid la Shes rab rGyal mtshan! Even now, we - mother and children - are beaten up; we have been deprived

[16] Verse 7 should be quoted here.

of whatever we have in the house. What benefit is there in this singing of yours?" Saying this, she tossed about rocks and dirt. Mid la Happy Report went (fled?) inside. Along with (?) the fees he got from reading and from singing, and a sack of roasted barley and a sack of some barley , etc., he gathered up what few things he had. He was beaten by his mother and sister (?). They pulled the hairs on the back of his head. [mgo ni zho thum bzin btang 'dug](?)

On that occasion, the mother and children consulted. The mother said: "Now, for us, mother and children, there is no hope[17] (daybreak) for us in this life, in this place. There is no other means (for us). You, my son, hasten to dBus to learn magic. It would be desirable to pay back these people with sickness of heart,"- so she said. Having made this speech, she resolved (on a course of action). Accompanied by a few friends, she sold the field that was her property; she bought a sorrel-colored horse named Te la grags. Furthermore, she made up a sack of the fees and goods earned by (?) the mother and children; he went off carrying the sack to dBus. His mother and sister went to see him off; they arrived at Pal ma Glorious-Plain. She offered her son her love; she gave him much advice. He went off, together with many traders who had come from Khams.

[17] Already on folio 197, above, she had been prepared to abandon her husband and the town of rTsa, even before Mila's birth.

Then he arrived in dBus and he asked everyone [to tell him] who was a great magician.

Folio 202

Near Yar Lung sgur po, there was no one greater than G.yu ston Khro rgyal ba the sorcerer. [Mila] went from Kha rag to Yar Lung. He met G.yu ston Khro rgyal and came before him. He offered the dark brown horse and its burden [of goods]. He gave an exact account of his former sufferings, requesting the sorcerer to be so kind as to take an interest in him and provide him with both provisions and the teachings of magic power. The sorcerer replied: "Other suppliants have offered vast amounts such as the Perfection of Wisdom in One Hundred Thousand Lines (mdo sde 'bum), but you alone have offered all you have. You have tasted affliction, therefore you must abide [here] one year, whereupon I will quickly bestow the teachings of magic. I will provide whatever you need to succeed in the sorcery of hailstorms, etc."

Then Mila Happy-Report shed tears, having again given a full account of the afflictions that had occured to his mother and her children; his heart was seized with such [grief]! G.yu ston also shed tears; "Alas, no one more pitiable than you has previously come before me; you really need magic power- I speak from my heart. I have a friend named SÑing Khro rgyal who is a greater sorcerer than I; he is a Bon po. This Bonpo and I have exchanged magical

teachings for we are close friends.[18] I obtained the teachings on the magical production of hailstorms from him without difficulty. I have an oath not to pass this knowledge on to others. Therefore, go to request this from him."

He gave [Mila] a white mare loaded with roots used for dyeing; [Mila] went before the Bonpo, offered the horse and the pigment and re-told the story of his many afflictions.
Folio 203

Then he asked him, out of compassion, to transmit (btag 'tshal?) the teachings of magic. The Bon po said: "Among the many people who have come before me for this technique, no one has come who has previously suffered as much as you have." And he, too, began to weep. Then he transmitted the technique of magic to Mila Happy-Report and to his own son.

They were enclosed so as to perform the [fearsome] rite of propitiation.[19] They recited mantras [zlas pa] for a month; signs that the magic had taken effect completely began to appear. At the same time, in his native village, having directed his power against the enemies who had hated his mother and sister, within three days this power was unleashed on them. Among those who hated them, the son of his uncle, G.yu rGyal, was about to be married. A group of

[18] ITB, pp. 399-407, esp. 406 for rapport between Bonpo and rNing ma pa practitioners.

[19] See Dan Martin: "The Early education of Milarepa" The Journal of the Tibet Society 2 (1982): 53-76 for a thorough investigation of current knowledge on these teachers and their methods.

people was gathered for the feast and the house [suddenly] fell on them unaware. Twenty-five (Ñi shu rtsa lnga) of those who had shown hatred for mother and children, the inimical fathers and sons died. Those who did not die were possessed by demons.

"It was I, Mila Happy-Report, who unleashed this! You have become food suitable for the demons! All those possessed by demons are to die!"

In summary, all this was done to the family of his enemies; it came about that one old lady did not die. Thus it came about that the story was passed along and reached dBus. Then the Bonpo said: "My son, it was good for you to compel me; offer a goat in thanks to my deity. There only remains one old lady; so, we are satisfied. It would be easy to kill her too!"

Then the people of rTsa [and] Ron pa deliberated, saying: "It is not worth it to kill these two, the mother and the daughter, but it is expedient to kill him!" To do this, they hired three men. After making preparations, they sent them to kill Mid la Happy Report.

Folio 204

Then there arrived a yogin [at the home of] the mother and the sister; he offered to convey a message to Mila. The news they sent in a letter was: "Son, you are successful. By the force of your power, all our enemies here have died. We obtained a small parcel of things and also a small quantity of provisions. We are now [da rung] sending to you

the provisions thus obtained. Do not come back to our town. Make hail against the townfolk! Men have gone to kill you. Be attentive to that also!" This was the message they sent. Then the yogin went quickly to dBus, where he met Mila Happy Report and passed on the aforementioned messages. Mila Happy Report was satisfied. He rewarded the yogin with food, who returned to Yar log [yar log 'ongs]. On the road he met the men who were sent to kill Mila. He engaged them in conversation; [he persuaded] them that Mila had escaped from their plan to kill him [by foreseeing it?]; knowing [i.e. believing, rig nas] this, they returned [to the village]. [Or: Having known the plan, he had escaped being killed by them; they therefore returned. Or: Thinking (rig nas) that their victim (gsod bya) had escaped, they returned.]

Then Mila Happy Report went to see the Bonpo. He requested him to be so kind as to help him unleash a hailstorm on the town of his enemies. The Bonpo said: "I have a technique for doing it. Entrust yourself to me. I will show you."

Thus, the technique of causing hailstorms was taught. It took a month to accomplish. They recited mantras and inserted a powder into a [boiling] substance[20]. This gave rise to violent thunder, etc. - all the omens. Hail arrived at the town of rTsa pa in Gung Thang. The entire

[20] For information on weather-making magic in Tibet, see René de Nebesky-Wojkowitz, Oracles and Demons of Tibet (The Hague: Mouton & Co., 1956), pp. 465-466; 467-480; 485.

harvest of nearly ripe ears of barley- all of it - was smashed by the fall of hail. The [hail] was sent to pass over the other mountains and streams. In fact, this kind of [destructive] hail fell for many years and all the enemies were overthrown. In brief, by these deeds, Mila Happy Report

Folio 205

- having gone to dBus, learned the techniques of [destructive] magic.

A sense of revulsion and of renunciation arose
[in him], because of his [use] of the magic
power of destruction and hail.
He remembered the sacred Dharma of the Holy One
[<u>dam pa'i</u>] and devout faith grew within him;
He relied upon a holy lama, G.yu Thog Lha dGa';
I bow down to the prophecy about Saint Marpa. (9)

And this is the explication:

The Lord Mila Happy Report destroyed many people by his magic and destroyed fields with hail, thus causing great misery and harm to beings. Immeasurable grief and penitence grew within him. He went before Lama G.yu Thog Lha dGa', saying:

"On my own, I asked you, my Guru, for the two teachings on hail and sorcery, in which I have succeeded. By relying on that power [those techniques] I have heaped up an immense negative karma by having caused the death of sentient beings. At dawn this morning, immeasurable grief arose [in

me]. Now I offer a confession of all my sins. Please, holy Lama, consider granting me a Doctrine [chos] [producing] sacred Buddhahood in one body, in one lifetime." Thus he supplicated. The Lama said: "Very well! I have many teachings by which you can become a Buddha in one life in one body, but I cannot be your Guru. In Upper Nang there resides a holy, perfected Lama named 'Bre sTon Lha dGa'. Go there to request the holy Doctrine."

Both he and the Bon po furnished [Mila] with many provisions for Dharma [practice]. He went to Upper Nang and met Lama 'Bre sTon Lha dGa', telling him all that he had previously done. The Lama said: "My son, you are a very great sinner. Practising the method of rDzogs-chen[21] under my guidence in the morning, you can realize Buddhahood that morning; learning it in the evening, you become a Buddha that evening. Overcoming all sin,

Folio 206

[21] Dan Martin, op. cit., pp. 61-62, for a translation of Rang Byung rDo rJe's interpretation of this encounter in greater detail. rDzogs chen is discussed in Samten G. Karmay "A Discussion on the Doctrinal Position of rDzogs Chen from the 10th to the 13th centuries", Journal Asiatique (T. CCLXIII): 147-156. Also: W. Y. Evans-Wentz, ed. The Tibetan Book of the Great Liberation (London: Oxford University Press, 1968), pp. 202-240 "The Seeing of Reality." Also: Brian C. Beresford, ed. The Dzog Chen Preliminary Practice of the Innermost Essence, the Long chen Nying thig Ngon dro with original Tibetan root text composed by the Knowledge-Bearer Jig me Ling pa (1729-1798), trans. by Tulku Thondup. (Dharamsala: LTWA, 1982). And: Namkhai Norbu and Kennard Lipman, trans. Mañjuśrīmītra: Primordial Experience, An Introduction to rDzogs-Chen Meditation. (Boulder and London: Shambhala, 1987).

you can become a Buddha in one body, in one lifetime; I will teach you this holy Dharma practice."

Mila was very delighted with that. He listened to the Teaching and [tried] to practice. But the power descending through the Lineage had no effect [Ladakhi usage: skye ru ma 'dod] . He therefore supplicated the Lama, who said: "How many sins have you heaped up?" Mila replied: "Previously I have sinned using magic power, hail, etc." He retold the story in detail.

The Lama said: "I had no idea that you had so much sin! How can I be your spiritual guide?"[22] And he, too, shed many tears. "Now, my son, the Lama who is going to be your spiritual guide is a direct disciple of the great Saint Nâropa, named Marpa Lotsawa[23], who dwells in Lho Brag. Go to him and ask for Dharma [teachings]. He is capable [thub pa] of being your spiritual guide. I too will go to him for Dharma; I will take you to him." Thus the teacher and the disciple set out together.

Then, on the way, Mila Happy Report asked Lama 'Bre ston: "What is Lama Marpa like? What Doctrine does he know? What Guru did he serve? What virtues does he possess?" The Lama expounded the virtues and the biography [rnam par thar pa] of Lama Marpa in detail. Mila Happy Report, hearing such virtue on the part of the Lama, and

22 See Thurman, trans., Vimalakîrtinirdeśa, p. 46. Wisdom and skill in liberative technique is necessary.

23 Tibetan text: lo tstsha [ba], which means `the translator.'

trusting in it (rten nas), experienced limitless [inner] devotion and made many prostrations toward the place where Marpa dwelt. He also bowed to Lama 'Bre ston, placing his feet on his own head.[24] "Holy Lama, please consider accepting me and acting as my spiritual guide. It would be very kind of you!" Thus he supplicated.

By these deeds, Mila Happy Report [burdened by] the accumulated karma [of evil deeds done] by the power of sorcery and hail, experienced renunciation

Folio 207

and generated immense devotion toward his Guru.

He came before Marpa to ask for the Dharma along
with provisions;
The Saint was cared for by the compassionate Lady;
For the sake of Dharma, which is hard to acquire,
The Saint performed labors;
I bow down to the Saint as he performs hard labor!
(10)

This is the explication:

Then Lord Mila Happy Report, having shown reverence to ['Bre ston], [intended] to go on, [but] Lama 'Bre ston completely fainted, and remained stupefied. Thus, Mila Happy Report set out for the presence of Lama Marpa [on his

[24] Note that this suggests one purpose of a rnam thar, which is to reawaken roots of virtue and vows from former lives that conduce toward the auspicious encounter of Guru and disciple. Placing the feet of a Guru on one's head is a type of Guru devotion. In fact the whole passage suggests the climate of Guru-yoga, for Mila directs his devotion not only to Marpa, but also to 'Bre ston.

own]. He arrived at Lho Brag and went up toward Marpa's dwelling place. He met three tantrikas, the master and two servants, plowing a hard, dried-out field. [He asked them]: "In this territory there is a Lama named Marpa bLo gros, a genuine heart-son disciple of the Holy Guru Glorious Nâropa. Where is his dwelling place?"

The elder tantrika replied: "I am going to seek an audience [with him]. You yourself [should] finish this plowing." He then went off within [inside the house].

Mila carefully plowed [the field]. After a little while, having finished the ploughing he sat down and waited. From inside, he was invited to come up; having been called, he went inside. There the tantrika who had been plowing was sitting on a rug, clothed in a yellow gown. He was cleaning the dirt from his face. [When they] met, he was seated with a rather serious look on his face. Mila pondered: "A little while ago, this was the very same one who was doing the ploughing."[25] As he reflected, he did many

25 The ability to recognize the Guru as Buddha in all circumstances of the daily life of a disciple is an essential aspect of Guru-yoga and as such an essential indication of the likelihood of success on the part of the disciple. See p. 142-3, Lamotte trans. of Vimalakîrti. Śâriputra is told that the correct way to meditate is not to manifest body or mind in the triple world, and not to exit from the nirodha-samâpatti, but to manifest ordinary attitudes...and not to renounce spiritual characters already obtained, but to manifest [all] the characters of a pṛthagjana. sGampopa's biography of Marpa says: "Although the great translator seemed always to abide without meditating, he remained undisturbed, always in samâdhi. He realized the true continuum of reality (dharmatâ)." (cf. BA, p. 404).

prostrations. Having offered something as a kind of present,

Folio 208

he recounted in detail his former deeds. "I heard of your fame, o Lama, and I come before you supplicating your kind consideration. Please grant me both the Dharma and provisions [for study], in your kindness, since I yearn to know." Marpa said: "If you want provisions, no teachings; if you want teachings, no provisions. I bestow only one, not both! You yourself must choose."[26]

Mila replied, "In that case, please, in your compassion, grant me the Dharma. I will provide whatever is necessary by gathering alms."

Marpa said: "In that case you need to perform labor as a fee for the Dharma. Go gather provisions and come right back."

Mila Happy Report went off into the neighborhood that morning, sometimes offering a song (glu); thus he performed his alms rounds. In that neighborhood he found much barley, so he came back carrying a full sack. He offered the barley to the Lama's wife, saying "I will perform whatever service you need, o Lady. Please give me a little of this barley to eat." Thus he supplicated the kind Lady. He exerted himself in the service of the Lady and she cherished him and took care of him.

26 See Thurman trans., Vimalakīrti.: "Reverend Śāriputra, did you come here for the sake of Dharma? Or did you come here for the sake of a chair?" p. 50.

Then the Lama said: "You are called Mila Happy Report. It is said that you have performed mighty sorcery. If my enemy comes against me in the morning you are to slay him that morning with sorcery."[27]

"Great Sorcerer, now I am going to build a fort named Srog mkhar skya bo. You are to carry all the stones as your fee for the Dharma."

For this [project] Mila went down in the morning

Folio 209

and exerted himself for a long time, [carrying] stones; a sore appeared on his back. Then, the Lady went before Marpa and asked: "Let him rest until the sore on his back is healed." The Lama said: "Let him now carry the load of stone on his right shoulder." And so he did, for a long time. And a sore appeared on the right shoulder also. The Lady made the same request as before, but the Lama said: "Let him now carry the load on the left shoulder." So he exerted himself at this labor for a long time and a sore also broke out on the left shoulder. From carrying rocks, all three sores broke out. But not one word of Dharma teaching was bestowed.

The Lady furnished him with a round lump of butter and a carcass of meat. She said: "Use this as an initiation fee. This evening someone is going to be initiated. You, too, should go in to the rite of initiation."

[27] See BA, pp. 414-415, for another sorcerer disciple of Marpa.

Lama Mila entered to be initiated and offered the two [items]. [Marpa] looked them over carefully. [Then he said]: "This is the very meat that was given to me as a gift by a devout patron; and this butter is the same butter offered by the patroness Tho pe mo! Having stolen my meat and butter, you have [dared to] ask for an initiation!" He dragged (sñags? sñeg?) [Mila] Happy Report by the hair and threw him out. He was not admitted to the initiation.

The Lady said: "He suffered immensely doing that work [for you]; he carried rock on his back until sores broke out. Who would have done such a thing - to produce a sore on a man[28]? He is not a beast of burden. Bestow the Dharma on him now, at this time. It would be better to let him leave to go wherever he may go if the Dharma [is not to be] completely transmitted [at this time]. It is not he who is asking you; it is I myself. [You should] know! I provided him with the meat and butter and advised him to come to you for the Dharma,

Folio 210

[but] you would not bestow it."

The Lama said: "If he desires the Dharma, let him quickly build this fort."

"How can he do it? Now there are many sores!"

28 mi la: a possible pun?

"Just as one makes a sore-ring for a beast of burden, make a sore-ring on his back so he can carry rocks. Then I will consider his request." Thus the Lama directed.

"He desires the holy Dharma; he needs to cleanse away the defilements of karma; thus he is useful to me."
[so that nothing enters the wounds...? so btab nas...]

She made a sore-ring and he transported the rock with effort. His hands and feet became very weak [ña ris chu shags su?]; because of the sores, the flesh of his body was exhausted with pain. He completed the fort with nine storeys named `sKu mKhar skya bo.'

These are the deeds Mila Happy Report did, serving the Lama endowed with holiness, performing work according to the Lama's orders, with difficulties without measure.

[The Lama], though revered, would not listen [to his request] for the holy Dharma;
The Lady could not prevail upon [him] to admit [Mila] to the Doctrine;
She said: rNgog [will] bestow all the profound Siddha Dharma (sgrubs zab mo'i chos kun gnang);
I bow down to his success in learning [the Dharma].
(11)

This is the exposition:

Mila Happy Report, in this way, through penance and difficulty, succeeded with the Lady as his benefactress. Since [Marpa] did not wish to bestow even a word of Dharma, the Lady out of kindness now [recommended] a course of

action. Since the Dharma was not being bestowed at all, he was sick at heart. She gave him a portion of goods and he went before the Dharma Rock-[cave] of rNgog to request the Dharma in great earnest.

Folio 211

She secretly provided [Mila] with a bit of food and provisions and a hair from the head of glorious Nâropa. She said: "Hurry so as to ask for the Dharma; [Marpa has been unwilling from the start to bestow it. Both Lamas can do it; since Marpa has been putting off giving you the teachings, go to him." So Mila Happy Report went before the Lama and asked to be allowed to the get the Dharma from Lama rNgog. He went quickly and supplicated.](?)

The Lama said: "O my good man, you are unhappy because I have not bestowed the Dharma. Nâropa Panchen granted me the profound essence of many oral instructions, so you had better stay here [with me]!"

Once more, Mila went away in a hurry. He then quickly returned before the Lama and made respectful supplication, but the [teachings] were not granted. He made prostrations. The Lama said [to the Lady]: "Lady, Lady, you gave Happy Report some advice on your own. Your words were unsuccessful." Then he struck [Mila], kicked him, scolded him, and sent him away. The Lama was angry.

"O Mother, did you provide him with a portion of provisions?"

"I did not send any provisions he requested."

"O no? You did send them, so that Happy Report could go asking for Dharma from another person. It is not permitted to grant him my provisions." Then Marpa chased her (?) away. He took back all the provisions that the Lady had given. He flung a cushion (phyi sgan sngas) and went out.

Happy Report set up [his pack] and went before rNgog chos kyi rdo rje. He met the Lama. With faith, he reverently bowed. He inquired about his health. rNgog said: "My Lama Marpa Lotsawa had a special type of salute.

Folio 212

As for you, where do you come from?"

Mila responded: "I myself come from Lama Marpa Lho Brag Pa."

Lama rNgog said: "Well, then, you must be the one from his Presence who is named Mila Happy Report." "Yes, I am the one named Happy Report. I have been sent to you by the Lady with this letter, this hair of glorious Nâropa, and this offering of a bit of food [piece of cloth?] Please consider bestowing the Dharma that comes down to us from Marpa and the lineage."

Lama rNgog replied: "If such is the command of the Lady, [so be it]; I must certainly teach you so as to manifest the Doctrine. But before teaching you...

I have an enemy. Cast hail upon him and then I will teach you Dharma."

In this way, Happy Report was accepted [and granted] the oral teachings. An assembly of Dol was gathered. Lama rNgog carried a sheep in order to repay the [destroyer-spirits?]. In the middle of the field the destructive hail was unleashed. The hail fell. [Or: He put the hail-producing magical substance (an amulet) in the middle of a field.] It was a severe hailstorm. Many houses of that land were destroyed. All the harvest, too, was wrecked. All the people suffered devastation. Then, he went home. The corpses of the birds killed by the hail were all gathered together right in front of him. (? A basket was full of them.) As measureless sorrow arose in him, he pondered: "In order to obtain the Dharma - on account of what I have done - in order to attain complete Buddhahood in one life, I have to accumulate evil deeds like this!" So he thought and wept. Lama rNgog said: "Did you unleash the hail? Did it arrive?"

"A very severe hailstorm was cast upon them; many houses of the town were destroyed; the whole harvest was levelled; all the people came to grief. On land and in the sky over the place, all sentient beings were killed.

Folio 213

I came to the Lama in order to attain Buddhahood. As a result of this, I have accumulated hellish deeds!" He emptied his <u>chu ba</u>, placing the corpses of the birds [killed] by magic before the Lama. (?) Weeping, he sat down. The wife of Lama rNgog said again and again "Do not

weep, Mila." Lama rNgog said: "Do not weep, my son; you need not weep. All these sins do not pursue you; the profound Doctrine for attaining Buddhahood in one lifetime and in one body outshines [sin]. I now must give you the teachings." He took an oath (sñing bzhes) [(?) being engaged in the Dharma of the Middle Way...or: Title of a text?]

Then at that time, the permission given prior to the empowerment of the Lady Nairâtmyâ was granted. From the distorted path of a great sinner, [he took up] the meaningful path of skillful means, receiving the transmission of the Doctrine of the Noble Ones. The immeasurably profound Doctrine having been bestowed many times [mang du], and with provisions provided by the Lama and his wife, he was enclosed in a cavern and the opening was sealed with clay. There he dwelt for one year in pursuit of spiritual attainment; realization did not arise - merely a slight experience occured.[29]

Under these circumstances, Mila Happy Report met Lama rNgog and requested the profound Doctrine.

The Master [rNgog] and his disciple went together

Before Marpa-

Since his defiled deeds had been exhausted, he

[29] But at least some experience occured, unlike under 'Bre ston. The biography clearly indicates that there are gradations of efficacy in the teachings available, depending on the skillful liberative techniques of the Guru, the special power of particular lineages, and the capabilities and merits of the disciple.

was now a worthy vessel [in which to pour] spiritual teachings;

He became a master of all the Dharma teachings;

I bow down and praise the prophecy[30] [lung du stan] about the Saint. (12)

This is the exposition:

Then Lama rNgog said to Mila Happy-Report when he had finished his practice: "Now the house of the Lama, `Turquoise Roof' (sKu mKhar dGu Thog) is finished and I am going to bring offerings to him [Marpa]. You, too, should come along." He set forth measureless goods both worldly and religious as offerings and Master and disciple went to the gathering.

Folio 214

Then, Lama Mila went on ahead, met and saluted the Lady, and inquired about her health. She was very delighted, and grasped Mila's hands. He placed her feet [in homage] on his head. He also went before the Lama, greeted him and inquired about his health. The Lama, very delighted, asked: "Have you received the teachings?" Mila told him the instructions he had received in detail. "Very

30 Marpa's prophecy of Mila's eventual attainment of Buddhahood. A song sung by Nâropa to Marpa at Phullahari (see Life of Marpa, p. 89): byang phyogs mun pa'i smag rum na//gangs la ñi ma shar ba bzhin// thos pa dga' zhes bya ba yi// mi la khyod la phyag 'tshal lo// Comment by Losang Jamspal: The realization of Marpa and Mila is considered to have been the same, but because of Marpa's outer activities, many disciples would lose faith in him. But Mila's would not, so the latter's practice would be more effective than Marpa's in training disciples.

well," he replied. Then Lama rNgog arrived. He offered many generous gifts. All the masters and students were approaching [Marpa] at that time.

The Lama said to Lama rNgog: "Did you bestow the Dharma on Mila?" He replied: "I gave him the teachings." Marpa said: "Very well, very good. As of last year, I had not granted Mila the teachings. I was not kind to him. In his mental continuum were immeasurable sin and defilement. In order to cleanse these, I used tilling the soil, erecting the fort, etc., as a form of service."

"In general Mila, you possess a worthy vessel that is, however, impure. The vessel has to be worthy [to receive] the oral instructions. Your previous sins are now completely cleansed. Thus, it will be sufficient for you to practice [in accordance with] the oral teachings in the four preliminary merit-producing practices.[31] Stay with me so that I may bestow on you that which is needed." Before the disciples, the Lama said:

"Now this time of [one] year is very serious (dog?). He is to withdraw into solitude, not seeing anyone, for the period of six months. He will withdraw from all other persons." He bestowed all the Doctrine on Mila the way one pours into a flask; thus he was granted the initiation and the oral instructions on Bodhicitta [sems skyed= bodhicittotpada]. The necessary teachings were entirely

[31] Judith Hanson, trans. The Torch of Certainty by Jamgon Kongtrul. (Boulder and London: Shambhala, 1977) explains the `Four Special Foundations' practice in detail.

complete as soon as he had requested them. "Now all you need is practice and experience [of results].

Folio 215

In general, to reach attainment one needs three years of practice for experience to appear." Mila said: "In that case, I should perform such practices in my own country where there are many solitary places [where dwelt?] great perfected ones. Now it would be suitable to show me how to remove these obstacles and obtain spiritual progress in my mind."

The Lama said: "This is suitable. In addition, I will bestow the instructions for removing obstacles and granting spiritual progress. I am one of the foremost disciples of Nāropa; I studied with thirteen learned Lamas for twenty years; all was received, nothing was held back. [All] was taken into the center of my heart." Mila obtained these oral instructions.

Then [Mila] went to Lama rNgog Chos kyi rdo rje; he compared the [true] Dharma-view with [mere] opinion and theory, [but] he did not possess more than Mila. A comparison of the profound oral instructions of Dharma, of ejection of consciousness, and in time and space ('pho ba'i gnas skabs na?[32]), shows that rNgog was worthy and profound,

[32] Chandra Das p. 751 gives for gnas skabs: avasara, avasthā = temporal state, opportunity. Lokesh Chandra: adhikāra, daśā, mātra, etc.

but only to a lesser extent; he was not superior to Mila[33]. Comparing meditation experience there was no one more excellent than Mila. Among Lord Marpa's principal sons, such as Mila (der mid la'i thugs dgongs la?) and rNgog chos kyi rdo rje, the inner circle became very great. None of the precepts were lacking [among them]. (?) Their aim and purpose was unsurpassed, entirely on account of the Doctrine he carefully bestowed. To Lord Marpa Lho Brag pa be limitless honor! For himself, immeasurable delight and happiness arose.

These things were done by the Saint Mila, relying on the great Lord Marpa Lho Brag pa when he became the receptacle of the oral instructions, having exhausted all obscurations[34]; he received in his mind all the Dharma instructions and arrived at his goal [or: Having in his heart all the doctrine of the Hearing Lineage, he arrived at the goal.]

[33] They were both 'Saints' but their abilities as Gurus differed in degree and extent. This applies both to knowledge of Doctrine and ability to guide disciples.

[34] Definition of an Arhat, corresponding to the irreversible Bodhisattva (Cf. Abhidharmasamuccaya of Asaṅga, etc.). Tibetan: las sgrib thams cad zad nas.

Part III

Chapter 10 The Biography of Milarepa by rGyal Thang pa

Folio 216

The Saint Mila possessed the essence of the
oral instructions;
Having obtained the entire Dharma,
he remembered his mother and sister;
He went before the Guru to ask permission to return to
his homeland.
I bow down to the Saint's obtaining permission
to go. (13)

This is the exposition:

When Mila Happy Report had perfectly received all the teachings and oral instructions, he knew all the essentials [about] dispelling obstacles and obtaining spiritual progress, and so forth. [After] three years of practice, as the Dharma began to flower, he wished to be permitted to go in person to his own land and to the holy places [gnas chen rnams]; for a long time he had not been to his homeland.

Out of compassion, he wanted [to see] his mother, sister, and so forth. He went before the Lama. "O precious Guru, relying on your strong and enduring compassion, I who had accumulated all manner of evil have been made a pure vessel for receiving the entire Dharma-instructions just as [fluid] is poured into a vessel. I know all the essentials of removing obstacles and [acquiring] spiritual progress. I am now asking, since the flower of the Dharma has begun to

blossom, so as to attain the height of realization, to go to my own country, a holy place. I will practice until siddhi is attained. Please be kind to me so that I may come to meet the Father-Mother Guru on a particular occasion [in the future]."

The Lama said: "How is it that you are speaking thus? (bu khyod rang ji ltar zer ba bzhin) All the instructions are completed. You have been taught the essentials of removing obstacles to make spiritual progress, and so forth. All sinful karma has been purified. [You must do] as I did for so long a time (?). You must meditate until [bar du] in general, you have attained siddhi as the flowering of my teachings. In particular, by practicing for three years in solitude you will attain what was at first unobtainable. You must come to meet me on certain occasions.[1] Now, go in haste to your homeland." Thus Mila decided to return to his homeland and thus he received permission.

Folio 217

These are the facts about Mila Happy Report who having fully acquired the entire Dharma of the oral instructions, asked for permission to visit his homeland, in order to attain [or: to become an attainer (thob po) of siddhi].

Thus, when he received permission,
On the point of departure,
He asked a blessing of his spiritual parents,
Bowing down to them;

[1] But this does not occur.

Seven times he devoutly placed his head at the
feet of the Lady;
I bow down to the Saint overcome with faith.
(14)

This is the explication:

Then, Lord Mila Happy Report, properly obtained permission from his Guru in order to return to his homeland; His Parent Gurus, provided him with the Dharma and requisities for the journey; as he was about to set forth up country, Mila went to his Parent Gurus with a small gift.

Lama Marpa Lho Brag pa said: " You, O Mila Happy Report, are someone with great force in the accumulation of karma; you are one whose devotion to the Guru is great; you are one who has a great dose of courage; all the instructions of my Guru are entirely given [to you]; take up, then, the paternal line of the bKa' brgyud pas; undertake [the task] of a teacher of the practice lineage."

He was thus commissioned as a Master of Dharma by mind to mind transmission [_thugs_ _la_ _thugs_ _sprod_]. Then Mila Happy Report reverently bowed to both mother and father Gurus; he shed tears as he grasped the feet of each of them. He then placed the crown of his head to the feet of the Gurus. He received from the mouth of the Guru the blessing of his mind, not to be separate from him in all things [all circumstances] and all times.

The Lama directed: "O Mila Happy-Report, from time to time, you are to come to meet me." Then the Lady accompanied him a short distance.

Folio 218

"Now, Happy Report, I had a dream [while asleep] [or: a true dream]: it is suitable for you to uphold the foundation of the bKa' brgyud teachings; it is suitable to raise up the victory banner of the practice lineage teachings; it is suitable to use the power to work all manner of wonders [zil gnon; victories?] and miracles [rdzu 'phrul], etc.; it is suitable to accomplish extensively the [salvific] aims of sentient beings; it is suitable to [perform] great deeds of penance and asceticism, until these things happen. These things you must know; now, make haste and go; seek to be happy."[2]

To her, Happy Report said: "I bow down many times to the Lady. I make you my guide in all things and for all time. I make you father and mother, for you have protected me, and not refused compassion. For as long as I possess this body, I am obligated to you who are my greatest benefactress, since the time I was born until I die." Seven

[2] bDag med ma's speech to Milarepa is a good illustration of one of the purposes of a rnam thar. It also expresses something of the vision and spirituality of the bKa' brgyud pa. The lineage of spiritual practice of the Indian Mahâsiddhas is to continue in Tibet; this lineage is destined to spread - it is a missionary enterprise involving the use of signs, miracles, and wonders in the context of Buddhist tantric practice. It is a tradition in continuity with the Mahâyâna, seeking to benefit all beings. It does not avoid difficulties, but seeks to make skillful use of obstacles as a part of the spiritual path.

times he grasped the feet of the Lady and reverenced her. He requested her secret water[3], since she was a non-human wisdom ḍākinī. When they were together or apart, her body [had provided] much kindness[4]. He [therefore] asked her to be inseparable, in her compassion, at all times and in all things.

Having embraced the Lady well, he was very much overcome and wept. Since they had been together a long time, they had much to remember (?); tears fell abundantly from the Lady's [eyes]. "O my son, Happy Report, we are inseparable in all things and for all time [even] when you are away."

Having done these things, Mila Happy Report returned to his homeland. He saluted reverently both ~~the~~ Guru and the Lady, who had kindly bestowed the precepts and instructions. [or: for the prophecy]

Then he went up to Gung Thang and arrived at the
village of rTsa;
His mother having died, he found the field

[3] (gsang chu) Urine? Suggests context of the `secret' abhiṣeka. See also Janice D. Willis, "The Search for Padmacan: A Study in the Interpretation of Tibetan Sacred Biography", The Journal of Religious Studies XIII (Spr. 1985, #1): 66-69. Willis speaks of sgrub chu as nectar/water hidden in sacred caves, but the context is esoteric initiation into a rdzogs rim practice involving a `woman' (=Padma can= one characterized by having a lotus). The water in the rnam thar she is studying turned to sin dhu ra (red color), suggesting menstrual blood. (See fn. 23, ibid.)

[4] Meaning that she fed him while he was with Marpa and also took care of him when he was with rNgog.

untilled [hard and infertile]

Folio 219

and the house caved in;

His sister had been evicted from her own land

Immense sorrow of soul arose.

I bow down to the Saint in whom renunciation arose.

(15)[5]

This is the exposition:

When the Lord Mila Happy report went up to his town, having left the presence of his Guru, on the high road, he had an easy and well-favored journey. Then he arrived in his homeland. His mother was dead. The house was wrecked. His sister had been evicted. Then he went to the door of his home and there arose a sentiment of grief. A house without a master- no wonder it decayed! A mother who has died - no wonder, with no one to care for her! A sister has been evicted from her land - no wonder, without a guardian! He wept much from the core of his being, out of grief for his mother, sister, and property. But as he did this, he reflected that the deeds of incarnate existence in the world are thus, and no wonder! An immense desire for renunciation was born in him. He sang this song[6]:

I bow down to the [lineage] Gurus;

Alas, alas without any essence

[5] The word mgur is missing from the verse here, but not in the opening section of the rnam thar (folio 192).

[6] mgur. The first use of this word in the body of the text.

Without any substance at all, in general,

This is the nature of cyclic existence!

Eternally insubstantial! [rtags shing rtags shing]

Insubstantial, ever changing, ever becoming:

All three: mother, sister, property-

All three of them are insubstantial,

At this time, they are insubstantial;

The essence of yoga is not to desire

[any substance]

[Or: Why don't I seek for the essence

of yoga!?](rnal 'byor sñing po cis mi tshol)

In this way, Mila Happy report looked upon the desolation of his land, his mother, sister, etc. And he came to know the meaning of the insubstantiality of all things.

His sister

Folio 220

Peta heard that the Saint had arrived;

They both met at White Rock Hermitage Cave;

Having been embraced by his sister,

They wept and fainted because of sorrow

(gdung pas);

I bow down to the meeting of the Saint

and his sister. (16) [7]

[7] Note that by now the pattern of the verses is well-established as a devotional exercise in which the author invites the reader to visualize the scene and perform a prostration before it. Compare, for example, the Via Crucis.

This is the exposition:

Then Mila Happy Report went down to his town. He sat in meditation for a few days at the start of the higher ground of the valley of rTsa. Several days passed. One evening in a dream, he saw a field [or: he was ploughing] being plowed by a ploughman, who could not finish it. At that time the dream was an outward manifestation of the inner signs [of spiritual growth]. "I thought it was not appropriate to leave the ploughing incomplete; thus I sang this song:

On the primordial ground-
Like the origin itself-
A pair of two great oxen are yoked[8]
Setting in place the plow of Insight and Skillful Means.
For one who is a ploughman of the mind, who knows how to plough,
Who is fierce and has done the ploughing assiduously-
Though the soil is firm and compact, he succeeds."

He then went to the White Rock Horse Tooth Cave hermitage. "At this place I intend to attain the flower of siddhi by practising for three years in accordance with the instructions of my Guru, in solitude. I will not give a

8 zung 'jug, yuganaddha; to force the citta into the avadhūtī.

thought to, or say a word about, these three: food, clothing, and drink. I will practice all alone in penitence and austerity."

At first, the psychosomatic veins of all bodies obstruct interior energies like water swirling over a dam; the whole body shakes and many obstructions in the veins work against the currents of energy. It is like the waters swirling over a dam. In order to liberate [oneself] the recollected consciousness meditates on the inner vajra in the avadhûtî (central psychosomatic channel)[9]. By meditation, one visualizes the `diamond' as abiding in the avadhûtî, the consciousness is liberated, binding the obstruction of the channels (nâḍî) with the `noose' of vajra.

Folio 221

In this state (gags) of mind, one can confront immeasurable grief, fear, terror, etc., when such obstruct the mind; thus the mind is liberated by meditation and

[9] See the notion of vajra as interior Voidness, with is uncuttable, unburnable, indestructible, etc. in the rnam thar of Vajradhara, folios 11-12. The following comment on the channeling of inner energy is from a teaching given by Tai Situ Rinpoche, a Karma bKa' brgyud pa master: "According to the profound method, you must use the `inner' body in an adequate way, in accord with the physical body. This refers to such exercises as the Six Yogas of Nâropa, in which first one purifies the negative currents to make the veins functional, since some of them have not functioned for a great length of time, others function in an incorrect way; this is like a kind of `cure' for the veins, in which the `inner' body is made functional and in which one needs to learn to perceive everything adequately and to cause the flows to go in positive rather than negative directions." (Italian text translated by the author; text provided by the kindness of Franco and Kristin Pizzi.)

possesses peace, bliss, wisdom, and joy. When fear and terror appear as obstacles, one meditates on gods and goddesses. One is liberated from fearful destinies[10] by following the meditation instructions of fearlessness. Other [obstacles] of whatever type can occur to anyone. Thus, each one is liberated by meditation uniting consciousness and essence. [Being] a liberated person and a defiled person cannot occur simultaneously.

In the peaceful state of this meditation, he abode without eating or drinking, exploring the mind by means of penance and austerity.

His sister Peta, having been evicted, was wandering down towards Sñe nam. She heard that Lord Mila had arrived nearby. She brought nine handfuls of grain and a quantity of cooked food. She met some people [mi da la la] on the way. She said: "I heard that my brother Happy Report, is nearby. Did you see him?" They replied: "A few say they have not seen him. Some people say he is meditating in the mountains at White Rock; perhaps he is!" She went to seek him up towards the mountains. She looked up and there was a cave on a rock; the entry was closed off. There was a man inside. Peta thought: "He must be my brother." She knocked at the entry and spoke with a weak voice. Mila said: "Who is there?" Peta asked him for some sort of signal or word. She thought "The voice is like my

[10] See Tadeusz Skorupski. The Sarvadurgatipariśodhana Tantra: Elimination of All Evil Destinies (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1983), an entire tantra devoted to this goal.

brother's;" weeping, she [recognized] her own elder brother, Happy Report.

Lord Mila Happy Report

Folio 222

thought: "My sister Peta is not dead- she has arrived!" He went to the entryway and rolled away the stone. They met. Both of them embraced and wept for a long time. The sister gave an oral account of her many sorrows since they had parted, while they both wept for grief. "At first, o my brother, mother and daughter were very afflicted. There was no household any more. There was no food. Our mother became rather sick. Even though I strenuously sought to take care of her, it was useless and she died of starvation. I wandered from the town in torment towards Sñe nam. Then I heard that my brother had returned, and I went to meet him right away; at first I did not recognize you."

Lord Mila Happy report said: "Yes, it is I. Even though I dwell without meeting with many people, I do get familiar with them individually. Thus, I certainly [heard what happened]. Our afflicted mother surely [deserves] our compassion, and I thought I would not meet you again. Now we, brother and sister, have the joy of meeting [again]." He then caressed his sister's hand. "Please accept the food I offer to you, my sister. In fact, all the food I have for you is only a bit of powdered nettles. What should I give you?"

His sister said: "It is true, then, that my brother is without anything at all; thus I would like to offer this cooked food and nine handfuls of grain." He crumbled for her some powdered nettles and each offered the other some food for the soup pot; both brother and sister [shared it]. Lord Mila said: "I have occupied this place for six months. I have not been fully fed for that long."

Folio 223

Peta said: O my brother, what difficulties you are enduring!"

That evening, he lay down in the White Rock cave. The next morning she gave him the nine handfuls of grain. "I will go to the village below the fields to seek alms of butter and food. If I receive a suitable offering, I will give it to you."

Thus a month or two passed by and his sister came, leaving behind many offerings. When the portion of powdered nettles and so forth was used up, he encountered considerable difficulties. Thinking that it might be useful to go to gather butter where his aunt was, on the pasture lands, he went. He set out for where his aunt was milking a yak. He asked for alms. The aunt said: "You good-for-nothing! Shameless! So it is indeed true - you have finally turned up. So you need something! You did the deed [of magic]- so what happened to us?!" Thus she abused him exceedingly. She pulled out a tent pole and chased him with it. He fled. Because of his great austerities, he tripped

and fell on a basket used for collecting dung; she caught up with him and thoroughly pummeled him. Still blazing with anger, she turned around. The Saint thought toward her: "Since even going forth for alms is unprofitable, it is better to die."

He went back to White Rock and continued his practice of physical austerity. Then, after a little while, Peta received some excellent dry food having done such work as irrigation, weaving, and carrying daily loads. She offered what she had, including a small pot of fermented drink. "I have searched continuously and found only this. Other peoples' Dharma practice benefits self and

Folio 224

others, but my brother's Dharma practice makes trouble for himself and for us! It is not so good! It would now be better to give up this Dharma practice." Mila replied: "One needs to be able to give up body and life to practice Dharma. My Dharma practice is not mistaken, - just wait and see!" He did not heed her advice.

Then Peta, seeing her brother Mila Happy-Report without clothes, possessing only the torn sheepskin blanket of a dead beggar, thought: "I will make my brother something to wear." She wandered off to the town. At that occasion, a Bon po named Dar po had assembled the offerings and ritual objects for removing evil influences. Peta gathered these

things, including the colored yarn[11] in a skein, making a ball of thread and two pieces of cloth [from the discarded ritual objects]. She brought along some of the left overs from the feast, and went before Milarepa. She suggested that he wear the two pieces of cloth that she had assembled, offering them with the left over food. Mila said: "I am satisfied with my garments. This is a waste of time that is harmful to one's practice. Neither skin nor bone needs a covering, so why should you go to any trouble for my sake? Is it that your mind is troubled because I go without?" He then cut the two pieces into little [unrelated?] shapes for his loins and wrapped it around his waist. He made use of the things she collected for food. He said: "So you think you are more of a yogin than I?" Having put up with these difficulties, he shut the door and resumed meditation.

Then, after a while, at a certain time, one day a little understanding regarding the illusion body and the mystic heat arose. At night, he had a small experience of the appearance of light in a dream.

Folio 225

In short, some food in the belly gives rise to spiritual experience![12] Then Mila Happy-Report was content and energetic, thanks to the small amount of beer offered him by Peta. Another time she came to offer some provisions

[11] See Nebesky-Wojkowitz, op.cit, pp. 459-461, use of thread crosses, etc.

[12] See Life of Marpa, p. 150: "Meat and liquor expand nâdî, prâna, and bindu."

and other things; he asked her for some more beer, because it delighted him. He acted happy and clear-headed, and sang this song:

Not able, o Peta [to bear] the sorrow of life,
[I went] to White Rock Peak, high in the sky;
The hermitage in the middle of the Sky-Cave;
Above, the purple cloud of the south floats by,
Below, the vulture hawk breaks the fowler's net,
In the middle, beasts of prey disport themselves;
This is my place of solitude!
I, the yogin Mila, say so!
Happy, delighted in mind, delighted in illusion's
body,
Happy destiny! I am without encumbrances,
Happy, full of fortitude, free from fear-
Happy, possessing the non-dual view of things,
Happy, in meditative equipoise without torpor,
Happy, I am Mila the yogin, a body made of mind!
Sister Peta, you are my patron and comfort;
[Why] aren't you in haste to practice meditation
in solitude?

Peta said: "How can you be joyful when there is unhappiness in the family? We have nothing to eat! We are completely without property! Your happiness has no value for me! Being obliged to go out gathering alms is [in itself] a good reason to be unhappy!" Happy-Report replied: "We may dedicate our hearts to the Three Jewels! Though endless

misfortunes come to us, we shall be without reproach. Now be off!" Then Peta went down toward the town to seek alms.

Then the Saint abode in meditation continuously [bshar nas = clarifying the mind as one meditates], on the spot where he met his sister, practicing his [usual] austerities.

A group of hunters came along.

Folio 226

They asked if Peta was carrying any portions of food, or if there were any books to carry off. [Since there was nothing] they beat up Lord Mila. Mila explained the Buddhist Doctrine on the cause and effect of karma to these hunters. "This is how great evils come about. One should not act like this - there is future merit [to be lost or gained.]" They replied: "What can be done [to gain] this so-called great merit?"

Mila said to them: "A great meditator like me is not inclined to steal even a blade of grass. If you think like that, you will get great merit." They replied: "Fine. We will think as you do." Lord Mila just sat there, hungry and mute. [ltogs kug tu] They moved him around, lifting him up high in a tree. From that spot, they suspended him over a precipice. They gave him a hard time! But they did not acquire the guilt of an evil deed. He told them about accumulating merit, and so forth.

They said: "Well then, if we do this, to whom is the sin attributed, and what is this so-called great merit?" He replied: "It is great merit indeed to offer supplications

to the Three Jewels." They said: "Then we want to pray some more!" Each of them poured dust into the mouth of Lord Mila, which was gaping wide open, and each made a request. Then they did it a second and a third time. As they did this, they supplicated. In brief, this was how these hunters caused the Saint difficulties. But, fearing him, for a long time they provided service to Peta, giving her portions of grain and excellent food, as offerings.

Mila said: "Having resided here for three years, I have been provided for by you and have been offered what little water and supplies [I need]. Now you [Peta] may always have my provisions and there is no longer any need to gather alms. You have remained here until you had no flesh on your body and have become exhausted.

Folio 227

I will not remain in this place; I will go up to a hermitage [in the mountains]. You yourself should abide here and take care [bsos gcig] of yourself on whatever you get. In the future we, brother and sister, will meet again and converse in detail." Then Peta said: "Up until now, I have had no closer relation than you, my brother."

Then he went up through the town.

These things occurred when Mila went back to his home town. Immeasurable compassion arose in him by means of his having taken up the practice of austerity and asceticism.

In this life, he meditated in equanimity,

And practised austerities in the six meditation caves,

Including Ling nga, and others;

All alone, he planted the victory banner of spiritual practice;

I bow down to the Saint, perfected in his asceticism.

(17)

This is the explication.

Then Mila Happy Report meditated and practiced this type of austerity at the following places, caves, and hermitages (and at others as well): Red Rock Linga Cave, Smin rgyud grib ma Cave, rKyang dpal nam kha'i Cave, Rag ma byang chub Cave, etc.

First, at Red Rock Linga Cave, where he went to meditate, he had only nettles for provisions and nothing else [men gcig dang med]. At that time, he purified the illusory body [sgyu lus] in the daytime, and at night he worked on the clear-light meditation. At that time, no matter what occurred in his practice of austerities (physical yoga, haṭha yoga)

Folio 228

he kept to a diet of nettles. Even his body took on the green color of nettles.

After a long time, Peta came, bringing along a half peck of parched barley, and butter packed in skins. She saw the renunciate's body, colored all over like the green of nettles, and she thought: "My brother is without anything to eat- this is the reason for this condition. That is why he is this color - he looks like a dead man." So she

thought, and she wept many tears. Then she thought to boil some cold water for soup. But when [Mila] picked up the pot, he could not hold it in his hand- it slipped away and [broke] and a disk of dried food shaped like the pot came out. [The disk] rolled around and down the mountain. Many people heard that this had happened. Some heard about it and wept ['chi ma shor], and for some, faith arose.[13] Peta went down to the village for him. He dwelt by himself, alone, meditating.

To his cave came men of Sñe nam who had gathered the feathers of many eagles. Having seen the green color of the body of Saint Mila, the feather gatherers said: "It's an elf [i.e. a non-human]!" They fled from the sight. [or: light rays pass through him! 'o zer nas]. Mila said to them: "I am not an elf!" "So what is your name?" "I am the son of Shes rab rgyal mtshan of rTsa, Mid la Happy-Report." Thus the feather-gatherers came to know the facts. They also offered him some excellent provisions. They also started to use nettles for food and they exerted themselves in meditation. A small experience of the illusory body arose; at night, they finally saw the streaks of the clear light.

Then a few women disciples from Gung Thang heard that a son of Shes rab rgyal mtshan of rTsa, called Happy-Report,

Folio 229

[13] LM says that this relic still exists and is at Tashilungpo. (p. 217, fn. 6).

had achieved spiritual attainment; they offered him three years worth of barley. Extraordinary faith arose [in them] when the group of ladies went to meet Mila, when he was dwelling at Ling nge. The ladies said to him: "We ourselves want to know about what Mid-la the son of Shes rab rgyal mtshan does." Mila told them: "Yes, I am he; because I ate a lot of nettles, my former color has thus changed to green." They bowed to him. All of them offered some of the articles they had on hand. They asked him if he now would no longer eat nettles. They wanted to offer other provisions. In reply, Lord Mila Happy Report sang this song:

I bow down to the Lord Gurus,
I Mila, am of the nettle clan-
And nettles belong to Mila's clan;
Nettles and Mila cannot be distinguished!
You, too, Lady Patrons, are of the clan of faith;
Faith, too, is of the Ladies' clan;
Faith and patroness cannot be distinguished!
Mind, too, is of the clan of luminosity;
Light belongs to the clan of Mind;
Light and Mind -these two- cannot be distinguished.

He discoursed on the nature of duality to these Patronesses[14] and so forth, and they felt much remorse. They

[14] The tendency to distinguish the grasper and the grasped, yours and mine, etc.

brought forth many useful things, offering provisions to Mila.

Thus Mila went hither and thither to both Ling nga and Smin brgyud grib ma Caves, exploring the path of yoga practice, and so experienced something of the clear light and illusory body. Then he went to rKyang dpal nam mkha' Cave.

Folio 230

He went up to that place and also down to Brag dkar, there to explore the practice of the mystic veins and inner currents by means of his austerities. He combined the currents in the central vessel, but that night when he stopped the breath process, nothing happened.[15]

One evening, four ladies came to him, massaging his body, and using their skills to help his practice. They told him: "You must use this technique." They taught him the Six Yogic Methods [of Nâropa] and then they disappeared. On that occasion, Mila meditated in accord with these devices and was that evening able to produce warmth [wearing] only cotton. Thus he needed only a simple lower garment of cotton, and is famous as Mid-la the Ras-pa [one who wears cotton cloth].

Since that time, he used each of several cushions for two or three months as he meditated without moving. The

[15] He made an error and the <u>prâṇa</u> went into the wrong <u>nâḍîs</u>. This is another example (cf. when in the sGampopa version he erred in imagining the glow from his butter lamp to be `illumination') of the Saint's mistakes in contemplative practice.

result was that many virtues arose. While he was doing current and vein practice, he had a visit from Marpa Lotsawa[16] during his meditation period. Then he continued to meditate, earnestly equipoised and concentrated. Then he attained full accomplishment and the power to fly in space arose. At that time, from the rising to the setting of the sun, he flew toward the sun at White Rock Horse Tooth Cave[17]; at sunrise, when the sun warms the hillside, he flew from Horse Tooth to White Rock. In that town there was someone named Gung po mgon po dpal. While he was plowing together with his son, Mila was seen flying. The son said: "A person is not able to fly!" The father said: "Lead the ox away quickly. He looks like Milarepa, a mad yogin [smyon pa][18]. He flies because he is pulled by the sun." He had no faith in him.

Then upon an occasion a truly accomplished perfected yogin arrived in that region from Sa smad.

Folio 231

He met [Milarepa]. "Where are you from?" [asked Mila] The yogin [sen ta ba] was from around Lho Brag. He asked him spiritual questions. He had heard that Lama Marpa of

[16] A mystical visit, for which see an expanded account in the gTsang smyon version, Songs, pp. 3-4.

[17] See LM, p. 129.

[18] Hence, he is not a holy man, he is just crazy. The existence of smyon pas in the thirteenth century indicates greater continuity between the early period of the bKa' brgyud pa and the time of gTsang smyon than one might think after reading the "Preface" to the Life of the Saint of gTsang by E. Gene Smith.

Lho Brag was dead. Saint Mila offered up prayers to him. Sobbing sorrowfully, he made many exclamations of misery. Then he had the intention of going to see the Lama Parents and make supplications. His mind was deeply recollected, however, and he became detached from his emotional reaction.

These are the things that Saint Milarepa did while pursuing the practice of asceticism, steadying the inner currents in the psychosomatic channels, and immense virtue arose.

Once he went towards Sñe nam;
A patron arranged for his provisions;
[But] not abiding with him, he afterwards went
into the La phyis (<u>sic</u>) snow mountains;
I bow down to the Saint meditating in the snow
ranges. (18)

This is the explication:

Then when the Saint-Victor Milarepa had heard that his Guru Marpa Lho Brag pa had died (<u>bde-bar gshegs pa</u> = <u>sugata</u>), he abandoned his practice to go to Lho Brag. He went to Tsar ma of Sñe nam. A patroness named rNgog dor mo met him and became full of faith toward him. She approached him and paid him homage, asking: "Are you the Saint-Victor Milarepa?" The patrons supplicated him to remain there. They offered to bring him provisions. The Saint, taking only nine handfuls of grain, went off toward La phyis. That morning, clouds began to gather at the place. For eighteen days it snowed without interruption.

Folio 232

Mountains and valleys were completely covered with the snow. No one could travel. In that great snowfall, not even the animals could go outside. The patrons could not bring him provisions for seven months. All the people of Sñe nam said that he, the perfect yogin [of Khu Khun?] had been killed by the snow. Both male and female patrons wept sorrowfully.

During that time, he thought to himself: "I myself am alive; no one can get here because the road is cut off. If I myself go out, I might die. It seems that I am to die here in La phyis. Perhaps I should perform the ejection of consciousness ['pho ba]." A woman dressed in leaves came along and said: "Do not perform the ejection of consciousness. Please eat samâdhi![19] Day and night, do nothing but the meditations of Generation and Completion (skyed rdzogs); we, the dharma master ḍâkinîs will bless you. You are not in danger of death. We are taking care of you!" Therefore, he let go of his worries and did not perform the ejection of consciousness. Day and night he meditated in a state of contemplative absorption (samâdhi). "Now and then, there was a sensation of cold; of snow

[19] See Lamotte trans., Vimalakîrti, pp. 127-8. We may compare the attributes of Vimalakîrti to those of Mila. "He (Vim.) seemed to take food and drink, but he nourished himself always with the flavor of ecstasy (dhyâna rasa asvâdana)". Fn. 10 tells us that this consists of tasting the flavor or delights of ecstasy and is generally condemned in such texts as the Laṅkâvatâra, p. 212, 14; Sûtrâlaṃkâra, p. 160,14; MPP-Ś, p. 1027, 1045; ADK VIII p. 144. See also, P. Demiéville, Le Concile de Lhasa, pp. 62-70.

blindness; of deafness in my ear, etc.; many states of difficulty arose. At times, I was free of these difficulties. A feeling of lightness occurred, at times without apparent cause." [or: since I had had nothing to eat.] He was stirred by the rush of inner energies and he was stunned. Little by little, the clear light dawned and increased. In those seven months, in short, hardly having food enough to fill the end of a spoon, meditating in a state of samâdhi, taking his contemplation as food, the body was not overcome by death. Innumerable evident signs of virtue also came from within. At that time, immortality

Folio 233

was achieved, the siddhi of Life-Immortal (tshe'i dngos grub bgyi ba); at this point, though sentient beings are impermanent, he manifested the opposite quality.[20] The apparent body is not dominated by death when this siddhi is accomplished. He thus had the siddhi of never lacking enough food. The great mass of sentient beings do not understand the accumulation of such merit. Whether with food or even without food, because he had achieved this siddhi, he was without any hunger (kres pa)[21]. Unerringly, the supreme Accomplishment is thus achieved.

20 By not dying, Milarepa manifested his transcendence of the doctrine of impermanence because he has moved beyond Samsâra. For this see the rnam thar of Vajradhara, folio 11. See also, Robert Thurman, "Confrontation and Interior Realization," p. 246, section 5.

21 See Asanga on food and on meditation in Wayman: An Analysis of the Śrâvakabhûmi Manuscript, Chpt. V "Asaṅga's Views on Food," pp. 135ff.

Exclusively showing forth the doctrine for his disciples, he achieved the Dharmakâya, which is described as not changing; unmovable; fully accomplished. In short, he entirely attained both ordinary and supreme Accomplishments [22].

These things the Saint did when he went to the La phyis snow mountains, obtaining Accomplishment through the practice of austerities.

Thinking that the Saint was dead for seven months,
A few people, having made offerings, set out to see;
The Lord was not dead, so they reverently
invited him to their town;
I bow down to the Saint of wonders! (19)

This is the explication:

Then, the Saint Victor Milarepa, having gone to the La phyis snow ranges, abode where for seven months it was cloudy without any light. At that time he entirely achieved supreme and ordinary Accomplishment. Several of the patrons of Sñe nam, among the first of whom was rNgog dor mo, [thinking] that the Saint had died, went to search for the corpse with the intention of cremating it. They recited the noble Seven Day cycle of prayers[23]. They made many offerings, and set off carrying a shovel, a nice blanket, and a conch. At that time, the Saint went to a place one

[22] See Lessing and Wayman, pp. 220-221, fn. 13, and YGT, pp. 289-293, <u>et passim</u>.

[23] Seven times seven, like the <u>Bardo Thodol</u>.

day's journey [from his cave?] and stayed there a week. [Meanwhile, the people of the search party] reached the place where the Saint had been staying.

Folio 234

The people sought for him. They blew the conch. They made loud noises. Thus the Saint heard the sound of human voices and of the conch. From his cave-rock with snow on top he saw the people coming. They blew the conch. Making the path clear of snow, they searched. Mila thought: "They are looking for me." Sitting on top of the snow, he offered a prayer; as he prayed, there was a lovely sound which was heard by the search party. They were very happy to find him. "It is evident that I am not dead." Because of a huge steep snow drift, they couldn't get to him. The search party could not free him. The Saint held his breath and flew to the search party, going to where they were. Then he even loaded them on himself and flew over the snow mountains. Then he arrived at his cave. The Saint still had the sack of nine measures of parched barley, and with it a side of meat that he had not eaten. He gave it to the search party. Patroness Dor mo grasped the Saint and wept: "Our Saint is not dead! How has it happened that our Saint is not dead?" The Saint said: "The reason I did not die is that I wear the clothing of mystic heat (gtum-mo); I eat the food of contemplative absorption; I meditate on Guru-yoga and practice the Generation and Completion stages of meditation. One has the help of deities and ḍâkinîs, thus I

did not die." Great wonder arose in the chief patron and in all the members of the search party. They performed many prostrations, placing his feet on their heads. They were indeed very happy that the Lord was not dead. "Now we invite you to our town."

Folio 235

They asked him to leave [that place] by all means. The Saint granted their wish with delight, and accompanied [them] to [their] town. At that time, his fame and renown spread [past] the boundary of Sñe nam. All became his reverent devotees. All the people of the valley came to meet him. Upon a certain occasion, with limitless faith and devotion aroused, all the people made vast offerings to the Saint: some offered gold, some turquoise, also copper, and silk garments, various cotton items, etc. The Saint was surrounded by delightful objects, so that only his head could be seen! He had too much stuff! In particular, the patron-couple rNgog offered thick woollen clothing for the body, a horse for riding, a turquoise for fastening [around the head], as gifts of devotion, and they grasped the feet of the Saint. These Patrons said: "We are meeting a Siddha like you because of the accumulation of great merit; we want to be inseparable from you all the time. Please grant this, in your compassion." Tears poured from their eyes. The whole group of people wept and prayed in the same way. On that occasion, the Saint did not take the wealth [offered to him], but returned it to all the people, the male and female

patrons. This was his `custom'. Then he said: "Now I offer this song about what happened to me previously in the snow:

At the end of the year of the Tiger,
At the start of the year of the Hare[24]
As a yogin, I went off to the snow mountains of La
phyis
Yes, I went to the La phyis snow ranges;
Both sky and earth converse (danced?- '<u>bros pa</u>)
They shoved the air by the great power of a wind storm,
In the south, a purple cloud moved [like] a host
arrayed;
Both the sun and moon were taken captive-
The deep snow came down for nine days and nine nights-
In all, it came down for eighteen days and nights

Folio 236

That was how the snow was
At the time of the new year- both snow and wind
were great,
[But there were] three things struggling on the
snow mountain peak-
For the cotton cloth on the yogin's body was the
third-
And the winner in the fight was the cotton garment!
Either the cotton cloth is warm, or else,

[24] Male Iron Tiger year/Female Iron Rabbit year = 1110-1111. See p. 26 Songs, and Appendix 1.

The snow mountain is warm! Or else-

The air is very mild!

Happy in equanimity is the realm of the yogin's body!

How are you, o patrons?

Indeed, the yogin's fame is seen and heard

Everywhere!"

Having said this to the patrons and patronesses, he explained the doctrine of self-and-others. He left that place; he did not stay there. Deeply touched by his deeds, all the people experienced great wonderment toward him. His light and fame spread in all directions: "A great Siddha is risen among us!"

These things were done by the Saint Mila the yogin when he attained immeasurable virtue, having gone to the La phyis snow ranges. O Holy Saint, meeting with patrons and patronesses, preaching all the Doctrine in song, we reverently bow to you!

Then the Lord went to meditate in the forest

Of the Land of Senge, towards Mon {Bhutan};

Having attained virtue, he sang all his songs[25]

to a circle of disciples;

Holy Saint, we reverently bow to you! (20)

This is the explication:

When the Saint-Victor Milarepa went to meditate in the forest of Senge Ling in the land of Mon, there was a very

[25] This phrase is not in the set of verses at the start of the <u>rnam thar</u>.

pleasant grove with fruit trees in the place. Many flowers grew there. It was a place of many monkeys and langurs. A place of solitude, without any people! Local gods and spirits

Folio 237

gathered there. Very powerful and fierce beings arrived and sat down at that place. At the root of a great tree-trunk, he abode within a cave the size of two men, with his copper pot. Without [paying attention to] day or night, he meditated on the ground [next to the tree] equipoised in contemplation.[26] Thus he abode at that time. He went without food except an occasional bit of the fruit. Contemplative absorption [samâdhi] was like a food-offering to him. The evident signs of virtue arose strongly in him. At that time, the patrons and patronesses of Sñe nam spoke, sending two men to the Saint with an invitation. The two men sought the fruit grove in the land of Senge. For a long time, they could not find him. Finally, they encountered him where he dwelt, near the tree trunk. They bowed and inquired about his health. "My state of health is happy. How are you?" The Saint continued:

"In this [holy] place, various flowers grow.

Here there are the cries of sweet-sounding bird song.

[26] See N. Dutt, Early Monastic Buddhism, p. 157 for the rukkha-mûlikaṅgaṃ; in the Visuddhimagga, etc., the thirteen dhutâṅgas: `The Tree-Rootman's Practice'. A clear instance, it would seem, of an early Buddhist practice embraced by Milarepa. Cf. Wayman, Buddhist Insight, p. 55, the `dhûtaguṇas'.

A grove where monkeys and langurs play-
Thus I reside alone in a wilderness place,
Happy."

Thus he sang, offering many songs. The two envoys said to him: "We two disciples implore you by all means to accept an invitation." The Saint said: "I will not go back with you." Suddenly, he got up and went away. The two men followed after him. But he climbed through the cave, which was so narrow that barely one man could fit in it, and got away. The envoys called to him: "Here you have no servants, no furniture, and so forth. How can you be happy?"

Folio 238

They tried to get him to go with them for the sake of the disciples. The Saint sang:

Here water and wood is near to me-
But a so-called servant is a false [need];
My need for food and companions is rather small;
If you have gtummo in the body, you have heat aflame!
So clothing, too, is a false need,
My need for woolen cloth is also small;
Illusions appear at the root of mind-
Thus, even relatives and friends are a false need.
Having cares and worries is also unnecessary-
A meditator leaves the mind alone, [in its `natural state']
Our need for the thoughts that rise up is also small-

Delusions! - who needs them?
The true nature [of reality] arises in the mind [of
itself]
So called grammar and logic are also false-
The need for literacy and knowledge is rather small,
If one finds the treasure of the precious Mind;
Even food and wealth are seen as false;
And as for this `enjoyment'-the need is small,
If we bring about the boundless goal of beings!
So-called patrons - who needs them?
And my need for your invitation is small, too!"

Thus he sang, for he did not wish to go. The two men made entreaties and offerings to him, but he just sat where he was. The Saint said nothing whatever; suddenly, he got up and went away. The envoys went after him. Water, rocks, trees, all three, were so tangled and dense that a person could not get through. But, having held his breath, Mila flew away. The two went home unsuccessful. All the patrons and patronesses of the town let out sobs and made lamentations.

These things the Saint did as he meditated in the forest of Senge Ling, acquiring the signs of limitless virtue, when he refused the invitation of patrons and patronesses.

Then, upon an occasion,
He went to Sñe nam brod bur

Folio 239

His aunt and sister heard about the fame of the Saint;
Both ladies went to meet him, to invite him;
I bow down to the Saint when he sang a song
Upon meeting them. (21)

This is the explication:

The Saint Milarepa did this: after a while, he went to Sñe nam brod bur where he meditated assiduously. Bkra shis rtsegs and Legs se became his patrons. After that, the Saint abode below that place, without any difficulties. At that time, both his aunt and sister heard that his fame and reputation had become great and they went to the place where the Saint dwelt. The aunt and the sister went there carrying many things, which they held in their hands along with things loaded on a white yak and on a yo wo [hornless yak]- flour, butter, etc. They went to meet him with various requests, entrusting [themselves] to the [disciple named] Se ras pa. The Saint said [to Se ras pa]: "Now my aunt is coming to Mid la Happy Report, but you should let her know that I have no need of her visit. [Tell her] I am not dying of hunger and can do without the offerings she is carrying. I cannot meet with her." He said to Se ras pa: "Tell Peta to come up." So he did. Peta said: "You, aunt, wait here and sit upon that cloth. I will now go to ask for an audience." The aunt agreed, and sat down. Se ras pa asked the other disciples to keep her company. Then he said to Mila: "You must give an audience to your aunt!" But he shook his head and would not grant it. Then Peta went to

meet him and paid homage, receiving his blessing. "O my brother, are you well?

Folio 240

I hope you are content?" He replied: "Peta, welcome. I now have enough food and clothing without begging." Then Peta asked for an audience for the aunt- "Now we, brother and sister, have only our aunt as a relative. At any rate, you must give her an audience." The Saint said:

> Our aunt has the body of a relative,
> But has the hostility of an enemy;
> In the body of human, but
> The mind of a demon

"What did she do when I was destitute? At any rate, now I will not see her. If she comes to see me I will go away." He started to load up his bag. Seeing him make preparations to depart, his sister Peta was frustrated and began to cry. "O Saint, please hear me! At this time, please consider a brief meeting with your aunt." The Saint said: "Peta, you are very kind, and you are both father and mother to me; I have to listen to you. If she is to meet with me, set up a curtain between me and her. That way she can meet me." Peta told this to the aunt. "My brother is in strict meditation. There is a curtain between us and him. There will, however, be an audience. Please come in." The aunt went to see him and asked about his health. The Saint composed this song:

> I bow down to the Lord Guru!

In rTsa-valley of the five towns in Gung thang,
There were these three: mother and two children;
Becoming the enemies of their relatives, we
were scattered like a heap of beans
With a stick.
Then I wandered in unfamiliar lands,
Where there was no `aunt';
In the White Rock Peak solitude,
Urged on by both hunger and thirst,
I went to my aunt, who called me a beggar
and disgraceful;
She pulled out a tent pole and chased me-
With hatred aflame in her body, she pursued;
Without strength in my body,

Folio 241

I fell in a ditch.
Remember that you struck me until I was swollen?
Meeting me now, aren't you ashamed?

Out of shame, his aunt was unable to reply. She fell down and wept saying, "Truly, truly." Peta was pleased at this. Then the Saint said: "So much evil [or: a bad rebirth] occurs from the accumulation of the karma of hatred and attachment. First our aunt does great malice to me. Now she does this out of great attachment to me. This gives rise to birth in lower realms. Don't be attached to me![27]

[27] False, or wrongly motivated, devotion is as harmful as any other wrong attitude.

Instead, generate reverent faith and respect. Don't produce anger and malice, instead purify yourself." He pushed aside the curtain and showed his face and blessed her. At that, his aunt repented of her former deeds and confessed them. At last, she performed acts of faith, reverence, and even great devotion. When this had ripened in her, she received initiation; with all her heart she offered all her wealth and possessions to the Saint. She placed his feet upon her head. Wanting to return to her abode, she also asked the Saint to come there with her, but this he did not accept.

These things the Saint did when he arrived at Sñe nam brod from Senge Ling. He met his sister and, afterwards, his aunt was converted.

After that, he dwelt in Chu dbar and in Brin;
Innumerable gods, demons, and Tse ring ma[28]
Created numerous threats, marvels, and omens;
I bow down the Guru who then seized and destroyed them.

(22)

This is the explication:

Then the Saint-Victor Milarepa dwelt for a long time in meditation at Chu dbar and Brin, when it was the water-male dragon year[29], in the first month of summer, in the part of the month when the moon is waxing, on the eighth day at just past midnight [or: just pre-dawn, 3 to 4 a.m.].

[28] See Thurman trans., Vimalakīrti, p. 37, "The maidens of Māra are converted."

[29] Consulting the chart in Vostrikov, this would have been in 1112.

Folio 242

The Eighteen Great Demons, along with a retinue filling the whole sky with deities and demons of all kinds, made the sound of thunder and earthquake, and so forth, manifesting various marvellous omens. From the group of them, there were five demons who were emanating ugly and fierce forms. These were the five great goddesses, meat eaters, manifesting various ugly forms; such as a laughing skeleton-woman who raised up Mount Sumeru and banged it on her lap; there were mountain-haunting demonesses in female form; a wolf-face appeared cleverly from the vulva where blood streamed in a steady flow. A mouth appeared in the sky, sucking up the great ocean. Yama in the form of a yakşī appeared with a fang the size of a huge spike; she played the sun and the moon like cymbals. A yakşī in the form of a woman appeared; her color was like something charred; her body as tall as Mount Sumeru, she caused the planets to fall from the sky. Then there was an especially fascinating and charming Lady Goddess unequalled in external appearance. She tried to seduce the Saint forcefully, greeting him alluringly (?). There were other illusory yakşas, some multiform, some formless, some many-armed, and rakşasas of the wild rocky mountains who [scattered] rocks and soil in the four directions. He was entirely surrounded. A fire gathered together in the sky, and so forth, [so that there were] many fearsome and dangerous omens and signs, making threats and external manifestations toward the Saint. They

then tried to make mischief with his meditation practice, so he then offered the deities and <u>dâkinîs</u> this song:

To the Precious Guru possessing the Three Jewels
Named all-famous Marpa, and all the Buddhas,
I make a prayer, longing to possess bliss!
I beseech your compassion from the Dharmadhâtu[30]

Folio 243

Alone, in Chu dbar of Brin,
I a cotton-clad yogin of Tibet
Spend this one life in deep meditation...

Thus, and more, he sang. The gods and demons thought that he had become slightly afraid [as he sang]. They thought they had great power to make obstacles. The gods and demons unanimously assembled and said to him: "You have presented us with an offering of song, you made an offering at the right time to [us] gods and demons. Is it not so that you are Milarepa?"- and so forth. Mila replied with words of prophecy, these being the thoughts of the Lord: "Again, the essence of mind is to be birthless, unobstructed, indestructible, and free from illusion, and so it is! This is the army of Yama, 100 million strong." There was a rain of sharp weapons that also came at him, but he did not move [=did not destroy him], for his mind was without fear of death or birth. [He is free from] grasping and attachment, especially to the body, for it is the karmic result in terms

[30] "Father" in the invisible realm, which is 'like space' and is the realm of Vajradhara, inseparable from the Dharmadhâtu.

of agglomerated flesh and blood [of grasping and attachment]. "O gods and demons, if you want it, you can have it! I have no attachment to this! Indeed, the self is both cause and effect and, for those who understand, illusion comes from ignorance." Entering [a state of] fearlessness and confidence, he presented this song:

In the town named Brin of Ding ri,
There are many merchants making profits;
Both India and Tibet are nearby,
And on the high snow mountains dwells the
Fierce Lady of Long-Life...

and so forth, he sang. He pacified the hatred and malice in the mental continua of all the assembly of yakṣas and yakṣīs, subjecting them to religious discipline. Unanimously, these non-humans supplicated the Saint and said: "Listen, o Cotton-Clad Yogin! You have accumulated the merit of a human body;

Folio 244

Fortunate you are indeed to be an accomplished yogin!" - and so forth, but it had no effect on his mind.

Then, one evening, on the tenth day of the first of the three months of summer, five ladies, lovely, wonderful, and luminous, came before the Saint, saluted, and circumambulated many times.

They said: "These are the curds of a wild ox," and served him on a ladle of sapphire[31]. They bowed reverently. The first one, who was clever, asked:

The red-faced rakṣasa of Tibet-
like the snowy valley and the mountains
Which are close together-
And a yakṣa to whom belongs this snow mountain...

So she offered a song, with reverence and devotion, saluting with her body. [He] taught them about the secret-mantra of the Vajrayāna, and they practiced meditation to lead to conversion and liberation. These things the Saint did when dwelling in Chu dbar of Brin. Scorned amidst innumerable gods and demons including the Tse ring mas, who tried to make obstacles, the Saint overpowered them and afterwards converted them. This is the meaning.

Then the Lord went to the valley of the Land of Sñe
nam, to liberate
A Bon po of Sñe nam who voyaged in the intermediate
state;
Geshe Dar bLo became faithful and devoted;
I bow down to the taming of the virtuous assembly
of the Saṃgha. (23)

This is the explication:

[31] See Songs, pp. 313 and 316. Cf. also V. Urubshurow, p. 321. But the Tibetan xylograph in the possession of the Pizzis does not have any of this!

Then Saint Milarepa went to Sñe nam. There was a Bon po of Sñe nam named gShen[32] Khro rgyal who had power and wealth. He believed in, made offerings to, and propitiated [the Saint], lifting his foot to his head many times. Then the Bon po was about to die. He made out his last will and instructed his eldest son: "For myself, I need no other roots of virtue [than Milarepa]. For my benefit, I ask you to give offerings to the Saint and ask his loving kindness for me. The son himself did as he had been requested.

Folio 245

Then, after three or four days, they wrote down the name of the dead man and made repeated supplications to call his consciousness into the [written] name; then the name-sign [the paper] began to shake. Then there was a sound, and light and he dissolved into the heart of the Saint. The family of the Bon po was delighted, and had faith in him. On that occasion great devotion arose.[33]

Peta was at rTsa, weeping very much. There, on that occasion, the Saint did not weep. He asked: "What is the meaning of this?" Peta said: "This is what has occured to the Mila clan of Khu kun [town of clan origin?]. We are sinful, you and I and our parents. Where have they both gone [after death]?" And so she wept. The Saint said:

[32] Cf. gShen-rabs, the founder of the Bon religion.

[33] Milarepa performs a rite for the dead, acting as a psychopomp. See M. Eliade. Shamanism. (Princeton: Bollingen, Princeton University Press, 1964), pp. 207ff; 414-421.

"Our afflicted parents died because the power of Yama took them away. From the start until now I have used all three: body, speech, and mind - for virtuous deeds. Since kindness to parents includes all sentient beings, I have already brought about their salvation, since I am in manifestation, and they both are not (in fact, they are silent). So do not weep, I mentally performed the [transfer of] roots of virtue to our parents."

Then it came about that the great fame and reputation of the Saint Mila [was spread abroad]. Attendants and provisions gathered like a cloud and at that time he became very popular.

In that place there was a teacher of grammar and debate named Dar blo. He was an Abhidharmist, and he knew many piṭakas. He was learned in verse. He [and Mila] were comparable in merit. One day, Teacher Dar blo thought to engage [Mila] in debate: "This so-called Milarepa the yogin is illiterate. He is getting all the offerings for the dead and is becoming the object of [the people's] faith - this is how he eats. People are even comparing my fame and merit to his. Today I must tell the people about him and then subdue and expell him from this town."

Folio 246

He went up one day to meet with the Saint. There, rDo rJe grags pa and others, some of the cotton clad yogins, were in the presence of the two of them. [rDo rJe grags pa] said to the Saint: "The Debate-Teacher Dar blo is burdened

with a measureless heap of sinful karma from previous lives as a master of studies. Today, over there, he has come to meet you. [He offered a sign of reverence, and returned the bow submissively. The associates of the scholar also requested the same sign of respect; the Saint did not comply and remained seated, as if asleep.](?) The Teacher Dar blo went up to him; he had a butter offering in his hand. He bowed and inquired about his health. The Saint did not accept his bow or his offering. He lifted up his feet a little bit. Then the Teacher Dar blo said: "You are said to be a great Siddha, mighty in yoga (yogeśvara). We should both engage in debate on our opinions of the Doctrine." Mila got up and said: "Now then, let us debate." Then they both began a little dispute on their respective opinions. The Teacher Dar blo was unable [to defeat Mila]; the Saint vanquished [him]. Dar blo said: "You are a destroyer of Buddha's teachings; you are in the wrong toward the Three Jewels; you are not a Dharma-practitioner. From the start, you are full of imposture. You wrongly eat the goods of the deceased and the offerings of the faithful." He abused him in various ways and kicked at his head. He then threw dust and dirt in his mouth. The Saint did nothing whatever at the time; he just let him do it. Then, after a while, [Dar blo's] rage calmed down and he put his

Folio 247

robe back on. These things [provoked] Ras chung pa to say: "We should do to this evil doer as he did to our Lama!

Strike him!" As he was about to strike Teacher Dar blo, the Saint said: "Don't hit! Don't hit! Just wipe my mouth clean of this dirt." He then cleaned the dirt from his head by shaking it around. This being done, Ras chung pa cleaned the dirt from his mouth. The Saint said: "O Ras chung pa, your meditation [practice] is diminishing. Let us both join in song together." He offered this song to Dar blo:

I bow down to the Lord Gurus;
Excellent is the peace of Dharma, separated from passion;
[Excellent] to go for refuge to the Doctrine of the Holy Path;
O Master Dar blo, listen!
You are respected as one who is knowledgeable in this world-
We are both excellent in hearing, analysis, and meditation;
We are now meeting so as to converse,
[but] in you, hatred is like a fire
Ignited in the mind;
The Five Paths are aflame with the Three Afflictions;
We two men are in the noise of jealousy,
And thus this place is [like a] hell realm-
Which is a shame for the Three Refuges!
You yourself do not know the nature of mind,
And what you know of the Holy Doctrine
Is of no profit to you!

For you are not pacified in mind-
You, a so-called great scholar, are not accomplished;
Since you are not striking the head of `Self'
What good is it to strike Mila's head?
You are not casting dirt upon delusion-
So what good is it to cast dirt on me?
Your mental motivation is not pure-
So what good are your monastic vows?
You lack diligence in these three: Body, Speech, and Mind,
So you have put on the three robes of the monk
To no avail;
You have not abandoned these three: Lust, Hate, and Delusion-

Folio 248

So what good is it to make distinctions
Among different sects and practices?
I am the yogin Milarepa;
Previously, there was nothing I hadn't done;
And even now, having criticized [you], I feel a little sad;
There is nothing I haven't meditated upon,
But here is something new-
A meditation on dirt in my mouth;
There was nothing I hadn't `kicked' before-
But now you've kicked me with your foot!
Although you are a master of the Holy Doctrine,

The allies pride and misery increase
[In one who is] a receptacle of fully-ripened
Amassed evil karma;
Negative accumulations are gathered in the mind,
And [not just in] the body- so that
For a hundred aeons one is not set free,
But if one undertakes right contemplation,
Then good fruit may ripen, so it is said;
If you only have intellectual Dharma,
It creates evil deeds;
If you are a true listener, you will achieve
tranquility,
But if you are `clever' in doctrinal distinctions,
Then hatred and selfishness increase.

[Dar blo] was then ashamed for the faults he had committed. Pondering, he went away. "That which the father [Mila] says is so; nothing is false of what he said. I myself have accumulated great sins. Now I will confess these sins," he thought. Then he went back to where the Saint was, and when he met him, the Saint manifested five likenesses, all the same. Several sat inside, some were outside. Some were in the entry way. Some going up, some going down. The teacher Dar blo pondered [this]. The Saint manifested many likenesses at the same time. Dar blo wondered: "To which one should I make my confession?" But the Saint knew his thoughts and Mila said: "There is a Paṇḍita inside; go

there. Go up there and start a debate." Dar blo asked him what he looks like.

Folio 249

Mila said: "He has knowledge and intelligence. If you can defeat him, you won't have to confess to me and your sins will certainly be wiped off." So he went inside. The venerable Paṇḍita who appeared was carrying a column of bronze. He said: "We can both debate with this ṫantrika and put him on our lap [to humble him]. He who is the Victor will be established as the Teacher over the one defeated." They both engaged in debate. Whatever he did, Dar blo did not win the debate. Then the Paṇḍita made extensive offerings and dissolved into Mila. Then the other manifestations dissolved into one. Finally, Mila dissolved into himself! This is what Master Dar Blo thought: "This Guru has acquired the power to command illusory manifestations. He has attained Perfection. Formerly, for a little while, because of my karmic accumulations, I was imagining wrong things [about him]. But now perfect faith and reverence have arisen." He said to the Saint:

"[I now] offer my confession of sins with regret and repentance." He then requested teachings and he followed his advice. The Saint became compassionate, bestowed the Doctrine and advised him to meditate. With good meditation experience, the state of Perfection dawned.

Then, at that time, among the monks of Sñe nam, Gung thang, and elsewhere, hatred arose against the Saint. There

was a small <u>vihâra</u> named Ras pa rDzing bu where the monks said to the Saint: "You are someone who adheres to false views." These cotton-clad ones struck him [or: they struck the cotton-clad yogins] with rock and heaped immense abuse on him. One day, the Saint went there and said: "Today I want to go to the <u>vihâra</u> at rDzing bu." The Master and three disciples, these four, went. There were many good dogs of that <u>vihâra</u>.

Folio 250

All these dogs did not chase the Saint, master and disciples. They licked them and were happy. Then a monk arrived. The Saint, master and disciples, was recognized. The monk said: "O deceitful Mila - master with disciples - [why] have you come to our place? To beat us up?" Just then, ten monks arrived. They all cruelly beat and carried off the Saint -master and disciples- but no harm came to the Saint, not even one thing. Then they said: "This rogue, even when beaten nothing happens. We'll tie them up one by one with iron and put them on the pinnacle of the monastery and leave them there." They took them with the Saint and handcuffed them and when they were all tied up, they went back outside. When the monks left them all, master and disciples, well tied up, the Saint said: "<u>Phaṭ</u>!" All of them who had been bound, master and disciples, were set free. And their captors, the monks, were now tied up! Then several other monks showed up. "This rogue knows a lot!" All the monks came and said: "Tie this rogue up well!"

"Throw him off a cliff! Come on!" Each monk went and brought a rope. They tied the Saint up well. The fifteen monks tried to drag him down the hill but they couldn't move the Saint. They tried everything, but nothing happened; they could not harm him. In that place, on that occasion, the Saint performed a great deed with his power. He pulled outside all the things - people and objects- that they had inside. The animals that were outside, he brought inside! In short, in this way he turned everything inside-out. All became terrified and fearful. They made offerings to the Saint.

Folio 251

The Saint offered this song:

I, the yogin Milarepa
Possess unobstructed might of non-ego[34]
Yours is a monastery of impure beings
With non-devotion, wrong views, and slander-
How can you capture, tie up, strike, and beat
[others]?
I can't accept this, nor do I want to
listen to, nor do such things-
Nor am I ashamed to use wildness (spyod pa)
[as skillful means]-
If you stop [doing evil], then offer faith
and reverence,
But if you don't stop, I'll crush you to powder!

[34] Also suggests ma, `mother of wisdom.'

A rain of stones fell from space and the abbot and the leaders of that monastery, with all the monks, placed their heads beneath his feet; they became faithful and devoted. These things the Saint did as miracles and [displays] of magical power; he completely wrecked those impious beings after they had captured him, and they became devoted. This is the explanation.

Then, for the female and male patrons of Brin,
To awaken their understanding, he flew
off a precipice;
And the patrons received a blessing from Târâ;
I bow down to the Saint, who bestows a blessing.
(24)

This is the explication:

Then the Saint Victor Milarepa abode in Chü dbar of Brin with Ras chung rdo rje grags pa and patroness Legs ses, a leader and a few other persons. The many patrons and patronesses of Brin came together at one time to make a request for the initiation of the Five Deities of Cakrasaṃvara. The Saint was overcome by compassion. He set up a <u>maṇḍala</u> of colored sand; the practitioners were first established in the empowerment of the Vase[35]. After they had perfected the previous empowerments, he then bestowed the higher empowerment of the Vase. "Now since I, Mila, am old, the vase

Folio 252

[35] See Lessing and Wayman, p. 312.

itself will work the performance of the rite." He at once recited the mantra: `om na ma sarva tathâ ga ta.' Then it was not necessary to place the vase on top of the people individually. Then all of them marvelled at what happened, the Yoginî Glorious Târâ[36] and the others as well. Many of the people muttered [the mantra] and acquired wisdom [or: Many people muttered Târâ's mantra and acquired wisdom.]. For some people who did not even need to meditate, full comprehension arose. All became very cheerful and happy. The Saint said:

I am of the Hearing Lineage, which I hand on intact;
I unite the Supreme State inseparably with Bliss,
And the initiation of the Five Wisdoms, with the Vase
of Initiation working-by-itself;
Thus I bestow the Buddha's wisdom;
Having acquired wisdom, a blissful light appears-
True understanding arises in the initiation of the
Victor,
The experience arises to fulfill all wishes
In the initiation rare, unlike any other!
My system of initiation, that of Lama Mila,
Is truly wonderful in essence [or: for this one needs
wonder and faith], and is needed by the devoted!

So he sang. Faith and devotion arose in all the people.

[36] This could be the deity, but it could also be the `secret name' of one of the participants.(Pema Wangyal)

The next morning, Ras chung rdo rje grags pa drew an image of the Diamond Sow and Patroness Legs Se made one of Hevajra. In order to set them up, they asked for a consecration. They made ready the pûjâ. [Mila] said to bring some barley [as a substitute for flowers](me tog nas khyer la shog), and it was done as he ordered. The Saint told many stories. At that point the barley-flowers made a spitting sound: Thu thu thu. The Saint said: "I, Mila, from the time of my earliest childhood and upbringing have strewn flowers [ritually]. Now that I am old, I invite the head of the tutelary deity to strew the flowers." The image of Vajrayoginî nodded its head in front. At the same time, the image of Hevajra also shook. The barley-flowers that were in front began to pour

Folio 253

forth the sound `hram' and the barley mingled with the image of the tutelary deities. This happened in front of them and they marvelled; there was a great, marvellous light and they made obeissance. The Saint said:

The invocation of the deity on canvas
Is not needed for acquiring wisdom;
The flowers of wisdom arise of themselves-
O Ras chung pa! The consecration is permanent![37]

He sang this song and then went away. After a few days, he arrived at the home of Legs se and her husband, who went

[37] These thang kas are believed still to exist at Pen che ling [i.e. Pan ches Ling at Swayambunath in the Kathmandu Valley]. (Informant: Pema Wangyal)

before the Saint and requested teaching on the Mind. "Please give us both a teaching (khrid)[38] at the same time. One will guide the other after following your lead." The Saint said: "Yes, one can follow the other to guide one another. I accept your request."

Having situated the Patron in meditation practice, the patroness performed reverential service. In the Patron, the instruction did not give rise even to a brief experience of realization. But in the Patroness, a state of good understanding and perfection arose. The Lama Saint bestowed the essential nature [of mind] on her[39] and the realization of wisdom arose in her. The Patron said: "I also will carry provisions so that I will understand." His wife said: "You should also meditate!" Even for him, an understanding of wisdom and insight arose. On that occasion, the Patron went to get provisions and Legs se and the Saint ate the offerings. The Saint laughed and smiled. The Patroness asked: "Why, o Saint, are you laughing and smiling?" The Saint said: "The Patron is just now bringing a load [20 cups] of roast barley and other things for food and while going along he met a tiger on the road.

Folio 254

[38] R. A. Stein. Vie et Chants, p. 134.

[39] Takpo, pp. 132f, the Guru; 143-5, the two basic paths as instantaneous and gradual. See also The Ninth Karmapa Wang Ch'ug Dor-je: The Mahâmudrâ Eliminating the Darkness of Ignorance (Dharamsala: LTWA, 1978), pp. xiii, Introduction by Alexander Berzin.

The Patron was not able to run away or even to strike back; he had to stand there! That's why I am laughing!" After a long time, the Patron came with the offerings. He said: "I met a tiger today; I did not run away; I just stood there. By the compassion of my Guru, the tiger did not cause any harm." The Patroness said to him: "We have really met a genuine Guru in this one!" Understanding arose in their minds. "Tigers and other fierce animals do not harm us; we, an old man and an old woman, are both content."

At that time the Saint said:

I am Milarepa the yogin;
Having patrons is a great blessing;
When I practice austerities, wandering among mountain
solitudes,
My bodily necessities are set in order
By you- male and female patrons;
The right circumstances of causes and conditions
are present
And experience arises in the mind-
No longer need one fear the sight of fearsome beasts
Such as tigers and the rest.

To both patron and patroness, he is said to have given explanations of the fullness of wisdom (yang dag pa ye shes kyi); they also both firmly acquired realization of the fullness of wisdom.

On one occasion, to several patrons and patronesses of Brin, he gave an initiation of Vajrapāṇi Garuda (?) and it happened that seven disciples flew in the air.

Again, upon a certain occasion, several patrons and patronesses of Brin performed a gaṇacakra (tshogs kyi 'khor lo)[40]. At that gaṇacakra, the Saint said: "I am going to invite the eighty four Siddhas [while] you yourselves [prepare] the gaṇacakra and so forth." They asked him: "How much is needed?" He replied: "I am only teasing- this is sufficient." He then spoke the mantra:

gu ru samaya hum//

snapping his fingers

Folio 255

making a cracking sound. Then, in a little while, accompanied by a noise, the assembly of the [eighty-four] Siddhas came to the gaṇacakra - the Great Brahman [Saraha] and the rest! Then, [the participants] invited them to the gaṇacakra. After a little while there was a glow and a sound and the clamor of musical sound; the [eighty four] Great Siddhas - every one of them- went away in silence. Then, at that time, in that place, understanding arose in several people. It also occured that several were able to fly in the sky. So it was on that occasion. They were all blessed- the disciples, the patrons, and the patronesses. It happened that realizaticn arose in many [of them]. Innumerable omens of a marvellous kind occured.

[40] Tantric ritual feast.

The participants in the gaṇacakra asked for a dedication of merit. The Saint said: "I am not going to do it; I will send someone else. Do not disperse for a little while! Just sit!" Having said this, he went away. Then, after that, the Noble Târâ came; she was sitting on a throne. She gave the dedication of merit called bsngo ba yon bshad (?), and the rest. Then all the people were marvelling and immense devotion arose. The Saint returned after a short while. "Did Saint (rje btsun) Târâ give the blessings and dedication of merit ? Then that suffices!"

These things the Saint did, bestowing profound Dharma and initiatic power (dbang) on all of them - the faithful disciples, patrons, and patronesses. At that time he blessed them and immeasurable signs and wonders appeared.

Then the Saint, Mila the yogin,
Not abiding in that place, [went to]

Folio 256

Southern gTsang and the Three Provinces of
Western Tibet,
And to the North of gTsang;
I bow down to his wanderings among the mountain
solitudes. (25)

This is the explication:

Then, the Saint-Victor Mid la ras pa, at that time did not remain in any one place, but went wandering among the mountain solitudes without any direction. It was his intention (dgongs pa) to establish the doctrine of the

practice lineage (bsgrub brgyud). In particular, whoever heard the name of the Saint, Mid la, was released from cyclic existence and became perfected in all virtues, it is said. So he thought: "Because my name and fame have spread in all directions, I am to wander like a vagabond in the mountain solitudes."

First, he went to the upper part of the Three Provinces of Western Tibet. He also went to the Three Snow-Mountain Lakes. Of snow mountains, the king is Ti se; of lakes, the king is Ma pham; of mountains, the king is rTse rGya, and so forth. So he went to all of them. He established the teachings of the practice lineage; there his experience and understanding increased. He accomplished immeasurable good for many of the sentient beings of those places. Then he went down the road to Pu rangs [north of West Nepal], and bLo bo and Gung thang, to many places thereabouts. He established the doctrine of the practice lineage while dwelling there for a short time. He accomplished immeasurable benefits for sentient beings. Then he went down to La stod in the south, to Lho byang, and to Ding ri, and to Bong Shong, and to Shri ri, to Khrom, and so on, dwelling amid the holy places in the mountain solitudes of southern La stod. He established the doctrine of the practice lineage in these places and accomplished immeasurable good for sentient beings. Then he went in the direction of G.yas ru byang, and then to rGyal thang[41]

[41] Author's region, in northwestern Yunnan. Cf. the Seven Limbs of the samputa for `ubiquity', applicable to this

and to Shel lug and Glu rgyal gling po, mChog dkar gyi brag, and so on. Having also dwelt towards G.yas ru byang, he established the doctrine of the practice lineage.

Folio 257

He accomplished immeasurable good for sentient beings in these places. First dwelling in Brag of the "Eighty" of rGyal thang, his understanding and realization increased more and more. When hawks flew up into the sky, he followed! The Saint also flew from the Rock of the Eighty [in rGyal Thang]. He left to go to She lcag ma; flying from Shel lcag he went to the Rock of the Eighty, manifesting innumerable wonders and he established the doctrine of the practice lineage. Then he dwelt in Glu rgyal gling po. A Nâga of Gling po offered things delightful to the body, chiefly a Mudrâ. Mila [engaged in practice] with her to greatly benefit and increase the arising of the clear light of wisdom of the Four Blisses[42]. He only ate crushed nettles as food.

On one occasion, the lady patrons of 'Gur klu rgyal prepared an offering. At that place also he established the doctrine of the practice-lineage, accomplishing the good of innumerable sentient beings.

Then he dwelt in the mountain solitudes of Bar tshigs and mChog dKar brag, and gTso bo stag gu. He instructed the aspect of the Mila rnam thar, as discussed in the Vajradhara rnam thar.

[42] See Takpo, p. 440, fn. 23, Lhalungpa's comment on the Mudrâ practice.

Lady Ko ne, and others for a long time. There too he established the doctrine of the practice lineage, accomplishing the good of innumerable sentient beings. Then he went to Cung gi yul po che la and Jo ro, and 'Bring 'tshams, and sTag tshang, and so forth, where he established the doctrine of the practice lineage and accomplished the good of innumerable sentient beings. He went wandering aimlessly in the mountain solitudes there and elsewhere; he did not remain [in one place]; there is no spot of ground which his feet did not travel. In these places he also performed austerities and established the doctrine of the practice lineage; his realization and understanding increased[43] and he benefited innumerable sentient beings.
Folio 258

He also possessed the effective means for benefiting [beings] (i.e. for setting in motion meaningful relations in the Dharma: 'brel ba). In this way, the Saint dwelt in Zal mo [a district of Kham] in the land of Tibet, in this throne [world] beneath the umbrella of the sun. No one was greater than he in establishing the doctrine of meditation (sgrub tshugs). Even now, there is no one like him. No one else could equal his (1) understanding and realization; (2) miracles; (3) meditative concentration (zad par = kṛtsna); (4) his supremacy over Māras; (5) supreme knowledge (abhijñā); (6) manifestation of forms and (7) transformation

[43] See Thurman trans., Vimalakīrti: "The more you teach and demonstrate virtuous qualities to others, the more you grow with respect to these virtuous qualities." p. 39.

[of circumstances]; (8) meditation attainment; (9) virtues, and so forth. No one was better than the Saint. No one has [since] arisen to be his equal. He accomplished benefits, some that can be seen, others which cannot, for innumerable sentient beings. He could ripen and liberate [them], especially incarnate beings with the body of a Buddha, such as was Lord Dwags po [sGampopa].

He obtained the unobstructed virtue of obtaining power over both mind and interior energies (rlung), like that of Ras chung rdo rje grags pa; he possessed faith and devotion like that of 'Bri sgom g.yang legs; he obtained the power of bliss and heat (bde drod) like Ras pa Zhi ba skyong; he was strong and patient in austerities and meditation like Rong chung pa ras pa; in benefiting sentient beings through perceiving wisdom and so on, he was like Lung skam ras pa, like sNi zhangs ras pa, like Se Bam ston chung, and other inner [disciples] like Patroness Legs se, Yoginī lCam me, or like Yoginī sGon me, and so forth. Thus there were many disciples accomplishing the immense benefit of sentient beings, their realization, perceiving wisdom directly, having arisen in the mind. Those who could do so increased their ability to help other beings. In this way, the Saint realized the voidness of the Five Heaps of the Five Poisons [or skandhas?]. The demon of narrow views [or: hatred, etc.: chung po'i bdud] was conquered; all the desirable things were recognized as illusory, like dreams; the demon of the devaputras was defeated.

Folio 259

Many beautiful women surrounded him, making sexual advances to test him, but he was not moved to lust. Thus he defeated the demon of delusion.

For those beings who [believe] themselves to be `eternal' (and thus lacking understanding), he showed the truth of impermanence [by dying].[44]

The Teacher Lom thing nga of the North even gave him poison three times, but he didn't die. Thus he subdued Yama; he conquered the Four Demons of the [merely] relative meaning. Also, even from the absolute perspective, the Five Skandhas are not to be perceived as ordinary, but as a Buddha's body. Thus, the demonic delusion of the skandhas is overcome. All that arises, good or bad, is understood [to arise] in one's own nature as the Clear Light. Thus the Mâras are subdued. In this way he fully realized inner attainment. The Five Poisons: desire, anger, ignorance, pride, jealousy, etc., he realized to be the Five Wisdoms! Thus he overcame the demon of delusion [misery]. He understood the meaning of ultimate reality as being without birth or death. He overcame the demon Yama. In this he

[44] Ironically, since he is said to resist poison three times, thus manifesting his victory over the delusion of death and illness. The Tibetan text is convoluted.

In the following section, the final sickness and death of Milarepa is presented as a Bodhisattva's `display' of compassionate activity, in accord with the teaching of Vimalakīrti: "The sicknesses of the bodhisattvas arise from great compassion" (Thurman trans., p. 43) and every deed of great compassion manifests liberation, even sickness, old age, death, and rebirth (ibid., p. 46: "Even his reincarnation is like a liberation.").

[manifested] also the absolute truth. He completely vanquished the Four Demons of all space (dbyings su bcom pa'i) by his might in yoga. This great Victor among Siddhas suitably attained both the great and ordinary Accomplishments.

These things Lord Mila did: everywhere he established the doctrine of the practice lineage, wandering as a vagabond in the mountain solitudes. He benefited sentient beings immeasurably. This is the explication.

Thus the Saint-Guru,
Possessing the Six Perfections and Defeating the Four Mâras,
Having completed all his enlightened activity,
Manifested the way to pass out of misery [Parinirvâṇa];
I bow down to the completion of the Saint's biography (rnam thar). (26)

This is the meaning:

Then, Milarepa, Lord of Yogins, having completely and perfectly accomplished all the work of benefiting beings, taught all his disciples as much as possible [so that] signs of siddhi [appeared]. Having attained virtue, many of the disciples set out to benefit sentient beings.

Folio 260

They introduced the good custom of asceticism; as great meditators, wandering the mountain solitudes, they became

very eminent among the Guru Siddhas of this [Buddha] field of both India and Tibet.

When the Saint was seventy-three years old, the age of a person worthy of veneration, amid some of the people and some followers and disciples, [he said]: "Whether I die or don't die makes no difference; [except] in order to teach impermanence to those disciples possessing the view of permanence. Especially for the purpose of delighting Teacher Byang 'bar, in this year, I am going to manifest the impermanence of this illusion body." In the presence of a circle of his disciples, the Saint was giving an initiation. [dbang can lags mod/] The disciples said: "For the benefit of others, take pity and do not die." The Saint said: "Formerly, the Blessed One, the Mighty Sage also [died]; he displayed the manner of passing away from suffering. From that, there arose causes that became more beneficial for sentient beings. In the same way, the Gurus of the bKa' brgyud also display the manner of passing away from misery, thus bringing about a greater good for the benefit of sentient beings. Just as I can accomplish the good of sentient beings by not passing away from misery, and have up until now done so, I am also able to accomplish the good of beings by passing away from sorrow." Thus he displayed the manner of dying to the misery of this world in an exoteric way, so it is said.. "For the people, I am to appear in different aspects when I die." Then he sang this song:

I am the yogin Milarepa:

Having conquered the frost of Demon Yama,
[I] go to the further destiny;
At that time [of death], many things will be seen;
For some, a heap, essentially an apparitional
form (like a stûpa) will arise;
They will worship and make offerings to the Form
Of the corpse they clean;
For some, the apparition dies not [for Mind dies not]
Having become a rainbow body,

Folio 261

It departs this realm (dhâtu);
Thus, both apparencies [seem] true!

At that time, dwelling in the hermitage of Chu dbar, there were twelve yogins and yoginîs before him: 'Bri sgom g.yang legs and Yoginî lCam me and the rest. Their appearance was [like] the Six Lords of Light. Free of illness and other [obstacles], they abode, making [spiritual] progress.

In the hollow of his bed-linen, his rainbow-[like]-body-apparency departed. Ras pa Zhi ba skyong and Patroness Legs se, and some of the rest [saw] the apparition [snang ngor].

In Sñe nam, the Bon po Tsan dar 'bum, by the power of a passionate attachment, bestowed a fine turquoise on a beautiful woman as a bribe. He gave her a cup of curds into which poison with butter and tsampa had been mixed. [He said to her:] "You are to bring this and by various means get him to drink it. If Milarepa is an ordinary person, he

will let you come in; if he is non-ordinary, it will serve as an example. Otherwise, give me back my turquoise." So off she went.

The curds offered to the Saint were cool. The Saint accepted the curds, even though he knew [it was poisoned]. He gave the cup back to the beautiful woman. "Because of this deed, you have obtained a turquoise. Because of this, the deed is completely to fulfill the wishes of Bon Po Tsan dar. I am going to drink the curds. When it ripens fully, your connection toward [this deed] will not be too heavy; with my blessing..." He then sent the beautiful lady away.

Then, after a while, he was ill. The disciples asked: "How, if possible, is this sickness to be cured?" The Saint said: "It is not useful [to cure it]; at this time it is necessary that I go."[45]

"In the cave behind me, when I die, I have some money for the funeral, and some things that I give to you. You are to make offerings and perform worship, and so forth.

Folio 262

Now you are to [make reparation for] infractions [against] your vows," he said.

[45] Vimalakîrti (Thurman trans., p. 47) is again our clue to the Mahâyâna doctrines underlying bKa'brgyud pa spirituality in the rnam thars: "His liberative technique consists of not exhausting himself by trying to avoid all physical illness, and of applying himself to accomplish the benefit of living beings without interrupting the cycle of reincarnations." It is worth remembering that the first Karmapa, Dus gsum mkhyen pa, predicted his own reincarnation and was the first 'tulku' in Tibetan tradition.

Legs se said to him: "Since our Guru is without possessions, we need to take up a collection to make preparations for your funeral." She offered to do this, but he would not permit it.

Then, in the year of the monkey[46], on the evening of the full moon day of the last of the [three] spring months, unattached to all passions, his consciousness meditated; then, it went to the realm of the Clear Light in Space.

[He said:] "gShen chung pa, you have done me much good service. After I depart take my hat and my staff and bring them to Ras chung pa in a place called Lo ro."

Then, between nine and midnight, a butter lamp that burns for one night was lit and he gave Dharma teachings. In this way, he put his body in yoga position; he poised his hand in a mudrâ and said: "My sacred lamp is to be placed on my head." Thus they did as he said. He sat without moving all night. Then it was dawn. The attendants went to see [if it was] daybreak. He said: Get up to check the evidence. Is it [really] morning?" "Now, take away the lamp. Now it doesn't matter to me whether I meditate or not. But I am doing this for the purpose of showing you [a

[46] If the `Sheep year' of the birth account of rGyal thang pa is the water-female-sheep year, 1043, then this is 1116; if the birth year is the wood-female-sheep year, 1055, then this is 1128. The latter is more likely. Note that the age of 73 given in the text also corresponds to the differences 1043-1116 and 1055-1128. See Victoria K. Urubshurow, op. cit., Appendix II, pp. 385-386, for a discussion of Milarepa's chronology in the light of BA, pp. 427-37 and the rnam thar by gTsang smyon Heruka. These sources give his age at death as 83 (1040-1123, an iron-male-dragon year to a water-female-hare year).

good example]. I am an old man, so I am at the point of death. Even so, I meditate. If you don't meditate, you won't achieve Buddhahood. You must meditate." With that phrase, he died ('pho ba). He went to the place of accomplished practitioners in the sky. Then, in the midst of the atmosphere, there was a sound of music. A white ray of light emerged from the top of his head and remained, planted in the sky-realm. These and many other good omens occurred. Then, among the circle of disciples, there were tears in their eyes. They sat down before his remains and made offerings and prayers. Then behind his body,

Folio 263

in the crevice, they opened the ground, where there were three categories of items: [1. sacred objects:] a mirror with a flame, a flaming silk, a rusty knife. That was all he had. As for his external possessions [2], [there remained] a pouch of flour with white patches, several cotton garments almost without any holes and white undergarment ('gan rka) and [3] a ritual headress with a mirror[47] and little samaya texts. Other than these, there were no other possessions, objects, and whatnot. Thus the disciples thought: "We need a support for our devotion;" They made offerings to the corpse for a week into the intermediate state. Then the people of Brin and Sñe nam, patrons and patronesses, met together. The people of Brin wanted to take the corpse to the district of Brin. Those

[47] A Bard's hat, and symbol of Vajradhara.

from Sñe nam wanted to take it to Sñe nam. Thus they did not agree! The leader of the folk of Brin named rGya gar bya ba said: "You are in the right, and we are in the right. Now we both, Brin and Sñe nam, can be seen from the mountain between us; therefore, we will cremate the corpse there." They decided in favor of his advice. Then all the patrons and disciples as a group announced this publically. They met for three days. Then, at the time, the people of Brin, being covetous men, had intense devotion. At midnight they brought the corpse to Brin. They erected a shrine for the corpse. They [tried] to purify the corpse in a cremation fire, but amid the flames, it resisted [being burnt].

Then, at the place of the assembly of all the disciples, they made offerings together and were very sad. Then also, some of them fainted, some wept, some beat their breasts, some dishevelled their hair, etc. All of them became subdued. In the sky, there were many musical sounds descending.

Folio 264

From the heart cakra [of the corpse], flame arose of itself. Then, all the smoke came together to form a rainbow; all bowed their heads, and parasols, victory banners, and the eight auspicious objects and so forth appeared. In the sky, a sparkling light was all-pervading and there appeared together heroes and heroines; also many

assemblies of ḍâkinīs gathered in the realm of the sky. A voice from [the sky] spoke:

The Precious Guru departed at this time;
Among all the people of his place on earth-
Some are fainting, some weeping-
Crying out in lamentation, beating the breast,
Dishevelling the hair,
Making offerings very sincerely:
A self-arisen fire ignited from his heart,
The smoke became like a rainbow,
Bowing like a creeper;
Conches, a victory banner, and so forth,
Appear as signs with the eight auspicious omens-
With the sound of timbrel, conch and cymbals,
The sound of ram's horn, reed pipe and sitara,
The musical sounds are heard with the appearance
[of musicians]-
A delightful celestial assembly of the ḍâkinīs:
The Guru, powerful Lord of Ḍâkinīs-
[now] his pure corpse departs to its place in the
heavenly realm.

-and so forth, they sang, with many words and melodies. This was manifestly heard by all. All of those in that gathering became devoted with far more faith [than ever before].

Then, for many days of the intermediate state, offerings were made at the sepulchre [pur khang].

Afterwards, preparations [for burial] were made and the relics were arranged and placed in the tomb. Of the relics, not even a bit of the finger or toe nails were left because they had been taken by the heroes and ḍâkinîs.[48]

The aggregates composing the body [passed away] entirely without remainder (sku phung po lhag med du mngon pa) in the manner of a completely perfect Buddha. But the Nirmâṇakâya still exists in as many manifestations as are necessary to help disciples, and to accomplish the good of beings[49]. Also, in order to appear to certain disciples, an emanation went to Mang Khung.

Folio 265

One emanation dwelt in the place of White Rock ta po. So as to give Dharma teaching to certain disciples, he went to Mang Khung where dwelt Teacher Byang 'bar [the one who had tried to poison him; see above, Folio 260]. By the power of the former passions in his mind, he had offered poison to Milarepa, which the latter knew about all along. He went there for the benefit of that Teacher, in order to display impermanence for those beings [caught up in the idea of] permanence, that is how it is to be understood.

[48] This very strong tradition is found in BA, p. 436, and in the rnam thar by gTsang smyon there is an elaborate, theatrical description of the scene of the cremation and the 'spiriting away' of the relics, LM pp. 182-195.

[49] An example of such Buddha-activity may be found in the Śûramgamasamâdhi Sûtra, sections 142-147, the fictional Nirvâṇas of Mañjuśrî. Êtienne Lamotte, trans. La Concentration de la Marche Hèroique (Bruxelles: Institut Belge des Hautes Études Chinoises, 1965), pp. 242-245. See also the rnam thar of Vajradhara, folio 11.

Indeed, that is how attainment is brought about - by oneself, so it is said. He thus displayed the way to die happily. "Whatever you think or do, I follow your thoughts - thus I manifest dying."

In brief, the Saint Victor Milarepa came forth from the narrow passage of asceticism and austerity, for disciples essentially [both] capable and not capable, [showing] how one naturally possesses the happiness of full realization; he established the doctrine of the practice lineage, accomplishing the aims of innumerable sentient beings and disciples; having set out to liberate all ripened sentient beings from contact, memory, hearing, and sight. By contemplation, he completely passed beyond sorrow. This is the meaning!

These deeds of the Saint Victor Milarepa, have been combined by rGyal Thang pa bde chen rdo rje into a thorougly wonderful, sublime biography, which expresses faith clearly. It is now complete.

Beautiful! Corrected. Auspicious!

Part III

Chapter 11: Transliteration of the Tibetan Text of the Milarepa rnam thar by rGyal Thang pa from the dKar brgyud gser 'phreng: A Thirteenth Century Collection of Verse Hagiographies of the Succession of Eminent Masters of the 'Brug-pa dKar-brGyud Pa Tradition .

Reproduced from a rare manuscript from the library of Hemis Monastery (Ladakh) by the 8th Khams-sprul Don-brGyud-Nyi-ma. Published by the Sungrab Nyamso Gyunphel Parkhang Tibetan Craft Community, Tashijong, Palampur, H.P. (India). 1973. I-Tib-73-904146

189. // rje btsun gyi rgyal po mid la ras pa'i rnam thar bzhugs// ^

190. // na mo gu ru dha na/ de yang 'dir / rje btsun mid la ras pa zhes bgyi ba de'i rnam par thar pa la gñis/ rtsa ba'i tshig bstan ^ pa dang/ de'i don 'grel par bshad pa gñis su yod pa las/ dang po rtsa ba'i tshig tshigs su bcad te bstan pa ni// // shrī gu ru ba jra [va zra] dhva za [ja] na mo// rje btsun bla ma mid la ras pa rje// gang la gang 'dul sprul pa mchog gi sku// tha mal tshul bzung dka' spyad sna tshogs ^ bgyi/ yon tan rñes mdzad rje la gus phag 'tshal// (1) sngon gyi smon lam rten 'brel byed pa la// dzam gling bod yul lho bod so 'tshams [mtshams] sa// yul bran pha ^ lnga rtsa yi lung par 'khrungs // rje btsun

'khrungs pa'i gnas la gus phyag 'tshal// (2) pha mes rigs brgyud gdung rus mid la'i rigs// gdung rus mi che ^

191. rang bzhin phal pa'i sras// mi brgyud mi mang mi ngo ñung ba'i rigs/ rje btsun 'byon pa'i rigs la gus phyag 'tshal// (3) de lta'i rje btsun mid la ras pa ñid// ^ yum gyi lhums zhugs yum ñid ngal zhing dub// rmi lam gñid dus dka' la che ba'i ltas// rje btsun lhums zhugs la gus phyag 'tshal// (4) de ltar lhum zhugs zla dgu ngo bcu nas// ^ gza' skar bzang po zla tshes bcwa [bco] lnga la// mtshan ma'i ltas dang bcas te rje ñid 'khrungs// rje btsun 'khrungs pa'i dus la gus phyag 'tshal // (5) yab kyis rje ñid lhag ^ par gces par skyangs// yab de 'das nas kun gyis rtser ['tshe] zhing mnor// yum sras phongs nas glu slabs yon kun slangs/ rje btsun 'o[b] rgyal dus la gus phyag 'tshal// (6) ^ rje btsun glu slabs yon tan klog yon gyis// yum dang lcam mo 'bad nas bsos lags kyang// kun gyis gña' zhing [brñas shing] rku 'phrog sdug gsum du// rje btsun thugs skyo skyes la gus phyag 'tshal/ (7) ^ yum gyis skul nas ñi ma dbus phyogs su// mthu mkhan rtsal nas mthu ser chos kun zhus// dgra yul de ru 'thu btang ser ba phab// rje btsun mthu chen ldan ^ la gus phyag 'tshal// (8) mthu dang ser bas nges 'byung skyo ba skyes// dad gus 'khrungs nas dam pa'i lha chos dran // bla ma dam pa g.yu thog lha dga' sten// rje btsun ^

192. mar pa lung stan gus phyag 'tshal// (9) rgyags dang chos zhus mar pa'i drung du bzhugs// jo mo'i thugs zin rje btsun legs par skyangs// chos la dka' stan rje btsun las la bkol// rje btsun dka' las mdzad la ^ gus phyag 'tshal// (10) zhabs tog mdzad dang dam chos gnang ma ñan// jo mos ma phod rngog du chos la btang// rngog gis gsung sgrubs zab mo'i chos rnams gnang// ñams blangs sgrub pa mdzad la gus ^ phyag 'tshal// (11) dpon slob gdongs nas mar pa'i drung du byon// la? sgrib zad nas gdams pa'i snod dang ldan// man ngag chos rnams kun gyi bdag por gyur// rje btsun lung du stan la gus phyag 'tshal// (12) gdams pa'i bcud ^ ldan rje btsun mid la yis// chos kun thob nas ma dang sring mo dran// bla ma'i drung du yul du 'gro bar zhus// rje btsun snang ba thob la gus phyag 'tshal// (13) de ltar snang ba thob nas byon dus su// yab yum rje la ^ phyag 'tshal byin rlabs zhus// jo mo'i zhabs nas mos phyir lan bdun 'dzul// rje btsun dad pas [b]rgyal la gus phyag 'tshal // (14) de nas yar byon gung thang rtsa ru phebs// yum ñid gum nas zhing rengs khang pa sdib// ^ sring mo yul bud ngen shes tshad med 'khrungs// rje btsun nges 'byung mgur gsungs gus phyag 'tshal // (15) sring mo pe tas rje btsun phebs pa thos// brag dkar rdzong du lcam sring gñis po 'jal// sring mos 'jus nas gdung pas ^ ngu zhing brgyal // rje btsun lcam sring 'jal la gus phyag 'tshal // (16) tshe 'di blos btang ling nga la sogs pa'i// rdzong drug gnas la dka' ba spyad te sgoms// grogs med gcig pur sgrub pa'i rgyal mtshan rtsugs// rje btsun dka' thub ^

193. mthar phyin gus phyag 'tshal // (17) dus skabs de nas sñe nam phyogs su byon// yon bdag gcig gsol rgyags skyel [bya] bar byas// der yang ma bzhugs la phyis gangs la byon// rje btsun gangs la ^ sgoms la gus phyag 'tshal// (18) zla bdun lon nas rje btsun grongs par byas// mi 'ga' sgran nas rje btsun lta ru phin// rje ñid ma grongs yul der spyan grangs [drangs] pa'i// rje btsun ngo mtshar can la gus phyag 'tshal // (19) de rjes de ^ nas yon [mon?] gyi kha dod kyi// seng ge gling gi nags la sgoms du byon// der kyang da rung yon tan dpag med rñes// rje btsun dam pa khyed la gus phyag 'tshal// (20) de nas skabs la sñe nam grod bur bzhugs// a ne sring mos rje btsun ^ sñan pa thos// me tshan gñis kyis spyan 'dren 'jal du phyin// rje btsun 'jal nas mgur gsungs gus phyag 'tshal// (21) de rjes brin dang chu dbar gnas der bzhugs// tshe rings ma sogs lha 'dre dpag med kyis// ^ ltas dang cho 'phrul sdigs pa tshad med byas// bla mas tshar bcad rjes bzung gus phyag 'tshal// (22) de rjes sñe nam yul gyi lung par byon// sñe nam bon po bar dor 'khyam pa sgra// dge bshes dar blo rjes bzung dad par byas/ ^ dgu chen [dge 'dun, cf. 244.5] bsde tshogs btul la gus phyag 'tshal// (23) de ltar brin pa'i yon bdag pho mo la// ñams rtogs shar dang cong la 'phur ba dang// rje btsun bla ma bcom ldan sgrol mar mthong// rje btsun yon tan ldan la gus phyag 'tshal// (24) de ^ lta'i rje btsun mid la'i rnal 'byor pas// sa der ma bzhugs mnga' ris skor gsum dang/ g.yas ru lho byang gtsang gi sa cha sogs// ri khrod

phyogs med 'grims la gus phyag 'tshal// (25) de ltar rje btsun bla ma de ñid kyis / bdud ^

194. bzhi bcom nas yon tan drug dang ldan// phrin las rdzong nas mya ngan 'da' tshul stan// rje btsun rnam thar rdzogs la gus phyag 'tshal // (26) ces tshigs su bcad pa'i bstod pa/ rje btsun gyi rgyal po mid la ras pa'i/ rnam par thar pa'i rtsa ba'i ^ tshig gis bstod pa 'di ñid/ rgyal thang pa bde chen rdo rjes sbyar ba îthî // rje btsun bla ma mid la ras pa rje // gang la gang 'dul sprul pa mchog gi skus // tha mal tshul bzung ^ dka' spyad sna tshogs kyis // yon tan dpag med brñes mdzad gus phyag 'tshal // (1) ces pa'i don ni/ de yang rje btsun gyi rgyal po mid la ras pa zhes bgyi ba 'di ñid /spyir sangs rgyas kyi rnam 'phrul kho na yin te/ de yang sñigs ma lnga ^ rdo'i [bdo'i] dus 'dir tha mal pa'i tshul du byon nas/ tha mal pa'i sems can (?) rnams kyi 'gro don mdzad pa yin/ de yin par yang/ mdo las/ rdzogs pa'i sangs rgyas bcom ldan 'das // sñigs ma lnga rdo'i [bdo'i] dus tshod la// gang la gang 'dul ^ sku sprul nas// 'gro ba'i don la 'byon par 'gyur // la la dka' thub dka' spyad dang/ la la tha mal tshul du 'byon// sogs pa dang/ yang rdo rje gur las kyang/ gangs su snang nas kyang 'gro ba sems can gyi don ^ byed do/ seng ger snang nas kyang 'gro ba sems can gyi don byed do/ chang 'tshong ma dang/ smad 'tshong mar snang nas kyang 'gro ba sems can pa'i don byed do/ tha mal pa dang/ rigs dman par snang nas kyang 'gro ba sems can pa'i don byed do/ ces gsungs ^ pas/

des na rdzogs pa'i sangs rgyas ñid / tha mal pa dang rigs ngan par sprul nas 'gro ba sems can pa'i don byed par gsungs pas/ rje btsun rgyal po mid la ras pa ñid kyang / tha mal pa rnams kyi snang ngor/ tha mal pa'i skur ^

195. sprul nas/ tha mal pa rnams kyi don la byon par khums so// yang bla ma ras chung ba zhi ba 'od la/ rje btsun ñid rang gi zhal nas/ khyed kyi mno bsam la nga su yin [nam] shes kyin 'dug [gam] ^ ces gsungs/ zhi ba 'od kyis/ bdag rang gi sang ngor sangs rgyas gcig ka yin mnos kyin gda' zhus pas/ der bla ma'i zhal nas de 'ang khyod lus pos [mos gus] byed pa'i dus kyi skad gcig yin/ yin pa nga sangs rgyas rang gis lung [b]stan cing/ sangs rgyas ^ ñid rang gi rnam 'phrul du 'byon pa/ slob dpon 'phags pa klu sgrub sñing po zhes bya ba gcig yod pa/ de'i skye ba'i rnam 'phrul gcig nga yin gsung/ des nas rje btsun gyi rgyal po mid la ras pa 'di ñid/ sangs rgyas kyi sprul pa klu sgrub sñing po ^ dngos yin [s]te/ de yang/ nga da lta tha mal pa rnams kyi snang ngor/ tha mal pa'i skur sprul nas/ tha mal pa rnams kyi don la byon pa'o/ des na rje btsun gyi rgyal po mid la ras pa 'di ñid ni/ rigs tha mal pa mid la'i ^ rigs su sku skye ba bzhes la/ lus tha mal pa bzar med bgor med kyi lus su 'khrungs nas/ dka' thub dka' spyad sna tshogs pa'i sgo nas yon tan mñes [s]te/ sñigs ma lnga rdo'i [bdo'i] dus 'dir/ tha mal pa'i sems can gyi don kho na ^ la byon pa'o/ de rnams kyis tha mal pa rnams kyi snang ngor/ tha mal pa'i skur byon nas sprul pa'i skus sems can

pa'i don mdzad du byon pa'i don to// // sngon gyi smon lam rten 'brel byed stobs kyis// jam-gling [dzam-gling] ^ bod yul lho bod pa 'tshams [mtshams] sa// yul phran pha lnga rtsa ba'i lung par 'khrungs// rje btsun 'khrungs pa'i gnas la phag 'tshal bstod// (2) ces pa'i don ni/ de yang rje btsun gyi rgyal po mid la ras pa ñid/ spyir yang mes po spwa [swa yas?] [yas cod kyi = name of the clan?] ^

196. cod kyi mi rgyud kyi yul ni/ bar phug spyi'i las sgo ba yin la/ mes po'i ring la yul shor ba yin [s]te/ de yang mes po des tshong gcig pu la phyin cing/ cho long [cho lo] thebs tshad byas nas/ nor rdzas rnams zad/ ^ bu lon mang du zug nas/ yul der ma zug/ de'i dus su gung thang rtsa'i tshong pa mang po byang phyogs gcig mar yong pa la/ khong tshos tshong pa rnams kyi gnas tshang byas nas/ de'i gron po rnams dang sdongs nas/ gung thang rtsa'i ^ yul du byon to/ de yang yul de na/ spyir yul bran [phran ?] pha lnga zhes bya ba/ de yang/ ron pa/ dmungs/ shag pa/ dgun pa/ (r)tsa pa zhes bya ba yod pa'i nang nas/ rje btsun 'khrungs pa'i gnas ni/ (r)tsa zhes bgyi ba ^ de ru 'khrungs so// gnas de ñid du dang po yab kyis byon nas/ yul de ñid du mkhar btab (b)ste bzung ba lags so// de rnams kyis 'khrungs pa'i gnas ngos bzung ba'i don (s)to// // yab mes rigs brgyud ^ gdung rus mid la'i rigs// gdung rus mi che ring ngan phal pa'i sras// mi rgyud mi mang mi ngo ñung ba'i rigs// rje btsun 'byon pa'i rigs la gus phyag 'tshal // (3) ces pa'i don ni/ de yang rje btsun gyi rgyal

po mid la ^ ras pa ñid kyi/ gdung rus ni mid la'i rigs lags/ de la mes po mid la rdo rje rgyal mtshan/ yab mid la shes rab rgyal mtshan zhes bgyi ba/ thugs rgyud bzang ba/ kun dang mthun cha che ba/ rñing ma'i chos kyang [dan] bag tsam mkhyen ^ pa gcig yin/ de ñid kyis dgung lo ñi shu bzhes pa dang/ gung thang (r)tsa zhes bgyi ba de ñid du yul btab nas bzung pa lags so// de'i dus su yul phran pha lnga zhes pa de/ yul gyi tshan chung ba/ 'dzin mkhan gyi mi ^

197. ñung ba/ yul na grong re re gñis gñis las med pas/ de rnams me shi nas su la blong/ rgyags chad na su la skyi bya ba/ shin tu skyo ba'i yul yin/ de la myang tsha dkar rgyan ma zhes bya ba'i ^ bud med gcig yul de nas btsun mor bsu ste/ stabs (?) su bzhugs pa lags/ de yang mi brgyud kyang [dang] mi mang ste/ pha gcig bu gcig rang las med pas/ thams cad kyis (b)rñas pa'i gnas su byed pa khral dang 'u lag dang cher babs/ shin tu 'o ^ (b)rgyal par 'byung nas/ yul de mi zin khad la yod pa'i dus su/ yum des yab de 'bor tshad tshad yod pa dang/ yum de la nam tho rangs gcig rmi lam du/ bud med mi sdug pa'i mtshan dang ldan pa gcig 'ongs nas/ ang ge ^ gsan dang dkar legs ma// khyod kyi brtan grogs shes rab rgyal mtshan 'di// rigs ni mi bzang mid la'i rigs// rus ni mi che phal pa yin// khong rang shin tu ngan lags kyang// khong la mtshan ñid ldan pa'i bu// sras ^ gcig ñur [myur] du skye lags pas// 'di ñid ma 'bor stabs su sdod// gsung nas mgo la cab cab pa gcig byas nas mi snang bar song ngo// de rnams kyis rje btsun ñid kyi yab

mes gdung rus dang bcas pa bstan pa'i don to// ^ // de lta'i rje btsun mid la ras pa ñid/ yum gyi lhums zhugs yum ñid ngal zhing dub/ rmi lam gñid dus dka' las che ba'i ltas/ rje btsun lhums su zhugs la gus phyag 'tshal / (4) ces pa'i ^ don ni/ de yang rje btsun mid la ras pa de ñid/ ñang lam dkar legs ma zhes bgyi ba de ñid kyi lhums su/ sta pa'i zla ba tshes pa brgyad la/ yum gyi lhums su zhugs nas bzhugs pa'i du su/ yum de ñid kyang/ sku ngal zhing dub par yang ^

198. gyur/ khyad par du rmi lam dang gñid dus su/ rmi lam 'di lta bu sa (?) rang byung/ nub gcig yum dad kyis chu chen po yang ngag pa [dag pa] gcig rgal bas/ chu de rgol ba'i dus mi thar ba lta bu dka' thub dang/ dka' spyad dpag tu med pa byung zhing/ ^ rjes su 'ol le thar ba'i rmi ltas dang [rang] 'byung zhing/ yang nub gcig yum des ri chen po gcig la 'dzegs pas/ ri de la mi 'dzegs pa'i dka' thub dang dka' spyad chen pos rjes su 'ol le 'dzegs pa dang/ yang nub gcig bar snang na yar / ^ kras pa [kras ka] ring po gcig 'dug pa la 'dzegs pas/ de la mi thar ba'i dka' thub dang dka' spyad chen pos rjes su 'ol le thar ba dang/ yang yum de'i lhums nas/ seng ge'i phru gu gcig btsas pas/ de gso ba dang srol ba la dka' ^ thub dang dka' spyad chen po dgos pa byung ba dang/ de la sogs pa yum gyi lhums su bzhugs pa'i dus su/ yum de rmi ltas dang de ltar byung zhing/ ñin snang gi ñams snang la yang/ bal (b)kal ba la sogs pa las

ka gang dang gang byed ^ kyang/ dka' thub dang dka' spyad che ba/ zin rgyu ye med pa/ rjes su zin tsa na zin pa de ñid dngos po shin du dag pa re byung ngo// de rnams kyis rje btsun yum gyi lhums su bzhugs pa'i dus dka' thub dka' spyad de ltar du snang ngo ces ^ pa'i don to// // de ltar lhums zhugs zla dgu ngo bcu nas// bza' skar bzang po zla tshes bcwa [bco] lnga la// mtshan ma'i ltas dang bcas te rje ñid 'khrungs/ rje btsun 'khrungs pa'i ^ dus la phyag 'tshal bstod// ces pa'i don ni/ de yang rje btsun ñid/ zla dgu ngo dang bcu nas / lug gi lo/ smin drug gi zla ba'i tshes bcwa [bco] lnga'i ñi ma shar gros [dros] la/ ba gcig yod pa la be'u gcig skyes pas/ skyes mi thog [ma thag?] ^

199. la de'i bkri [sri?] bzhos pas [?] / 'o ma gung thang bre lnga byung / de dkrogs pas mar gung thang bre lnga byung/ phugs na nas bre lnga yod pa bu chung skyes pa'i lha gsol gyi chang btso bsam nas ^ btan pas/ nas khal lnga ru 'phel 'dug pa dang/ mar ri sa srang bcu tham pa 'gor ba yod pa de/ mar khal lnga ru song ba la sogs pa'i ltas bzang po dpag tu med pa dang bcas te bde bar 'khrungs so// dus de'i dus na ^ yab shes rab rgyal mtsan zhes bgyi ba de ñid kyis/ dgun ces pa'i yul der don spyod gcig la byon pa'i shul du 'khrungs pas/ der go na yod pa'i bu tsha gcig yod pa yab 'bod du btang nas phyin pas/ yab de la/ yum la ^ sras gcig dang tsas gda'/ ming 'dogs pa dang la yar byon zhus pas/ yab de ñid 'dzum mdzad nas/ gtam gcig thos pa la

da res kyi gtam de dga'/ bu de'i ming da lta rang du 'dogs pa yin no gsung nas/ sras de'i mtshan ^ yang thos ba dga' bya bar gsol to/ de rnams kyis rje btsun ñid ltas bzang po dang bcas te bde bar 'khrungs so ces pa'i don to// // yab kyis rje ñid lhag par gces par skyangs// yab de ^ 'das nas kun gyis rtser ['tsher] zhing mnor [mnar]// yum sras phongs nas glu slabs yon kun blangs/ rje btsun 'a ['o = dka'] rgyal dus la phyag tshal (b)stod// (6) ces pa'i don ñid / de yang/ rje mid la thos pa dga' ces pa de ñid la/ yab des ^ bu gcig par song ba'i stobs la rten nas/ lhag par gces par skyangs shing / shing tu skyid par bzhugs so/ de nas lo gsum nas bu mo gcig dang btsas/ de'i ming pe ta mgon skyid ces par btags so/ de lta bu'i yab yum sras bcas ^

200. thams cad shin du bde zhing long spyod bag tsam dang ldan par bzhugs/ de nas lo 'ga' zhigs nas/ yab de ñid la lho [glo ba] nad kyis btab ste/ cis kyang ma zlogs par gum/ der de'i phyogs su/ yod pa'i dngos pos thams cad btang nas/ yum smad gsum po la ^ cang yang med par bzhugs pas/ khyim mdzes [=mtshes] ñe 'brel 'dra yod pas/ khong yum smad la rngan 'chan ['tshan] byas te/ dkon rtsegs gcig yod pa dang gzhan yang nor mang dag phrogs/ der rdzas cha'i dngos pos cang yang med par/ yum smad gsum pos ^ bzhugs/ de'i dus dus su ma des/ ñid 'khal rkyed thags byas shing lcam sring gñis po bsos [gsos]/ de'i dus na yab ni gum/ nor ni zad / mi thams cad kyis rñas [brñas pa]/ gsol rgyu dang / snams rgyu ni med/ yum smad gsum gyi sha ni shor/ de'i dus su sa

phyogs de ^ na slob dpon rtsa pa zhes bya ba'i sngags pa yod pa la/ klog slabs pas klog gcig mkhyen/ khong de'i cho ga 'dra'i g.yog la gshegs shing/ de'i khyos ma dang klog gi yon gyis yum dang sring mo bsos kyang/ des kyang cang yang ^ phan par ma gyur/ rje btsun gyis glu mkhan gcig la glu slabs nas/ glu blangs pa'i yon gyis yum smad gñis po bsos pas kyang cang yang phan par ma gyur/ de'i bar skabs thams cad du 'ang khyim mdzes dang ñe 'brel thams cad kyis/ la las ^ rkus/ la las phrogs/ la las rtungs te/ yum sras gsum po la bde ba nang [ni] gcig dang [kyang] ma byung ngo// de rnams kyis rje btsun ñid kyis/ sems can pa'i snang ngor 'o rgyal zhing thugs nges 'byung dpag med 'khrungs so ces pa'i don to// // yum ^ gyis skul zhing ñi ma dbus phyogs su// mthu ldan rtsal [brtsal] nas mthu ser chos kun slabs// dgra yul de ru mthu btang ser ba phab// rje btsun mthu chen ldan la gus phyag 'tshal// (8) ces pa'i don ni/ de yang/ ^

201. dus de'i dus na mid la thos pa dga' zhes pa 'di ñid/ srang kha gcig na glu len cing yon blong gin yod tsa na/ 'a ma ni 'chi ma phrul byas nas byung/ der sras dang 'jal bas/ yum na re nga ^ la 'di 'dra'i bu gcig skye ba/ sdung ba'i dgra la ni gnod khab rtse gcig dang mi 'khyol/ byams pa'i gñen la ni phan spu rtse tsam dang mi thogs/ mid la shes rab rgyal mtshan la 'di 'dra'i bu rul/ 'ong ba / da lta rang ka yang ni/ nged ma ^ smad brdungs/ phugs na yod tshad phrogs byas so/ da 'dis khyod la phan par 'dug gam/ zer nas sa 'thor rdo 'thor byed du byung / der mid la thos

pa dgas phugs su byon gzigs pas / klog yon 'dra dang/ glu blangs pa'i yon ^ 'dra la byung ba'i / tsam tsums 'dra dang/ nas tsums 'dra la sogs pa dam dum yod pa tso ni khyer/ yum dang sring mo ni rdungs/ skra ni phyi / mgo ni zho thum bzhin btang 'dug/ de'i dus su yum smad pas gros mdzad pas/ yum na re/ da ^ 'u ma smad pas 'dir tshe phyir pa dang nam langs pa mi 'ong bar 'dug pas/ gzhan gyi thabs mi 'dug/ bu khyod ñi ma dbus su mthu slob tu rgyug la/ 'di rnams la sñing nad blan [glan] pa grag par 'dug zer nas/ de la gros ^ thag gcod/ grogs 'ga' dang bcas nas/ yum gyi nor zhing gcig yod pa de btsongs nas/ rta kham pa te la grags bya ba'i rta gcig khugs/ gzhan yang yum smad gñis kyis khur bla [gla] byas pas/ khugs pa'i tshos dum gcig dang byas [bcas] pa snams te dbus su ^ byon / ma sring gñis pos dang pal ma dpal thang thug pa skyel ma byas/ bu la sñing khrag mang du blud/ kha ta mang du bas [byas] nas/ khams pa'i tshod [tshong] pa mang du byung ba dang stongs nas dbus su byon// de nas dbus su bebs pa dang/ mi ^

202. thams cad la mthu su che dris pas/ yar lungs sgur po'i drung gi/ g.yu ston khro rgyal bas mthu che ba med zer ba thos nas/ der kha rag nas yar lungs su [du] byon/ g.yu ston khro rgyal gyi drung du phyin nas 'jal te/ rta kham pa khal ^ dang bcas pa phul te/ sngar gyi lo rgyus tso [tsho] zhib tu sñad te/ bdag la mthu'i chos dang/ rgyags gñis ka bla ma'i drung nas thugs la 'dogs par zhu zhus pas/ g.yu ston na re nga'i mthu la/ mdo sde 'bum la sogs pa'i bul ba

['bul] ^ tshad med pa phul nas zhu ba byung ste/ lus longs spyod yod tshad yul nas zhu ba khyod min ma byung/ sdug pa khyod kyis sdug myong 'dug pa/ ngas mthu chos myur por sbyin gyis gsung nas lo gcig sdad dgos so/ de la ngas mthu dang ^ ser ba la sogs pa gang dgos pa grub pa byas la btang gis gsungs/ de'i dus na/ mid la thos pa dgas/ thugs la rtags lags/ bdag cag ma smad la sdug 'di dang di 'dra 'byung ces da rtung lo rgyus zhib tu sñad nas spyan chab gcig btang bas/ ^ g.yu ston pa la yang 'chi ma 'byung nas/ a pa sdug pa khyed las sñing nge [rje] ba nga'i rtsa ru sngar ma byung/ khyod la sñing nas kyang mthu gcig rang dgos par 'dug gsung/ de la ngas [ngas las] mthu che ba'i/ grogs po sñing [sñegs?] khro rgyal bya ba'i bon po gcig ^ yod/ de'i bon po dang nga gñis mthu chos phar zhu tshur zhu byas pa'i mched grogs yin/ kho la mthu ser tshegs med pa ngas zhus te/ ngas gzhan la sbyin du med pa'i mnga' byas yod pas/ kho rang la zhu ru rgyugs gsung nas/ ^ rgod ma dkar mo gcig dang tshos thang gcig skur nas btang/ der bon po'i drung du mid la thos pa dgas byon nas sngar gyi rta tshos dang bcas pa bon po la phul nas/ gong bzhin sdug gtam mang po zhus nas/ mthu'i chos thugs la ^

203. brtag [btag] 'tshal ces zhus pas/ sñegs [?] khro rgyal na re/ nga'i rtsa 'dir ji tsam pa'i mi gcig byung ste/ khyod pas sdug pa sngar ma byung zer nas/ bon po la yang 'chi ma byung ngo/ de nas kho rang gi ^ bu gcig 'dug pa dang/ mid la thos pa dga' gñis la mthu slabs nas/ sñen

pa gcig 'dug pa la 'tshams bcad te/ zlas pa byas pas/ zla ba gcig ma lon par/ mthu grub pa'i rtags thams cad ma lus par rdzogs par byung/ dus de'i dus su/ yul ^ du sngun [sngon] gyi yum smad pa la sdang pa'i dgra de rnams la dmigs nas mthu btang bas/ mthu btang nas zhag gsum nas/ kho tso [tsho] la shin du sdang pa'i a khu g.yu rgyal bya ba'i bu gcig yod pa la sna [mna] ma gcig bsu nas/ de'i lha ston la mi ^ mang po gcig tshogs nas yod pas/ yid la med la khang pa sdibs nas/ kho rang pha spad kyis gtso byas pa'i / khong yum smad la shin du sdang ba'i dgra ñi shu rtsa lnga shi/ ma shi ba re re tsam la 'dre babs nas/ kha smra zhing/ nga ^ mid la thos pa dgas btang ba yin/ khyed kyi za 'dre la 'ongs pa yin zer cing/ 'dre babs pa thams cad shi'o/ mdor na dgra'i rigs su byas pa la ma shi ba rgan mod [mo gcig] byung ngo// de lta bu'i gtam de gcig nas gcig tu brgyud pas dbus su ^ phar gsan/ de'i dus su bon po na re/ bu khyod kyis nga sñag [sñegs ?] rin chog yod pa 'dug/ nga'i lha la btang dag thong/ rgan mo gcig las ma lus pa kho pa la sñing tshim zer cing/ bsod na de la yang tshegs med zer ro/ de'i ^ dus su (r)tsa ron pa tsos [tshos] gros byas nas/ ma smad 'di gñis ni bsad don mi gnas par 'dug/ mid la rang bsod [gsod] du phyin pa drag zer nas bros [gros] byung bas/ der mi gsum la rngan pa byin nas/ mid la thos pa dga' bsod [gsod] du ^

204. btong [gtong] ba'i grobs [grabs] byas so// de nas ma sring gñis pos rnal 'byor gcig byung ba la/ rngan pa

byins mid la la bya btongs su btang ngo/ de yang yig phrin springs nas bu yis go bcad do/ 'dir dgra thams cad shi/ de'i stobs la rten nas ^ nged la 'ang rdzas cha dam dum dang btad/ rgyags dang ldang tsam yod/ da rung dang rgyags sgrugs la btang gis/ yul du ma 'ong bar/ yul pa la ser ba'i lam na re ba gcig dang [kyang] pheb [phobs]/ khyod bsod pa'i mi song bas/ de la 'ang zon gyis gcig zer ^ ba'i yig lon skur btang bas/ de nas rnal 'byor pa des myur por dbus su phyin/ mid la thos pa dga' dang 'jal nas/ sngar gyi yig lon rnams zhib tu sñad pas/ mid la thos pa dga' yang sems kyi kho thag chod do// der ^ rnal 'byor pa rngan zan des yar log 'ongs pas/ mid la bsod pa'i mi rnams dang lam du phrad/ der gleng langs 'phros ma gtam byung bas/ kho pas dang [gsod] bya shor bar rig nas yar log go/ de nas mid la thos pa dgas/ bon ^ po'i drung du phyin te/ da bdag cag gi dgra yul der/ ser ba'i lam na re 'ong ba'i ser btad gcig thugs la 'dogs par zhu zhus pas/ g.yu ston na re/ de mi ston pa'i thabs med/ khyod kyis nga la blo bkal ba ^ yin pas/ stan [ston] gyis zer nas/ de lta bu'i ser ba'i man ngag stan nas/ zla ba gcig sgrubs pas / thun khol ba dang/ thun dong gi nang du 'brug drag [sgrags] pa la sogs pa'i rtags thams cad thon nas/ gung thang (r)tsa pa la ser ba phab pas/ lo ^ [tog] thams cad srus su 'chos tsam la ser ba babs nas lo tog thams cad btsom [bcom]/ ri thams cad shos rgal gyis grog par btang ngo// de lta bu'i ser ba de lo du ma'i bar du phab nas/ dgra thams cad rlag par byas so/ mdor na / de rnams kyis/ mid la thos pa dga' ^

205. ces pa de ñid kyis/ dbus su byon nas mthu slabs so ces pa'i don te// // mthu dang ser bas nges 'byung skyo ba skyes// dad gus 'khrungs nas dam pa'i lha chos dran// bla ma dam ^ pa g.yu thog lha dga' rten [bsten]// rje btsun mar pa lung stan gus phyag 'tshal // (9) ces pa'i don ni/ rje mid la thos pa dga' ces pa de ñid/ mthus mi mang po bsad/ ser bas yul zhing bcom/ mdor na sems can la gnod pa tshan ^ tsher mdzad pa de la/ thugs 'gyod pa dang nges 'byung dpag tu med pa 'khrungs nas/ bla ma g.yu thog lha dga'i drung du byon nas/ bdag gis de lta bu'i zhu ba ñid cag bla ma gñis la bgyis/ mthu dang ser ba la grub pa thob/ de stobs ^ la rten nas [brten nas] sems can la gnod par gyur pa'i las dpag med gcig bsags dga' lags/ de la da nang tho rangs 'gyod pa dpag tu med pa skyes lags/ da bdag gi sdig pa thams cad mthol bshags su 'bul cing/ bla ma dam pa khyed ñid kyis bdag la ^ tshe gcig lus gcig la sangs rgyas ba'i dam pa'i chos gcig thugs la rtags 'tshal ces zhus pas/ bla ma'i zhal nas de shin du legs/ nga la gdams pa yod pa mar dag yod de/ ngas khyed tshe gcig lus gcig lus gcig la sangs rgyas ba'i bla ma bag mi yong/ ñang ^ stod na bla ma dam pa 'bre ston lha dga' zhes bya ba phun sum tshogs pa gcig bzhugs/ der song la dam pa'i chos zhus ces gsung nas/ bla ma de ñid dang [bon po] de gñis kyis chos rgyags mang du skur nas/ ñang stod du byon te/ bla ma 'bre ston lha dga' la ^ 'jal nas/ sngar gyi byas lugs thams cad zhus pas/ bla ma'i zhal nas bu khyed shin du sdig pa che bar 'dug/ nga la

rdzogs pa chen po zhes bya ba'i [dam chos] nang rtogs nang sangs rgyas/ nub rtogs nub sangs rgyas ba/ sdig pa thams cad zil gyis non cing/ tshe ^

206. gcig lus gcig la sangs rgyas ba'i dam chos de khyod la stan zhes sung/ der mid la shin tu mñes te/ chos gñan nas ñams su blangs pas/ yon tan cho chad pa skye ru ma 'dod/ bla ma la zhus pas/ bla ma'i zhal nas khyed kyis sdig ^ sgrib ji tsam rang bsags pa yin pa gsungs/ der mid la thos pa dgas/ sngar gyi mthu ser la sogs pa'i sdig pa byas tshul rgyas par zhus pas/ bla ma'i zhal nas/ nga ni de tsam gyi sdig pa rang yang med dam bsam pa yin te/ de tsam ^ gyi sdig pa 'dug pa/ ngas khyod kyi 'dren pa gar 'ongs gsung nas/ spyan chab dang mang du shor/ da bu khyod kyi 'dren pa 'ong ba'i bla ma/ rje btsun chen po nâ ro pa'i dngos slob / mar pa lo tstsha zhes bya ba/ lho brag na ^ bzhugs kyis/ der song la chos zhus/ des khyod kyi 'dren pa tub pa yin gsung/ nga 'ang der/ chos zhu tu 'gro/ ngas khyod kyi sa sna byas la 'gro yis gsung nas/ dpon slob gñis pos sdongs nas gshegs so/ de'i ^ dus su lam kha gcig tu/ mid la thos pa dgas/ bla ma 'dre ['bre] ston la/ bla ma mar pa 'am de ji 'dra gcig yin/ chos ci mkhyen/ bla ma gang sten [bstan] / yon tan ji tsam mnga' ba gcig lags zhus pas/ der bla mas/ bla ma mar pa'i yon tan dang rnam par thar pa rnams rgyas par bshad pas/ mid la thos pa dga' ñid/ de lta bu'i bla ma'i yon tan bsan pa [nas] la rten [brten] nas/ mos gus tshad med pa skyes/ bla ma mar

pa bzhugs pa'i phyogs su phag mang du btsal/ bla ma 'bre ^ ston la yang mos pa dang gus pas phyag 'tshal/ zhabs spyi thog tu blangs / bla ma dam pa ñid kyis bdag gi 'dren pa'i bla ma mdzad thugs la btags/ sku drin che lags ces [zhes] zhus so// mdor na de rnams kyis mid la thos ^

207. pa dga' ces pa de ñid/ mthu ser gyis las bsags pa la/ thugs nges 'byung skyes shing/ bla ma la mos gus dpag med 'khrungs so/ ces pa'i don to// // rgyags dang ^ chos zhus mar pa'i drung du bzhugs// jo ma'i thugs zin rje btsun legs par skyangs [bskyangs]// chos la dka' stan rje btsun las la bkol// rje btsun dka' las mdzad la gus phyag 'tshal// (10) ces pa'i don ni/ de yang rje mid la thos ^ pa dga' ces pa de ñid kyis/ bla ma'i zhabs tog byas nas gshegs pas/ bla ma 'bre ston sku khams gcig zi nas bzhugs/ mid la thos pa dgas bla ma mar pa'i drung du gshegs ste/ lho brag tu phebs pa dang/ bla ma ^ mar pa'i gnas na yar byon pas/ zhing rengs gcig gi thog na/ phru rlog pa'i sngags pa dpon g.yog gñis gsum gcig 'dug pa dang phrad/ yul 'di na bla ma mar pa blo gros zhes bya ba/ bla ma dam pa dpal n(â) ro pa'i dngos slob dpon ^ gcig bzhugs zer gda' ba gang na bzhugs lags byas pas/ sngags pa rgan pa de na re/ ngas 'jal kha zhus la 'ong gis/ khyod rang phru 'di glogs [rlogs shig] gcig zer nas/ nang du gshegs song/ mid las krad cad nas phru rlogs pas/ en ^ tsam nas khru de rlog pa tshar nas sgugs shing bzhugs pas/ yug [phug?] nas yar shog zer nas 'bod du byung nas nang du gshegs pas/ da kyi'i [phyi'i]

sngags pa phru rlogs pa de ñid/ tsams se [cams se] skyer kha gcig snam(s)/ grum ze [tse] gcig gi kha na ni bzhugs/ zhal ^ gyi sa ngad rnams ni phyis/ zhal bag bibs nas bzhugs pa dang 'jal/ mid la'i thugs dgongs la/ de ci'i phru rlog pa de ka yin par 'dug dgongs shing phyag mang du btsal ['tshal]/ phyag rten gyi rnam pa gcig yod pa phul nas ^

208. sngar gyi lo rgyus rnams zhib tu zhus te/ bdag gis bla ma khyed ñid kyi sñan pa thos nas/ drung du mchis pa lags thugs rjes 'dzin par zhu lags/ de yang [bdag la]/ rgyags dang chos gñis ka/ drung nas thugs la rtag 'tshal lags ['dags 'tshal; cf. ngo shes pa] shes zhus pas/ ^ mar pa'i zhal nas/ rgyags 'dod na chos mi 'ong/ chos 'dod na rgyags mi 'ong/ gñis po gang rung gcig ngas sbyin gyis/ khyod rang 'doms (g)sung/ der mid las 'o na bdag la chos thugs rjes 'dzin par zhu/ rgyags bdag rang bsod sñoms ^ 'dra dang gang tub tub bgyid par zhu lags ces zhus pas/ bla ma'i zhal nas/ 'o na chos kyi yon la las ka byed dgos so/ khyod rang rgyags sgrugs la shog gcig sung/ der rje mid la thos pa dgas/ de 'i nang par nas ^ yul phyogs gcig na mar gshegs te/ res glu blangs / res dbyangs 'dra blangs shing/ bsod sñoms mdzad pas/ yul phyogs de nas nas mang du rñed/ de'i nas tshugs pa gang khur nas 'ongs te/ bla ma'i btsun mo la nas de ^ phul nas/ bdag jo mo'i zhabs tog gang dgos sgrub lags/ nas 'di yang 'bul lags/ bdag la bza' rgyu than thun dang/ jo mos thugs la thugs jo mo ces zhus nas/ jo mo'i zhabs tog la 'bad pas/ jo mo'i thugs ^ zin te legs par

skyangs so// de nas bla ma'i zhal nas/ mid la thos pa dga' khyod kyi ming/ a ka mthu chen bya bar 'dogs so/ nga la nang par nas dgra byung na/ khyod kyi mthus bsad dgos so a gsung/ ^ de'i nang par bla ma mar pa'i zhal nas/ a ka mthu chen / da srog mkhar skya bo bya ba'i mkhar rtsig pa yin pas/ de'i rdo ba thams cad khyod kyi chos kyi yon la skyos gcig [shig] gsung/ der mid las/ de'i nang par ^

209. na mar/ rdo ba yun ring po'i bar du 'bad nas skyas pas/ sku rgyab la sgal pa byung/ dus de'i dus su/ jo mos/ rgyab kyi sgal pa 'di (g)sos (g)sos ngal so ru chud [chug] mdzod ces mar pa'i drung du ^ zhus pas/ bla ma'i zhal nas/ da phrag pa g.yas la khol la rdo ba skyos [skyes] gsung/ de bzhin du mdzad nas yun ring du skyas pas/ phrag pa g.yas la 'ang sgal pa byung/ yang bla ma la jo mos zhus pas/ ^ phrag pa g.yon pa la khol la skyes sung/ yang de bzhin du mdzad nas yun ring po'i bar du 'bad nas skyas pas/ phrag pa g.yon pa yang rdol/ mdor na sgal pa gsum gsum byung byung rdo ba skyas [pa] dang [kyang]/ chos tshig gcig dang ^ [kyang] gnang du ma 'dod/ der jo mos sha khog pa gcig dang mar ril gcig skur nas/ 'di la dbang khal gyis la/ do nub dbang zhu ba gcig pa 'dug gis/ khyod rang dang [yang] dbang la zhugs gcig gsung nas/ bla ma mid las de gñis khyed nas ^ phul te dbang la zhugs pas/ de gñis la cher re gzigs nas/ sha 'di ni nga la yon bdag che ge mos phul ba de yin par 'dug/ mar 'di ni yon bdag mo tho pe mos phul ba'i mar yin par 'dug/ nga'i mar dang sha ^ khyer nas khyod dbang zhu ba

gsung nas/ thos pa dga'i sñags spu nas brud nas phyir bton/ dbang ma gnang bas/ jo mo na re/ khos dang sdug pa'i las tshad med pa byas/ rdo bas rgyab la sgal ~~pa byung~~ byung skyas pa lags mod/ mi ^ la sgal pa byung ba kho min pa su gdog pa/ dud 'gro ni ma lags/ da lan chos gnong la thong mdzod/ ye mi gnang na kho rang gar shed btang pa grag par brda [gda'] zhus pas/ de khyod la bcol ba med kyis/ nga rang ^

210. shes / nga'i sha dang mar skur nas/ kho la chos gcig 'ong ngos shes pa gsung ste gnang du ma 'dod/ bla ma'i zhal nas/ chos 'dod na mkhar 'di myur por rtsigs sung/ 'o na sgal pa mang po gda' ba/ ji ltar du bgyid ^ lags zhus pas/ dud 'gro la yang sgal khang [khung] byas nas 'khol gyin 'dug pa/ sgal pa la sgal khang [khung] chos la rdo ba skyos sung/ der mid la'i thugs dgongs la/ bla ma'i gsung yin/ dam pa'i chos 'dod pa yin/ las ^ kyi sgrib pa sbyong ba yin dgongs nas/ nga la phan sñam nas / thugs rus skyed la mkhal la so btab nas/ sgal kang [khung] bcas [byas] te 'bad nas rdo ba skyas pas/ rkang lag thams cad ni ña ris chu shags su song/ sgal pa rnams ni ^ jir/ lus kyi sha ni zad ste shin du sdug cing 'o rgyal bas/ rdzes su [rjes su] sku mkhar skya bo thog dgu yong pa de 'byons so [bzhengs so]/ de rnams kyis mid la thos pa dga' ces pa des/ mtshan ldan gyi bla ma rten nas [bste nas] / bla ma'i gsung ^ bzhin (b)sgrubs te/ dka' ba dpag med bcod [spyad do] ces pa'i don to/ // zhabs tog mdzad kyang dam chos gnang

ma ñan/ jo mos ma phod rngog tu chos la btang/ rngog gis gsung sgrubs zab ^ mo'i chos kun gnang/ ñams blangs sgrub pa mdzad la phyag 'tshal stod// (11) ces pa'i don ni/ de yang mid la thos pa dga' ñid kyis/ de lta bu'i dka' thub dka' spyad du mas zhabs tog sgrubs pa dang/ chos tshig gcig dang [kyang] ^ gnang du ma 'dod par/ jo mo'i thugs dgongs la/ da 'di tsam gyis las byas dang/ chos ni ye mi gnang par 'dug/ sdun pa 'di sñing bar 'dug pas/ kho rang la rdzas cha gcig skur la/ rngog chos kyi rdo'i drung du ^

211. chos zhu ru btang ba grag [drag] par 'dug dgongs nas/ dpal na ro pa'i dbu skra gcig dang/ na bza'i dum bu gcig dang gzhan nang [yang?] rgyags en tsam gcig dang bcas pa phag tu skur nas da ltar nga dang ^ bla ma gñis kar shol [shel?] 'debs dang ye ma sdod par chos zhu ru rgyug gcig gsung/ der mid la thos pa dga' de ñid kyis/ bla ma'i drung du/ bdag res gcig bla ma rngog gi drung du phyin nas chos 'tra ['dra] zhus te/ myur por yang bla ma'i ^ drung du 'ong bar zhu lags ces zhus pas/ bla ma'i zhal nas [/] a po khyod ngas chos ma byin pas ma dga' bar 'dug ste/ nga la nâ ro pa paṇ chen gyi thugs kyi ñing khu zab la mang ba'i gdams pa yod/ kho de sdod ^ ces sung/ der mid las bdag lan gcig cis kyang tsab pa gcig phyin nas/ de nas myur du drung du log 'ong bar zhe zhus zhus nas/ ma gñan par/ phyag 'tshal te 'ongs pas/ bla ma'i zhal nas / jo mo jo mo khyod rang gi thos pa ^ dga' song ngo gros thob gros thob sung/ der jo mos gros btab pa dang ma thebs pa'i tshig tu byas/ khong la

'phrul brdeg gcig dang rdeg pa'i tshig mdzad nas btang bas/ bla ma byon nas kho 'khros pa yin [brdos pa?]/ khyod kyis kho ^ la rdzas cha ma skur ram gsung/ skur ba mi bdog lags zhus pas/ min skur yod/ thos pa dga' chos zhu tu gzhan du 'gro ba la/ ngas rgyags skur ba mi 'ong gsung nas ded de/ jo mos skur ba'i rdzas cha rnams ni phrogs/ phyi ^ sgan sngas sgan gcig rgyab nas gshegs so/ der thos pa dgas bzhengs te/ rngog chos kyi rdo rje'i drung du byon pas/ bla ma la 'jal/ dad cing gus pas phyag 'tshal / sñun zhus pas/ rngog gi zhal nas/ nga'i bla ma mar pa lo ^

212. tstsha'i phyag byed lugs gcig byung/ khyod kyis gang nas 'ongs gsung/ d(e)r mid las bdag gis bla ma mar pa lho brag pa'i drung nas 'ongs pa lags zhus pas/ bla ma rngog gi zhal nas/ 'o na khyed bla ma'i drung na yod pa'i mid la thos ^ pa dga' bya ba de yin nam sung/ der bdag thos pa dga' ces pa lags/ bdag jo mos khyed kyi drung du btang ba lags gsung yig 'di dang/ dpal na ro pa'i dbu skra 'di dang/ na bza'i dum pa 'di yang 'bul cing gda' lags/ bdag ^ cag la chos bla ma mar pa nas brgyud pa gcig dang thugs la btag 'tshal lags zhus pas/ bla ma rngog gi zhal nas/ jo mo'i gsung de ltar yin na/ chos los dang stan dgos / chos ston pa'i dang la/ nga la gra [dgra] gcig yod/ de la ser ^ ba phob gcig de nas ngas chos stan gyi sung/ de ltar du thos pa dgas dang [kyang] zhal gyis bzhes nas/ dol gyi tshogs 'dus pas/ bla ma rngog gi gnag lug khyer 'dug pa'i lan la/ zhing gi dkyil du ser btad rtsugs nas/ ser ba ^

phab pas/ ser ba shin du che ba gcig phebs nas/ yul de'i mkhar mang po yang zhig/ lo thog thams cad yang bcom nas/ mi thams cad du cogs theg ge song/ de nas tshur byon pas/ ser bas bya bsad pa'i ro khong rang gi rdong du [mdun du? rdogs su?] byung ba rnams ^ sdus nas byon pas/ thug khud tshel pa gang byung/ de snams nas/ ñen shes tshad med pa 'khrungs/ ^ngas tshe gcig tu rdzogs pa'i sangs rgyas thob par bya ba'i phyir du chos zhus pa la/ 'di 'dra'i las ngan bsags sñam nas bshums shing byon pas/ bla ^ ma rngog gi zhal nas/ khyod kyis sleb bam ser ba phebs [phab] sam gsung/ der ser ba shin du che ba gcig phebs lags te/ yul gyi mkhar mang po bshig / lo thog thams cad bcom/ mi thams cad bsdug bsngal du gyur/ sa dang bar snang la gnas pa'i ^

213. sems can thams cad bsad / bdag sangs rgyas gcig sgrub tu bla ma'i drung du 'ongs pa la/ dmyal ba'i las 'di lta bu da bsags bda'i ces zhus nas/ bya ro thu gang po de bla ma'i drung du spungs te/ bshums shing bzhugs ^ pas/ der bla ma rngog gi jo mos mid la bu ma ngu gsung zhing brid/ bla ma rngog gi zhal nas/ bu ma ngu/ ngu mi dgos/ sdig pa thams cad rdzes su mi 'brang bar zil gyis mnon cing/ tshe gcig lus gcig la sangs rgyas ba'i zab chos ^ yod/ de khyed la mi ster ram gsung nas/ chos dbu theg tu gzhag nas dbu sñing bzhes te/ da ka'i tshe mo la bdag med ma'i rdzes gnang gcig gnang nas/ sdig po che bseb [bseg?] lam nas 'khrid par byed pa la thabs lam khyad par ^ du gcig phags pa'i chos la sogs pa/ zab mo'i chos tshad med pa mang du

gnang nas/ bla ma yab yum gñis pos rgyags gnang nas brag phug gcig tu 'dag char [sbyar ba] byas te/ lo gcig gi bar du sgrub pa la bzhugs/ rtogs pa ni ma shar/ ñams ^ myong ni en tsam skyes// de rnams kyis mid la thos pa dga' ces pa de ñid kyis/ bla ma rngog dang 'jal nas zab mo'i chos zhus so ces pa'i don to// // dpon slob sdongs nas mar pa'i drung du byon// ^ las sgrib zad nas gdams pa'i snod dang ldan/ gdam ngag chos rnams kun gyi bdag por gyur// rje btsun lung du stan la phyag 'tshal (s)tod// (12) ces pa'i don ni/ de yang rje mid la thos pa dga' ces pa de ñid kyis sgrub pa thon par ^ dang/ bla ma rngog gi zhal nas/ da bla ma'i sku mkhar dgu thog grub pa de la dbul ba gcig skyel du 'gro ba yin/ khyod rang dang 'deng ngo(g?) gsung nas/ chos dang zang zing gi 'bul ba tshad med khyer nas/ dpon slob pas sdongs ^

214. nas byon no/ de nas bla ma mid las sngan la byon te/ jo mo dang 'jal phyag byas sñun zhus pas/ jo mo yang shin du mñes te/ mid la'i phyag nas 'then/ dbu la zha 'bi (?) byas/ bla ma'i drung du yang 'jal ^ phyag byas sñun zhus pas/ bla ma shin du mñes te khyod kyis rdol lam chos byung ngam gsung/ der byung lugs rnams zhib tu zhus pas/ bzang gsung / de nas bla ma rngog gis dang gdan phebs/ 'bul ba gya nom pa mang po phul/ ^ dpon slob thams cad zhal 'dzom pa'i dus na/ bla ma'i zhal nas/ bla ma rngog la/ khyod kyis mid la la chos byin nam gsung/ bdag gis chos byin lags zhus pas/ mar pa'i zhal nas shin du yang legs so/

na ning nas nga ^ mid la la chos mi ster ba de/ nga thugs rje chung ba yang yin/ kho'i rgyud la sdig sgrib dpag tu med pa 'dug pas/ de rnams sbyang ba'i phyir/ khru rlog pa dang/ mkhar rtsig pa la sogs pa la bkol ba yin/ spyir mid la khyod ^ snod-[rung] ldan pa'i gang zag gcig 'dug/ gdam ngag gi snod du rung ba yin/ khyod kyi sngon 'gro sdig sbyong la sogs pa yongs su tshar yod/ da dngos gzhi gdam ngag phog pas chog par yod pas/ khyod la gang dgos ster ba yin pas nga'i ^ rtsa ru sdod gcig gsung nas/ grwa pa rnams kyi rtsa ru bla ma'i zhal nas/ da lo'i lo 'di shin du dog/ zla ba drug bya ba da su dang yang mi phrad par 'tshams gcod do gsung nas/ gzhan thams cad la 'tshams bcad de/ rje mid la ñid la ^ dbang gdams ngag sems skyed la sogs pa'i chos thams cad bum pa gang [ye? spo = byo?] tshul du gnang ngo/ de lta bu'i chos rnams yongs su rdzogs pa dang gñis de rnams la ñams len dang sgrub pa dgos so gsung/ de la ji tsam pa 'tshal zhus pas/ spyir du grub pa thob thob ^

215. dgos / khyar du 'di la lo gsum bya ba ñams len dgos pa yin no gsung/ der rje mid la ñid kyis / de lta bu'i sgrub pa rnams bdag rang gi yul na ri khrod gnas chen phun sum tshogs pa mang po bdog de rnams su ^ sgrub pa byed/ da rung yang 'di rnams kyi gags sel [gegs sel] dang/ bogs 'don la sogs pa rnams thugs la 'dogs par zhu ces zhus pas/ bla ma'i zhal nas/ de de ltar du rung gsung nas/ gags sel bogs 'don la sogs pa rjes kyi chos ma lus pa yang ^ gnang / ngas bla ma na ro pas gtso mdzad pa'i/ bla ma mkhas grub

bcu gsum lo ñi shu sten pa'i gdams ngag thams cad khyod la ma rdzogs ri (?) gsung nas/ dbu sñing yang bzhes so/ de nas mid la ñid kyis gdams ngag de rnams thob pa dang/ bla ma ^ rngog chos kyi rdo rje ru byon te/ grub mtha' chos la ltas sdur byas pa dang/ mid la mi lhag rgyu ma byung/ gdams ngag gi chos zab sdur byas pas kyang/ 'pho ba'i gnas skabs na/ rngog bag tsam du zab rung ba gcig 'dug ^ de min mid la mi lhag rgyu ma byung/ sgoms pa'i ñams la ñams sdur byas pas dang mid la mi lhag rgyu ma byung nas/ der mid la'i thugs dgongs la/ rngog chos kyi rdo rje 'di ñid/ rje mar pa ñid kyi bu chen rnams kyi nang nas ^ mchog tu gyur pa/ gdams pa thams cad ma thob pa med pa yin pa la/ don la 'di ñid pas kyang nga mi lhag rgyu med pa'i chos gcig gnang 'dug dgongs / rje mar pa lho brag pa la mos gus tshad med skyes/ khong rang la yang dga' ba dang ^ spro ba tshad med pa byung ngo/ de rnams kyis / rje btsun mid la ñid kyis/ rje mar pa lho brag pa chen po de ñid sten cing las sgrib thams cad zad nas gdams pa'i snod du gyur cing/ sñan rgyud kyi chos thams cad thugs la lon pa'i don to// // ^

216. gdams pa'i bcud ldan rje btsun mid la yis// chos kun thob nas ma dang sring mo dran// bla ma'i drung du yul du 'gro bar zhus// rje btsun snang [gnang] ba thob la gus phyag 'tshal// (13) ces pa'i don ni/ de yang / rje btsun mid la thos ^ pa dga' ces pa de ñid kyis/ gdams pa'i chos thams cad ni yong su rdzogs/ gags sel dang bogs 'don la sogs pa'i gnad thams cad ni mkhyen/ chos kyi me tog la

sgrub pa lo gsum rang yul gyi gnas chen rnams su btang dngos su 'gro bar bzhed pa dang/ ^ yun ring po'i bar du yul du ma byon pas/ ma dang sring mo la sogs pa yang thugs la 'dod nas/ der bla ma'i drung du byon te/ bla ma rin po che bkhyed ñid kyis thugs rjes bzung ba'i stobs la sten nas/ bdag gis bsags pa'i sdig pa thams cad ni dag / gdams ^ pa'i chos ma lus pa ni bum pa gang spo'i tshul du thob/ gags sel dang bogs 'don gyi gnad thams cad ni mkhyen/ da chos kyi me tog la kha ring ji ltar zhus pa bzhin/ bdag rang gi yul na gnas chen phun sum tshogs pa gdog lags/ de rnams su ^ ji srid grub pa ma thob kyi bar du sgrub pa byed lags shing/ skabs skabs su bla ma yab yum gyi drung du 'jal du 'ong ba gcig thugs rjes 'dzin par zhu ces zhus pas/ bla ma'i zhal nas/ bu khyod rang ji ltar zer ba bzhin/ gdams pa thams cad ^ ma lus par rdzogs par byas yod/ gags sel bogs 'don la sogs pa'i gnad thams cad stan yod/ las sgrib thams cad byang zhing dag par byas yod pas/ ngas kha ring ji ltar byas pa bzhin du/ nga'i chos kyi me tog la / spyir grub pa nam thob thob [thob po] ^ kyi bar du sgoms/ khyad par du mi dang ye mi 'phrad pa'i sgrub pa lo gsum bya ba gyis/ skabs skabs su nga la yang phrad du shog la / yul du rgyug cig gsung ste/ mid la ñid kyis yul du gshegs [gsher shing?] par thugs thag bcad cing gnang ba ^

217. thos po// de rnams kyis rje mid la thos pa dga' zhes pa de ñid kyis/ gdams pa'i chos ma lus par rdzogs par thob nas/ yul du gshegs [gsher shin] par snang ba thob po

ces pa'i don to// // de ^ ltar snang [gnang] ba thob nas byon dus su// yab yum rje la phyag 'tshal byin rlabs zhus// jo mo'i zhabs nas mos phyir lan bdun 'dzul// rje btsun dad pas brgyal la gus phyag 'tshal // (14) ces pa'i don ni/ de yang / rje mid ^ la thos pa dga' ces pa des/ bla ma la yul du 'byon pa'i snang [gnang] ba legs par thob nas/ bla ma yab yum gñis kyis chos dang lam chas kyi rdzong nga yang mdzad nas/ yar byon par chos pas/ bla ma yab yum gñis pos dang [yang] bag tsam ^ skye pa mi la byon te/ bla ma mar pa lho brag pa'i zhal nas/ mid la thos pa dga' khyod/ bsags pa'i las shugs che ba gcig 'dug/ bla ma la mos gus che ba gcig 'dug/ sñing rus kyi gcad kham che ba gcig 'dug/ ^ bla ma nga'i gdams ngag yod tshad thams cad ma lus par rdzogs par byin yod pas/ khyod kyis bka' (b)rgyud kyi pha rabs zung gcig/ sgrub rgyud kyi bstan pa tshugs cig [shig]/ ces gsung te/ thugs la thugs sprod chos kyi bdag por skos so// de nas mid la thos ^ pa dga' ñid kyis/ bla ma yab yum [gñis] la dang cing gus pas phyag re 'tshal/ zhabs la re 'dzus/ yug re bshums/ yang phyag 'tshal zhabs la 'dzus/ yug re bshums mdzad/ de'i dus su bla ma'i zhabs spyi thog tu ^ gzhag/ dus rang rnam pa thams cad du mi 'bral cing rgyud byin gyis rlob par zhal gyis bzhes shing/ mid la thos pa dga' khyod skabs skabs su nga la yang 'phrad du shog a gsung nas bla ma ni gshegs so/ de nas/ dang [yang] jo mos bag ^

218. tsam gcig skyal nas/ da thos pa dga' khyod nga'i rmi lam la g.yud yod na/ bka' brgyud bstan pa'i 'gram gzhi 'dzin pa gcig dang [kyang] 'ong par 'dug/ sgrub rgyud bstan pa'i rgyal mtshan 'dzugs pa gcig dang [kyang] 'ang par 'dug/ zad par dang zil ^ (g)non dang rdzu 'phrul la sogs pa la yang mnga' (b)rñes pa gcig dang [kyang] 'ong bar 'dug/ 'gro ba sems can gyi don tshad med pa 'grub pa gcig dang 'ong bar 'dug/ de ltar ma byung gi bar la dka' thub dang dka' las chen po 'ong bar 'dug go/ de ltar shes par ^ gyis la khyod skyid par gyis la rgyug gcig gsung/ der thos pa dga' ñid kyis/ jo mo la phyag mang du 'tshal/ dus dang rnam pa thams cad du bdag gi 'dren pa mdzod/ thugs ma phod par skyangs shing pha ma yang mdzad do/ ^ bdag gis lus 'di blangs nas ji srid 'tsho'i bar la yum khyed pas sku drin che ba gang na gdog pa gsung zhing/ jo mo'i zhabs kyi 'og nas phar 'dzul tshur 'dzul lan bdun byas/ jo mo'i gsang chu yang gsol nas ^ ma mi min ye shes mkha' 'gro ma// sku drin tshad bzung mi bdog pas/ dus dang rnam pa thams cad du/ 'bral med thugs rjes bzung du gsol/ ces zhus nas/ jo mo la legs par 'dus nas brgyal brgyal du bshums so// der ^ yun rings gcig nas dran pa rñed pa dang/ jo mo yang spyan chab ñi le mdzad nas/ thos pa dga' bu gñis dus dang rnam pa thams cad du mi 'bral gyis sung nas gshegs nas song ngo/ de rnams kyi sgo nas/ mid la thos pa dga' ^ ñid yul du byon pa'i dus su/ bla ma dang jo mo la phyag 'tshal zhing thugs rjes bzung nas lung stan to/ ces pa'i don to// // de nas

yar byon gung thang (r)tsa ru phebs// yum ñid gum nas zhing rengs ^

219. khang pa rdibs// sring mo yul bud ñen shes tshad med 'khrungs// rje btsun nges 'byung 'khrungs la gus phyag 'tshal// (15) ces pa'i don ni/ de yang/ rje mid la thos pa dga' ces pa de ñid ^ kyis/ bla ma'i drung nas yar yul du byon/ yar lam/ lam mang bde zhing sgrod pa sla bar yang byung/ de nas yul du phebs pa dang/ yum ni gum/ khang pa ni rdibs/ sring mo ni yul nas bud 'dug pas/ dus ^ de'i dus su/ khong rang gi khang pa'i sgo du byon te/ thugs bsam gcig btang bas/ bdag po med pa'i khang pa 'jig las 'os ci yod/ bso [gso] mkhan med pa'i 'a ma 'gum pa las 'os ci yod/ skyong mkhan med ^ pa'i sring mo yul 'bud pa las 'os ci yod bsam zhing/ yul dang ma sring la thugs 'phrang bzhin pa'i ngang nas mang du bshums so/ 'on kyang byas na/ 'jig rten 'khor ba'i 'dun ma la 'os 'di ka las ci yod ^ dgongs shing/ thugs nges 'byung dpag tu med pa 'khrungs nas/ mgur ma 'di ltar du gsungs so// rje bla ma rnams la phyag 'tshal// kye ma kye ma sñing po med// spyir 'khor ba'i chos la sñing po med// ^ rtags shing rtags shing sñing po med// 'gyur gyin 'gyur gyin sñing po med// yul dang ma dang sring mo gsum// gsum kar yod kyang sñing po med// da sñing po med pa'i dus 'di tu// rnal 'byor sñing po cis mi tshol ^ ['tshol ba] ces gsungs so/ de rnams kyi sgo nas mid la thos pa dga' ñid kyis yul du phebs pas ma sring la sogs pa/

stongs par gzigs nas/ de rnams la sñings po med par mkhyen pa'i don to// // sring mo ^

220. pe tas rje btsun phebs pa thos// brag dkar rdzong du lcam sring gñis po 'jal// sring mos 'dzus nas gdung pas ngu zhing rgyal [brgyal]// rje btsun lcam sring 'jal la gus phyag 'tshal// (16) ces pa'i don ni/ de yang rje btsun mid ^ la thos pa dga' ces pa de ñid kyis/ yul de nas mar byon te/ zhag 'ga' tsa'i lung pa'i phu de sa kar sgom zhing bzhugs/ de nas zhag 'ga' song ba dang/ nub gcig rmi lam du/ zhing gcig rmos pas thong pas ye ^ ma phed pa gcig rmi/ de'i dus su/ phyi'i rmi lam de nang gi ltas la lta ba yin/ nga zhing ma phed pas ma phan dgongs nas/ mgur ma 'di ñid gsungs so// gzhi mñam pa ñid kyi sa gzhi la// zung 'dzug [= zung gzug, 'jug] ^ glang chen gñis sdebs nas// thabs dang shes rab bshol btags te// blo dang ldan pa'i thong mkhan gyis// brtson 'grus drag po'i smos [rmos] byas nas// tha ba sra yang phed te mchi// zhes sung nas/ gnas brag ^ dkar rta po dbu ma'i rdzong du byon nas/ gnas 'di ñid du nga/ bla ma'i gsung bzhin du /lo gsum mi dang ma phrad pa byas la sgrub pa'i me tog btang dgongs nas/ bza' bgo btung gsum la sogs pa tshe 'di'i 'dun [mdun] ma'i ^ thog du skad gcig dang [kyang] ma bsam par/ rang gcig bu ru dka' thub dang dka' spyad kyi sgo nas ñams su blangs pas/ dang po rtsa rlung gi gags/ sku lus thams cad chu rags kyi 'khor lo ltar khor [lor?] ro (?) 'khor ba dang/ lus phyi nang med par ^ khrig khrig pa dang la sogs pa rtsa rlung gi gags mang

du byung/ de ltar chu rags kyi 'khor lo ltar 'khor ba'i (?) gang [gags ?] de la/ dbu ma'i nang du rdo rje 'khrigs pa'i dmigs pa sgoms pas grol la/ rtsa 'khrig pa'i gags de la rdo rje ^

221. zhags pa sdams pa'i dmigs pa sgoms pas grol lo// sems kyi gags la/ thugs mi dga' ba tshad med pa dang/ 'jigs shing skrag pa la sogs pa tshad med pa byung ngo/ thugs mi dga' ba'i gags de la/ dga' bzhi ^ ye shes rgod byed kyi dmigs pa sgoms pas grol lo// 'jigs shing skrag pa'i gags la snang ba lha dang lha mor sgoms te/ bag gro 'jigs med kyi gdams pa sgoms pas grol lo// gzhan yang gang kyi rigs gang byung thams cad la/ de lta bu'i ^ dmigs pa gnad dang ltan pa re sgoms pas grol la// mi grol ba dang mi sel ba dang mi sel ba gcig dang [kyang] ma byung ngo// de lta bu'i ting nge 'dzin la gsol rgyu/ snams rgyu ye med par/ dka' thub dka' spyad kyi sgo nas ñams su len cing bzhugs pas/ sring ^ mo pe ta zhes pa de yul bud nas/ sñe nam phyogs na mar 'khyam cing yod pas/ rje mid la ñid kyis yul na phebs 'dug gam zer ba thos nas/ pe tas nas phul dgu dang zan ril gcig khyer nas/ rje mid [mi da?] la ^ la 'jal du phyin pas/ mi 'dra dang 'phrad nas/ nga'i ming po thos pa dga' rtol 'dug gam zer ba/ khyed kyis mthong nam (?) zhes dris pas/ la las ni ma 'thong [mthong] zer / la la na re/ brag dkar gyi ri la sgom ^ gyin yod dam zer ba thos nas/ de phyogs na yar tshol du phyin pas/ brag phug gcig gi sgo rdo ba gcig gis btsad pa gcig 'dug pa na yar ltas

pas/ mi gcig 'dug / pe ta'i bsam pa la da 'di yin nam sñam nas/ sgo ^ brdungs pas gre ba zhum pa'i skad gcig na re/ su yod ci byed gsung/ der pe tas skad la rtags tsa na (?)/ ming po'i skad 'dra nas/ pe tas/ ngan bu'i co co [=jo jo] thos pa dga' lags po byas nas ngus pas/ rje mid la thos ^

222. pa dga' thugs dgongs la / nga'i sring mo pe ta ma shi bar slob grag dgongs nas/ sgo tu byons pha 'ong de log slog pas/ der sring mo pe ta dang 'jal pas/ lcam sring gñis po gcig la gcig bjus ['jus] nas yun rings gcig bshums/ de nas ^ gñis kar gyi bshums 'phro bcad nas sring mos sdug gtam mang du bshad/ de yang co co thogs na mar/ bdag cag ma smad ni shin du sdug lags/ bza' bza' rgyu ma byung/ dag dgo rgyu ma byung/ 'a ma la nad dum tsam gcig na ^ ba la/ bdag gis krad cad nas dam du btsal nas bsos dang [kyang] ma phan par ltogs rir [grir] shi/ bdag gis ni yul du ma zug par sñe nam phyogs su 'khyams phyin/ de nas co cos phebs pa thos nas 'ongs pa lags/ co co dang 'jal ^ sñam pa ye ma byung lags/ ces zhus pas/ rje mid la thos pa dga'i zhal nas/ da ka 'dug/ ngas yang [kyang] mi mang po dang phrad pa med/ re re tsam phrad pa la bris [dris] pas/ de ltar ka byung zer/ 'a ma ka sdug pa sñing rje ^ khyod rang yang phrad snos [sñams ? sgos pas? sgo nas?] byung ba med/ da res bu ming sring phrad pa dga' gsung zhing/ sring mo'i phyag nas theg chen gcig mdzad nas/ sring mo la za ma ster ba bzhed dang [kyang]/ phugs na ni zwa skam po phye ma dum gcig las med pas/ ga ^ re khyod la za ma gcig sbyin dgos

te/ nga la zwa skam po dum tsam gcig las phugs na med/ ci ster ba gsungs pas/ sring mo na re/ co co la cang yang med pa bden lags/ ngan bu'i khur po 'di na zan ril gcig dang nas phul ^ dgu bdog lags kyis zer nas/ zan ril de zwa phye ma de la brul nas/ lcam sreng [sring] gñis pos zan ma thug phor re gsol bas/ rje mid la'i zhal nas / ngas gnas 'di tu zla ba drug sdad te/ di (?) ring gis ^

223. grangs pa yang ma byung ngo gsung/ pe ta na re/ co co la ji 'dra'i 'o rgyal yang myong bda' zer nas/ de nub dkar ñal nas/ de'i nang par nas phul dgu 'o de co co la phul/ bdag gis ^ yul 'dra na mar tshol grong 'dra la phyin la/ dam dum khugs na 'bul du 'ong lags kyis zer nas song/ de nas zla ba gcig gñis song ba dang/ sring mos gzhag pa'i nas phul dgu po dang/ zwa phye dam dum yod pa tso ni zad/ ^ shin du 'o rgyal bar gyur nas/ se [sa] ma 'brog na a ne gcig yod pa na mar slong gro gcig la phyin na grag [drag] gam dgongs byon pas/ a ne 'bri gcig 'jo yin 'dug pa'i rtsa ru gshegs nas/ bsod sñoms gcig mdzad pas/ a ne ^ na re/ bsod chung ngo / bla 'tshed ['tshong] ngo / khos tol 'dug zer ba bden par 'dug pa/ khyod ka dgos kyis/ khyod kyis byas pa'i las la nged la ji 'dra byung zer nas/ shin du 'bar cing/ sbra'i tshugs shing bton nas ded byung/ ^ der rje btsun gyis bros pas/ dka' thub dka' spyad grags pas/ na rkon [Ladakhi: sna rkon] gcig la sgags rgyab nas/ a nes zin te/ rje btsun mid la legs par brdungs nas/ 'bar cing log song/ der rje btsun gyi thugs dgongs la/ da gang nas

kyang ^ gsol rgyu ni mi rñed par 'dug / shi n'ang shi dgongs nas/ brag dkar du log nas byon nas snga ma ltar lus dka' thub dka' spyad kyi sgo nas ñams su blangs pas/ de nas en tsam gcig nas pe tas/ ñin khal rkyed thags 'dra ^ dang/ yur thon 'dra la khugs pa'i / zan lhog skam po dam dum 'dra dang/ skyur po rdze chung gang rñed nas de phul nas/ ngan bus krad cad nas btsal lags te/ 'di las ma rñed lags/ gzhan gyi chos kyis rang skyid la/ ^

224. gzhan la phan pa 'ong gin rda [gda'] ste/ co co'i chos 'dis co co rang 'o rgyal ba/ bdag cag rnams la yang mi phan pa g.yud rang (?) mi gda'/ da chos 'di spangs na grag pa ma lags sam zhus pas/ mid la'i zhal na ^ chos kyi phyogs su lus srog mdor nus pa de ka dgos pa yin/ nga'i chos 'di ma nor gyis/ khyod rang ngang srings gcig gsungs nas/ pe ta'i zhu ba de la ma gsan no // de'i dus su mid la thos pa dga' la / sprang po ^ gcig shi ba'i thul khog gcig yin pa snams rgyu yang med pa la/ pe ta'i bsam pa la/ nga'i co co 'di la snams rgyu gcig ka [ka' ?] 'ang byung na bsam pa la/ grong yul na mar 'khyams phyin pas/ de dus na bon po dar po yod pas/ de rnams ^ kyi rgyang bu (?) dang/ yas tags rnams sdus nas/ grub ril 'dra byas/ de rnams la byas pa'i rnam ldod khra lab leb gñis tsam byung nas/ de dang zan lhag skam po dam dum 'dra dang byas pa khyer nas/ yang mid la'i drung du phyin nas/ snam ^ ldod (?) 'di 'dra gñis snams par zhu byas nas/ zan lhag skam po de rnams dang bcas pa phul bas/ mid la'i zhal nas/ gos kyis go chod do/ dus

lo lo [le lo] dang dge bar bar [chad] yin/ sha mi ñe dang dus pa ñe rgyu gcig khyod ka la 'dug ^ nga la dog rgyu med pa de/ khyod kyi blo la bzan par byung 'dug pa gsung nas/ snam bu de gñis la bzo'i rnam pa tsam med pa'i smad khris ltu gcig byas nas sku smad la gsol/ zan skam de rnams la rgyags mdzad nas/ ngas dang khyod ^ rnal 'byor ba 'dug ste/ go bcad sung nas [sgo bcad 'o rgyal nas?] gnas da kar sgom cing bzhugs po/ de nas yun en tsam song ba'i dus na/ ñin par sgyu lus dang/ rtum mo la yang byang en tsam chud/ mtshan mo rmi lam dang 'od gsal la yang ñams myong bag ^

225. tsam skyes/ mdor na chos la myong ba grod pa tsung zad byung ste/ de nas mid la thos pa dga' ñid/ thugs dga' spro dang ldan zhing bzhugs yod pas/ pe tas chang phul dgu tsam gcig dang/ gzhan ^ yang gsol chas dam dum 'tra [dra'] khyer 'ongs nas phul bas/ nan dar [tar? tan?] gñes [mñes] te/ chang de yang gsol/ thugs dang ba spro mdzad nas/ mgur ma 'di ltar du gsungs so/ ma phod rtse ba'i pe ta ñon// brag dkar spro [spo?] mtho nam ^ mkha'i rdzong// nam mkha' rdzong gi rdzong dkyil na// steng na lho sprin smug po lding// 'og na bya rgyal gshog pa rkyong// bar na spyan gzan rtsed mo rtse// 'di lta bu'i dgon gnas na// mid la rnal 'byor skad pa ^ nga/ ñams dga' blo bde sgyu lus bde 'o// nga 'dzin chags med pa'i 'gro 'dug bde 'o// zhum pa med pa'i rtul shugs bde 'o// gñis su med pa'i lta ba bde'o// bying rgod med pa'i gsam gtan bde'o// nga mid la ^ rnal 'byor lus sems bde'o// sring mo pe ta mgon skyid khyod//

tsab [tsam] tsob ma byed gro ra (?) sgoms// ces sung pas/ pe ta na re/ brod po rang yong ba'i rigs su mi gda' / ñid tsag [cag] la ni gsol rgyu 'am snams rgyu ye mi gda'/ ^ ngan bu la ni 'khos kha med/ tshol du phyin yang rñed rgyu ni mi gda' zhus pas/ thos pa dga'i zhal nas/ 'u dkon mchog gsum la blo khol dang/ 'u gñis la yang dus brtan 'u sdug po 'ong co yang med kyis/ da rgyug ^ gcig gsung/ de nas yang/ pe tas yul grong 'dra na mar tshol gro 'dra la phyin no/ de nas yang / rje btsun ñid sa da [de] ka na dka' thub dang dka' spyad kyi 'phrad nas bshar nas sgom zhing bzhugs pas/ ri dang kyi rngon pa ^

226. gcig pa byung/ de rnams kyis pe tas skya la [skyal?] ba'i gsol chas dam dum yod pa 'dra yang khyer/ phyag dpe 'dra yod pa yang khyer/ rje mid la ñid la rgyab/ der mid las/ khyi ra ba de rnams la/ las rgyu 'bras kyi chos 'dra ^ yang bshad/ 'di lta bu la sdig pa chen po 'ong ngo/ 'di bzhin ma byed par bsod nams sogs gsungs pas/ kho pa na re bsod nams rang ji skad byas na che zer/ der mid las/ nga lta bu'i sgom chen pa'i rtsa rtse phyogs pa min pa'i/ bteg ['degs] ^ na bsod nams 'ong ba yin gsungs pas/ 'o na nged kyis khyed bteg gis zer nas/ rje mid la ñid ltogs kug tu bzhugs pa de/ kho pas re mos byas shing 'phang du bteg nas/ cong rus pa sa la da ka gcig su rdabs pas shin tu ^ 'o rgyal ba byung/ de lta bu'i sdig pa ma sog/ sog na bsod nams sogs gsungs pas/ 'o na de la sdig pa 'ong na bsod nams gang che zer/ dkon mchog la gsol ba btab pa ka bsod

nams che/ dkon mchog la gsol ba 'debs shing ^ song gsungs pas/ yang kho pa na re go yis gsol ba btab dgos zer nas/ re res rje mid la ñid kyi zhal gdangs/ re res zhal du thal ba ldugs shing gsol 'debs gcig song/ gsol 'debs gñis song ngo/ gsum song ngo ^ zer cing de bzhin ka byas so// mdor na de lta bus/ khyi ra ba de rnams kyis rje btsun 'o rgyal la bkod do/ de nas yang yun rings zhig nas/ pe tas bran gron 'dra dang/ sran ma 'dra dang/ zan lhag 'dra dang/ dam dum khyer nas ^ phul bas/ mid la'i zhal nas/ da ngas rang gnas 'di ru lo gsum sdad/ khyod kyis dang [kyang] de rgyags kyi nga'i rgyags chu dam dum gang 'gugs phul ba yin/ da khyod kyis nga'i rgyags chu brtan du mi 'brugs [sgrug pa] kyis/ khyod rang yang sha zad brang ^

227. dengs 'dug/ da nga yang gnas 'dir mi sdod par/ yas mar gyi ri khrod gcig la 'gro ba yin/ khyod rang gis kang (?) 'brugs pa khyod rang gi lus 'di bsos gcig/ sang rjes su 'u rang ming ^ sring 'phrad nas gleng langs zhib tu byed pa yin no gsung pas/ de nas pe ta na re/ 'an [ngan] bu la dus 'dir gñen du byas pa co co ñid las med/ de la dus dang rnam pa thams cad du mi 'phrad pa mi mchi lags/ de tung [rtung?] sngar bzhin ^ 'jal cing/ zhabs tog dam dum gang 'grub bgyid lags zer nas yul grong na mar song ngo// de rnams kyis / rje mid la thos pa dga' ñid kyis yul du phebs shing/ thugs nges 'byung dpag tu med pa 'khrungs ^ nas/ dka' thub dka' spyad kyi sgo nas ñams su blangs so/ ces pa'i don to// // tshe 'di blos btang ling nga (?) la

sogs pa'i// rdzong drug gnas la dka' ba spyad te sgoms// grogs med gcig pus [pus 'khyud] sgrub pa'i ^ rgyal mtshan gtsugs// rje btsun dka' thub mthar phyin gus phyag 'tshal// (17) ces pa'i don ni/ de yang/ mid la thos pa dga' ces pa de ñid kyis/ gnas ling nga brag dmar gyi rdzong dang/ smin rgyud grib ma'i rdzong dang/ rkyang ^ dpal nam mkha'i rdzong dang/ rag ma byang chub kyi rdzong la sogs/ rdzong drug gi gnas rnams dang/ gzhan yang ri khrod kyi gnas rnams su/ dka' thub dang dka' spyad 'di ltar du sgoms so/ de yang dang po ling nga brag dmar gyi rdzong la ^ byon nas/ sgoms pa'i dus su/ gsol rgyags kyi dngos po ni zwa men gcig dang med/ dus de'i dus su/ ñin bar sgyu lus sbyangs/ mtshan bar 'od gsal sbyangs pas/ dka' thub dka' spyad gang byung yang/ dus de'i dus na/ ^

228. zwa kho na gsol ba la rten nas/ sku gzugs yang zwa pa'i mdog bzhin sngo khrong [grong] song/ de na yun ring po gcig nas/ pe tas tsam pa khal phyed tsam dang/ mar [s]krog ril gcig khur nas skyel du byung/ de'i dus su sku mdog ^ thams cad zwa pa'i mdog ji lta ba bzhin sngo khrong song 'dug/ der pe ta'i bsam pa la/ nga'i co co gsol rgyu ni 'di las med/ mdog ni 'di las med/ da [de?] rang 'grongs pa 'dra bsam nas/ mang du ngus/ de nas 'jams gcig ^ skol la grang bsam nas/ khog ma blangs pas khog ma lag nas shor nas phyag pas/ khog ma'i nang nas/ za'i skor khog ma cog 'dra gcig thon nas/ mthur la ri li li [ling ling?] 'gril song/ de lta bu de mi mang ^ pos thos pas/ la las 'chi ma shor/

la la la dad pa skyes pa yang byung skad/ der yang pe tas yul grong na mar phyin/ khong rang gcig sus sgom cing bzhugs pas/ brag de la sñe nam pa'i mi/ bya rgod kyi ^ sgro thu ba mang du byung nas/ rje mid la ñid sku mdog sngon por yod pa de mthong bas/ sgro thun pa rnams na re/ mi ma yin 'dug 'o zer nas bros/ der mid las/ da mi ma yin ma yin no gsungs pas/ 'o na khyod su ^ yin zer/ der tsa pa shes rab rgyal mtshan gyi bu/ mid la thos pa dga' bya ba de yin gsungs pas/ sgro thun pa rnams kyis ngo shes te/ de rnams kyi rgyags lhag dam dum 'dug pa yang phul lo/ de rnams kyis zwa pa'i tsho thal byas shing/ 'bad ^ nas sgoms pas/ de'i dus su/ sgyu lus la yang myong ba than thun thon/ mtshan bar 'od gsal lags [khyags?] khyug [khyug khyug pa?] zin pa yang byung ngo// de nas gung thang gi ña ma 'ga' zung gis/ tsa pa shes rab rgyal mtshan gyi bu/ thos pa dga' ^

229. bya ba des grub pa thob nas/ rtas [brta ba] phul gus lo gsum gyi rgyags byung 'dug zer ba thos nas/ dad pa thun mong ma yin pa skyes nas/ ña ma 'gas mid la la 'jal du 'ongs pas/ ling nga na bzhugs pa dang ^ 'jal/ de ru ña ma rnams kyis / ñid cag mid la shes rab rgyal mtshan gyi bu/ mid la thos pa dga' bya ba de lags sam zhus pas/ mid la'i zhal nas/ yin pa yin ngas zwa bza' grags [drags] nas/ mdog sngon por song ba yin ^ gyis gsung/ der phyag 'tshal/ phyag rten gyi dngos po than thun khyer 'ongs pa kun phul nas/ da zwa 'di tsam mi gsol bar zhu/ bdag cag rnams kyis

kyang/ gsol rgyags than thun 'bul lags kyis zhus pas/ rje mid la thos ^ pa dga' ces pa des/ mgur ma 'di ltar du gsungs so/ rje bla ma rnams la phyag 'tshal// nga mid la 'ang zwa'i rigs can yin// zwa 'ang mid la'i rigs can yin// zwa dang mid la dbyer ma phyed [phyod]// khyod yon bdag mo 'ang dad pa'i ^ rigs can yin// dad pa 'ang yon bdag mo'i rigs can yin// dad pa dang yon bdag mo dbyer ma 'phyed// sems dang snang pa'i rigs can yin// snang ba 'ang sems kyi rigs can yin// snang ba dang sems gñis la dbyer ma phyed// ces gsung nas/ ^ yon bdag mo rnams la gñis chos la sogs pa mang du gnong ngo/ phyis yon bdag mo rnams kyis/ mid la'i gsol rgyags la yang phan pa mang du byung ngo// de nas mid la ñid kyis/ ling nga dang/ smin brgyud grib ma'i rdzong ^ gñis la phar gshegs tshur gshegs mdzad cing/ dka' thub dang dka' spyad kyi sgo nas ñams su blangs pas/ sgyu lus dang 'od gsal la myong ba bag tsam thon no// de nas yang/ rkyang dpal nam mkha' rdzong du byon nas/ gnas de ^

230. dang brag dkar gñis la yar gshegs mar gshegs mdzad nas/ dka' thub dka' spyad kyi sgo nas rtsa rlung ñams su blangs pas/ rtsa rlung la dril ['dril] dang/ de gong yas chad rtsa rlung ma nus pa cho chad ma thon pa la/ nub gcig bud med bzhi 'ongs nas ^ sku la sku mñe byas/ 'khrul 'khor mi shes par 'dug pa/ 'khrul 'khor 'di ltar chos zer nas/ 'khrul 'khor me thab kyi drug chings ['ching ba] de ñid slabs nas mi snang bar gyur to// der mid las/ de nub na mar 'khrul 'khor de bzhin du bcas nas sgoms/ de ^ nub rang la

drod ras thub pa tsam byung/ dus de na mar ras rkyang re cog ge snams pas/ mid la ras pa ces par grags so/ dus de'i dus na gdan thog re re'i ste su [du] / zla ba gñis gsum re/ mñam bzhag re re la ma g.yos par sgoms pas/ yon tan ^ mang du skyes so/ mdor na de lta bu'i rtsa rlung de la/ dang po mar pa lo tstsha dang 'jal nas/ dus de de'i bar du sgoms pa yin/ de nas dang [kyang] 'bad 'bung bcad nas sgoms pas/ ci zhig ltar du gyur pa dang/ bar snang la 'phur ^ nus pa yang byung/ dus de'i dus na/ snga gro [dro] ñi ma nub du shar tsa na/ brag dkar rta so ru 'phur nas ñi ma la gshegs/ dgongs mo ñi ma shar du song ba dang/ rta so nas brag dkar du 'phur cing gshegs pas/ yul ^ de na yod pa'i gung po mgon po dpal zhes bya ba/ pha spad gñis kyis rmos byed cing yod pas/ mid la ñid 'phugs gshegs pa bu des mthong ste/ kho de ba mi 'phur 'gro yin 'dug go byas pas/ pha na re/ glang myur por ^ khrid dang/ de 'dra mid la ras pa bya ba sñon pa [smyon pa] de/ kho ñi [ñid ?] ma sñog pa'i phur ['phur] 'gro ba yin gyis zer cing mos par mi byed pa yang yod do// de nas skabs gcig tu song ba dang/ yul de na/ sa smad nas 'ongs pa'i pen ta ba [sen ta ba] ^

231. yang dag gcig 'dug pa dang 'jal gang nas 'ongs byas pas/ lho brag thos skor ['khor ?] nas 'ongs pa'i sen ta ba [sic] yin par 'dug / der gleng mo dris pas/ bla ma mar pa lho brag pa grongs pa thos pas/ der rje btsun ^ mid las/ gdung pas gsol ba btab/ ngud mo'i smre sngags mang po mdzad pas/ de nas bla ma yab yum la 'jal du 'gro dgongs pa'i

gdung sems lam me ba gcig yod pa'i kho thag de nas chod do// de rnams kyis rje btsun mid la ^ ñid kyis/ dka' thub dka' spyad kyi sgo nas ñams su blangs pas/ rtsa rlung la nus pa than ['thang?] cing yon tan dpag tu med pa 'khrungs so/ ces pa'i don to// // dus skabs de nas sñe nam phyogs su byon// yon ^ bdag gcig gis gsol rgyags sgrig par bgyis// der ma bzhugs par la phyis gangs la byon// rje btsun gangs la sgoms la gus phyag 'tshal// (18) ces pa'i don ni/ de yang/ rje btsun gyi rgyal po mid la ras pa ces pa de ñid kyis ^ bla ma mar pa lho brag pa ñid bde bar gshegs pa thos pas/ lho brag tu gshegs pa'i kho thag chod nas/ rje btsun ñid kyis sñe nam tsar ma bya bar byons/ yon bdag rngog dor mo bya ba dang 'jal / der yon bdag de shin tu dad par gyur nas/ nang du spyan drangs/ sñen bkur gyi nom pa bgyis nas/ khyed ñid rje btsun rgyal po mid la ras pa ces pa de ru gda' lags pas/ khyed ñid bdag gis 'degs par zhu zer nas/ yon bdag des rje btsun ^ gyi gsol rgyags rting nas skyel bar byas/ rje btsun rang gis zhib phul dgu tsam 'ong ba gcig snams te la phyis la gshegs nas/ gnas su pheb pa'i nang par na mar sprin 'dus nas/ kha ba ñin mtshan bcwa [bco] brgyad rgyun ma ^

232. cad par byung nas/ ri rlungs med par gangs su song/ lam gyi 'brul ['grul] thag thams cad chad/ ma tha na phyug ma yang phyi ru gdon sa med pa'i kha ba chen po yang dag pa byung ngo/ der yon bdag des/ zla ba bdun rgyags skyal sa ma byung ^ par/ der sñe nam pa'i mi thams cad na

re/ khu khun gyi rnal 'byor pa phun sum tshogs pa de kha
bas bsad do zer cing 'thab po ['thab song] // yon bdag pho
mo gñis po ngu zhing sdug bsnal du gyur to/ de'i dus su/
rje btsun ñid kyis thugs bsam mdzad pas/ da [de] rang 'tsho
^ ba skyel mkhan la ni lam chad 'dug/ da [de] rang gis
phyin rang 'chi ba las mi yong bar 'dug/ da [de] rang nga
la phyis kyi gangs khrod 'di ru 'chi bar [mi] 'dug pas/
'pho ba bya dgongs nas yod pa dang/ gos shing lo ^ gon pa'i
bud med gcig 'ongs nas/ 'pho ba'i chos ma byed par ting nge
'dzin zas su zo dang/ ñin mtshan gñis skyed rdzogs kyi don
'ba' zhig sgoms dang/ nged chos bdag mkha' 'gro rnams kyis
byin gyis labs la/ khyod kyi srog bar du mi 'gro ba gcig
bya ^ yis zer ba gcig byung/ der thugs thag chod te/ 'pho
ba'i chos ma byas par/ ñin mtshan gñis ka ting nge 'dzin
kho na sgoms pas/ skabs skabs la gser [bser] ma'i rnam pa/
mig long ba dang/ rna ba 'on pa la sogs pa 'o rgyal ba'i
rnam ^ pa mang du byung / skabs skabs la de rnams med par/
sra sil sil ba yang byung/ skabs la gsol rgyu med pa'i /
rlung gis skyod nas rgyal zhing/ 'od gsal la cham cham 'gro
ba yang byung/ mdor na dus der zla ba ^ bdun la/ gsol rgyu
zhib thur mgo gang dang [yang] med kyang/ ting nge 'dzin
kho na sgoms cing/ ting nge 'dzin zas su gsol/ sku 'grongs
pa mi mnga' zhing/ yon tan gyi mngon rtags tshad med pa
yang thon no// de yang de'i dus su/ 'chi ba med ^

233. pa tshe'i dngos grub bgyi ba/ sems can rtag phyis
can rnams la mi rtag pa stan pa'i phyar [phyir] ma rtog pa/

sku 'grongs pa mi mnga' ba'i dngos grub dang thob bo/ phongs pa med pa zas kyi dngos grub ces pa/ sems can ^ gyi tshogs rdzogs don ma rtogs pa/ gsol ye ma gsol dang [kyang] kres pa med pa'i dngos grub dang [kyang] thob bo/ 'khrul pa med pa mchog gi dngos grub ces bgyi ba/ gdul bya la chos ston pa ma rtogs/ chos kyi sku la 'pho 'gyur mi mnga' ba'i dngos grub ^ kyang thob po// mdor na mchog thun mong gi dngos grub ma lus par thob po// de rnams kyis / rje btsun ñid kyis/ la phyis gangs la byon nas/ dka' thub dang dka' spyad kyi sgo nas/ grub pa thob po/ ces pa'i don to// ^ zla bdun lon nas rje btsun grongs par byas/ mi 'ga' sgran nas rje btsun lta ru phyin// rje ñid ma grangs [grongs] yul der spyan drangs mos// rje btsun ngo mtshar can la gus phyag 'tshal// (19) ces pa'i don ni/ ^ de yang/ rje btsun gyi rgyal po mid la ras pa zhes pa de ñid kyis/ la phyis gangs la byon nas/ zla bdun khrigs pa gsal rgyu gang yang med par bzhugs/ de'i dus su mchog thun mong gi dngos grub ma lus pa thob kyang/ sñe nam pa'i ^ yon bdag rngog dor mos gtso byas pa'i yon bdag 'ga' yis/ rje btsun ñid grongs par byas nas/ da de lta bu'i spur btsal nas/ [s]pur sbyangs nas/ khong gi don du 'us/ bdun tshigs la sogs pa byas pa grag [drag] zer te/ ma ^ 'ga' sgran [sgron] nas/ dung dang lwa ba yag dang/ khyem dang byas [bcas] pa khyer nas phyin pas/ rje btsun gyis gshegs pa'i dus su ñin lam gcig gi sa la/ khong rnam pa'i zhag bdun byas nas phyin pas/ rje btsun gyi bzhugs pa 'di tsam yin nam snas [sñam] pa ^

234. sa gcig tu rtol ba dang/ tshol mi rnams kyis / dung bus/ khu bton ['don] pas/ de lta bu'i dung gi skad dang/ mi 'i ku co rje btsun gyis gsan pas/ brag phug nas gangs thog tu byon nas gzigs pas/ mi 'ga' zhig (?)/ dung 'bud/ lam ^ gyi kha ba sel byed cing 'ong ba gzigs pas/ der thugs dgongs la/ nga tshol ba yin nam dgongs nas/ gangs de'i thog tu bzhugs nas gsol ba btab pas/ de'i gsol 'debs kyi gsung lhang lhang ba/ tshol ['tshol ?] mi ^ rnams kyis dang [kyang] thos pas/ tshol mi rnams dga' nas/ go bcad ma grongs yod pa 'dug byas nas phyin pas/ gangs kyi sgang 'ben tshad gang tsam gcig chags 'dug pa la/ tshol mi rnams kyis ma thar pa la/ rje btsun gyis ^ rlung bzung nas 'phur ma thabs la tshol mi rnams su [bsu] ru byon byung/ de nas re re khur cing 'phur ma thabs la gangs thog tu skyal [skyel ?]/ de nas brag phug tu phebs pa dang/ rje btsun gyis kha ring khur byon pa'i zhib phul ^ dgu'o de dang/ sha lhu gcig yod pa de yang ma gsol bar tshol mi rnams la grangs pas [grongs]/ yon bdag dor mos rje btsun la 'jus nas ngus zhing/ rje btsun ma grongs lags 'am/ rje btsun ma grongs pa'i rgyu ji ltar mdzad lags pa zer/ rje ^ btsun gyi zhal nas/ nga mi 'chi ba'i rgyu rtu mo'i [gtum mo'i] gos gon/ ting nge 'dzin gyi zas zos/ bla ma'i rnal 'byor sgoms/ skyed rdzogs kyi don sgoms/ dpa' bo dang mkha' 'gro rnams kyis stong [stongs] grogs mdzad nas ma shi ba yin gsung/ der yon ^ bdag des gtso byas pa'i tshol mi thams cad shin tu ngo mtsar skyes te/ phyag mang du 'tshal skod ba (?) byas/

zhabs spyi thog tu blangs nas/ rje ñid ma grongs pa shin du thugs la rtags/ da bdag cag gi yul du spyan 'dren ^

235. pa lags pas/ cis kyang gshegs par zhu lags ces zhus pas/ rje btsun gyis dang dges bzhin gnang ste/ yul du sdongs te byon/ dus de'i dus na sñe nam gyi phyogs der sñan pa dang grags pa ^ chen byung ngo/ thams cad dad cing mos par yang gyur nas/ lung pa'i mi thams cad 'jal du byung/ dus de'i dus su/ mi thams cad dad gus dpag med skyes nas/ rje btsun ñid la/ la las gser phul/ la las g.yu phul/ de bzhin du ^ zangs dang gos dar dang/ ras sna la sogs pa tshad med pa phul nas/ rje btsun ñid longs spyod kyi dkyil na dbu pi de [?] las mi snang ba'i longs spyod tshad med pa'i 'bul ba byung/ khyad par du yon bdag rngog dor mos/ lus la gon pa'i ber/ 'og tu ^ zhon pa'i rta/ skye ru 'dogs pa'i g.yu la sogs pa phul nas rje btsun gyi zhabs la 'jus nas/ khyed lta bu'i grub thob gcig dang bdag 'jal ba/ bsod nams kyi bsags pa re che ba/ dus dang rnam sa thams cad du 'bral ba med par thugs rjes 'dzin par zhu/ ^ ces mig nas 'chi ma 'byin pas/ der tshogs pa'i mi thams cad kyis kyang/ ngu zhing gsol ba de ltar du btab po [pa'o?]/ dus de'i dus su/ rje btsun ñid kyis/ nor de rnams thams cad sa sar [so sor] zlog nas ma snams pa ru/ yon bdag pho mo ^ rnams la/ kha ring nas nga la byung lugs 'di ltar du byung ngo/ ces pa'i mgur ma 'di ltar du bzhes so// lo stag lo lo'i zhabs la// yos bu'i lo'i lo dgo [mgo] la// rnal 'byor la phyis gangs la phyin/ ^ ngas la phyis gangs la phyin tsa

na// khong gnam sa gñis kyis bros byas nas// skyi zer rlung po'i bang chen rdzangs [rdzong ba]// lho sprin smug po'i 'dun dmag g.yos// ñi zla gñis po dbon [btson; rtson?] du bzung// dgung kha ba ñin ^

236. dgu mtshan dgu babs// cha la ñin mtshan bco brgyad babs// de lta bu'i kha ba dang// lo gsar sgang gi lhags pa gñis// rnal 'byor lus kyi ras gos gsum// gangs dkar gyi rtse la 'khrug pa shor// 'khrug pa ^ cud [gcud?] ras gos rgyal// yang na ras gos drod che 'am// yang na gangs dkar dro 'am ci// yang na skyi zer ngad 'dzam ['jam] mam// rnal 'byor sku khams sñoms par gda'// khyed yon bdag tso sku khams bde lags sam// cha la rnal 'byor ^ grags su thong// rgyal khams yongs su gtam de sgrogs// ces sung nas/ yon bdag pho mo rnams la ña [gñis] chos dang [kyang] mang du gsungs nas/ gnas der ma bzhugs par gshegs so/ der mi thams cad 'phreng bzhin du ngo mtshar dpag tu med pa ^ skyes shing/ sñan pa dang grags pas phyogs thams cad du khyab cing/ grub thob chen po gcig 'dug go zer ba yang byung ngo// de rnams kyis/ rje btsun mid la rnal 'byor pa ces pa de ñid kyis/ la phyis gangs la byon nas/ yon tan dpag tu med pa ^ rñes te [brñes] / yon bdag pho mo rnams dang 'jal zhing/ mgur dang chos kun gsungs so/ rje btsun dam pa khyed la gus phyag 'tshal// ces pa'i don to// // de rjes de nas mon gyi kha thod kyi// seng ge gling gi ^ nags la sgom du byon// yon tan rñes nas 'khor la mgur kun gsungs// rje btsun dam pa khyed la gus phyag 'tshal// (20) ces pa'i don

ni/ de yang/ rje btsun gyi rgyal po mid la ras pa ces pa de ñid kyis/ mon gyi gnas ^ seng ge gling gi nags la sgom du byon no/ de lta bu'i gnas de shing rtsi nags tshal shin du sdug pa/ me tog mang po skyes pa/ spra dang spre'u mang po gnas pa/ mi dang skye bo'i tshogs kyis dben pa/ gzhi bdag dang lha 'dre'i ^

237. tshogs kun/ shin du gñan pa'i gnas der gdan phebs/ de'i shing sdong chen po gcig gi rtsa na/ bug pa mi gñis tsam shong ba gcig 'dug pa'i nang du bzhugs te/ ñin mtshan med par sa de nas skad gcig dang ^ ma g.yos par mñam par (?) gzhag ste sgoms so/ de ltar bzhugs pa'i dus na yang/ kham gyi zas shing tog re tsam min pa gsol rgyu med dang [kyang]/ ting nge 'dzin kho na zas su gsol bas/ yon tan gyi mngon rtags der yang cher 'khrungs so/ dus ^ de'i dus su/ sña nam pa'i yon bdag pho mo rnams kyis gros byas te/ mi gñis rje btsun gdan 'dren du btang ngo/ de nas mi gñis pos seng ge gling gi nags bseb btsal bas/ yun ring po'i bar du ni ma rñed/ rjes su rje btsun ñid shing sdong ^ gcig gi 'gram na bzhugs 'dug pa dang 'jal/ phyag 'tshal sñun zhus nas/ sku khams bde lags sam zhus pas/ rje btsun gyi zhal/ gnas me tog sna tshogs skye ba'i gnas// ljon shing sna tshogs skye ba'i sa// bya skad sñan ^ po sgrogs pa'i gnas// spra spre yang rtsal sbyong ba'i sa// 'di lta bu'i dgon gnas 'dir// gcig pur sdad pa nga ñid bde'o// ces pa la sogs pa'i mgur mang du bzhes so/ der mi gñis po des/ bu slob rnams kyis ^ bdag cag gñis spyan 'dren du btang pa

lags pas cis kyang gsher par zhu ces zhus pas/ rje btsun gyi zhal nas/ nga khyed kyi phyir nas mi 'gro gsung nas hag (?) bzhengs nas gshegs song/ der da ka'i ting nas mi ^ gñis pos dang phyin pas/ brag phug btsan po mis ye mi thar ba gcig na yar 'dzegs nas gshegs song/ der gdan 'dren pas 'di na zhabs tog pa dang/ yo byad la sogs pa cang [=ci yang] yang mi bda' [gda'] lags pas/ cis kyang ^

238. bu slob rnams kyi don la gshegs par zhu ces zhus pas/ rje btsun gyi zhal nas/ chu shing gam na yod rtsa na// g.yog po zer dang rdzun du gda'// za rogs [grogs] 'dis dang [kyang] dgos ched chung// rtum mo [gtum mo] lus la 'bar tsa [rtsa] na//^ go lag [ldog] zer dang [kyang] rdzun du gda'// snam bu 'dis kyang dgos rgyu chung// snang pa sgyu mar rtogs [r]tsa na/ gñen 'brel zer dang [kyang] rdzun du gda'// gdung sems can des dang dgos rgyu chung// sgom pa rang babs skyes [r]tsa ^ na// rnam rtog zer dang [kyang] rdzun du gda'// ñon mongs 'dis dang [kyang] dgos rgyu chung// don dam rgyud la shar tsa na// sgra tshad zer dang rdzun gcig gda'// tshig shes 'dis kyang dgos rgyu chung// rin chen sems kyi gter rñed na/ ^ zas nor zer dang [kyang] rdzun gcig gda'// longs spyod 'dis kyang dgos rgyu chung// 'gro don phyogs med byed tsa na// yon bdag zer dang [kyang] rdzun du gda'// khyed kyi gdan 'dren dgos rgyu chung// ces sung byon du ma bzhed do/ ^ der mi gñis pos gsol ba 'debs shing sdad pas/ yang rje btsun ñid cang mi gsung bar hog (?) bzhengs so/ de ka'i rdzes na phar gdan

'dren pa gñis pos dang [kyang] phyin pas/ chu dang brag dang shing dang gsum 'thab pa'i mis ye mi thar ba ^ gcig la/ rlung bzung nas gcig phur ma thabs su gshegs song/ der kho pa gñis la bya sa ma byung bar log yongs pas/ yul pa'i yon bdag pho mo thams cad ngud mo 'don cing gsol ba 'debs shing 'dug skad// de rnams kyis ^ rje btsun ñid kyis/ seng ge gling gi nags la sgoms pas/ mngon rtags kyi yon tan tshad med pa rñes shing/ yon bdag pho mo'i gdan 'dren byung yang ma byon no/ ces pa'i don to// // de nas skabs kha [la?] sñe nam brod bur ^

239. byon/ a ne sring mos rje btsun sñan pa thos// me [mo] mtshan gñis kyis spyan 'dren 'jal du phyin// rje btsun 'jal dus mgur gsungs gus phyag 'tshal// (21) ces pa'i don ni/ de yang ^ rje btsun mid la ras pa zhes dgyi [bgyi] ba des/ de nas skabs su song ba dang/ sñe nam brod bur byon/ dka' thub dka' spyad kyi 'phrags nas bton nas sgoms pas/ yon bdag bkra shis rtsegs dang/ yon bdag mo legs se dang gis [gñis?] yon bdag ^ byas / de na mar rje btsun ñid 'tsho bas 'o mi rgyal ba yang byung// dus de'i dus su/ a ne dang sring mo gñis kyis/ rje btsun gnas de na bzhugs pa dang/ sñan pa dang grags pa chen po byung pa thos nas/ a ne dang sring mo gñis kyis ^ g.yag dkar yu ba gcig la phye mar la sogs pa dang/ gzhags phyag rten la sogs pa mang du khyer 'ongs nas/ rje btsun la 'jal ba'i zhu sna/ se ras pa la bcol bas/ rje btsun gyi zhal nas/ da mid la thos pa dga' la a ne'i ^ 'jal mkhan dang [yang] mi dgos so/ phyag rten

dang 'bul ba med dang [kyang]/ nga ltogs ris mi 'chi bar yod kyis gyis la / 'jal kha mi 'ong bar 'dug go gyis la pe ta la yar shog gyis gcig gsung nas/ der se ras pas/ pe ta ^ la yar rgyu gi brta byas nas/ a ne rang yug de ru bzhugs gcig / da ltar 'jal kha 'ang lags kyis byas pas/ 'o las zer nas da ka na sdad 'dug/ der se ras pas bu slob gzhan 'dra la zhu rogs [grogs] bcol nas/ a ne ^ la 'jal kha gcig cis kyang gnang 'tshal ces zhus pas/ dbu hril hril mdzad nas gnang du ma 'dod/ de nas pe tas 'jal phyag 'tshal byin gyis rlabs zhus/ bla ma rje btsun la 'jus 'chi ma phral byas nas/ co co [jo jo] sku khams ^

240. bde lags sam zhus pas/ pe ta 'ongs sam/ nga da bza' gos mi sles (?) tsam yon mchod gsung/ de nas pe ta[s ky]ang a ne'i 'jal kha zhu rogs [grogs] byas/ de yang/ 'u skol ming sring la dus 'di ru gñen du byas pas a ne mo las med pa ^ lags/ cis kyang 'jal kha gcig btang 'tshal lags ces zhus pas/ rje btsun na re/ gñen a ne lus la sdang pa'i dgra// mi'i lus la bdud kyi sems// nga phongs dus mos ci byas pa// cis kyang da res mi 'phrad do//^ gsungs/ mo 'jal na nga 'gro gsung nas khres po sbres te/ gshegs pa'i grabs mdzad pas/ pe tas/ spring 'chel nas ngu zhing/ rje btsun mkhyen/ da lan a ne la 'jal kha tseg pa gcig ['tsheg pa? rtseg pa?] thugs la thogs shes zhus pas/ ^ rje btsun gyi zhal nas/ nga la pha ma gñis pos dang/ pe ta khyod drin che ba yin/ khyod kyi kha la gñan dgos kyis/ mo 'jal na nga dang mo'i bar du yol la thong la / 'jal du chud gcig

gsung nas/ der pe tas a ne ^ la/ co co [jo jo] thugs dam dam po la ni 'dug ste/ bar du yol bas ni gcod cing 'dug/ 'jal kha 'ong bar yod kyis shog byas pas/ a nes 'jal du phyins sku khams zhus pas/ rje btsun gyis mgur ma 'di ltar du bzhes ^ so/ rje bla ma rnams la phyag 'tshal lo// gung thang skya lnga'i tsa ron na// ñe 'brel grar [grags?] langs ma smad gsum// sran phung ber ka rgyab ltar gtor// 'dris med kyi yul du 'khyams dus su// a ne bya ba gcig dang med// ^ brag dkar so mtho'i dgon pa nas// skres skom ña [gñis] pos yongs skul nas// ltogs nas a ner 'ongs tsa na// sprang po bla 'tshong ngo zer nas tshugs shing bton// zes sdang lus kyis 'bar zhing ded// lus stobs ^

241. med pas rkong [skong?] la 'gyel// lus mtho ba tog [mtho tog] rdungs pa dran lags so// dus da lta 'jal ba mi skyengs sam// ces gsung pas a ne kha skyengs nas/ bden lags bden lags zer cing 'chi ma ñil ^ ñil 'dug pas/ pe ta yang dga' lo/ de nas rje btsun gyi zhal nas/ chags sdang gi las bsags pas ngan song du skye ba yin/ dang po a nes nga la zhe sdang chen po byas/ da lta nga la zhen chags chen po byed pa 'di/ ngan ^ song du skye ba'i rgyu yin/ da zhen chags ma byed mos gus skyed// zhes sdang ma byed dag snang sbyongs// gsung nas/ yol la de bsal nas zhal ras stan byin rlabs dang mdzod/ de'i dus su a ne des/ sngar gyi las la 'gyod ^ cing bshags pa byas/ phyis dad pa dang gus pas mos gus chen po yang byas/ dus de rang du yang smin byed kyi dbang zhus/ sñing tig gi/ nor rdzas thams cad rje

btsun ñid la phul cing/ zhabs spyi thog tu blangs nas/ rang gi nas su ldog ^ par bzhed cing/ rje btsun la yang gshegs par zhus pas ma gnang ngo// de rnams kyis/ rje btsun ñid kyis / seng ge gling nas / sña [sñe] nam brod pur phebs shing/ lcam sring 'jal nas/ a ne rjes su bzung ngo/ ces pa'i don to// ^ // // de rjes brin dang chu dbar gnas der bzhugs// tshe rings la sogs lha 'dre dpag med kyis// ltas dang cho 'phrul sdigs pa tshad med byas// bla mas tshar bcad rjes bzung gus phyag 'tshal// (22) ces pa'i don ni/ de yang ^ rje btsun gyi rgyal po mid la ras pa ces pa de ñid kyis/ brin dang chu dbar gyi gnas su bzhugs nas/ yun ring du sgoms pas/ chu pho (?) 'brug gi lo/ dbyar zla dang po'i yar ngo/ tshes pa brgyad kyi nam phyed yol tsam na/ gdon ^

242. chen po bcwa [bco] brgyad kyis gtso byas pa'i/ snang srid kyi lha 'dre'i tshogs la ma 'tshogs pa gang yang med pas/ gnam 'brug pa dang/ sa g.yo ba la sogs pa cho 'phrul sna tshogs ston du byung/ de rnams kyi nang nas shin du 'jigs shing/ mi sdug pa'i ^ sha za mo chen mo lnga yis/ mi sdug pa'i gzugs sna tshogs ston cing/ de yang keng rus bzhad pa'i bud med gcig gis ri rab 'phang du bteg nas brdeg pa dang/ gnod sbyin mo gzugs bud med du byas pa/ gdong pa lce spyang du byas/ ^ gsang ba'i gnas nas khrag gi chu rgyun 'bab pa gcig gis/ bar snang du rgya mtsho chen po la hub kyis 'debs shing byung ngo/ gnod sbyin mo gzugs gshin rje'i gzugs byas pa/ 'chi ba lan phur tsam byas pa gcig

gis ñi zla cha lang du/ ^ brdebs shing byung ngo/ gnod sbyin mo gzugs bud med du byas pa/ mdog sol ba ltar gnag pa/ gzugs ri rab tsam yod pa gcig gis gza' skar thad la 'bebs pa byung ngo/ khyad par du 'ang shin du sgeg cing mdzes pa'i/ bud med lha mo'i ^ cha byad 'dra ba gcig gis/ rje btsun la tshul bzhin ma yin pa'i sgo nas slus 'debs su byung ba dang/ gzhan yang sprul pa'i gnod sbyin mang po zags med lag pa skyong ba dang/ sa rdo ri brag rgod pa dang/ phyogs bzhi 'obs kyis ^ skor ba dang/ nam mkha' me yis 'khrigs pa dang la sogs pa'i ltas dang cho 'phrul shin du 'jigs shing yang nga bas/ rje btsun ñid sdigs pa la sogs pa'i cha byad du byed cing/ bsam gtan la bar chod rtsom du byung bas/ de'i dus su/ rje ñid kyis lha dang mkha' 'gro ^ la gsol ba btab pa'i mgur 'di ltar du bzhes so// rje sum ldan gyi bla ma rin po che// mtshan yongs su grags pa'i lho brag pa// skal ldan gdung pas gsol ba 'debs// pha mi mngon byings nas thugs ^

243. dgongs 'tshal// dben pa drin gyi chu dbar du// nga bod kyi rnal 'byor ras pa yis// rtse gcig bsam gtan sgom du 'ongs// ces pa la sogs pa'i mgur ma gsungs pas/ lha 'dre rnams kyi bsam pa la/ ^ kho bag tsam 'khyags 'dug/ bar chad rlags che bar 'dug gis bsam nas/ lha 'dre rnams mgrin gcig tu sdebs nas 'di skad zer ro/ khyed lhang lhang glu'i gsol 'debs pa/ lha dang mkha' 'gro ran par sgron// khyod mid la ras pa ^ ma lags sam// ces pa la sogs pa'i bar chad lung ston gyi tshig de skad zer byung bas/ der rje ñid kyi

thugs dgongs la/ lar sems kyi rang bzhin skye 'gag med cing spros pa dang bral ba 'di ñid la/ gshin rje'i dmag bye ba dung phyur ^ gyis mtshon cha'i char sna tshogs pa phab kyang g.yos pa med pa 'di la/ skye ba dang 'chi ba dang 'jig pa'i gnas med pa yin/ bzung 'dzin [gzung 'dzin] gyi zhen pa las grub pa'i sha khrag gi rdos pa tsan 'di/ lha 'dre rnams 'dod na da lta rang du byin pas chog/ 'di la zhen rgyu med/ lar rang gnod bya dang gnod byed du mthong pa rnams/ ma rig pa'i 'khrul snang yin dgongs nas/ mi 'jigs pa gdeng du chud pa'i mgur ma 'di ltar du bzhes so/ ^ yul la mtshan gsol ding ma brin [ding ri la brin]// mi khye rong mang po 'tshogs pa'i yul// rgya bod gñis kyi 'brim pa'i sa// gangs mtho la gñan mo tshe rings ma// ces pa la sogs pa'i mgur ma gsungs pas/ gnod sbyin pho mo'i ^ tshogs thams cad/ sdang dang rdug sems thams cad zhi nas/ rgyud dul byas nas/ mi ma yin de rnams kyis mgrin gcig par 'di skad ces/ rje btsun la zhus te/ kye kye ras pa gson gcig rnal 'byor pa/ khyod bsod nams bsags pa mi'i lus// dal [rnal] ^

244. 'byor mchog thob skal ba can// ces pa la sogs pa'i glu phul nas mi snang bar gyur to// de nas dus phyis dbyar zla ra ba'i tshes bcu'i nub mo/ mtshar sdug 'od dang ldan pa'i bud med lnga/ rje btsun gyi drung du 'ongs ^ nas/ phyag dang skor ba mang du byas nas/ ba men gyi zho yin zer ba mu men gyi skyogs gang grangs nas/ gus pa phul te/ 'grin [grin pa?] gcig par 'di skad zhus so/ gdong dmar srin po bod kyi yul// kha ba can ^ 'ongs pag shu rlong [pags pa

shu ba len pa (lang ba)?]// gnod sbyin gangs kyi ra ba 'dir// ces pa la sogs pa'i glu phul nas/ mos pa dang gus pas/ lus phyags phul cing/ gsang sngags rdo rje theg pa'i chos stan nas/ smin grol la bkod do// de rnams kyi ^ rje btsun ñid brin chu dbar du bzhugs pa'i dus su/ tshe rings ma la sogs pa lha 'dre dpag tu med pas bar cad kyi tho tsams ['tsham] pas/ rje btsun gyis de rnams tshar bcad cing rjes su bzung ngo/ ces pa'i don to// // de rjes sñe ^ nam yul gyi lung par byon// sñ[e] nam bon po bar dor 'khyams pa sgral// dge shes dar blo dad cing gus par byas// dge `dun dge tshogs btul la gus phyag 'tshal// (23) ces pa'i don ni/ de yang rje btsun mid la ras pa zhes ^ pa de ñid kyis/ sñe nam du byon pas/ sñe nam pa'i bon po gshen khro rgyal ces pa mnga' thang dang 'byor pa ru ldan pa gcig yod pa de ñid dad nas/ 'bul ba dang 'degs pa'i zhabs tog mang du sgrubs/ de nas bon po de 'chi khar ^ song ba dang/ kho'i kha (?) chams la/ bu che zhogs gcig yod pa la/ nga la dge rtsa gzhan mi dgos kyis/ nga'i phyogs su btong ba'i rdzas cha gang yod thams cad / rje btsun gyi drung du phul la/ thugs rjes zung gyis gcig/ der bu des kho rang ji ltar ^

245. zer bzhin byas pas/ de'i zhag gsum gro bzhi'i dus su/ mtshan byang la dgug bzhug [gzhug] byas pas/ mtshan byang mngon sum du 'dar khri li li [li khri?] 'dug/ de nas sgra dang 'dong bcas nas/ rje btsun gyi thugs khar ^ thim song/ der bon po'i bu smad thams cad gda' zhing dad nas/ mos gus chen po skyes pa'i dus na/ pe ta rtsa na yod pa

mang du ngu zhing 'dug/ der rje btsun gyis de tsam ma ngu/ ci don pa gsung pas/ pe ta na re/ khu kun [khu ba kun ldan?] gyi mi la 'di ^ ltar byed / 'u skol dang gi [ngang gi] pha ma sdig can/ gñis po gar song cha med du btong pa zer nas ngus pas/ rje btsun gyi zhal nas/ pha ma sdug pa gñis po 'chi bdag gi dbang du song nas gum ste/ ngas dang po nas da da'i [lta'i] bar la lus ^ ngag yid gsum dge ba la skol ['khol] tshad/ pha ma gñis kyis gtse [cf. grtses; 'tshe ba] byas sems can thams cad kyi don du byas pa yin/ nga mngon dǔ byas tsa na/ pha ma gñis dang mngon du mi byed kha med yin mod/ ma ngu pha ma'i dge rtsa ngas byas zin yod kyis ^ gsungs so/ de nas rje btsun mid la ñid la/ sñan pa dang grags pa chen po yang byung ngo// 'khor dang longs spyod sprin bzhin du 'dus nas/ sku bsod chen po byung ba'i dus der/ gnas de na mtshams bcad pa'i ston pa dar [b]lo bya ba/ mngon pa la sogs ^ pa'i sde snod mang po shes pa/ tshig gis mkhas par byas pa gcig yod pas/ khong gi 'du long/ kho'i bsod nams la sto bar byung pas/ ñin gcig mtshams bcad kyi ston pa dar [b]lo'i bsam ba[s] la/ mid la ras pa zhes bya ba'i rnal 'byor pa ^ yi gi [ge] shes rgyu tshig gcig dang med pa'i/ dad rdzas gshin rdzas thams cad za ba/ nga'i yang [phags?] bsod nams la sto bar byed pa gcig 'dug/ di ring [di ri ri?] sgrog [sgro?] gleng gcig byas la kho 'pham par byas la yul 'di nas phur la btang bsam nas/ rje btsun ^

246. gyi drung na yar/ ñin gcig 'jal zer nas byung bas/ der rdo rje grags pa la sogs pa'i ras pa 'ga' zung drung na yod pas/ rje btsun la/ mtshid [mtshan ñid? mtshams en cad ?] kyi ston pa dar [b]lo bya ba 'u skol dpon slob la snga nas sdigs pa'i las dpag med sog pa de ^ 'ang/ di ring ma ta na 'jal 'jal zer nas gda' [rda?]/ de la khos dang la phyag gcig stob ñen bdog lags kyis de'i phyag de 'ang dang du long mdzod/ kho la dge shes kyi gñen bkur gcig mdzad par zhu zhus pas/ rje btsun ni lus ^ tshags dang mi mdzad par gzims nas bzhugs 'dug/ der ston pa dar [b]lo yar 'ongs nas/ mar ril gcig gi phyag rten byas nas/ phyag phul te sñun zhus pas/ rje btsun ñid ni phyag dang [kyang] len du yang ma bzhed/ phyag ^ rten phul yang/ zhabs langs pa min pa mdzad du ma 'dod/ de nas ston pa dar blo [sic] na re/ ñid rnal 'byor gyi dbang phyug grub thob chen po yin zer ba/ 'u rang gñis grub mtha'i chos la rtsod pa byas shog zer ba/ der ^ mid la ñid rtsog bzhengs nas/ 'o na rtsod pa gcig thong (?) dang [g]sung/ der gñis pos grub mtha' la rtsod pa bag tsam mdzad pas/ ston pa dar [b]lo ma thub par/ rje btsun 'pham nas/ der dar [b]lo kho rtsig pa zos te ^ sangs rgyas kyi bstan pa gshig gshig po [gshib pa?]/ dkon mchog gi dbu dpangs dmod po [dmod tshod?]/ chos kyi rnam spyi ye med par/ mi 'di tsam gyi mgo skor ba/ dad rdzas dang gshin rdzas la yog zas byed byed pa zer cing/ tshul du ma'i sgo ^ nas bshe [bshes] zhing/ dbu la rdog ril [rdog 'gril ba] byas/ zhal du sa dang thal ba yang blug go/ de ltar byas pa dang rje btsun ñid lan ci yang mi mdzad par kho byed du

'dzud cing 'dug/ de nas cung zhig nas [cf. bshig pa]/ kho'i zhes sdang zhi nas [zhig nas] ^

247. gos gyon cing 'dug pa la / ras chung pa rnams na re/ ngan pa 'dis 'u'i bla ma la 'di lta bu byed pa zer nas/ rdung zer nas/ ston pa dar [b]lo brdung du byung ba la/ rje btsun gyi zhal nas/ ^ ma rdung ma rdung nga'i kha'i sa 'di pa phyis dang gsung/ dbu'i sa rtso phyag gis shar shar sprug gin [=kyin?] 'dug/ de ras chung pa rnams kyis/ zhal gyi sa brus ['bru ba] pas/ rje btsun gyi zhal nas/ ras chung pa dang/ 'bri sgom/ khyed gñis kyis nga'i ^ ram bu theg gcig gsung nas/ mgur ma 'di ñid dar [b]lo la bzhes so// rje bla ma rnams la phyag 'tshal lo// chos zhi ba 'dod chags bral ba'i mchog/ lam dam pa'i chos la skyabs su mchi// kwa [kye] bsan [gsan] dang dge shes ^ dar [b]lo ba// ñid 'jig rten 'di na mkhas shing btsun// nga 'jig rten 'di na bzang zhing rtogs// chos thos bsam sgom la 'u gñis mchog// 'u gñis 'jal ba'i 'jal phrad la// mi ñid ni zhe sdang me ltar 'bar// ^ lam [l]nga ni sdug gsum tsha ba du// mi 'u gñis chags sdang gi ku cho [co] la// gnas ngan sogs zer te logs na med// skyabs dkong mchog gsum la ngo re tsha// khyod rang sems kyi ngo bo'i mi shes pa'i// dam chos shes pas cing zhig phan// ^ byed rang rgyud zhi zhing ma thul ba'i // thos pa che nas ci zhig bya// khyed da bdag gi mgo bo mi brdung bar// nga mid la rdungs pas ci zhig phan// khyed ñon mongs thal bas mi g.yog par// nga thal bas ^ g.yogs pas ci zhig phan// khyed shes rgyud bag dang

mi ldan pa'i // tshul chos sdom pa yod nas ced [cer? ci?]// khyed lus ngag yid gsum mi btsun pa'i// thang sham chos gos gyon nas ced (?)// khyod chags sdang rmongs gsum ma ^

248. spangs pa'i // grub mtha'i dbye bshag mkhas nas ced (?)// rnal 'byor mid la ras pa ngas// sngad ma zos pa gcig med pa la// zag pa zos pa da res tsam// nga ma 'goms pa gcig med pa la// thal ba 'goms pa ^ da res tsam// ngas ma dril ba ['dris pa ?] gcig med pa la// rdog pas dril ba da res tsam// dam chos dge shes mkhas lags kyang// nga rgyal dang ñon mongs 'phel ba'i grogs [grong?]// rnam smin las ngan sog pa'i snod// lus tsan [can] ngag gis ^ bsags pa'i las// skal pa brgyar yang chud mi mdza' ['dza']// nam zhig dus la bab pa na// 'bras bu ñid du smin par gsungs// ñid dam chos mkhas na sdig pa yongs // thos pa che na zhi dul skyed// ñid grub ^mtha' mkhas na chags sdang spongs [yongs]// ces [g]sung pas/ kho yang ngo nong byas nas song/ de nas ston pa dar [b]los mno bsam btong gin phyin pas/ a pa da [nga?] kyi nas khong gsung pa de la 'ang mi bden pa gcig kyang mi 'dug/ ^ ngas sdig pa rang ches pa gcig gsogs pa 'dra/ da sdig pa bshags pa grag [drag?] bsam nas/ rje btsun gyi drung du sa da ka nas log 'ongs te/ rje btsun la 'jal bas/ rje btsun ñid cog 'dra ba lnga ru sprul nas/ la la nang na bzhugs ^ la la phyi na bzhugs/ la la srang kha na yar 'gro mar 'gro mdzad kyin 'dug/ der ston pa dar [b]lo'i bsam pa la/ rje btsun ni mang po gcig tu sprul ba 'dra na/ nga dag gang gi drung du bshags pa byed pa bsam

zhing/ blo the ^ tshom log log [log ge?] yod pas/ da rje btsun gyis mkhyen nas/ bshags pa gang la byas dang [kyang] chog gis/ nang ya gi na pandita gcig 'dug gis/ dang [dong la] la ya gi dang rtsod pa byis dang gsung/ der dar [b]los de ji 'dra gcig brda [gda?] zhus ^

249. pas blo gros dang sheb tu ldan pa yin zer 'dug/ yi ni khyod kyi chos gtam gyis thub na/ nga la bshags pa ma byas kyang khyod kyi sdig pa nges par 'dag gi gsung/ der nang du phyin pas/ btsun pa ^ pandita'i cha lugs su byas pa ka ba li khur du khur ba gcig 'dug/ de na re/ 'u rang gñis sngags pa 'di dpang du tshugs la rtsod pa gyis/ su 'pham pa de rgyal ba'i bstan pa la 'jug go zer nas/ gñis pos rtsod pa byas pas/ gang la ^ rtsod dang dar [b]los ma thub bo/ de nas pandita de/ mchod pa rgyas pa gcig byas nas/ mid la la thim song/ de nas sprul pa gzhan rnams dang gcig la gcig thim nas/ mthar mid la rang la thim song/ der ston pa dar [b]lo'i bsam pa ^ la/ bla ma 'di sprul pa dang sgyur pa la mnga' rñes pa/ phun sum tshogs pa 'dug pa la/ ngas sngar de tsam gyi las bsags pa shin du ma legs 'dug sñam zhing/ dad pa dang gus pa phun sum tshogs pa skyes shing/ rje btsun la/ snong [nongs] zhing 'gyod pa'i ^ bshags pa phul/ rdzes su 'dzin par zhus pas/ rje btsun gyis dang [kyang] thugs rjes bzung zhing/ chos gnang/ sgom btab pas / sgom bzang po skyes shing/ phun sum tshogs pa byung ngo// dus de tsa na gzhan nang [gnang?] sñe nam pa dang/ gung thang pa la sogs pa'i ^ btsun pa'i sde thams cad rje btsun la

sdang par byung/ khyad par du 'ang/ ras pa rdzing bu ba bya ba'i dgon chung gcig yod pa'i / dge 'dun rnams kyis rje btsun ñid la/ chad lta ba gcig 'dug zer cing/ ras pa rnams la rdo brdungs 'dzud/ skur pa ^ tshad med pa gcig 'debs pa yin pa la/ ñin gcig tu song ba dang rje btsun gyi zhal nas/ di ring nga rdzing bu'i dgon par 'gro zer nas/ dpon g.yog bzhis byon pas/ dgon pa de na khyi bzang la mang ba 'dug pa la/ de rnams thams cad ^

Part III

Chapter 11: The transcription of the Biography of Milarepa by rGyal Thang pa

250. rje btsun dpon g.yog la mi 'dzing bar/ ldag cing 'dri yin 'dug/ de nas dge 'dun gcig pa byung bas/ rje btsun dpon g.yog yin par ngo shes nas/ dge 'dun gcig na re/ kye zog po mid la dpon g.yog pa 'u'i gnas 'di ru ^ byung/ la 'ur brdung du shog zer/ der dge 'dun bcu rtsam thon byung [thon mtshams su?]/ de rnams thams cad kyis rje btsun dpon g.yog rnams/ khyer brdungs rtsogs byas pas/ rje btsun ni de ltar byas dang mi ñes [mi mñes?] pa'i rnams pa gcig dang [kyang] mi 'dug/ de nas khong rnams na re/ ^ ngan pa 'di tsam brdungs dang/ krigs pa [krig cags? dkrigs?] gcig dang med pa/ 'di do re khyigs la dbu rtse'i nang du lcags tshud la zhag [gzhag] zer nas/ rje btsun nang du btsud nas lcags bcud nas 'ongs pas/ rje btsun gyis ni kho pa'i sngun la ngos phyi na phebs nas ^ 'dug/ der dge 'dun rnams kyis dpon g.yog thams cad legs par bkyigs nas gzhag pas/ rje btsun gyis phat. ces gsung pas/ dpon g.yog thams cad bkyigs pa rnams ni grol nas/ 'khyig mkhan gyi btsun pa rnams kong (?) nge kong nge bkyigs 'dug ^ de nas dge 'dun 'ga' 'ongs nas/ ngan pa 'dis gang yang shes pa 'dug/ dge 'dun thams cad shog la/ nga pa 'di legs par khyigs la/ cong ma gi la skyur la thong zer nas/ mi res thag pa re khyer 'ongs nas/ rje btsun ñid legs par ^ bkyigs nas/ bcun pa [btsun pa] bcwa [bco] lngas 'thur la drud pas/ rje btsun ni gul dang

'ong ma gus/ der ci byas gang byas dang [kyang] rje btsun la klags [glags] che bar ma gus/ slar gnas der rje btsun ñid kyis spyod pa cher mdzad te/ nus pa'i shugs dang ^ ldan pas/ nang na yod pa'i mi dang nor thams cad phyir bton ['don?]/ phyi na yod pa'i dud 'gro la sogs pa nang du bcud/ mdor na de ltar du ya ca yu (?) zlog gzhag pas/ thams cad 'jigs shing skrag par gyur nas/ rje btsun la gsol ba btab ^

251. pas/ rje btsun ñid kyis mgur ma 'di ltar du bzhes so/ nga rnal 'byor mid la ras pa // ma stobs kyi nus pa thogs med yod// ma dag 'gro ba'i dgon pa khyed// mi mos log ltas ^ bkur pa 'debs// brdeg brdung bzung bkyigs ci yang byas// nga mi ñan mi tho spyod pa mtshong (?) [ma tshong?] // nga ma cha yu log spyod pa byed// khyed dad na dad pas gus pa phul// mi dad thal ba rdul du rlog/ ces gsung nas/ ^ bar sgang nas rdo ba'i char pa phab pas/ dgon pa de'i dbu mdzad kyis gtso byas pa'i/ dge 'dun thams cad kyis zhabs spyi thog tu blangs shing/ dad cing gus par gyur to// de rnams kyis/ rje btsun ñid kyi rdzu 'phrul dang mthu stobs mdzad ^ pas/ mi mos pa'i 'gro ba tshar bcad nas rjes su bzung zhing / mos par mdzad do/ ces pa'i don to// // de ltar brin pa'i yon bdag pho mo la// ñams rtogs shar dang cong la 'phur ba dang// rje btsun ^ sgrol mas bsngo ba byas la sogs// rje btsun byin labs ldan la gus phyag 'tshal // (24) ces pa'i don ni/ de yang rje btsun gyi rgyal po mid la ras pa zhes pa de ñid kyis/ brin chu dbar du bzhugs nas/

ras chung rdo rje grags pa dang/ yon ^ bdag mo legs ses gtso mdzad pa'i gang zag 'ga' zhig gis/ brin pa'i yon bdag pho mo mang po gcig la/ bcom ldan 'das bde mchogs lha lnga'i dbang gcig zhu ba'i tshams sbyor gyi zhu ba bgyis nas/ rje btsun gyis dang [kyang] thugs rjes bzung ste/ rdul ^ tshon gyi dkyil 'khor bzhengs/ bum pa bcas/ mngon rtogs bdag 'jug dang bcas pa sngon du legs par mdzad nas/ sngon 'gro'i dbang rnams rdzogs te/ bum pa'i dbang gi dngos gzhi skur ba'i dus su/ da mid la nga rgas 'dug go/ bum ^

252. pa kho rang las byed du 'dzud pa yin no gsung nas/ om na ma sarva tathâ ga ta ces gsung rjod pa tsam gyis/ bum pa mi rnams kyi spyi thog tu rim pa bzhin gzhag ['jog] mi dgos par byung/ der thams cad ngo mtshar skyes nas/ rnal 'byor ma sgron me [sgrol ma dpal chen?] la sogs ^ pa'i mi mang po 'ur cing ye shes babs/ la la la sgom ma dgos par ñams rtogs shar nas/ thams cad dga' zhing spro bar gyur pas/ rje btsun ñid kyi zhal nas/ nga sñan brgyud dri med kyi dal du// dbyer med zung 'jug bde ba'i ^ mchog/ ye shes lnga'i dbang skur bas// dbang gi bum pa las la bkol// sangs rgyas ye shes ngo sprad pas// ye shes babs pa sgrol ma dpal chen bden// rtogs pa 'char ba dbang rgyal bden// ñams myong 'char ba bsam grub bden / ^ 'di 'dra'i dbang skur gzhan na dkon// nga bla ma mid la'i dbang skur lugs// ngo mtshar mos gus los kyang dgos// ces gsung zhing/ mi thams cad dad cing gus par gyur to// de'i nang par/ ras chung rdo rje grags pas ^ phag mo'i thang sku gcig bzhengs pa dang/ yon

bdag mo legs ses dges pa rdo rje'i thang sku gcig bzhengs pa la rab gnas zhus pas/ mchod pa shoms/ me tog nas khyer la shog gsung nas/ de de bzhin du sgrubs pas/ rje btsun ^ gsung gleng mang po mdzad nas/ me tog nas de la (?) thu thu thu gsung nas/ de nas rje btsun na re/ mid la nga dang po gzhon pa'i dus na ngas langs nas me tog 'thor ba yin te/ da nga rgas 'dug pa ^ yid dam gyi lha tso me tog long me tog cas [ces] grags gsung zhing 'dug pas/ rnal 'byor ma'i thang sku de dbu skug skug (?) mdun du byung/ de'i dus na dges pa rdo rje'i thang sku de yang 'gul ldeg 'dug/ mdun na yod pa'i me tog ^

253. nas de rnams bsho hram zer tsa na/ yid dam gyi thang sku la thim song/ der drung na yod pa rnams kyis 'di lta bu'i mdzad pa ngo mtshar che yo ['o] zer cing mos gus byas/ rje btsun gyi zhal nas/ gzugs ^ sku ras ris lha sku la// ye shes dbab dang ma dgos par// ye shes me tog rang sar thim// rab gnas chags so ras chung pa// zhes pa'i mgur gsungs nas gshegs song/ de nas zhag 'ga' zhig lon pa dang/ ^ legs se pa bza' mis/ rje btsun gyi drung du sems khrid gcig zhu bar byas nas/ rje btsun gyi drung du legs ses/ bdag gcag gñis dus gcig tu khrid zhu lags sam/ gcig khrid g.yog gcig gis byas nas ting du zhu lags zhus pas/ rje btsun ^ gyi zhal nas/ gcig gi khrid g.yog gcig gis gyis la zhus gsung/ dang la yon bdag zhu ru tshud gsung/ der yon bdag sgom du btsud nas yon bdag mos g.yog byas pas/ yon bdag la khrid khyugs ^ se ba gcig las ma byung/ yon bdag mo

la ngos ñams bzang po phun sum tshogs pa shar/ de bla ma rje btsun gyis ngo sprad pas/ ye shes ngos zin cing rtogs pa shar ro [to]/ yang yon bdag na re/ nga yang rgyags skyel ngos shes byed/ khyod rang ^ sgoms gcig zer nas de bzhin du byas pas/ yon bdag gis dang [kyang] ye shes ngos zin cing rtogs pa shar ro [to]/ dus de'i dus na yon bdag gis rgyags skyel du 'ongs pas/ rje btsun dang/ legs se gsol gsol cing yod pas/ rje btsun ñid ni ha ^ ha gsung nas bzhad cing 'dug/ rje btsun ci la/ bzhad lags pa zhus pas/ rje btsun gyi zhal nas/ yon bdag khos tsam pa khal gcig tsam dang/ gzhan nang [yang] za chas 'dra khur nas 'ong gin 'dug pas/ stag dang lam du ^

254. thug nas/ yon bdag khos 'bros dang [kyang] ma nus/ rdeg dang [kyang] ma nus par krong nge [nged?] lus 'dug/ de la nga rgod bro ba yin gsung/ der yun ring po gcig nas yon bdag gis sleb byung bas/ khong na re/ nga di ring stag dang ^ thug ste/ 'bros pa yang ma byung/ krong ka lus te/ bla ma'i thugs rjes stag gis gnod pa ma byas zer/ der yon bdag mo na re/ 'di 'dra'i bla ma gcig dang ni 'jal/ rgyud la ñams rtogs ni shar/ stag la sogs pa'i sems can sdug ^ pa can gyis ni mi tshugs/ 'u rgan rgon gñis 'tsheng 'dug zer/ de'i dus su rje btsun gyi zhal nas/ rnal 'byor mid la ras pa nga// yon tan ldan zhing byin rlabs che// ri khrod 'grim cing dka' spyad byas// de dus mthun rkyen sgrig ^ pa'i mi// yon bdag pho mo khyed gñis kyis// rgyu tshogs rten 'brel rab 'grig nas// ñams myong rgyud la shar ba yin//

stag sogs gnod pa lta ci smos// ces [g]sung nas/ yon bdag pho mo gñis la/ yang dag pa ^ ye shes kyi ngo sprod mang du gsungs pas/ khong gñis kyis kyang yang dag pa ye shes kyi don rtogs shing brtan pa thob po [bo]// yang skabs gcig la/ brin pa'i yon bdag pho mo 'ga' zhig la/ rdo rje rtum po [gtum mo] bya khyung gi dbang gcig ^ skur bas/ slob ma bdun bar snang la 'phur ba yang byung ngo// yang skabs gcig na/ brin pa'i yon bdag pho mo 'gas/ tshogs kyi 'khor lo skor bas/ tshogs kyi 'khor lo de la/ rje btsun gyi gsung nas/ ngas bla ma ^ grub thob brgyad po spyan trangs [drangs] la 'ong gis/ khyed rang tshogs 'khor sogs gcig gsung/ de la ji tsam 'tshal zhus pas/ mad dang ku re yin 'di kas chog gis gsung nas/ gu ru sa ma ya hum dza dzaḥ gsung zhing se gol ^

255. tog tog mdzad cing 'dug go/ de nas en tsam nas/ sgra dang 'dong [sdongs] bcas nas/ bram ze chen po la sogs pa'i grub thob brgyad tshogs 'khor de la byon byung/ de nas de rnams la tshogs kyi 'khor lo rnams drangs pas/ ^ en tsam nas bar snang la sgra dang rol mo sgra 'ur ding ba byung bas/ grub chen brgyad po de cang yang mi gsung bar gshegs song/ de'i dus su/ sa de na yod pa'i mi 'ga' zhig la ñams dang rtogs pa shar/ 'ga' zhig bar snang ^ la 'phur nus pa yang byung ngo/ de lta bu'i dus su/ de la sogs pa'i bu slob yon bdag pho mo dang bcas pa rnams byin gyis rlabs shing/ ñams dang rtogs pa shar ba mang po byung zhing/ ngo mtshar ba'i ltas dpag tu med pa byung ngo// de'i ^ tshogs

'khor de'i bsngo ba zhus pas/ rje btsun gyi zhal nas bsngo ba la aga ma yin pa gcig btang gis/ khyed rang yug [yud] ma 'gyes par sdod gcig sung nas gshegs song/ de'i rjes su rje btsun ma 'phags ma sgrol ma byon nas/ gdan ^ gyi kha ru bzhugs nas/ bsngo ba yon bshad la sogs pa'i bsngo ba mdzad do/ de'i dus su mi thams cad ngo mtshar zhing/ mos gus tshad med pa skyes so/ de yang en tsam nas rje btsun ñid byon nas/ khyed kyi bsngo ba yon bshad rje btsun ma grol mas ^ byas am/ de go bcad gsung nas gshegs song// de rnams kyis/ rje btsun mid la ras pa ces pa de ñid kyis/ dad pa dang ldan pa'i bu slob yon bdag pho mo dang bcas pa rnams la dbang dang zab mo'i chos gnang zhing/ de'i dus su ^ byin rlabs dang/ ngo mtshar ba'i ltas dpag tu med pa byung ngo/ ces pa'i don to// // de lta'i rje btsun mid la rnal 'byor pas// sa der ma bzhugs mnga' ris skor gsum dang// g.yas ru lho ^

256. byang rtsang ga [gtsang gi] sa cha sogs// ri khrod phyogs med 'grims la gus phyag 'tshal// (25) ces pa'i don ni/ de yang rje btsun gyi rgyal po mid la ras pa ces pa de ñid kyis/ skabs gcig tu song ba dang/ sa der ma bzhugs par/ phyogs med ^ kyi ri khrod 'grims la/ sgrub brgyud kyi bstan pa gcig rtsugs [btsugs] dgongs pa dang/ khyar [khyad] du rje btsun mid la'i mtshan thos pa'i sems can thams cad 'khor ba gnas stongs te mngon par rdzogs par sangs rgyas bar gsungs/ de la dgongs nas/ phyogs thams cad ^ mtshan gyi sñan pas khyab par bya ba'i phyir du/ phyogs med kyi ri

khrod kho na la byon par dgong te/ sngan la stod mnga' ris skor gsum gyi sa cha la byon/ de yang gangs ri mtsho gsum la byon te/ gangs kyi rgyal po ^ ti se/ mtsho'i rgyal po ma pham/ ri'i rgyal po rtse rgya la sogs pa rnams su byon cing/ sgrub brgyud kyi bstan pa rtsugs [btsugs] te/ ñams dang rtogs pa rgyas/ gnas de rnams la gnas pa'i sems can/ tshad med pa'i don yang mang du mdzad do// de nas mar ^ byon pa'i lam du pu rangs dang/ blo bo dang/ gung thang dang / mang yul la sogs pa rnams su/ tog tsam re bzhugs shing sgrub brgyud kyi bstan pa btsugs/ 'gro ba sems can la phan pa tshad med pa mdzad do// de nas la stod g.yas ru ^ lho byang na mar la byon/ ding ri dang/ bong shong / shri ri dang/ khrom la sogs pa'i la stod lho'i ri khrod kyi gnas rnams su bzhugs shing/ de rnams su yang sgrub brgyud kyi bstan pa gtsugs [btshugs]/ 'gro ba sems can pa'i don tshad med pa yang mdzad do/ ^ de nas g.yas ru byang gi phyogs su byon te/ de yang rgyal thang dang/ shel [shal?] lug [lcag?] dang/ glu rgyal gling po dang/ mchog dkar gyi brag la sogs pa/ g.yas ru byang gi sa phyogs su yang bzhugs nas/ sgrub brgyud kyi bstan pa ^

257. gtsugs [btsugs]/ de rnams kyi 'gro ba sems can pa'i don tshad med pa yang mdzod do// de yang/ dang po rgyal thang brgya[d] bcu'i brag la bzhugs nas/ ñams dang rtogs pa gong nas gong du 'phel zhing rgyas ^ pa'i ngang nas/ bya rgod po tso nam mkha' la 'phur ba'i ting [gting] na yar/ rje btsun ñid kyis kyang/ rgya [brgyad] bcu'i brag

nas 'phur/ shel lcag ma la gshegs/ shel lcag nas 'phur cing brgya[d] bcu'i brag la byon pa'i rdzu 'phrul dpag ^ tu med pa ston cing/ sgrub brgyud kyi bstan pa gtsugs [tsugs] so// de nas glu rgyal gling por bzhugs nas/ kling [gling] po lha gcig gis lus dang longs spyod phul/ khyad par du phyag rgya bgyis te/ dga' bzhi ye shes 'od gsal gyi don la/ skyed dang bogs ^ chen po thon/ gsol du zwa gcig pu gsol/ skabs su/ 'gur klu rgyal gyi ña ma rnams la yang bsod sñoms mdzad/ gnas der yang bsgrub pa'i bstan pa rtsugs [btsugs]/ 'gro ba sems can pa'i don tshad med pa yang mdzad do// de ^ nas mchog dkar brag dang/ bar tshigs kyi ri khrod rnams su bzhugs/ gtso bo stag gu dang/ jo mo ko ne la sogs pas yun ring du bteg/ der yang sgrub brgyud kyi bstan pa gtsugs/ 'gro ba sems can pa'i don tshad med pa yang mdzad do/ ^ de nas cung gi yul po che la byas/ co [jo] ro dang/ 'bring 'tshams dang/ stag tshang la sogs par byon nas/ sgrub brgyud kyi bstan pa gtsugs/ 'gro ba sems can pa'i don tshad med mdzad do// de la sogs pa ri khrod phyogs med du byon te/ ^ rje btsun mid las ma bzhugs pa dang/ zhabs kyis ma btsags ['tshag pa?] pa'i sa med do/ de rnams su yang dka' thub dang dka' spyad mdzad/ sgrub brgyud kyi bstan pa btsugs/ ñams dang rtogs pa rgyas par mdzad / 'gro ba sems can pa'i don ^

258. tshad med pa mdzad cing/ 'brel tshad don dang ldan par mdzad do ['brel tsad med don dang?]/ de lta bu'i rje btsun de ni/ bod yul zal mo'i gzhung [bzhugs?]/ khri

gdugs ñi ma'i 'og 'di na/ sgrub tshugs la rje btsun ñid pas che ba ma byung/ mi 'byung/ da lta ^ yang med par grags so// gzhan yang/ ñams dang rtogs pa dang/ rdzu 'phrul dang/ zad par dang/ zil gnon dang/ mngon par shes pa dang/ sprul pa dang/ sgyur ba dang / grub rtogs dang/ yon tan la sogs pa la yang/ rje btsun ñid pas lhag ^ pa ma byung/ mi 'byung/ da [de] lta yang med par grags so// gzhan yang/ snang ba dang/ mi snang ba'i 'gro ba sems can pa'i don yang tshad med pa mdzad cing/ smin pa dang grol ba mdzad cing/ khyad par du yang/ sangs rgyas sku skye ba gcig ^ pa gis thogs pa'i/ rje dwags po lta bu 'am/ rlung sems gñis la dbang thob cing yon tan la thogs pa med pa ras chung rdo rje grags pa lta bu 'am/ dad pa dang mos gus ldan pa 'bri sgom g.yang legs lta bu 'am/ bde drod gñis la dbang thob pa ras pa zhi ba skyong lta bu 'am/ ^ sgom dang dka' thub la spran [sran?] tshugs pa rong chung pa ras pa lta bu 'am/ de la sogs te ye shes ngos zin pa'i/ 'gro ba sems can la phan thogs pa lung skam ras pa lta bu 'am/ sni zhangs ras pa lta bu 'am/ se bam ston chung lta bu 'am/ gzhan nang yon bdag ^ mo legs se lta bu 'am/ rnal 'byor ma lcam me 'am/ rnal 'byor ma sgrol ma chen lta bu la sogs pa/ ye shes ngos zin cing rtogs pa rgyud la shar nas 'gro ba sems can pa'i don tshad med pa mdzad pa'i slob ma de lta bu mang du byung zhing/ 'gro don dang 'phrin las rgyas par ^ mdzad do// de lta bu'i rje btsun ñid ni/ ñe bar len pa'i phung po lnga stong pa ñid du rtogs pas/ chung po'i bdud bcom pa

yin/ 'dod pa'i yon tan thams cad sgyu ma 'am rmi lam ltar du rtogs pas/ lha'i bu'i bdud bcom/ bud med mdzes/ ^

259. ma mang pos mtha' skor te tshul bzhin ma yin pa'i sgo nas sñad tsal [rtsal] yang 'dod chang la g.yo 'gul med pas/ ñon mongs pa'i bdud bcom/ sems can rtag phyis can rnams la mi rtag pa'i tshul ston pa ^ ma rtogs / lom thing nga ston pa byang 'bar kyis btsan dug lan gsum gyi bar du btang yang/ sku ma yal bas/ 'chi bdag gi bdud bcom/ des na drang don gyi bdud bzhi yang bcom// yang nges don du yang/ gzugs kyi phung po tha mal ^ pa ma yin pa lha 'i sku ru rtogs pas/ phung po'i bdud bcom/ bzang rtog gi dga' spro thams cad 'od gsal gyi rang ngor rtogs pas/ lha'i bu'i bdud bcom/ ngan rtog gi rnam rtog/ 'dod chags/ zhe sdang/ gti mug/ nga rgyal/ phrog la sogs pa'i ñon mongs pa lnga/ ye shes lnga'i rang ngor rtogs pas/ ñon mongs pa'i bdud bcom/ don dam pa na/ skye 'chi med pa'i don rtogs pas/ 'chi bdag gi bdud bcom/ des na nges don du yang/ bdud bzhi rnam dag dbyings su bcom pa'i rnal 'byor gyi dbang phyug chen po/ mchog dang mthun mong ^ gi dngos grub ba tshul bzhin du rñes pa'i grub thob kyi rgyal po chen po lags so// de rnams kyis/ rje mid la ces pa de ñid kyis/ phyogs thams cad du sgrub brgyud kyi bstan pa gtsugs pa'i phyir/ phyogs med kyi ri khrod du gshegs nas/ 'gro ba sems can pa'i ^ don tshad med pa mdzad do// ces pa'i don to// // de lta'i bla ma rje btsun de ñid kyis// bdud bzhi bcom nas yon tan drug dang ldan// phrin las rdzogs nas mya ngan 'da' tshul stan//

rje btsun rnam thar rdzogs la gus ^ phyag 'tshal// (26) ces pa'i don ni/ de yang rnal 'byor gyi dbang phyug mid la ras pa ces pa de ñid kyis/ 'gro don dang phrin las thams cad ni yongs su rdzogs par mdzad/ dngos grub kyi mtshan ma ji sñed pa ni gdul byas kun la stan/ yon tan rdzogs nas sems can gyi don grub ^

260. pa'i slob ma ni mang du thon/ ri khrod 'grim pa'i sgom chen rnams kyi dka' srol bzang po ni btod [gtod]/ zhing 'di'i rgya bod gñis kyi bla ma grub thob rnams kyi nang nas mchog tu gyur pa'i/ rje btsun de ñid/ dgung lo bdun bcu don gsum bzhes pa ^ dang/ gdul bya bu slob 'ga' dang 'ga'i rtsa ru/ nga shi ba dang ma shi ba la khyad par med mod kyis kyang/ gdul bya rtag phyis can rnams la mi rtag pa stan pa'i phyir 'am/ khyad par du yang ston pa byang 'bar dges pa'i ched du/ sgyu ma ^ gzugs kyi phung po 'di/ dus da lo mi rtag pa'i tshul ston pa yin gsung/ de'i drung na yod pa'i 'khor slob rnams kyis/ rje btsun rang dbang can lags mod/ gdul bya'i don du ci nas kyang mi 'grongs par bzhugs pa gcig thugs rje bzung ^ 'tshal ces zhus pas/ rje btsun gyi zhal nas/ sngon bcom ldan 'das thub pa'i dbang po de 'ang/ mya ngan las 'das pa'i tshul bstan pas/ sems can gyi don du khyebs che ba'i rgyu yang byung 'dug/ de bzhin du bka' brgyud kyi bla ma ^ rnams dang/ mya ngan las 'das pa'i tshul stan pas/ sems can gyi don la khyebs che ba gcig byung 'dug/ nga yang mya ngan las ma 'das par sems can gyi don byed pa tso sngar du grub tshar/

nga mya ngan las 'das pas sems can gyi don grub ^ pa gcig yong pas/ de'i phyir mya ngan las 'das pa'i tshul ston no gsungs so// lar [yang] nga la mthong snang mang du 'ong/ gsung nas mgur ma 'di yang gsungs so// rnal 'byor mid la ras pa nga// 'chi bdag bdud kyi ba mo ^ yis/ bcom nas pha rol 'gro ba la// dus der mthong snang sna tshogs 'ong// la la'i snang ngor phung po 'byung// zhugs la sbyong zhing pur mchod 'bul// la la'i snang ngor 'chi rgyu med// 'ja' lus gyur nas ^

261. dbyings gshegs zer// de ltar snang ba gñis kar bden// ces [g]sung ngo/ de'i dus na/ chu dbar gyi ri khrod la bzhugs yod pa'i drung na/ rnal 'byor pa pho mo bcu gñis yod pa la/ 'bri sgom g.yang legs dang/ ^ rnal 'byor ma lcam me la sogs pa snang ba['i bdag po] dag pa drug gi snang ngor/ sñung ba la sogs pa med par bzhugs pa'i phro la/ gzims mal sbu gu dang nge byas nas 'ja' lus su gshegs pa'i snang ba yang byung ngo// ras pa zhi ba skyong dang/ yon bdag mo legs se ^ la sogs pa 'ga'i snang ngor/ sñe nam gyi bon po tsan dar 'bum zhes bgyi ba yod pas/ chags sdang gi dbang gis/ 'dze mo gcig la rngan pa g.yu legs po gcig byin nas/ zho phor pa gang la dug dang phye bsres pa btab nas/ 'di khyod kyis ^ khyer la/ khyod kyis thabs sna tshogs kyi sgo nas/ mid la ras pa mthun mong ba gcig gyis la shog gcig/ dper te ma mthun mongs na/ nga rang gi g.yu nga rang la dgos so zer nas btang bas/ rje btsun la zho de grangs pas/ rje btsun gyis ^ mkhyen bzhin du zho de legs par gsol

nas/ 'dze mo la phor pa btang te/ khyod kyis g.yu thob par bya ba'i phyir dang/ bon po tsan dar gyi thugs dgongs rdzogs par bya ba'i phyir du/ ngas zho 'thungs yod do/ khyod kyi rgyud thog tu ^ rnam smin mi lci bar byin rlab gyis gsung/ 'dze mo btang ngo// de nas en tsham sñung ba'i tshul stan nas/ 'khor na gnas pa (?) rnams kyis/ sñung ba 'di la thabs ji ltar byas na phan lags zhus pas/ rje btsun gyi zhal ^ nas/ gang gis dang [kyang] mi phan/ da lan nga 'gro dgos pa yin gsung nas/ nga'i rgyab kyi bu gu 'di na/ nga rang gi gshegs rdzongs ldang ngos shes pa'i nor yod pas 'di rnams phyogs su thogs/ khyed rnams kyis mchod 'bul la sogs ^

262. pa byas na/ dam tshig ñams so gsung nas/ der legs ses/ bla ma la phyag rdzas med pa ngam cag la rgyus gdog ['dogs]/ gshegs rdzongs gang 'byor gcig bdag gis sgrub bar zhu ces zhus pas ma gnang ngo// de nas spro'i 'u lo dpyid zla tha ^ ma'i ña'i nub mo/ dongs po thams cad la ma chags pa'i 'du shes sgoms te/ dbyings 'od gsal gyi ngang du 'gro ba yin no/ gshen chung pa khyod kyis/ nga'i g.yog mang du byas pa yin pas/ nga gshegs mi thog [thogs?]/ ras chung pa khong/ lo ro [lo re?] bya ^ ba na 'dug zer gyis/ nga'i zhwa 'di dang mkhar ba 'di dang [yang] khyer la song gcig gsung/ de nas nam sros pa dang/ dkar me mtshan thub pa gcig chos gsung nas/ de ltar du byas pas/ lus 'khrul 'khor du byas/ lag pa mñam bzhag gi phyag rgya ^ mdzad nas/ dkar me de nga'i spyi thog tu zhogs gsungs nas/ de de ltar du

gzhag pas [='jog pa]/ mtshan rgyags thugs dam la g.yos pa med par bzhugs 'dug/ de nas tho rangs su song ba dang/ nam langs sam ltos dang gsung/ langs rda [brda] ^ zhus pas/ 'o na dkar me de phar zhogs gsung nas/ da nga la sgoms ma sgoms khyad med te/ khyed tso la ston pa'i ched du/ nga rgad po 'chi kha ma gcig gis dang [kyang]/ de ltar du sgoms pa yin no/ ma sgoms pa'i chos kyis sangs rgyas mi thob ^ pa yin no / cis kyang sgoms gcig gsung nas/ skad gcig de ñid la 'pho ba mdzad nas/ mkha' la spyod pa'i gnas su gshegs so// de'i dus su bar snang la rol mo'i sgra grag pa dang/ spyi gtsug nas 'od zer dkar po gcig 'phros te ^ de nam mkha'i dbyings su zug pa dang la sogs pa'i ltas bzang po mang du yang byung ngo// de nas drung na yod pa'i slob 'khor de rnams / mig 'chi ma dang bcas pas/ gdung pas gsol ba 'debs shing drung du len tsam sdad/ de nas sku rgyab ^

263. gyi bug pa de ñid g.yengs pas / bur rdog gsum dang/ me long me thon pa gcig dang/ se dar me ma gcig dang/ gri gu tsa ma gcig dang las mi 'dug skad/ phyi rol na yod pa'i rdzas cha la/ phye sgye ^ dkar mo lhan pa rgyab pa gcig dang/ ras 'ga' bug rdol med tsam gcig dang/ 'gan rka (?) dkar po gcig dang/ dom ra me long ma gcig dang / gdams ngag gi pod chung gcig dang/ de rnams las gzhan phyag rdzas kyi dngos pos chags yang mi 'dug/ ^ der bu slob rnams kyis / mos gus kyi rten du de rnams dgos te/ zhag bdun gyi bar du pur la gsol ba btab po// de nas pur de/ brin sñe nam rnams kyi yon bdag pho mo rnams 'tshogs te/ brin pa

rnams brin lung ^ sar gdan drangs nas pur 'ju zer/ sñe nam pa rnams sñe nam gyi lung par gdan drangs nas pur 'ju zer nas ma 'chams/ der brin pa'i gtso bo rgya gar bya ba na re/ khyed rang ni bden/ nge rang ni bden/ da 'u rang brin sñe nam gñis ^ kar mthong ba'i ri ya gi la spyan grongs la pur zhu zer nas/ gros thag de la bcad do/ de nas yon bdag slob rigs su rtogs tshad la lon byas te/ zhag gsum 'tshogs pas/ de'i dus na brin pa rnams mi hrags la ^ mos gus che ba yod pas/ nam phyed brin du pur spyan drangs nas/ pur khang rtsigs te/ pur zhugs la sbyangs pas/ me 'bar du ma 'dod/ de nas der 'tshogs pa'i bu slob thams cad kyis/ ngag gdung pa dang bcas pas gsol ba ^ 'debs shing/ de yang / dus der / la la brgyal/ la la ngu/ la la brang brdung/ la la skra 'bal ba la sogs pa byed cing/ thams cad sdul bar ['dul bar] gyur pas/ bar snang na mar rol mo'i sgra mang po dang byas nas/ thugs kha [ka?] ^

264. nas me rang 'bar la 'bar byung/ de'i dus su du ba thams cad 'ja' tshon ris su shig shig pa byung/ dud pa'i rtse mo thams cad gdugs dang/ rgyal mtshan la sogs pa bkra shis kyi rdzas brgyad du snang ba yang byung/ me stag bar snang la 'phros pa ^ thams cad/ dpa' bo dang dpa' mo ru shig shig pa yang byung/ gzhan yang bar snang gi khams su mkha' 'gro'i tshogs mang po 'tshogs nas/ mgrin gcig par 'di skad du/ bla ma rin chen gshegs dus 'dir// sa la gnas pa'i mi rnams kun// la ^ la brgyal zhing la la ngu// skra 'bal brang brdung 'o dod 'bod// gdung pas gsol ba btab pa las//

rang byung me ni thugs nas 'bar// dud pa 'ja' tshon ltar 'khril zhing// gdung dang rgyal mtshan la sogs pa'i// bkra shis ltas brgyad rtags su shar// rnga sgra dung dang cha lang dang// pi wang gling bu ra ru sgra// zugs med grag tra 'khrol ba thos// yid 'ong mkha' 'gro lha tshogs nged// mkha' 'gro'i dbang phyug bla ma rje// pur sbyongs mkha' spyod gnas su gshegs// ^ ces pa la sogs pa'i gsung skad mang po grag pas/ thams cad kyis mngon sum du thos nas/ der 'tshogs pa thams cad/ lhag par du yang dad cing gus par gyur to// de nas zhag mang po'i bar du pur khang la mchod pa phul nas/ rjes ^ su pur khang gshig nas/ gdung rus rnams spyan 'dren pa'i grabs byas pas/ gdung rus sen mo tsam gcig dang spyan drang rgyu ma byung bar/ dpa' bo dang mka' 'gro rnams kyis spyan drang nas/ sku phung po lhag med du mngon par ^ rdzogs par sangs rgyas pa'i tshul yang ston// sprul pa'i sku'i dus phyis 'dir/ gang la gang 'dul gyi sku'i/ 'gro ba sems can pa'i don tshad med pa mdzad par grags so// yang gdul bya 'ga' zhig gi snang ngor/ mang khung du byon te/ ^

265. brag dkar ta po'i gnas la bzhugs nas/ gdul bya 'ga' zhig la chos ston pa'i bro la/ mang khung ba ston byang 'bar gyis/ sems can chags sdang gi dbang gis phud la dug btab nas grangs ^ pas/ mid la ras pa ñid kyis mkhyen bzhin du/ ston pa ñid kyi thugs dgongs yongs su rdzogs par bya ba'i phir dang/ sems can rtag phyis can rnams la mi rtag stan pa'i phyir/ ñid dgongs pa'i don ji ltar ba bzhin

du/ bdag gis ji ltar ^ ba sgrub par bgyi 'o gsung nas/ bde bar gshegs pa'i tshul yang stan to// mdor na rje btsun gyi rgyal po mid la ras pa ces pa de ñid kyis/ gdul bya snang ba dang mi snang ba la sogs pa'i snang ngor/ dka' thub dang dka' spyad kyi ^ 'phrang nas bton te/ ñams rtogs kyi gdeng dang ldan ji bzhin pa'i ngang nas/ sgrub brgyud kyi bstan pa btsugs to/ gdul bya sems can pa'i don tshad med pa mdzad cing/ mthong thos dran rig [reg] gi sems can thams cad smin grol la bkod nas/ ^ dgongs pa yong su mya ngan las 'das so ces pa'i don to// de rnams kyis rje btsun gyi rgyal po mid la ras pa ces pa de ñid kyi rnam par thar pa ngo mtshar zhing khyad par du 'phags pa/ dad pa'i gsal 'debs shes bya ba/ rgyal ^ thang pa bde chen rdo rje sbyar ba rdzogs s // shubham// zhus dag// mangalam /
ho

Works Consulted

1. Tibetan Texts

Abhayadanasri. The Biography of Eighty-Four Saints of Buddhist (sic) by Mi-hjigs-pa Sbyin-pa Dpal. Translator: Dge-slon Smon-grub Shes rab. Varanasi: E. Kalsang, 1972 [I-Tib-72-906150]

Acharya Vira Prakash. The Enlightenment of the Eighty-Four Saints. Varanasi, 1972 [I-Tib-76-902797]

Bde-mchog sñan brgyud Biographies. Darjeeling: Kargyud Sungrab Nyamso Khang, 1983 [Milarepa: pp. 133-401]

Bde-mchog mkha' 'gro sñan rgyud (Ras chung sñan rgyud) A manuscript of orally transmitted precepts focussing upon the tutelaries Cakrasaṃvara and Vajravârâhî representing the yig-cha compiled by Byang chub Bzang po, reproduced from a rare ms. in the library of Apho Rimpoche. Vol. I. Delhi: 1973 [I-Tib-73-902914] [rnam thar of Milarepa, pp. 97-125]

Chandra, Lokesh and Snellgrove, D. L. Sarva-tathâgata-tattva-saṃgraha. The Symposium of Truth. Śatapitaka Series #269. New Delhi, 1981

Chandra, Lokesh, ed., with an Introduction by E. Gene Smith. A Fifteenth Century Tibetan Compendium of Knowledge: The Bshad mdzod yid bzhin nor bu by Don dam smra ba'i seng ge. New Delhi: 1969 [I-Tib-905367]

Chandra, Lokesh, ed. Sum pa mkhan po Ye shes dpal 'byor Dpag bsam ljon bzang Part III Foreword by G. Tucci; Preface by L. Petech. New Delhi: International Academy of Indian Culture, 1959. [I-Tib-76-903051]

Chandra, Lokesh, ed. With a Preface by E. Gene Smith. The Life of the Saint of Gtsang by rGyod Tshang ras pa sna tshogs rang grol. New Delhi: 1969.

Chandra, Lokesh, ed. With a Preface by E. Gene Smith. Kongtrul's Encyclopedia of Indo-Tibetan Culture, Parts 1-3. New Delhi: International Academy of Indian Culture, 1970.

Gtsang smyon Heruka. Smanrtsis Shesrig Spendzod. Vol. 11; Bde mchog mkha' 'gro sñan rgyud (Ras Chung sÑan rGyud), Foreword by E. Gene Smith. Leh: S. W. Tashigangpa, 1971. [Mila rnam thar: pp. 91-93]

Khetsun Sangpo, ed. Biographical Dictionary of Tibet and Tibetan Buddhism, Volumes VII, VIII, IX. The Bka' brgyud pa Tradition. Dharamsala, LTWA, 1977, 1981, 1981.

Mkha' spyod dbag po, the Second Zwa Dmar (1350-1405). The Collected Writings (gsung 'bum). Reproduced from an incomplete ms. preserved in the Rumtek Monastery. Gangtok: 1978. [I-Tib-78-903290] [Mila rnam thar: pp. 188-317].

O-rgyan pa Rin Chen dpal, Grub Thob. Bka' brgyud yid bzin nor bu yi 'phreng ba. A precious rosary of lives of eminent masters of the 'Bri gung pa dKar-brgyud pa tradition. Leh: 1972. [I-Tib-72-904180] [Mila rnam thar, pp. 174-245]

Padma dKar po. Tibetan Chronicle (chos 'byung). Lokesh Chandra, ed., Foreword by E. Gene Smith. New Delhi: International Academy of Indian Culture, 1968.

Rang byung rdo rje, Karmapa III (1284-1339). Nges don phyag chen po'i smon lam. Unbound folia. [I-Tib-76-914807]

____________. Rnal 'byor gyi dbang phyug mi la bzad pa rdo rje'i gsung mgur mdzod nag ma. Vol. I & II Life and Songs of Milarepa. Dalhousie: 1978 [I-Tib-79-901890]

Rare dkar brgyud pa texts from the Library of Ri bo che rje drung of Padma-bkod (Bde mchog sñan rgyud) Arunachal Pradesh: Tibetan Nyingmapa Monastery, 1974. [I-Tib-74-901474] [Milarepa teachings: folia 25-45, 47-76]

Rgyal Thang pa Bde Chen rDo rJe. Dkar brgyud Gser 'phreng. Palampur, Tashijong, 1973. [I-Tib-73-904146] [Vajradhara: pages 1-13; Milarepa: 189-265]

Rwa Lung Dkar brgyud Gser 'phreng. (Bar 'Brug pa Dkar Brgyud pa of Rwa Lung; 18th century). Vol. I. Palampur: Sungrab Nyamso Gynphel, 1975. [Vajradhara: 17-27; Milarepa: 167-208]

Dkar brgyud gser 'phreng glegs ba mzung gi dkar chag gser gyi sgron me zhes bya ba bzhugs so. [I-Tib-76-9000092] [same as Rwa lung?]

sGampopa. Collected Works (gsung 'bum) of sGampopa bsod nams rin chen. Vol. I. Darjeeling, West Bengal, 1982. [I-Tib-82-902155] [Our text `A', pp. 23-42]

________________________Reproduced by Khasdub Gyatsho

Shashin. Delhi, 1975. [Our text `B', pp. 16-26]

________. Selected writings of sGampopa bsod nams rin chen (Dwags po lha rje). Ballimaran, Delhi: Topden Tshering, 1974. [Our text `C', pp. 18-30] (This is at SUNY Stony Brook)

Shangs pa gser 'phreng. A Golden Rosary of Lives of Masters of the Shangs pa dkar-brgyud pa schools. Introduction by E. Gene Smith. Leh: Tashi Yangphel Tashigang, 1970. [Vajradhara, pp. 1-36]

2. Other Works Consulted

Abbott, Justin E. and Godbole, Narhar R., trans. Stories of Indian Saints: Translation of Mahipati's Marathi Bhaktavijaya. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1982.

Allione, Tsultrim. Women of Wisdom. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1984.

Aranya, Sâmkhya-yogâchârya Swâmi Hariharânanda. Yoga Philosophy of Patañjali. P. N. Mukerji, trans. Albany: State University of New York Press, 1983.

Ardussi, John and Epstein, Lawrence. "The Saintly Madman in Tibet." In Himalayan Anthropology. Pp. 327-37. Edited by James Fisher. The Hague: Mouton, 1978.

Ardussi, John. "Brewing and Drinking the Beer of Enlightenment in Tibetan Buddhism: The Dohâ Tradition in Tibet" JAOS 97 (1977): 115-124.

Asvaghosa. Buddhacârita, or Acts of the Buddha. E. H. Johnston, trans. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1984.

Bacot, Jacques. "L'Écriture Cursive Tibétaine." Journal Asiatique, 1912: 5-78.

Bareau, André. Recherches sur la Biographie du Buddha dans les Sûtrapiṭaka et les Vinayapiṭaka anciens. Two Volumes. Paris: Publications de l'École Française d'Extrême Orient, 1963, 1970.

________. Les Sects Bouddhiques du Petit Véhicule. Paris: Publications de l'École Française d'Extrême Orient, 1955.

Beckwith, Christopher I., ed. Silver on Lapis: Tibetan Literary Culture and History. Bloomington, IN: The Tibet Society, 1987.

Bendall, Cecil and Rouse, W. H. D., translators. Śikṣa-

samuccaya: A Compendium of Buddhist Doctrine Compiled by Śântideva. London: John Murray, 1922.

Berzin, Alexander, editor and trans. A Guide to Ka-gyu Mahâmudrâ and Guru-yoga: The Mahâmudrâ Eliminating the Darkness of Ignorance by the Ninth Karmapa Wang-Ch'ug dor-je with oral commentary by Beru Khyentze Rinpoche. Dharamsala: Library of Tibetan Works and Archives, 1978.

Beyer, Stephan. The Cult of Târâ. Berkeley: The University of California Press, 1978.

Bhagat, M. G. Ancient Indian Asceticism. New Delhi: Munshiram Manoharlal, 1976.

Bharati, Agehânanda. The Tantric Tradition. New York: Samuel Weiser, 1975.

Bhattacharyya, Benoytosh. Guhyasamâja Tantra, or Tathâgataguhya. Baroda: Oriental Institute, 1931.

____________. The Indian Buddhist Iconography. Calcutta: Firma K. L. Mukhopadhyay, 1968.

Bhattacharyya, Narendra Nath. Ancient Indian Rituals and Their Social Contents. London: Curzon Press, 1975.

____________. History of the Tantric Religion. New Delhi: Manohar, 1982.

Bond, George D. "Text and Context in the Theravâda Buddhist Tradition: The Interpretations of the Arahant Ideal." The Journal of Religious Studies XIII (#1, 1985): 39-55.

Briggs, George Weston. Gorakhnath and the Kanphata Yogis. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1982.

Broido, Michael. "Does Tibetan Hermeneutics Throw any Light on Sandhâbhâṣa". The Journal of the Tibet Society 2 (1982): 5-39.

____________. "Padma dKar po on Tantra as Ground, Path, and Goal." The Journal of the Tibet Society 3 (1984): 5-46.

____________. "Sa skya Paṇḍita, the White Panacea, and the Hva-Shang Doctrine." The Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies 10, #2 (1987): 27-68.

Brown, Peter. "The Saint as Exemplar in Late Antiquity."

In Saints and Virtues, pp. 3-14, edited by John Stratton Hawley. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1987.

_________. The Making of Late Antiquity. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1978.

_________. The Cult of the Saints: Its Rise and Function in Latin Christianity. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1981.

Bu Ston. The Jewelry of Scripture. E. Obermiller, trans. Heidelberg: Institut für Buddhismus-Kunde, 1931.

Calia, Giuseppe. Sahaja Yoga: Il metodo della realizzazione spirituale secondo la via di Dâdû. Roma: Ubaldini Editore, 1985.

Campbell, Joseph. The Hero With a Thousand Faces. Bollingen Series XVII. Princeton: Princeton University Press, Second Edition, 1968, 1972.

Chandra Das, Sarat. Tibetan Studies. Calcutta: K. P. Bagchi & Co., 1984.

Chang, Garma C. C., trans. and ed. Six Yogas of Nâropa and Teachings on Mahâmudrâ. (Ithaca, NY: Snow Lion, n.d.) Reprint of: Teachings of Tibetan Yoga. New Hyde Park, NY: University Books, 1963.

_______________, ed. A Treasury of Mahâyâna Sûtras: Selections from the Mahâratnakûṭa Sûtra. University Park, PA: The Pennsylvania State University Press, 1983.

_____________, trans. The Hundred Thousand Songs of Milarepa. Two Volumes. Boulder: Shambhala, 1977.

Chattopadhyaya, Alaka. Atiśa and Tibet. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1981.

Childers, Robert Caesar. A Dictionary of the Pali Language. Kyoto: Rinsen Book Co., 1976 (reprint of 1875 edition).

Lama Chimpa and Chattopadhyaya, Alaka, translators. Târanâtha's History of Buddhism in India. Calcutta: K. P. Bagchi & Co., 1980.

Chitty, Derwas J., trans. The Letters of Saint Antony the Great. Fairacres, Oxford: SLG Press, 1975.

Clark, Walter Eugene, ed. Two Lamaistic Pantheons. New York: Paragon Book Reprint Corp., 1975. (reprint of 1937 edition).

Cleary, Thomas, trans. The Flower Ornament Scripture, a Translation of the Avataṃsaka Sûtra. Boulder: Shambhala, Volume I, 1984; Volume II, 1986; Volume III, 1987.

Collins, Steven. Selfless Persons: Imagery and Thought in Theravâda Buddhism. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982.

Conze, Edward, translator. Abhisamayâlaṅkara. Roma: Istituto Italiano per il Medio ed Estreme-Oriente, 1954.

_________. Thirty Years of Buddhist Studies: Selected Essays. Oxford: Bruno Cassirer, 1967.

_________. Buddhist Wisdom Books. London: George Allen & Unwin, 1958.

_________. Buddhist Thought in India. London: George Allen & Unwin, 1983.

_________. The Perfection of Wisdom in Eight Thousand Lines and its Verse Summary. San Francisco: Four Seasons Foundation, 1973.

_________. The Large Sûtra on Perfect Wisdom with the Divisions of the Abhisamayâlaṅkâra. Berkeley: The University of California Press, 1975.

_________. Buddhist Meditation. New York: Harper & Row, 1969.

Cowell, E. B., ed. The Jâtaka, or Stories of the Buddha's Former Births. London: The Pali Text Society, 1973.

Cozort, Daniel. Highest Yoga Tantra: An Introduction to the Esoteric Buddhism of Tibet. Ithaca: Snow Lion, 1986.

Cremaschi, Lisa, ed. and trans. Pacomio e i suoi discepoli: Regole e scritti. Magnano (VC): Edizioni Qiqajon, 1988.

____________. Detti inediti dei Padri del deserto. Magnano (VC): Edizioni Qiqajon, 1988.

Dallapiccola, Anna Libera and Lallemant, Stephanie Zingel-Avê, eds. The Stûpa: Its Religious, Historical and Architectural Significance. Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner Verlag, 1980.

Dargyay, Eva M. The Rise of Esoteric Buddhism in Tibet.

New York: Samuel Weiser, 1978.

Dasgupta, Shashibhusan. Obscure Religious Cults. Calcutta: Firma KLM Private, Ltd., 1076.

____________. An Introduction to Tantric Buddhism. Third Edition. Calcutta: University of Calcutta, 1974.

Davids, T. W. & Davids C. A. F. Rhys-, translators. Dialogues of the Buddha, Part II, translated from the Pâli of the Dîgha Nikâya. London: Oxford University Press, 1910.

Dayal, Har. The Bodhisattva Doctrine in Buddhist Sanskrit Literature. New York: Samuel Weiser, 1978.

Dawes, Elizabeth and Baynes, Norman H., translators. Three Byzantine Saints. Crestwood, NY: St. Vladimir's Seminary Press, 1977.

De Jong, J. W. "La Legende de Śântideva." Indo-Iranian Journal 16 (1974-5): 161-182.

de Koros, Alexander Csoma. A Grammar of the Tibetan Language in English. Calcutta: Baptist Mission Press, 1834.

Delehaye, Hippolyte, S.J., The Legends of the Saints: An Introduction to Hagiography. V. M. Crawford, trans. University of Notre Dame Press, 1961.

____________. Cinq Leçons sur la Methode Hagiographique Bruxelles: Société des Bollandistes, 1934.

____________. Sanctus: Essai sur le Culte des Saints dans l'Antiquité. Bruxelles: Société des Bollandistes, 1927.

Dhargyey, Geshey Ngawang. Tibetan Tradition of Mental Development. Dharamsala: LTWA, 1974.

Dhavamony, Mariasusai. "The Guru in Hinduism." Studia Missionalia #36 (1987): 147-173.

____________. "The Sadhu Ideal as Realized by Hindu Saints." Studia Missionalia #35 (1986): 199-224.

Dowman, Keith, trans. The Divine Madman: The Sublime Life and Songs of Drukpa Kunley. Clearlake, CA: The Dawn Horse Press, 1980.

____________. Sky Dancer: The Secret Life and Songs of the Lady Yeshe Tsogyel. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1984.

__________. Masters of Mahâmudrâ: Songs and Histories of the Eighty-Four Buddhist Siddhas. Albany: SUNY Press, 1985.

Dube, S. N. Cross Currents in Early Buddhism. New Delhi: Manohar, 1980.

Dugarov, B. S. "Namtar of Milaraiba and its Mongolian Version." In: Buddism i literaturno-hudozhestvennoe tvorchestvo narodov Tcentral 'noj Azii (Novosibirsk, USSR: 1985). (in Russian)

Duquoc, Christian & Floristân, Casian, editors. Models of Holiness. Concilium 129 (1979).

__________. Francis of Assisi Today. Concilium 149 (1981).

Dutt, Nalinaksha. Mahâyâna Buddhism. Calcutta: Firma KLM Private, Ltd. 1976.

__________. Early Monastic Buddhism. Calcutta: Firma K. L. Mukhopadhyay, 1971.

Dutt, Sukumar. The Buddha and Five After-Centuries. London: Luzac & Co., Ltd., 1957.

Egyed, Alice. The Eighty-Four Siddhas: A Tibetan Blockprint from Mongolia. Budapest: Akadèmiai Kiadô, 1984.

Eimer, Helmut. Rnam thar rgyas pa: Materialien zu Einer Biographie des Atiśa (Dīpamkaraśrījñâna). Wiesbaden: Otto Harrassowitz, 1979.

__________. "Life and Activities of Atiśa Dīpankaraśrījñâna: A Survey of Investigations Undertaken." Journal of the Asiatic Society XXVII #4 (1985): 3-12.

__________. "The Development of the Biographical Tradition Concerning Atiśa." (Offprint)

Elder, George, editor. Buddhist Insight: Essays by Alex Wayman. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1984.

__________. "The Saṃpuṭa Tantra: Edition and Translation Chapters I-IV". Ph.D. dissertation, Columbia University, 1978.

Eliade, Mircea. Shamanism: Archaic Techniques of Ecstasy. Willard R. Trask, translator. Bollingen Series LXXVI, Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1964.

__________. The Myth of the Eternal Return or, Cosmos

and History. Bollingen Series XLVI, Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1971.

__________. Patañjali and Yoga. Charles Lam Markmann, translator. New York: Schocken Books, 1975.

__________. A History of Religious Ideas, Volumes 2 and 3. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1982, 1985.

__________. The Sacred and the Profane. Willard R. Trask, translator. New York: Harcourt, Brace, and World, 1959.

__________. Rites and Symbols of Initiation. New York: Harper Torchbooks, 1958.

__________. Yoga: Immortality and Freedom. Willard R. Trask, translator. Bollingen Series LVI Second Ed. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1969.

Estrada, Alvaro. Maria Sabina: Her Life and Chants. Henry Munn, translator. Santa Barbara, CA: Ross-Erickson Inc., Publishers, 1981.

Evans-Wentz, W. Y., ed. The Tibetan Book of the Great Liberation. London: Oxford University Press, 1972.

__________. Tibetan Yoga and Secret Doctrines. Lama Kazi Dawa Samdup, translator. Second Edition. London: Oxford University Press, 1958.

__________. Tibet's Great Yogi Milarepa. Lama Kazi Dawa Samdup, translator. Second Edition. London: Oxford University Press, 1969.

Ferrari, Alfonsina. Mk'yen Brtse's Guide to the Holy Places of Central Tibet. Roma: IsMEO, 1958.

Fleet, J. F. "The Traditions About the Corporeal Relics of Buddha." JRAS of Gt. Britain & Ireland #6 (1906): 655-913.

Four Essential Buddhist Texts by H. H. the XIV Dalai Lama, the First Panchen Lama, Jamyang Khyentze Rinpoche, and Kalu Rinpoche. Dharamsala: LTWA, 1982.

Fremantle, Francesca and Trungpa, Chögyam, translators. The Tibetan Book of the Dead: The Great Liberation Through Hearing in the Bardo by Guru Rinpoche According to the Karma Lingpa. Boulder: Shambhala, 1975.

Geertz, Clifford. The Interpretation of Cultures. New York: Basic Books, 1973.

Gendun Drub, the First Dalai Lama. Bridging the Sûtras and Tantras. Glenn H. Mullin, translator and editor. Ithaca: Gabriel/Snow Lion, 1982.

Ghurye, G. S. Indian Sadhus. Second edition. Bombay: Popular Prakashan, 1964.

Giovanni della Croce (San Juan de la Cruz). Opere. Fernando di S. Maria, O.C.D., translator. Roma: Postulazione Generale dei Carmelitani Scalzi, 1985.

Gnoli, Raniero, translator. Testi Buddhisti in Sanscrito. Torino: Unione Tipografico-Editrice Torinese, 1983.

________. Luce delle Sacre Scritture (Tantraloka) di Abhinavagupta. Second Edition. Torino: Unione Tipografico-Editrice Torinese, 1980.

Gold, Daniel Richard. "The Lord as Guru in North Indian Religion: Hindi Sant Tradition and Universals of Religious Perception." Ph.D. dissertation, University of Chicago, 1982.

Gonda, J. Change and Continuity in Indian Religion. New Delhi: Munshiram Manoharlal Publishers, 1985.

Govinda, Lama Anagarika. Foundations of Tibetan Mysticism. York Beach, ME: Samuel Weiser, 1976.

Grant, Frederick C., editor. Hellenistic Religions: The Age of Syncretism. Indianapolis: The Bobbs-Merrill Co., 1953.

(g)Tsang smyon Heruka. The Life of Marpa the Translator: Seeing Accomplishes All. Translated by the Nâlandâ Translating Committee under the direction of Chögyam Trungpa. Boulder: Prajñâ Press, 1982.

Gtsang smyon Heruka. Vita di Milarepa. A cura di Jacques Bacot. Anna Devoto, translator. Milano: Tascabili Bompiani, 1986.

Guenther, Herbert V., translator. The Royal Song of Saraha: A Study in the History of Buddhist Thought. Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1969.

________. Tibetan Buddhism in Western Perspective. Emeryville, CA: Dharma Publishing 1977.

________. The Life and Teaching of Nâropa. London: Oxford University Press, 1963.

________. Buddhist Philosophy in Theory and Practice. Boulder: Shambhala, 1976.

________. The Jewel Ornament of Liberation by sGam.po.pa Berkeley: Shambhala, 1971.

Gunaratana, Henepola. The Path of Serenity and Insight. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1985.

Gyalway, Kalzang Gyats'o. Songs of Spiritual Change. Glenn H. Mullin, translator. Ithaca: Gabriel/Snow Lion, 1982.

Gyatso, Janet. "A Literary Transmission of the Traditions of Thang stong rgyal po: A Study of Visionary Buddhism in Tibet." Ph.D. dissertation, University of California, Berkeley, 1981.

Gyatso, Tenzin, the XIV Dalai Lama. Opening the Eye of New Awareness. Donald S. Lopez, Jr., and Jeffrey Hopkins, translators. London: Wisdom Publications, 1985.

________. Four Essential Buddhist Commentaries. Dharamsala, LTWA, 1982.

Hahn, Michael. Lehrbuch der Klassischen Tibetischen Schriftsprache. Bonn: Indica et Tibetica, 1985.

Hakeda, Yoshito S., editor and translator. Kukai: Major Works. New York: Columbia University Press, 1972.

________. The Awakening of Faith. New York: Columbia University Press, 1967.

Hamm, F. R. "Studien zur uberlieferungs-geschichte des mi la'i mgur 'bum." Zentralasiatische Studien 4 (1970): 29-79.

Hanson, Judith and Mervin. "Freedom and Contingency: The Concatenating Buddha: A Shangs pa rnam thar of Vajradhara." In Soundings in Tibetan Civilization, edited by Barbara Nimri Aziz and Matthew Kapstein. New Delhi: Manohar, 1985.

Harrison, Paul. "Who Gets to Ride on the Great Vehicle? Self-Image and Identity Among the Followers of the Early Mahâyâna." The Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies, 10 #1 (1987): 67-87.

Hawley, John Stratton, editor. Saints and Virtues. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1987.

Hiltebeitel, Alf. The Ritual of Battle: Krishna in the Mahâbhârata. Ithaca: Cornell University Press,

1976.

Hirakawa, Akira. "The Rise of Mahâyâna Buddhism and its Relation to the Worship of Stûpas." Memoirs of the Research Department of the Tokyo Bunko, No. 22, (1963): 57-106.

Hoffmann, Helmut H. R. "Tibetan Historiography and the Approach of the Tibetans to History." Journal of Asian History, 4 #2 (1970): 169-177.

Honko, Lauri, editor. Science of Religion: Studies in Methodology (Proceedings of the Study Conference of the International Association for the History of Religions, 1973). The Hague: Mouton, 1978.

Hopkins, Jeffrey, editor and translator. Compassion in Tibetan Buddhism. Valois, NY: Gabriel/Snow Lion, 1980.

Horner, I.B. The Early Buddhist Theory of Man Perfected: A Study of the Arahan. London: Williams and Norgate, 1936.

Hurvitz, Leon, translator. Scripture of the Lotus Blossom of the Fine Dharma. New York: Columbia University Press, 1976.

Jackson, Roger. "Sa Skya Paṇḍita's Account of the Bsam Yas Debate: History as Polemic." The Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies 5 #1 (1982): 89-99.

Jaini, Padmanabh S. "On the Sarvajñatva (omniscience) of Mahâvira and the Buddha." In Buddhist Studies in Honour of I.B. Horner. L. Cousins et alii, editors. Dordrecht, Holland: D. Reidel Publishing Co., 1974.

Jig me Ling pa. The Dzog Chen: Preliminary Practice of the Innermost Essence. Tulku Thondup, trans. Brian C. Beresford, editor. Dharamsala: LTWA, 1982.

Jonas, Hans. The Gnostic Religion. Second Edition. Boston: Beacon Press, 1963.

Joshi, Lal Mani. Studies in the Buddhistic Culture of India. Second Revised Edition. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1972.

Karmay, Samten G. "A Discussion on the Doctrinal Position of rDzogs Chen from the Tenth to the Thirteenth Centuries." Journal Asiatique, CCLXII (1975): 147-156.

Katz, Nathan. Buddhist Images of Human Perfection. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1982.

Kawamura, Leslie S., editor. The Bodhisattva Doctrine in Buddhism. Waterloo, Ontario: Wilfred Laurier University Press, 1981.

Keenan, John P. "Original Purity and the Focus of Early Yogâcâra." The Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies 5, #1 (1982):7-18.

Khenpo Rinpochay Konchog Gyaltsen and Katherine Rogers, translators and editors. The Garland of Mahâmudrâ Practices: A Translation of Kunga Rinchen's Clarifying the Jewel Rosary of the Profound Fivefold Path. Ithaca: Snow Lion, 1986.

Khetsun Sangpo Rinbochay. Tantric Practice in Nying ma. edited by Jeffrey Hopkins and Anne Klein. Ithaca: Snow Lion, 1982.

King, Winston L. Theravâda Meditation: The Buddhist Transformation of Yoga. University Park, PA: The Pennsylvania State University Press, 1980.

Kongtrul, Jamgon. The Torch of Certainty. Judith Hanson, translator. Boulder: Shambhala, 1977.

Kornman, Robin. "Hidden Literary Criticism in Tibetan Biographies." MLA, New York City, December 29, 1986.

Kun Chang. "On Tibetan Poetry." Central Asiatic Journal II (1956): 129-139.

Kunga Rinpoche, Lama and Cutillo, Brian. Drinking the Mountain Stream. Novato, CA: Lotsawa, 1978.

________. Miraculous Journey. Novato, CA: Lotsawa, 1986.

Kvaerne, Per. An Anthology of Buddhist Tantric Songs: A Study of the Caryâgîti. Bangkok: White Orchid Press, 1986.

Lalou, Marcelle. "La Version Tibêtaine du Ratnakûṭa," Journal Asiatique (1-2) (1927): 233-259.

________. Manuel Élèmentaire de Tibetain Classique. Paris: Librarie d'Amèrique et d'Orient Adrien Maisonneuve, 1950.

Lambertinis, Prosperi Cardinalis de (Benedicti XIV). Opus de Servorum Dei Beatificatione et Beatorum Canonizatione. In Septem Volumina Distributum. Prati: In Typographia Aldina, MDCCCXXXIX.

Lamotte, Étienne, translator and editor. Saṃdhinirmocana Sûtra: L'Explication des Mystères. Louvain: Bureaux du Récueil, 1935.

________. La Concentration de la Marche Héroique (Śûramgamasamâdhi Sûtra). Bruxelles: Institut Belge des Hautes Études Chinoises, 1965.

________. Histoire du Bouddhisme Indien. Louvain-la-Neuve: Institut Orientaliste, 1976.

________. Le Traité de la Grande Vertue de Sagesse de Nâgârjuna (Mahâprajñâpâramitâ-śâstra). Louvain: Université de Louvain, Institut Orientaliste. Tome I 1981; Tome II 1981; T. III 1970; T. IV 1976; T. V 1980.

________. La Somme du Grande Véhicule d'Asaṅga (Mahâyâna Saṃgraha). Louvain-la-Neuve: Institute Orientaliste, 1971.

________. L'Enseignement de Vimalakîrti (Vimalakîrti-nirdeśa). Louvain: Institut Orientaliste, 1962.

Lancaster, Lewis and Gomez, Luis O., editors. Prajñâ-pâramitâ and Related Systems. Studies in Honour of Edward Conze. Berkeley: Berkeley Buddhist Studies Series, 1977.

La Vallée Poussin, Louis de, translator. L'Abhidharma-kośa de Vasubandhu. Bruxelles: Institut Belge des Hautes Études Chinoises. Six Volumes, 1923-31.

________. "Note Sur les Corps du Bouddha." Le Muséon, New Series XIV (1913): 257-290.

________. "Studies in Buddhist Dogma: The Three Bodies of a Buddha (Trikâya)." JRAS of Gt. Britain and Ireland 2 (1906): 943-977.

________. La Siddhi de Hiuan-Tsang (Vijñaptimâtratâsiddhi). Paris: Librarie Orientaliste Paul Geuthner, 1929.

Law, Bimala Churn, translator. The Debates Commentary (Kathâvatthuppakarana Atthakathâ). London: Oxford University Press, 1940.

________. Designation of Human Types (Puggala-Paññatti). London: Pali Text Society/Luzac & Co, Ltd. 1969.

Lessing, F. D. and Wayman, A. Introduction to the Buddhist Tantric Systems: Translated from Mkhas grub rje's rGyud sDe sPyihi rNam par gZag pa rGyas par brJod. New York: Samuel Weiser, 1980.

Lèvi, Sylvain, editor and translator. Mahâyâna Sûtrâlaṃkara (Asaṅga), two volumes. Paris: 1907, 1911.

Li An-Che. "The bKah-Brgyud Sect of Lamaism," JAOS 69 (1949): 51-59.

Lobsang P. Lhalungpa, translator. The Life of Milarepa. Boulder: Shambhala, 1984.

_______. Mahâmudrâ: The Quintessence of Mind and Meditation by Takpo Tashi Namgyal. Boston: Shambhala, 1986.

Locke, John K., S.J. Karunamaya: The Cult of Avalokiteśvara-Matsyendranath in the valley of Nepal. Kathmandu: Sahayogi Prakashan, Publisher, 1980.

Loewe, Michael and Blacker, Carmen. Oracles and Divination. Boulder: Shambhala, 1981.

Lord, Albert B. The Singer of Tales. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1960.

Lu K'uan Yu (Charles Luk), translator. Empty Cloud: The Autobiography of the Chinese Zen Master Hsu Yun. Rochester, NY: Empty Cloud Press, 1974.

Macdonald, A. W. Matèriaux Pour l'Ètude de la Littèrature Populaire Tibètaine, I & II. Paris: Librarie C. Klincksieck, 1972.

Mañjuśrîmitra. Primordial Experience: An Introduction to rDzogs Chen Meditation. Namkhai Norbu, Kennard Lipman, and Barrie Simmons, translators. Boston: Shambhala, 1987.

Martin, Daniel. "Gling ras pa and the Founding of the 'Brug pa School," Tibet Society Bulletin 13 (June 1979): 56-69.

_______. "The Early Education of Milarepa," The Journal of the Tibet Society 2 (1982): 53-76.

_______. Review of The Life of Marpa the Translator-Seeing Accomplishes All. Translated by the Nâlandâ Translating Committee under the direction of Chögyam Trungpa. The Journal of the Tibet Society 3 (1984): 83-91.

Masson-Oursel, M. P. "Les Trois Corps du Bouddha," Journal Asiatique 1 (1913): 581-648.

Maulucci, Vincenzo. Vi sono santi tra i cristiani non cattolici? Assisi: Studio Teologico "Porziuncola",

1969.

Miller, Roy Andrew. "A Grammatical Sketch of Classical Tibetan," JAOS 90 (1970): 74-96.

Mitchell, W. J. T., editor. On Narrative. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1981.

Mitra, R. C. The Decline of Buddhism in India. Visva-Bharati, 1954.

Mohrmann, Christine, and Bartelink, G. J. M., eds. Vita di Antonio. Pietro Citati e Salvatore Lilla, translators. Third Edition. Milano: Arnoldo Mondadori Editore, 1981.

Moore, Peter. "Buddhism, Christianity, and the Study of Religion." In Buddhist Studies Ancient and Modern, edited by Philip Denwood and Alexander Piatigorsky. London: Curzon Press, 1983.

Mullin, Glenn H., translator and editor. Essence of Refined Gold by Sonam Gyatso (The III Dalai Lama). Commentary by Tenzin Gyatso (The XIV Dalai Lama). Ithaca: Gabriel/Snow Lion, 1982.

________. Selected Works of the Dalai Lama II: Tantric Yogas of Sister Niguma. Ithaca: Snow Lion, 1985.

Murti, T. R. V. The Central Philosophy of Buddhism: A Study of the Madhyamika System. London: Unwin Paperbacks, 1980.

Muses, C. A., editor. Esoteric Teachings of the Tibetan Tantra. Chang Chen Chi, translator. York Beach, ME: Samuel Weiser, 1982.

Nâlandâ Translation Committee. The Rain of Wisdom: The Vajra Songs of the Kagyu Gurus. Boulder: Shambhala, 1980.

Nebesky-Wojkowitz, René de. Oracles and Demons of Tibet: The Cult and Iconography of the Tibetan Protective Deities. The Hague: Mouton & Co., 1956.

Nicholas of Cusa. The Vision of God. Emma Gurney Salter, translator. New York: Frederick Ungar Publisher, 1960.

Norbu, Namkhai. The Crystal and the Way of Light. John Shane, editor. New York and London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1986.

Norman, K. R., translator and editor. The Elders' Verses, I: Theragâthâ, 1969. II: Therîgâthâ, 1971. London:

Pali Text Society/Luzac & Co., Ltd.

Nyanaponika Thera. Satipatthana: The Heart of Buddhist Meditation. York Beach, ME: Samuel Weiser, 1965.

O'Flaherty, Wendy Doniger, editor. Karma and Rebirth in Classical Indian Traditions. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1980.

Pallis, Marco. A Buddhist Spectrum. New York: The Seabury Press, 1981.

Pande, Govind Chandra. Studies in the Origins of Buddhism. Second Revised edition. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1974.

Paul, Diana Y. "The Life and Times of Paramârtha (499-569)", The Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies 5 (1982): 37-69.

Pereira, José and Tiso, Francis. "The Evolution of Buddhist Systematics from the Buddha to Vasubandhu," Philosophy East and West XXXVIII #2 (Apr. 1988): 172-186.

________. "A Buddhist Classification of Reality: A Translation of the First Chapter of the Abhidharmakośa of Vasubandhu," ARI 6 (1987):51-84.

Petroff, Elizabeth. Consolation of the Blessed. New York: Alta Gaia Society, 1979.

Pezzali, Amalia. "Śântideva, un mistico buddhista," Studia Missionalia 35 (1986):323-345.

________. Śântideva e il bodhicaryâvatâra. Bologna: Editrice Missionaria Italiana, 1982.

Potter, Karl H., editor. Encyclopedia of Indian Philosophies: Indian Metaphysics and Epistemology. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1972.

Prats, Ramon. Contributo allo Studio Biografico dei Primi gTer-ston. Napoli: Istituto Universitario Orientale, 1982.

Proudfoot, Wayne. Religious Experience. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1985.

Rahder, Jean. "La carrière du Saint Bouddhique," Bulletin de la Maison Franco-Japonaise. Tome II #1 (1929): 1-22.

________. Daśabhûmikasûtra et Bodhisattvabhûmi. Paris: Paul Geuthner, 1926.

Rahula Sankṛtyayana. "L'Origine du Vajrayâna et les 84 Siddhas," Journal Asiatique (1934):209-230.

Rahula, Walpola, translator. Le Compendium de la Super-Doctrine (Philosophie) (Abhidharmasamuccaya) d'Asaṅga. Paris: Publications de l'École Française d'Extrême Orient, Vol. LXXVIII, 1971.

Régamey, K. Three Chapters from the Samâdhirâja Sûtra. Warszawa: The Warsaw Society of Sciences and Letters, Publications of the Oriental Commission, 1938.

Reynolds, Frank E. "The Several Bodies of Buddha: Reflections on a Neglected Aspect of Theravâda Tradition," History of Religions 16 (1976-77):374-389.

______ and Capps, Donald, editors. The Biographical Process: Studies in the History and Psychology of Religion. The Hague: Mouton, 1976.

Rhoton, Jared Douglas. "A Study of the sDom-gSum of Sa-pan". Ph.D. dissertation. Columbia University 1985.

Riccardi, Theodore, Jr.; Lewis, Todd Thornton; and English, Richard. The Himalayas: Essays and Readings in History and Anthropology. New York: Southern Asian Institute, 1987.

Ricci, Matteo, S.J. The True Meaning of the Lord of Heaven (T'ien-chu Shih-i). Translated by Douglas Lancashire and Peter Hu Kuo-chen, S.J.; edited by Edward J. Malatesta, S.J. St. Louis: The Institute of Jesuit Sources, 1985.

Richardson, H. E. "The Karmapa Sect, A Historical Note," J. Royal Asiatic Society (1958):138-164 and 1959-61: 1-18.

Robinson, James B., translator. Buddha's Lions: The Lives of the Eighty-Four Siddhas (Caturaśīti-siddha-pravṛtti by Abhayadatta). Translated into Tibetan as Grub thob brgyad cu rtsa bzhi'i lo rgyus by sMon-grub Shes rab. Berkeley: Dharma Publishing, 1979.

Roerich, George N., translator. The Blue Annals. Second Edition. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1976.

Rosen, Elizabeth S. "Buddhist Architecture and Lay Patronage at Nâgârjunakoṇḍa," in Dallapiccola and Lallemant, op. cit., pp. 112-126.

Rousseau, Philip. Ascetics, Authority, and the Church in

the Age of Jerome and Cassian. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1978.

Rudolph, Kurt. Gnosis: The Nature and History of Gnosticism. San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1983.

Ruegg, David Seyfort. La Théorie du Tathâgatagarbha et du Gotra. Paris: École Française d'Extrême-Orient, 1969.

________. The Life of Bu ston Rin Po Che. (Bu ston rnam thar by sGra tshad pa rin chen rnam rgyal). Roma: IsMEO, Serie Orientale XXXIV, 1967.

Russell, Norman, translator. The Lives of the Desert Fathers. London: Mowbray, 1981.

Saeki, P. Y. The Nestorian Documents and Relics in China. Tokyo: The Toho Bunkwa Gakuin: The Academy of Oriental Culture, Tokyo Institute, 1950.

Sakya Dragpa Gyaltsen. Candragomin's Twenty Verses on the Bodhisattva Vow. Edited by Mark Tatz. Dharamsala: LTWA, 1982.

Sakya, Hemaraj, editor and T. R. Vaidya. Medieval Nepal (Colophons and Inscriptions). Kathmandu: T.R. Vaidya, Publisher, 1970.

Sartori, Jolanda Savioli. "Kamalaśîla, Maestro del Tibet," Studia Missionalia 36 (1987): 253-271.

Saunders, E. Dale. Mudrâ. Bollingen Series LVIII, Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1960.

Schmid, Toni. The Eighty-Five Siddhas. Stockholm: Statens Etnografiska Museum, The Sino-Swedish Expedition, Publication 42, 1958.

________. The Cotton-Clad Mila: The Tibetan Poet Saint's Life in Pictures. Stockholm: Statens Etnografiska Museum, The Sino-Swedish Expedition, Publication 36, 1952.

Shahidullah, M. Les chants mystiques de Kâṇha et de Saraha: Les "Dohâ-kośa" et les "Câryа." Paris: Adrien-Maisonneuve, 1928.

Shakabpa, Tsepon W. D. Bod kyi srid don rgyal rabs: An Advanced Political History of Tibet. Delhi: T. Tsepal Taikhang, 1976.

________. Tibet: A Political History. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1962.

Shantideva, Acharya. A Guide to the Bodhisattva's Way of Life. Translated by Stephen Bachelor. Dharamsala: LTWA, 1979.

Sherburne, Richard, S.J., trans. A Lamp for the Path and Commentary of Atisa. London: George Allen & Unwin, 1983.

Shils, Edward. Tradition. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1981.

Skorupski, Tadeusz, translator and editor. The Sarvadurgatipariśodhana Tantra: Elimination of All Evil Destinies. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1983.

Snellgrove, David L. Four Lamas of Dolpo. Volume I. Oxford: Bruno Cassirer, 1967.

________. Indo-Tibetan Buddhism. Two Volumes. Boston: Shambhala, 1987.

________. The Hevajra Tantra: A Critical Study. Two Volumes. London: Oxford University Press, 1959.

________ and Richardson, Hugh. A Cultural History of Tibet. Boulder: Prajñā Press, 1980.

Sorensen, Per K., translator and editor. Candrakīrti: Triśaraṇasaptati. Wien: Arbeitskreis für Tibetische und Buddhistische Studien, Universität Wien, 1986.

Sperling, Elliot. "The Fifth Karmapa and Some Aspects of the Relationship between Tibet and the Early Ming," in Tibetan Studies in Honour of Hugh Richardson, edited by Michael Aris and S.S.K. Aung. Warminster: Aris and Philips, 1980.

Speyer, J. S. Avadānaśataka. A Century of Edifying Tales Belonging to the Hīnayāna. St. Petersbourg: Commissionnaires de l'Academie Imperiale des Sciences, 1909.

Spiro, Melford E. Buddhism and Society: A Great Tradition and Its Burmese Vicissitudes. Second Edition. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1982.

Stcherbatsky, F. Th. Buddhist Logic. Two Volumes. New York: Dover Publications, 1962.

________. The Conception of Buddhist Nirvāṇa. Second revised edition. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1968.

Stein, R. A. The Epic of Gesar, "Introduction." Volume I.

Thimphu, Bhutan: Kunzang Tobgyel, 1979.

________. Recherches sur l'Épopée et le Barde au Tibet. Bibliothèque de l'Institute des Hautes Études Chinoises, Vol. 13. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1959.

________. "<<Saint et Divin>> Un Titre Tibétain et Chinois des Rois Tibétains," Journal Asiatique (1981): 232-275.

________. Tibetan Civilization. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1972.

________. Vie et Chants de 'Brug pa Kun legs le Yogin. Paris: G. P. Maisonneuve et Larose, 1972.

Stoddard, Heather. Le Mendiant de l'Amdo. Paris: Société d'Ethnographie, 1985.

Strong, John. "The Buddhist Avadânists and the Elder Upagupta," in Tantric and Taoist Studies in Honour of R. A. Stein, Volume 3, edited by Michel Strickmann, pp. 862-881. Bruxelles: Melanges Chinois et Bouddhiques, Vol. XXII, 1985.

Studia Missionalia 35 (1986): Issue devoted to "Saints" Rome: Gregorian University, 1986.

Suzuki, Daisetz Teitaro, translator. The Laṅkâvatâra Sûtra. Boulder: Prajñâ Press, 1978.

Syrkin, Alexander Y. "On the Behavior of the `Fool for Christ's Sake,'" History of Religions 22 #1 (1982): 150-171.

Takasaki, Jikido. A Study on the Ratnagotravibhâga (Uttaratantra): Being a Treatise on the Tathâgatagarbha Theory of Mahâyâna Buddhism. Roma: IsMEO, 1966.

Takakusu, J. "The Life of Vasu-bandhu." T'oung Pao Archives 4-5 (1903-04): 269-296; 461-466.

Tambiah, S. J. Buddhism and the Spirit Cults in Northeast Thailand. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1970.

________. The Buddhist Saints of the Forest and the Cult of Amulets. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984.

Tanquerey, Adolphe, S.S. The Spiritual Life: A Treatise on Ascetical and Mystical Theology. Second Edition.

Tournai: Desclée & Co., 1930.

The Tattvasaṃgraha of Shântarakṣita with the Commentary of Kamalashîla. Translated by Ganganatha Jha. Two Volumes. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1986.

Tatz, Mark. "The Life of Candragomin in Tibetan Historical Tradition," Tibet Journal 7 #3: 3-22

________, translator. Tattva-Ratnâvali: The Precious Garland of Verses on Reality by Advayavajra, a.k.a. Maitrigupta or Maitrîpa. Typescript, August, 1987.

Târanâtha, Jo Nang. The Origin of the Târâ Tantra. Translated by David Templeman. Dharamsala: LTWA, 1981.

________. The Seven Instruction Lineages. Translated by David Templeman. Dharamsala: LTWA, 1983.

Teresa of Avila, Saint. The Collected Works, Volume I. Translated by Kieran Kavanaugh, O.C.D. and Otilio Rodriguez, O.C.D. Washington, DC: Institute of Carmelite Studies, 1976.

Tharchin, Sermey Geshe Lobsang. A Commentary on Guru Yoga and Offering of the Maṇḍala. Ithaca: Snow Lion Publications, 1987.

________. Methods of Achieving the Paths. Translated by Barbara D. Taylor. Howell, NJ: The Mahâyâna Sûtra and Tantric Center, 1981.

Thinley, Karma. The History of the Sixteen Karmapas of Tibet. Boulder: Prajñâ Press, 1980.

Thomas, Edward J. The History of Buddhist Thought. London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trubner and Co., Ltd., 1933.

Thurman, Robert A. F., translator. The Holy Teaching of Vimalakîrti. University Park: The Pennsylvania State University Press, 1976.

________. editor. The Life and Teachings of Tsong Khapa. Dharamsala, LTWA, 1982.

________. "Buddhist Hermeneutics," Journal of the American Academy of Religion (March, 1978): 19-38.

________. "Transcendence and the Sacred in the Mahâyâna Middle Way," in Transcendence and the Sacred, edited by Charles Olson. South Bend: NDUP, 1982.

________. "Confrontation and Interior Realization in Indo-Tibetan Buddhist Traditions," in The Other Side of God

edited by Peter Berger. San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1982.

Thurston, Herbert, S.J., and Attwater, Donald, editors. Butler's Lives of the Saints: Complete Edition. Four Volumes. Westminster, MD: Christian Classics, 1956.

Trungpa, Chögyam. The Myth of Freedom and the Way of Meditation. Berkeley: Shambhala, 1976.

Tsong Kha pa. Tantra in Tibet: The Great Exposition of Secret Mantra, Volume I. Translated and edited by Jeffrey Hopkins. London: George Allen & Unwin, 1977.

Tucci, Giuseppe. "Animadversiones Indicae," Journal of the Asiatic Society of Bengal 26 (1930):125-160.

________. "Buddhist Notes: A Propos Avalokiteśvara," Mélanges Chinois et Bouddhiques, T. 9, (1948-51). Bruxelles: Institut Belge des Hautes Études Chinoises, 1951.

________. translator and editor. Deb T'er Dmar po Gsar ma: Tibetan Chronicles by bSod nams grags pa. Vol. I Roma: IsMEO, 1971.

________, editor. Minor Buddhist Texts, Parts One and Two. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1986 (reprint of IsMEO edition of 1956).

________. Nepal: Alla Scoperta del Regno dei Malla. Roma: Newton Compton Editori, Second Edition, 1978.

________. The Religions of Tibet. Translated by Geoffrey Samuel. Berkeley: The University of California Press, 1980.

________. Storia della Filosofia Indiana. Second Edition. Bari: Editori Laterza, 1987.

________. The Theory and Practice of the Maṇḍala. Translated by Alan Houghton Broughton. New York: Samuel Weiser, 1970.

________. Tibet Ignoto. Second Edition. Roma: Newton Compton Editori, 1985.

Urubshurow, Victoria Kennick. "Symbolic Process on the Buddhist Path: Spiritual Development in the Biographical Tradition of Milarepa." Ph.D. dissertation. The University of Chicago, 1984.

Van der Leeuw, G. Religion in Essence and Manifestation. Two Volumes. Translated by J. E. Turner. New York:

Harper and Row, 1963.

Van Tuyl, Charles. "An Analysis of Chapter Twenty Eight of the Hundred Thousand Songs of Milarepa, A Buddhist Poet and Saint of Tibet." Ph.D. dissertation, Indiana University, 1972.

________. "Mila Ras Pa," Tibet Society Bulletin 7 (1974): 21-27.

________. "Mila ras pa and the gCod ritual," The Tibet Journal IV #1 (1979): 34-40.

________. "Milarepa and the Eighteen Great Demons," Zentralasiatische Studien 13 (1979): 401-407.

Varenne, Jean. Yoga and the Hindu Tradition. Translated by Derek Coltman. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1976.

Verdu, Alfonso. Early Buddhist Philosophy in the Light of the Four Noble Truths. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1985.

Vostrikov, A. I. Tibetan Historical Literature. Translated by Harish Chandra Gupta. Indian Studies Past and Present (n.d.).

Wach, Joachim. Sociology of Religion. London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trubner, & Co., 1947.

________. Types of Religious Experience Christian and Non-Christian. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1951.

Warder, A. K. Indian Buddhism. Second Revised Edition. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1980.

Wayman, Alex. Analysis of the Śrāvakabhūmi Manuscript. University of California Publications in Classical Philology, Volume 17. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1961.

________. "The Bodhisattva Practice According to the Lam Rim Chen Mo," Dreloma: VIII (1982): 13-36.

________. "Buddha as Savior," Studia Missionalia 29 (1980): 191-207.

________. "Buddhism," Historia Religionum II: 372-464. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1971.

________. The Buddhist Tantras: Light on Indo-Tibetan Esotericism. New York: Samuel Weiser, 1973.

________, translator. Calming the Mind and Discerning the Real: Buddhist Meditation and the Middle View from the Lam Rim Chen Mo of Tsong-Kha-pa. New York: Columbia University Press, 1978.

________, translator. Chanting the Names of Mañjuśrī: The Mañjuśrīnāma-saṃgīti. Boston: Shambhala, 1985.

________. "The Guru in Buddhism," Studia Missionalia 37 (1988):195-213.

________ and Wayman, Hideko, translators. The Lion's Roar of Queen Śrimāla. New York: Columbia University Press, 1974.

________. "The Mahāsaṃghika and the Tathāgatagarbha (Buddhist Doctrinal History, Study I)," The Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies I (#1): 35-50.

________. "Nāgārjuna: Moralist Reformer of Buddhism," Studia Missionalia 34 (1985): 63-95.

________. "Observations on Translation from the Classical Tibetan Language into European Languages," Indo-Iranian Journal XIV (1972): 161-192.

________. "The Ritual in Tantric Buddhism of the Disciple's Entrance into the Mandala," Studia Missionalia 23 (1974):41-57.

________. "The Twenty-One Praises of Tārā, A Syncretism of Śaivism and Buddhism," Journal of the Bihar Research Society, 1959: 36-43.

________. Yoga of the Guhyasamāja Tantra: The Arcane Lore of Forty Verses. A Buddhist Tantra Commentary. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1977.

Weber, Max. The Sociology of Religion. Translated from the fourth German edition by Ephraim Fischoff. Boston: Beacon Press, 1964.

Weinstein, Donald, and Bell, Rudolph M. Saints and Society: The Two Worlds of Western Christendom, 1000-1700. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1982.

Welbon, G. Richard. "On Understanding the Buddhist Nirvāṇa," History of Religions 5 #1 (1965): 300-326.

Wiggins, David. Sameness and Substance. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1980.

Williams, Michael, editor. Charisma and Sacred Biography.

Journal of the AAR Studies Vol. XLVIII, #3 and 4, 1982.

Willis, Janice D. "On the Nature of rnam thar: Early dGe lugs pa Siddha Biographies," in Soundings in Tibetan Civilization; see above under Hanson.

________. "The Search for Padma-can: A Study in the Interpretation of Tibetan Sacred Biography," The Journal of Religious Studies XIII #1 (1985):56-73.

Wilson, Stephen, editor. Saints and Their Cults: Studies in Religious Sociology, Folklore, and History. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983.

Wright, Arthur F. "Biography and Hagiography in Hui-Chiao's Lives of Eminent Monks," in Silver Jubilee Volume of the Zinbun-Kagaku-Kenkyusyo. Kyoto: Kyoto University, 1954.

Wylie, Turrell. "The First Mongol Conquest of Tibet Reinterpreted," Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies 37 (1977): 103-133.

________, editor and translator. The Geography of Tibet According to the 'Dzam-gling-rgyas-bshad. Roma: IsMEO, 1962.

________. "Marpa's Tower: Notes on Local Hegemons in Tibet," History of Religions 3 #1 (1963): 278-291.

________. A Place Name Index to George N. Roerich's Translation of the Blue Annals. Roma: IsMEO, 1957.

________, translator. A Tibetan Religious Geography of Nepal. Roma: IsMEO, 1970.

Yampolsky, Philip B., translator. The Platform Sûtra of the Sixth Patriarch. New York: Columbia University Press, 1967.

Appendix 1

A. Comparison of the Tibetan texts of an autobiographical song of Milarepa

mGur 'bum:	Blue Annals
khyod rtogs 'dod can de	khyod rtogs 'dod can de
tshur ñon dang // mi nga	tshur ñon dang // mi nga
ngo kyod kyis shes ma	ngo khyod kyis shes ma
shes // mi gna ngo khyod	shes // mi nga ngo khyod
kyis ma shes na // mi nga	kyis ma shes na // nga
rang mi la ras pa yin //	gung thang gi mid la ras
lte ba gung thang smad du	pa yin // lte ba gung
bcad // slob gñer dbus	thang gi smad du bcad //
gtsang mthil du bgyis //	slob gñer dbus gtsang gi
pha dgyes ston rngog mes	phyog su bgyis // pha
dbu mdzad nas // rong	ngar ston ngang ngab mis
ston lha dga' yan chad du	dbu mdzad nas // rong
// lar drin can gyi bla	ston lha dga' yan chad du
ma bcu tsam bzhugs //	// spyir dri can gyi bla
chos ni rgyud sde snga	ma bcu tsam bzhugs //
'gyur zhus // khong lta	
dgongs kyi chos la mkhyen	
pa mtho // khyad par lha	khyad par lha rje snubs
rje gnubs chung la //	chung la // drag sngags
drag sngags gza' gdong	gza' gdong dmar nag zhus
dmar nag zhus //	// lta dgongs kyi mkhyen
khong	pa mtho lags shing //

sgrub 'phrin gyi phyag
bzhes mkhas na yang // mi
kho bos sgro 'dogs cung
ma chod // rje nâ ro dang
mai tris byin brlabs pa
// sems chos ñid ma dang
ngo sprod cing // lus
rten 'brel gnad du bsnun
pa zhig // lho chus khyer
gyi gnas na bzhugs so
skad // pha lo tstsa'i
sñan pa rgyang nas khums
// mtshan thos pa tsam
gyis ba spu g.yos // lam
dka' ba sbyad de spyan
sngar phyin // zhal
mthong ba'i mod la snang
ba 'gyur // khong tshe
rabs kyi bla ma yin par
nges //

rje 'gran kyi do
med lho brag pa // bka'
drin can gyi rje btsun la

dmar khrid kyi phyag
bzhes mkhas na yang // mi
kho bo'i spros pa cung ma
chod // rje na ro dang
mai tris byin brlabs
shing // lus rten 'brel
gnad du bsnun pa kyang
// sems chos ñid ma dang
ngo sprod cing // lho phu
chu khyer na bzhugs so
skad // pha lo tsâ'i sñan
pa rgyang nas 'khums //
mtshan thos pa tsam gyis
ba spu g.yos // lam dka'
ba spyad de spyan sngar
phyin // zhal mthong pa
rang gis snang ba 'gyur
// khong tshe rabs kyi
bla ma yin pa 'dra // pha
sku drin can gyi zhabs
drung du // lo drug zla
mthong brgyud du bsdad //
lus sku dang grib ma
bzhin du 'grogs //

// nor zang zing gi 'bul
ba bdag la med // lus
ngag gi zhabs tog rdul du
brlabs // rgyud zab mo
dgyes pa rdo rje thos //
khyad par nâ ro'i thabs
lam zhus // byin rlabs
can gyi bde mchog la //
smin lam dbang bzhi
rdzogs par thob // chos
phyag rgya che la ngo
sprod bgyis // don gñug
ma sems kyi ngo bo mthong
// gzhi chos ñid spros
dang bral bar rtogs //

zang zing gi 'bul rgyu ma
mchis te // lus ngag gi
zhabs tog rdul du brlabs
// thugs gting nas mñes
pa'i nang ka des //

spyir sñan brgyud kyi chu
bo rnam bzhi la // gdams
ngag che dgu spus btus
nas // gnad zab dgu bcud
kyi yang sñig phyung //
bsgom ni rtsa rlung thig le

sñan brgyud kyi gdams
ngag rdzogs par gnad //

bsgoms // don rlung sems gñis la rang dbang thob // nga de phyir nam mkha'i rnal 'byor pa // nang 'du ba rnam bzhi yongs su 'dres // phyi ' byung ba chu la ñam gna med // mi khyod la ñams sad byas pa tsam // dgon pa rgyal gyi shrî yin // gdugs da nangs lkog thag stod nas yong // dgong do nub

gar 'gro nges pa med // gna rnal 'byor byi byung tshul de ltar gda' // bu khye'u chung skyid do ci bder gshegs //

zhes rje btsun gyis de skad gsung pas //

zhes bya ba la sogs ba gsung pa de yin no //

Appendix 1

B. Tables of parallel texts from the Mila rnam thar of rGyal Thang pa and the mGur 'Bum of gTsang smyon Heruka. "The Song of the Snow Ranges" from Chapter 3 of the Songs (Tibetan xylography, folio 12.3 ff.; Gangtok printed edition, 1983, pp. 214-223).

Songs:	rGyal Thang pa:
Na mo gu ru / rje	ces pa'i don ni/
btsun mi la ras pa de ñid	de yang / rje btsun gyi
kyis dang por la phyi	rgyal po mid la ras pa
gangs gzigs su byon pas	ces pa de ñid kyis bla
lha 'dre dgug pa can	ma mar pa lho brag pa ñid
rnams btul zhes pa'i sñan	bde bar gshegs pa thos
pa la brten nas / gña'	pas / lho brag tu gshegs
nang pa kun gyi phyag	pa'i kho thag chod nas/
mchod kyi gnas su gyur	rje btsun ñid kyis sñe
cing / khyad par jo mo	nam tsar ma bya bar
'ur mos chos zhus / de'i	byons / yon bdag rngog
tshe dam pa rgyags phu ba	dor mo bya ba dang 'jal /

sku na phra mo rang du yod pa la bdag gi bu 'di yang cher song ba dang / rje btsun gyi phyag phyir 'bul zer shin tu dad par gyur pa'i sa nas / rtsar ma pa rnams kyis spyan drangs te gshen rdor mos zhabs tog 'bul ba'i tshe/ rje btsun grong gseb tu bzhugs pa dang/ 'khor ba'i bya ba rnams gzigs pas shin tu thugs 'byung ba'i rnam pa mdzad/ la phyi gangs la 'gro gsungs pas / rtsar ma pa rnams kyis rje btsun la sems

der yon bdag de shin tu dad par gyur nas/ nang du spyan drangs / sñen bkur gyi nom pa bgyis nas / khyed ñid rje btsun rgyal po mid la ras pa ces pa de ru gda' lags pas/ khyed ñid bdag gis 'degs par zhu zer nas/ yon bdag des rje btsun gyi gsol rgyags rting nas skyel bar byas / rje btsun rang gis zhib phul dgu tsam 'ong ba gcig snams te la phyis la gshegs nas /

can gyi don las ni med/ nged rnams kyi don la da lo dgun 'dir bzhugs khrid re gsung bar zhu/ 'dre thul rting nam byon rung chog pas nangs par sos nged rnams kyang phyag phyi byas 'gro zer ba dang/ khyad par ston pa shâ' kya gu na dang / gshen rdor mos nam zla dgun du song ba dang gangs la 'o brgyal 'ong lugs sogs bshol 'debs kyi zhu ba ci phul rung ma gsan par/ spyir nga nâ' ro pan chen gyi bu rgyud gangs kyi nga ros mi 'jigs/ mar pa'i bka' yang 'du 'dzi dang g.yeng ba spongs la gnas mi med kyi dben pa bsten gsung pa yin/ khyad par nga grogn yul du gzhi phab sdod pa 'chi bas 'tsher gsung

'byon par thag chod pa dang/ rtsar ma pa rnams kyis myur bar
rje btsun gyi 'tsho chas 'bul ba dang kho rang 'ga' dgun
chos zhur 'ong ba'i chad mdo byas te / ston pa shâ' kya gu
na dang gshen rḋor mo sogs ban skyes drug gis gshegs skyems
khyer te la thog par 'gro gyis la / la babs nas kyang dmu
rdzing bar phyin / de nas rje btsun gyis sku chas phye bre
do 'bras bre gang sha gzug

gcig / mar zhogs gcig rnams
yod pa bsnams te bdud 'dul
phug mo cher byon nas
bzhugs/ khod rnams kyis
phar log
phyin pas la thog tu
gnam 'khrigs bu yug
'tshubs nas lam phyed pa
yang kda' mo rang byung/
pus gong man kha 'tshub
dang 'thab cing 'ongs pas
yul du mi ñal tsam la
sleb/ de'i nub mo nas
bzung ste kha ba ñin
mtshan bco brgyad
babs pas / der zla ba drug
tu brin gña' nang gi
'grul chad pas / slob
'bangs rnams kyis rje
bstun grong par thag

gnas su pheb pa'i nang par
na mar sprin 'dus nas/
kha ba ñin mtshan bcwa
[bco] brgyad rgyun ma

232. cad par byung
nas/ ri rlungs med par
gangs su song/ lam gyi
'brul ['grul] thag thams
cad chad / ma tha na
phyug ma yang phyi ru
gdon sa med pa'i kha ba
chen po yang dag pa byung
ngo/ der yon bdag des/

zla ba bdun rgyags skyal
sa ma byung par / der
sñe nam pa'i mi thams cad
na re/ khu khun gyi rnal
'byor pa phun sum tshogs

bcad de / thugs dgongs rdzogs thabs kyi tshogs mchod phul /

pa de kha bas bsad do zer cing 'thab po ['thab song] // yon bdag pho mo gñis po ngu zhing sdug bsnal du gyur to / de'i dus su/ rje btsun ñid kyis thugs bsam mdzad pas / da [de] rang 'tsho ba skyel mkhan la ni lam chad 'dug / da [de] rang gis phyin rang 'chi ba las mi yong bar 'dug / da [de] rang gna la phyis kyi gangs khrod 'di ru 'chi bar [mi] 'dug pas / 'pho ba bya dgongs nas yod pa dang / gos shing lo gon pa'i bud med gcig 'ongs nas / 'pho ba'i chos ma byed par ting nge 'dzin zas su zo dang / ñin mtshan gñis skyed rdzogs kyi don 'ba' zhig sgoms dang/ nged chos bdag mkha' 'gro rnams kyis byin gyis labs la / khyod kyi srog bar du mi 'gro ba gcig bya yis zer ba gcig byung / der thugs thag chod te / 'pho ba'i chos ma byas par / ñin mtshan gñis ka ting nge 'dzin kho na sgoms pas / skabs skabs la gser [bser] ma'i rnam pa/ mig long ba dang / rna ba 'on pa la sogs pa 'o rgyal ba'i rnam pa mang du byung / skabs skabs la de rnams med par / sra sil sil ba yang byung / skabs la gsol rgyu med pa'i / rlung gis skyod nas rgyal zhing / 'od gsal la cham cham 'gro ba yang byung / mdor na dus der zla ba bdun la / gsol rgyu zhib thur mgo gang dang [yang] med kyang / ting nge 'dzin kho na sgoms cing / ting nge 'dzin zas su gsol/ sku 'grongs pa mi mnga' zhing / yon tan gyi mngon rtags tshad med pa yang thon no // de yang de'i dus su/ 'chi ba med

233. pa tshe'i dngos grub bgyi ba / sems can rtag phyis [cf. 'byi ba] can rnams la mi rtag pa stan pa'i phyar [phyir] ma rtog pa / sku 'grongs pa mi mnga' ba'i dngos grub dang thob bo/ phong pa med pa zas kyi dngos grub ces pa/ sems can gyi tshogs rdzogs don ma rtogs pa/ gsol ye ma gsol dang [kyang] kres pa med pa'i dngos grub dang [kyang] thob bo/ 'khrul pa med pa mchog gi dngos grub ces bgyi ba / gdul bya la chos ston pa ma rtogs/ chos kyi sku la 'pho 'gyur mi mnga' ba'i dngos grub kyang thob po// mdor na mchog thun mong gi dngos grub ma lus par thob po// de rnams kyis / rje btsun ñid kyis/ la phyis gangs la byon nas / dka' thub dang dka' spyad kyi sgo nas/ grub pa thob po / ces pa'i don to // zla bdun lon nas rje btsun grongs par byas / mi 'ga' sgran nas rje btsun lta ru phyin// rje ñid ma grangs [grongs] yul der spyan drangs mos// rje btsun ngo mtshar can la gus phyag 'tshal // (19) ces pa'i don ni / de yang rje btsun gyi rgyal po mid la ras pa zhes pa de ñid kyis/ la phyis gangs la byon nas/ zla bdun khrigs pa gsal rgyu gang

yang med par bzhugs/ de'i dus su mchog thun mong gi dngos grub ma lus pa thob kyang/ sñe nam pa'i yon bdag rngog dor mos gtso byas pa'i yon bdag 'ga' yis/ rje btsun ñid grongs par byas nas/ da de lta bu'i spur btsal

phyis sa ga'i zla bar song ba dang yang sngar gyi bu slob rnams kyis gangs sta gris gshags nas / rje btsun gyi gdung gdan 'dren du

phyin te/ nas su sleb
tu cha ba'i tshe stegs
shin tu ngal bso zhing
bsad pas / pha bong zhig
gi khar g.sa' chen po
zhig 'dzegs nas bya
rmyang byas te / yun ring
po zhig bltas nas song
skad/ der khong rnams
kyis g.sa' ma gis rje
btsun gyi pur zos yod pa
na na bza'i dum bu 'dra
ba'm / dbu skra 'dra ba
yod dam gzhan mi rñed
ces gleng zhing shin tu
ma dga' nas ngu bzhin
phyin pas gsal babs pa'i
shul na phar la mi'i
rkang rjes shig 'dug/
de nas 'phrang ring zhig
la gzig dang stag tu
brdzus nas song ba'i
'phrang lam de la stag
'phrang gzig 'phrang du
grags so // der khongs
rnams kyang dogs pa skyes
te lha 'dre yin nam sñam

nas/ [s]pur sbyangs
nas/ khong gi don du
'us/ bdun tshigs la sogs
pa byas pa grag [drag]
zer te/

ma 'ga' sgran
[sgron] nas/ dung dang
lwa ba yag dang / khyem
dang byas [bcas] pa khyer
nas phyin pas/ rje btsun
gyis gshegs pa'i dus su
ñin lam gcig gi sa la/
khong rnam pa'i zhag bdun
byas nas phyin pas / rje
btsun gyi bzhugs pa 'di
tsam yin nam snas [sñam]
pa

234. sa gcig tu rtol
ba dang/ tshol mi rnams
kyis/ dung bus / khu
bton ['don] pas/ de lta

nas the tshom za zhing
'ongs pas bdud 'dul phug
mo cher sleb tu ñe ba'i
tshe/

rje btsun gyis
mgur mzhes pa thos pas 'o
na khyi ra bas rgyags
phul ba'm/ gcan gzan
gyis bsad pa'i thed dra'
rñed nas ma grongs pa
srid dam sñam nas phyin
pas/

bu'i dung gi skad dang/
mi'i ku co rje btsun
gyis gsan pas/ brag phug
nas gangs thog tu byon
nas gzigs pas/ mi 'ga'
zhig (?)/ dung 'bud/
lam gyi kha ba sel byed
cing 'ong ba gzigs pas/
der thugs dgnongs la/ nga
tshol ba yin nam dgongs
nas/ gangs de'i thog tu
bzhugs nas gsol ba btab
pas/ de'i gsol 'debs kyi
gsung lhang lhang ba/
tshol ['tshol?] mi
rnams kyis dang [kyang]
thos pas/ tshol mi rnams
dga' nas/ go bcad ma
grongs yod pa 'dug byas
nas phyin pas/ gangs kyi
sgang 'ben tshad gang
tsam gcig chags 'dug pa
la/ tshol mi rnams kyis ma thar pa la/ rje btsun gyis rlung bzung nas 'phur ma thabs la tshol mi rnams su [bsu] ru byon bying/ de nas re re khur cing 'phur ma thabs la gangs thog tu skyal [skyel?]/ de nas brag phug tu phebs pa dang/ bla ma'i zhal nas

glen pa kun da phyi de
tsa na 'ong gin 'dug pa
la/ da dung mi sleb pa ci yin / zan dang tshod ma yang grang 'gro bar 'dug da phug tu myur du shog gsung pas/ der khong rnams dga' ches nas ngu bro ste / kun rje btsun gyi phyag zhabs kun nas rub rub 'zus te ngus pas / rje btsun gyi zhal nas / da de skad ma byed par za ma zo gsungs pas/ khong rnams kyis kyang gdod kyis phyag btsal bsñun dris nas brtags pas sngar gyi chas
rnams phye bre gang las
ma zad pa'i steng nas
'bras la sha btab pa'i
tshod ma byas 'dug pa la
/ston pa shâ' kya gu nas
nged rnams kyi za ma
tshun mdzad gda' ba/
bdag rnams 'ong ba rje

rje btsun gyis kha ring
khur byon pa'i zhib phul
dgu'o de dang/ sha lhu
gcig yod pa de yang ma
gsol bar tshol mi rnams
la grangs pas /

btsun gyis tugs mkhyen gyis gzigs pa lags sam zhus pas / rje btsun gyi zhal nas ngas pha bong gi steng nas bltas pas/ khyed rnams ngal bso zhing 'dug pa mthong gsungs / yang ston pa shâ kya gu nas bdag cag rnams kyis ni pha bong gi steng na g.sa' gcig las rje btsun ma mthong/ de dus rje btsun gang na bzhugs zhus pas / rje btsun gyi zhal nas g.sa' de ka nga yin mod / rlung sems la dbang thob pa'i rnal 'byor pa 'byung ba bzhi'i skye mched zil gyis non pas/ lus 'dod rgur bsgyur ba'i rdzu 'phrul ston nus pa yin / da lan ngas kyang khyed rnams skal ldan du 'dug pas bkod pa lus kyi rdzu

'phrul bstan pa yin / da de ltar byed pa'i gtam mi la ma lab gsungs/

yang gshen rdor mos zhus pa rje btsun na ning las kyang sku mdangs shin tu bzang bar gda' ba / lam sgo gñis ni kha bas chod de mi'i zhabs tog ni med / lha 'dres zhabs tog bgyis sam/ ri dwags kyi thed ro 'dra rñed pa lags sam ji ltar lags zhus pas /rje btsun gyi zhal nas nga phal cher ting nge 'dzin la 'byams nas zas za ma dgos/ dus bzang gi tshe mkha' 'gro rnams kyis tshogs kyi 'khor lo'i skal ba re yang bskyal / res phye thur mgo tsam re 'gams / khyad par kha sang rta'i zla ba'i smad la khyed bu slob rnams kyis nga'i mtha' bskor nas bza' btung mang po drangs pa'i ñams shig shar ba las/

yon bdag dor mos rje btsun la 'jus nas ngus zhing/ rje btsun ma grongs lags 'am/ rje btsun ma grongs pa'i rgyu ji ltar mdzad lags pa zer/ rje btsun gyi zhal nas/ nga mi 'chi ba'i rgyu rtu mo'i [gtum mo'i] gos gon/ ting nge 'dzin gyi zas zos/ bla ma'i rnal 'byor sgoms/ skyed rdzogs kyi don sgoms/ dpa' bo dang mkha' 'gro rnams kyis stong [stongs] grogs mdzad nas ma shi ba yin gsung/ der yon bdag des gtso byas pa'i tshol mi thams cad shin tu ngo mtsar skyes te/ phyag mang du 'tshal skod ba (?) byas/ zhabs spyi thog tu blangs nas/ rje ñid ma grongs pa shin du

zhag mang po'i bar du za thugs la rtags/
ma za sñing ye mi 'dod pa
zhig byung ba de dus khyed rnams kyis ci byas pa yin gsungs/
der khong rnams kyis dus brtsis pas thugs dgongs rdzogs
thabs kyi mchod pa phul ba dang dus mtshungs 'dug tshul zhib
rgyas phul bas/ rje btsun gyi zhal nas 'jig rten pa rnams
kyis dge rtsa byis pa bar dor phan par 'dug ste/ de bas
kyang da lta bar do gcod
pa stobs che gsungs/
de nas khong rnams kyis da bdag cag gi yul du
rje btsun gña' nang du spyan 'dren
gdan 'dren pa'i zhu ba 235. pa lags pas/
nan can phul bas/ rje
btsun gyi zhal nas nga
'di ka rang ñams dga' zhing ting nge 'dzin 'phel bar 'dug
pas mi 'gro khyed rang rnams songs gsungs pas/ khong rnams
kyis da lan rje btsun phar mi 'byon na bdag rnams la gña'
nang pa kun gyis khyed kyis rje btsun grongs su bcug pa yin
zer gtam ngan dang kha chag chen po rang yong/ khyad par jo
mo 'ur mos nga'i rje btsun khyer la shog zer ba'i 'phrin
ngan yang yang bskur byung bas bla ma mi gshegs na nged
rnams kyang 'dir 'chi bar sgug cing sdod zhus pas/ rje btsun
gyis khong rnams kyi nan ma theg par 'byon par zhal gyis
bzhes te / rje btsun la dgun mkha' 'gros mi la ras pa khyod
la mi dgos rung/ ma 'ongs slob rgyud la dgos pas gangs gshog
thabs 'di ltar gyis
zer mkha' 'gros

bslabs pa ltar byas pa'i
dkyar de khyer khong
rnams byung ba'i nangs
par tshur byon pas/ la
thog nas gshen rdor mo
sngon la phyin / rtsar ma
pa sogs ña ma rnams la/

cis kyang gshegs par zhu
lags ces zhus pas/ ṛje
btsun gyis dang dges
bzhin gnang ste/ yul du
sdongs te byon/

rje btsun sku ma nongs par 'byon zhing yod bya ba'i gtam sñan bsgrags/ rje btsun dpon slob kyang pha bong dkar leb tu gro btab pa'i sar/ gtam sñan thos pa'i ña ma pho mo rgan byis med pa kun rje btsun gyi gdong bsu ste zhal lta ru byung ba kun gyis rje btsun gyi sku la 'changs shing ngus te smre sngags kyi sgo nas bsñun dri zhus/ phyag dang skor ba byas / de'i tshe rje btsun la phyag 'khar spa'i der na lcag gcig yod pa des aum tshugs mdzad/ gangs gshog pa'i dkyar de zhabs la gsol te / pha bong dkar leb kyi steng nas der tshogs pa'i ña ma rnams la bsñun dri smed kyi lan du mgur 'di gsungs so// dpal de ring bkra shis shri gdugs la//

dus de'i
dus na sñe nam gyi phyogs
der sñan pa dang grags pa
chen byung ngo/ thams
cad dad cing mos par yang gyur nas/ lung pa'i mi thams cad 'jal du byung/ dus de'i dus su/ mi thams cad dad gus dpag med skyes nas / rje btsun ñid la/ la las gser phul/ la las

g.yu phul/ de bzhin du zangs dang gos dar dang/ ras sna la sogs pa tshad med pa phul nas/ rje btsun ñid longs spyod kyi dkyil na dbu pi de (?) las mi snang ba'i longs spyod tshad med pa'i 'bul ba byung/ khyad par du yon bdag rngog dor mos/ lus la gon pa'i ber/ 'og tu zhon pa'i rta/ skye ru 'dogs pa'i g.yu la sogs pa phul nas rje btsun gyi zhabs la 'jus nas/ khyed lta bu'i grub thob gcig dang bdag 'jal ba/ bsod nams kyi bsags pa re che ba/ dus dang rnam sa thams cad du 'bral med par thugs rjes 'dzin par zhu/ ces mig nas 'chi ma 'byin pas/ der tshogs pa'i mi thams cad kyis kyang / ngu zhing gsol ba de ltar du btab po [pa'o?]/ dus de'i dus su/ rje btsun ñid kyis / nor de rnams thams cad sa sar [so sor] zlog nas ma snams pa ru/ yon bdag pho mo rnams la/ kha ring nas gna la byung lugs 'di ltar du byung ngo/

khyed phyag mzal
gyi yon bdag pho mo dang//
nga rnal 'byor mi la ras
pa gñis // 'o skol ma
shi phrad pa glo ba dga'//
nga mi rgan glu yi
dkor mdzod yin // bsñun
dri smed kyi lan de glu
yis 'zal // sñan lhan ne
gson la thugs gtad 'tshal
// yang stag gi lo yi lo
gzhug la // yos bu'i lo

ces pa'i mgur ma
'di ltar du bzhes so// lo
stag lo lo'i zhabs la//
yos bu'i lo'i lo dgo

yi lo mgo la// wa rgyal zla ba'i ña drug la// nga 'khor ba'i chos la yid 'byung nas // 'brog la phyi gangs kyi ra ba der // mi nga yang dben pa sñeg tu phyin// khong gnam sa gñis po gros byas te // skyi ser rlung gi bang chen btang // 'byung ba chu klung g.yos g.yos nas// lho sprin smug po 'dun mar bsdus // ñi zla zung gcig btson du bzung // rgyu skar ñer brgyad star la brgyus// khrims kyis gza' brgyad lcags su bcug// dgu tshigs skya mo brtod la mnan// skar phran yongs la bud kyis btab// bud kyi mdangs g.yogs tha ma la// kha ba ñin dgu mtshan dgu babs// cha la ñin mtshan bco brgyad babs// 'bab che ste che ba bal 'dab tsam // 'dab chags bya

[mgo] la// rnal 'byor la phyis gangs la phyin/ ngas la phyis gangs la phyin tsa na// khong gnam sa gñis kyis bros byas nas// skyi zer rlung po'i bang chen rdzangs [rdzong ba]// lho sprin smug po'i 'dun dmag g.yos// ñi zla gñis po dbon [btson] du bzung// dgung kha ba ñin
236. dgu mtshan dgu babs// cha la ñin mtshan bco brgyad babs// de lta bu'i kha ba dang// lo gsar sgang gi lhags pa gñis// rnal 'byor lus kyi ras gos gsum// gangs dkar gyi rtse la 'khrug pa shor// 'khrug pa cud [gcud?] ras gos rgyal// yang na ras gos drod che 'am// yang na gangs dkar dro 'am ci// yang na skyi zer ngad 'dzam ['jam] mam// rnal

ltar lding zhing babs// chung ste chung ba phang lo tsam// bung ba lta bur 'khor zhing babs// yang chung sran ma yungs 'bru tsam // khu 'phangs bzhin bu 'dril zhing babs // lar kha ba che chung tshad las 'das// mtho gangs dkar gyi rtse mo

'byor sku khams sñoms par gda' // khyed yon bdag tso sku khams bde lags sam// cha la rnal 'byor grags su thong// rgyal khams yongs su gtam de sgrogs//

dgung la reg// dma' rtsi shing nags tshal bsñal zhing mnan// ri nag po rnams la sku dkar gsol// mtsho rba rlabs chan la dar chags btab// gtsang chab sngon mo sbubs su bcug/ sa mtho dman med par thang du mñam// 'bab de ltar che ba'i rang bzhin gyis// spyir mgo nag mi la bzang btson gal// rkang bzhi'i phyugs la mu ge byung// sgos ri dwags dman ma'i 'tsho ba bcad// steng 'dab chags bya la rgyags chad byung// 'og bra ba byi ba gter du sbas// gcan gzan rnams la kha chings byung// de 'dra'i skyi 'dong skal ba la// nga mi la ras pa'i sgos skal du// steng nas 'bab pa'i bu yug dang// dgun lo gsar sgang gi lhags pa dang // nga rnal 'byor mi la'i ras gos gsum// mtho gangs dkar gyi ltongs su 'khrug pa shor// kha ba babs rgyal chab tu zhu// rlung 'ar 'ur che yang rang sar zhi// ras gos me ltar 'bar gyin gda'// gyad dpe bzhag gi shi srog de ru bsnol// mtshon rtse rgyal gyi ral kha de ru sprad// dpa' la dor gyi 'khrug pa der rgyal bas// spyir chos pa yongs la tshad cig bzhag // sgos sgom chen yongs la tshad

do bor // yang sgos gtum mo ras rkyang gi che ba bton // nad 'du ba rnam bzhi srang la gzhal// phyis nang 'khrug med par gtan khrigs bgyis// rlung tsha grang gñis ka gcud la bor // phyis ci zer ñan par kha yis blangs // skyi 'dong kha ba'i gdong sri mnan// phyis g.yo 'gul med par rtsigs la phab// srid dmag dpung bgyid kyang ma 'tshal bar// dus da res kyi 'khrug pa rnal 'byor rgyal // nga mes kyi tsha bo stag slag can// sdar wa slag gyon nas 'bros ma myong // nga pha la bu skyes gyad kyi rigs// sdang dgra la ru zur 'chor ma myong// nga gcan gzan rgyal po seng ge'i rigs// gnas gangs khongs min par sdod ma myong// sho mas kyang bre mo bgyis pa lags// nga mi rgan gyi kha la gtad yod na// phyis sgrub rgyud kyi bstan pa dar te mchi// grub thob 'ga' re 'byon te mchi// rnal 'byor mi la ras pa nga// rgyal khams yongs la grags te mchi// khyod bu slob rnams bsams shing dad de mchi// gtan sñan zhig phyi nas brjod de mchi// nga rnal 'byor g.yar khams bde bar byung// khyed yon bdag rnams sku khams bde lags sam//

zhes gsungs pa'i tshe/ ña ma rnams dga' drags 'ur te bro 'khrabs pas/ rje btsun yang thugs ñams 'ur ba ltar mdzad nas zhabs bro mdzad pas/ pha bong 'dam brdzis pa bzhin du nur nas pha bong gi steng thams cad zhas

ces sung nas/ yon bdag pho mo rnams la ña [gñis] chos dang [kyang] mang du gsungs nas/ gnas der ma bzhugs par gshegs so/ der mi thams cad 'phreng bzhin du ngo mtshar dpag tu med pa dang grags pas phyogs

rjes kyis gang/ rked pa nur ba'i bang rim log ge a byung ba de la / sngar pha bong dkar leb zer ba la phyis dkyar rjes par grags so// de nas ña ma rnams kyis gña' nang rtsar mar spyan drangs nas gtang rag gi bsñen bkur 'bul ba'i gral du legs se 'bum gyis da lan rje btsun sku ma nongs par phebs pa 'di ci gang las yang dga' ba zhig byung/ sku mdangs ni sngar bas kyang bzang bar 'dug / thugs dam bzang po ni ye 'khrungs yin / zhabs tog mkha' 'gro rnams kyis bgyis lags sam zhes zhus pa'i lan du mgur 'di gsungs so//....

thams cad du khyab cing/ grub thob chen po gcig 'dug go zer ba yang byung ngo// de rnams kyis/ rje btsun mid la rnal 'byor pa ces pa de ñid kyis/ la phyis gangs la byon nas/ yon tan dpag tu med pa rñes te [brñes]/ yon bdag pho mo rnams dang 'jal zhing/ mgur dang chos kun gsungs so/ rje btsun dam pa khyed la gus phyag 'tshal // ces pa'i don to//

Appendix 2

The Saints in Comparative Perspective

In our first chapter, we summarized the problems associated with the use of the word Saint for the holy person in Buddhism. This appendix provides an occasion for employing a comparative approach in the study of the religious type which we have been calling the Saint.

The comparative approach is not without its problems. There are many good reasons for trying to remain faithful to the patterns of thinking of the scholars and masters of the tradition under study. This practice is indispensible for understanding how the tradition has interpreted itself historically. However, such a practice offers certain perils to the scholar of religion. In the first place, the scholar is usually neither a `native' nor a `believer'. The scholar is constantly engaged internally in a process of adjusting his thinking to that of the persons and texts set before him for study. Secondly, the scholar has an audience, readers or students, with whom he is in dialogue in present time. Finally, the scholar knows something of other traditions of religion, philosophy, and language, and has been trained to make use of this knowledge to enhance his skills as an

interpreter (hermeneut) of alien cultures. Overtly or covertly, the scholar is a comparativist.

The scholar of religion does not write about the religion he is studying in the language of the "natives". Even when the scholar writes about Western religion, he thinks, imagines, and writes within the confines of a particular tradition of scholarship. This context, which is usually somewhat removed from the object of study, necessarily distorts what is presented in the literary genre of scholarship and in the oral discourse known as "teaching". Even if the scholar has doubts about the universal applicability of the accepted categories of Western, modern, secular thinking, he must accept the challenge to make the subject under study to some extent comprehensible within that limited sphere of discourse.

Our research forces us to confront the provisionality of all cultures, including our own. What remains to be done? We can try to describe the religious beliefs, systems, and practices of other cultures to the people of our own. We can seek to advance contemporary human understanding by translating other systems of life and belief into the concepts that communicate effectively, if imperfectly, to our students or readers. Since the writer is confined to those observations that he has internalized from his own training and breadth of experience, the reader, it is hoped, will strive to understand what the scholar has written on the basis of careful observation and reflection.

Primo Levi, in a not-quite satisfying essay ("This Above All: Be Clear"), observes: "..writing serves to communicate, transmit information or feelings from mind to mind, from place to place and from time to time. And he who is not understood by anyone does not transmit anything....It is up to the writer to make himself understood by those who wish to understand him...As for this reader...[he reads] because he is curious about many things, wishes to choose among them and does not wish to delegate this choice to anyone."[1]

The translator of ancient texts must first labor to understand the ancient writers; then, knowing well the mentality of contemporary readers, he hopes to transmit his understanding to them. The scholar of world religions knows that he misperceives many things that lie hidden in the texts he translates; and there are many things that he may understand, but which cannot be made intelligible to contemporary readers or students! The contexts and scenarios of learned communication: Book, Classroom, Lecture Hall, Film, restrict what can be said of Temple, Ashram, Hermitage, Ritual. Thus our task presupposes a certain modesty on the part of researcher and reader. The comparative approach in religious studies starts with some points of contact, some analogies, and some illustrations of striking differences, in order to evoke something of the atmosphere of an alien tradition. Subsequently, we may

1 New York Times Book Review, November 20, 1988; p. 59.

offer systematic comparisons that clarify content in detail and which may suggest universal patterns or typologies.

The comparative approach in the study of Saints and sanctity has theological roots. On the first page of his great work, _De Servorum Dei Beatificatione et Beatorum Canonizatione_, Prospero Cardinal Lambertini (later Pope Benedict XIV) raised the problem of apotheosis:

> _"Apotheosis, quae etiam consecratio dicta est, nihil aliud erat, quam solemnis alicujus hominis inter Deos adscriptio..."_
>
> [Apotheosis, also called consecration, is nothing other than the solemn inclusion of a particular person among the Gods.]

Lambertini's intention in citing numerous examples of apotheosis from classical antiquity was to distinguish these from the structurally similar `apotheosis' of Christ and the Saints. His method for distinguishing classical apotheosis from Christian canonization was theological. Christ, the Divine Word Incarnate, had no need of any human agency to confer a title of divinity on him; similarly, the Saints, made holy in Christ, have no need of any merely human formula by which their greatness may be recognized. However, since apotheosis in antiquity was a formal decree passed by the authority of the Roman Senate, it was inevitable that critics of the Catholic tradition (specifically the Protestants) should compare the two

procedures, claiming that the papal decree of canonization is in essence no different from the decree of apotheosis by the Senate. In both instances, an authoritative body is observed in the process of passing judgment in order to legitimate, authorize, and establish the public cult of a deceased heroic person. The work of Lambertini essentially follows a case-study method by which the specifically Catholic criteria for canonization are applied to numerous and diverse instances of sanctity, thus showing the flexibility and reliability of the norms in question. In each instance, the legitimacy of the cult of the Saint in question is what is at stake. A person may have led a life of heroic virtue, may have taught with flawless orthodoxy, may have been gifted with exceptional mystical gifts, but unless such a person's holiness is confirmed by miracles, there is insufficient evidence for divine sanction of the public cult of the exemplary "servant of God".

Public cult is thus at the heart of the canonization process; canonization is not simply the acknowledgment of the holiness of a particular person. Canonization's significance lies in proclaiming that a holy life in some particular way holds meaning for the Church as a whole. This concept should be borne in mind when scholars of religion make use of the work of Hippolyte Delehaye. Delehaye was working as a hagiographer in service to the Catholic Church. He was firmly convinced that spurious cults and dubious Saints were harmful to the spiritual life

of Catholics and for that reason sought to establish a methodology for evaluating Saints, particularly from the earliest period of Church history. Evidence for the continuity of cult was one of Delehaye's key criteria for ascertaining the historicity of a Saint. Since he was always working as a theologian, the question of historicity was raised in order to ground the authenticity of particular cults of Saints. The historian of religion will have other interests and other objectives. For example, the scholar of world religions may find greater utility in the social function of myth than would the hagiographer in the Bollandist tradition.

The distinction between theology and religious studies is a very useful one. It is my understanding that theology is "faith seeking understanding". Theology takes place within and in service to a believing community. It is a literary form that strives to evaluate the data of faith and of human experience in a rationally coherent way, primarily to facilitate the transmission of the data of faith to the community of believers. Religious studies, on the other hand, is not a discipline at the service of a particular religious community. Its task is to communicate the data of all known religious cultures to contemporary, chiefly Western, civilization. Scholarship in religion is a literary genre that seeks to communicate what contemporary civilization may be able to understand of religion. I do not see religious studies as an `explanation' of human

religiosity, nor do I see it as a branch of theology, even if that be a non-sectarian sort of theology. This discipline, in my view, should wisely avoid reducing the variety of religious experience to an explanation that is meaningful to this particular civilization alone; it should also avoid committing itself to some synthetic role in the future evolution of religion. The task of explanation seems more suited to such disciplines as sociology, psychology, and anthropology, to the extent that these disciplines may be able to explain patterns of human behavior within the framework of particular scientific disciplines.

It is with the intent of advancing our understanding of the religious phenomenon of Saints that I have undertaken the present research. I have attempted to avoid explanations whether theological, psychological, or sociological. The model proposed in the first chapter is descriptive, and will assist other scholars in organizing the data from other world religions in which the `type' of the Saint appears. Quite simply, the Saint is the attainer of a high spiritual state `within', and is accorded recognition for this attainment (perceived as a source of mysterious power) by the community. The Saint is thus one religious model for resolving the tension between the remarkable individual and the community; the presence of the `holy' in a particular, exceptional person creates a cultural `tension' that, as Ricoeur says of the symbol,

`gives rise to thought.' The Saint represents some of the most cherished religious ideals of a community, and may be felt to be a reproach to the community for its unrealized ideals. The Saint can also be the bearer of the burden of spiritual failure for the community. Though most people are not Saints, in a given cultural situation there is a hunger for models, examples, and sources of inspiration in the moral sphere. When there are doubts about the meaningfulness of moral action, the Saint's numinous power has the effect of persuasion[2].

I settled on a dyadic model for organizing and communicating the data of sanctity for the sake of simplicity. This dyadic model also has the advantage of coming from the world of religious thought; I think that neither a Buddhist nor a Christian would object to this typology, since the two categories adequately subsume all the criteria that turn up in accounts of Saints and sanctity in world religions. Delehaye observes with characteristic clarity: "The saint is the servant of God who is the object of a public cult; that which is honored in him is

[2] Donald Weinstein and Rudolph M. Bell. <u>Saints and Society: The Two Worlds of Western Christendom, 1000-1700</u>. (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1982). "The cult of saints illustrates perfectly how piety embraced the (1) pursuit of spiritual perfection, (2) the feeling of reverence, and (3) the expectation of divine help in this world. ...the common conception embraced all three and held that God bestowed supernatural power upon those who had achieved a high spiritual state....Venerated for their holiness, but invoked for their power, saints stood as a reproach to the wonder-seeking crowd even as they served its humble needs." pp. 5-6.

sanctity."[3] Weinstein and Bell, in their landmark study of Christian Saints from 1000 to 1700 make use of too many types[4]. Their sociological approach lacks the elegant simplicity that might make it an effective model for a study of Buddhist or Hindu Saints. However, they come close to a two-part analytical approach similar to the one I am proposing:

> ...Saints were those who were recognized as having experienced so much reverence and achieved such a degree of purity that they had transcended the sinfulness of ordinary existence. Thus they took their places among the heavenly host and themselves became objects of reverence to the rest of the faithful, acting as intercessors for divine favor on behalf of those among whom they once had lived. Through their love of God, saints had achieved this superior state; now their love for God's creatures moved them to use their merit on behalf of human need.[5]

Here we have both inner attainment and the cultic relationship with the community; there is also at least a possibility that the terminology could be adapted to describe the Bodhisattva, but it is not the authors' intention to develop a comparative pattern.

[3] Hippolyte Delehaye. Sanctus: Essai sur le Culte des Saints dans l'Antiquitè. (Bruxelles: Sociètè des Bollandistes, 1927), p. 233. Similarly, Tibetan Buddhists recognize the categories inner, outer, and `secret' in hagiographical accounts.

[4] They offer five components of sanctity: supernatural power, asceticism, charitable activity, temporal/ecclesiastical power, and evangelical activity. (op. cit. pp. 284-5; cf. 150-161). Not all Saints have all five components; the components could be further multiplied; the components do not lend themselves easily to non-Christian contexts.

[5] Weinstein and Bell, op. cit., p. 5.

Joachim Wach's sociological description of the Saint can be easily accomodated by our dyadic pattern:

I. Interior Life

1. "The life of the saint is wholly determined by his basic religious experience, which sometimes comes early in his life..."

2. "He enjoys communion with the deity in a particularly intensive way...continuous prayer..."

II. Cult/Recognition

1. "His guidance...is eagerly sought."

2. "The saint influences others more by the indirect effect of example than by precept."

3. "The authority of the saint finds sociological expression either in circles or groups, bound together by the personal charisma of the leader, or in purely individual relations of a spontaneous or organized kind."

4. "People continue to venerate him or his memory, hoping for his help and intercession."

5. "Having been credited with miracles during his lifetime, the saint is expected to continue to impart the blessings of his power through his relics."

6. "...his grave may become a centre of cultic significance and a symbol dear and valuable to all who place themselves and their community under his protection."[6]

[6] Joachim Wach. Sociology of Religion. (London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trubner, & Co., 1947), pp 365-368.

Not surprisingly, the sociological approach gives less attention to the interior life of the Saint, which becomes a handicap in presenting the Saint in Buddhism. The present study has sought to remedy this with historical and doctrinal information.

In attempting a systematic comparison of the Saint in Buddhism and in Christianity, we find ourselves forewarned by Edward Conze:

> When we compare the doctrinal formulations of two such religions as Buddhism and Christianity we often feel that they converge so closely that they seem bound to meet at some point. But in fact they never do meet, and when we remember the roots and aspirations behind those formulations, a gulf yawns at once. ...I once read through a collection of the lives of Roman Catholic saints, and there was not one of whom a Buddhist could fully approve. This does not mean that they were unworthy people, but that they were bad Buddhists, though good Christians...[7]

Naturally, to compare does not necessarily mean to equate; finding strongly contrasting material can be a powerful stimulus to the quest for authentic understanding. Jean Leclercq observes that the main differences among Saints of different religions arise because of differences in doctrines on the nature of the Ultimate Reality and diversity of cultural milieux. Resemblances typically can be found in the notion of `interiority' as essential to the path to spiritual perfection, similarities in ascetical and contemplative practices, common vocabulary and imagery in

[7] Edward Conze. <u>Thirty Years of Buddhist Studies</u> (Oxford: Bruno Cassirer, 1967), p. 47.

describing spiritual experience, detachment from the temporal and orientation toward the eternal, and the notion that suffering leads to purification.[8] Leclercq is convinced that sanctity is a universal human archetype, psychologically antecedent to the variety of forms it takes in different cultures and religions[9]. On the basis of thirty years' reading of Saints' lives, I accept the idea of an archetype of the holy person upon which hangs all particular instances of the Saint. However, since not all cultures nurture the presence of the Saint as such, it is clear that only those spiritualities that give shape to the archetype actually produce Saints. Some religions actively discourage the notion of progress in the interior life; others prohibit the cult of particular persons. The archetype does not go away; it takes other forms until historical circumstances alter.

Let us review the types we have taken up in the first three chapters and compare them with the Catholic Saint.

The Arhat:

Having heard the message (Dharma) of the Buddha, he has embarked upon serious spiritual practice and has attained the goal: complete moral purity and irreversible liberation from attachments of any kind. He attains Nirvâṇa, the goal of Buddhist practice.

[8] Jean Leclercq, "Pour une hagiographie comparative," Studia Missionalia 35 (1986), pp. 115-116.

[9] Ibid., p. 121.

The Arhat is worthy of `cult' in this life from the time he takes up the practice of perfection; after death, his relics may be enshrined in a stûpa. The veneration of the enshrined relics gains merit for the worshipper who hopes for a better rebirth as a reward for religious deeds.

The Bodhisattva:

Having experienced the awakening of the `altruistic attitude' (bodhicitta), he makes a vow to liberate all sentient beings from cyclic existence in order to stabilize his intention to become a complete Buddha through the skillful practice of great compassion toward others and the cultivation of wisdom (prajñâ). He undertakes the practice of the Five Paths, ascends the Ten Stages of a Bodhisattva while perfecting the Virtues (pâramitâ). He refrains from personally entering Nirvâṇa before all other sentient beings have entered therein.

At the Eighth Stage, he is irreversible and unshakable and from that point on may be venerated as a Buddha. However, from the moment that the altruistic attitude is engendered, the Bodhisattva is worthy of veneration for his existence is already essentially supramundane. After death, his relics may be enshrined in a stûpa. His assistance in a wide diversity of circumstances may be obtained by the faithful through prayers and rites, both before and after death, because he is able to transfer his personal merits to others. The Bodhisattva's Perfect Enjoyment Body (Saṃbhogakâya) dwells in a Buddha-field, where beings may be

reborn in order to continue their spiritual perfection under his guidance.

The Catholic Saint:

The Saint is a baptized Christian who has attained moral perfection, avoiding both mortal and venial sins. He has practiced all the virtues to an heroic degree. He is united to God by an intense practice of contemplative prayer. His teaching and writing is in accord with the strictest standards of Catholic orthodoxy. His life is characterized by an ever-increasing efflorescence of charity, which is altruistic love for God and neighbor, in personal imitation of Christ. His inner attainment amounts to selfless generosity that is the fruition of cooperation with the grace of God. His attainment of holiness is utterly dependent on a disciplined cooperation with the initiatives of the Triune God.

During life, the Saint is called a servant of God, an exemplary Christian whose prayers and assistance may be requested by the faithful. After death, the people may continue to resort to his tomb with requests for intercessory prayers, since it is believed that the holy person can be a channel for divine grace and assistance. If official investigation of the case authenticates all the prerequisites and verifies posthumous miracles, the Servant of God may be officially accorded local veneration. Later, the title `Blessed' may be conferred by the Pope, with permission for an optional memorial Mass usually celebrated

locally on the anniversary of death. After further investigation, the title Saint may be granted with extension of the cult optionally to the whole Church. Titles such as martyr, confessor, virgin, widow, etc. are applied in accordance with the circumstances. Saints of greater importance are celebrated universally with an Obligatory Memorial; Saints whose writings are given a special place within the scope of authoritative Tradition may be honored as Doctors of the Church.

Milarepa as a Buddhist Saint:

Milarepa attained liberation from the defilments of past sins through the practice of penitential hard labor. He had been drawn to Marpa by the awakening of a previous-life votary bond; hearing the life story of Marpa was the means by which this latency was activated. He then took up the practice of the Bodhisattva path by awakening the altruistic attitude, again under Marpa. Milarepa himself taught that this path requires a capacity to strive heroically when he warned a wealthy patron to undertake elementary practices because he was not yet capable of attaining the heights of sanctity.[10]

Then he practiced the anuttarayoga tantras so as to attain the goal of Supreme Buddhahood in a single lifetime. This goal is personified as the tantric Buddha Vajradhara, which manifests the Five Bodies of a Buddha, the Five

[10] Songs, pp. 194-6.

Aspects of Wisdom (the Five Transcendent Awarenesses), and so forth as expounded in the rdo rje 'chang rnam thar.

During his life he sowed the seeds of awakening in the consciousness of sentient beings and brought these seeds to bloom. He traversed all the Buddha-realms.

Since he left behind no relics, it is devotion to the story of his liberation (rnam thar) that bestows benefits on disciples. The rnam thar leads to the path of emancipation and supreme knowledge; it is a gift bestowing joy and inward excellence on all beings in the cosmos. The rnam thar itself is an offering to the Buddhas; if read, it will break the fetters of the Eight Worldly Reactions. Linking oneself with the story of his life benefits self and others; the rnam thar is a feast, a wish-fulfilling gem that is to be venerated with offerings and invocations. The Saint will thereupon bestow protection and freedom from suffering.[11]

Comparing the fundamental themes of Milarepa's life and holiness to the Catholic criteria, we can see that he:

1. (orthodoxy) was able to deflect the criticism of scholars such as Dar bLo who accused him of unorthodox beliefs;

2. (perfection of inner attainments and virtures) demonstrated on numerous occasions not only the mundane but also the supreme siddhis. He did exemplary penance for his sins. His compassion, perfected as skillful means, extended to all creatures and increased its ever-widening reach;

[11] LM, colophon, pp. 201-202.

3. (<u>miracles</u>) worked miracles during life and after death. His cult has persisted for centuries among all Tibetans, for whom he is the exemplar of one who rose from a sinful life to Buddhahood in a single lifetime.

It seems that the characteristics of a Saint that are recognized in two very diverse religious systems can be found in the biographical accounts of Milarepa, suggesting that he persuasively displays the archetype of the holy person.

Conclusion:

So what <u>is</u> the Saint? The temptation is to respond like a Hasidic rabbi and tell yet another tale. In fact, the correct religious response <u>is</u> to tell the life of a Saint. The hagiographical impulse weaves its imagery of spiritual growth, inner attainment, and miraculous manifestation upon the otherwise invisible and elusive loom of the "holy" in the midst of the sensible world.

The church I serve is a shrine dedicated for over nine centuries to Saints Cosmas and Damian, physicians and martyrs in Syria in the early fourth century. A fresco cycle painted in 1639 tells their story: the birth of twin boys; the catechetical formation at their mother's knee; their first efforts at meditation and asceticism; their charitable career as physicians; their arrest, trial, and five-fold passion and death; their entombment and

apotheosis; their posthumous miracles; the fostering of their cult by the Emperor Justinian.

But the frescoes only provide a framework, helping to visualize the legend, the hymnody, and the novena prayers that constitute their liturgical cult. Preachers for 349 years have used the images as a point of departure for the bard-like recital of the epic of the martyrs. For nine days, beginning on the seventeenth of September, the well-known story is retold to the pilgrims gathered for the evening Mass; for three days, the feast is celebrated in the presence of thousands of pilgrims, with two great and carefully regulated processions[12] of the relics of the Saints, scores of Masses, and folkloristic manifestations. Unbroken continuity of devotion is the indispensible complement to the liturgical epic. In their dreams, the devotees see the Saints, hear them give advice, and, following their advice, receive the gift of miraculous cures. The faithful leave silver ex-votos as tokens of thanksgiving. The most intense remain all night in the shrine, keeping vigil with hymns and litanies. All year 'round they bring flowers and votive lights. They wait not upon "official initiative or direction." Their impetration of the Saints is a "search for forms of individual religious expression" that does not constitute the holiness of the Holy Twins _per se_, but which provides the indispensible

[12] Members of lay confraternities jealously guard the protocol of the procession, observing an unwritten body of custom that has all the force and seriousness of civil law.

component of piety that binds the Saints to the cultural identity of a people.

The people of the Molise, as the people of India, have inherited a common body of ideas of what sanctity is and what Saints can do. They venerate the statues and relics (the darśana of the Saints!) with candles, flowers, silver limbs, gold jewelry, vigils, hymns, penances, processions, and stones borne from afar. They take home the paper icons of the Saints; from the shrine lamps they take home vials of blessed oil, believed to have miraculous power. Thus the presence of the holy ones becomes part of the cycle of daily life, the cult of belief in the traditional family. The Saints venerated at the shrine come home to include the devotees in a wider and more powerful family with claims on the Holy that would otherwise hover remotely in unapproachable Light.

Appendix 3

Texts by rGyal Thang pa in dbu-med script.

DKAR BRGYUD GSER 'PHRENG

A THIRTEENTH CENTURY COLLECTION OF VERSE

HAGIOGRAPHIES OF THE SUCCESSION OF EMINENT MASTERS

OF THE 'BRUG-PA DKAR-BRGYUD-PA TRADITION

by

RGYAL-THANG-PA BDE-CHEN-RDO-RJE

Reproduced from a rare manuscript from the library

of the Hemis Monastery by

The 8th Khams-sprul Don-brgyud-Ñi-ma

Sungrab Nyamso Gyunphel Parkhang

Tibetan Craft Community

Tashijong, Palampur, H.P.

1973

[illegible]

[illegible]

[illegible]

[illegible]

9 [illegible]

10 [illegible]

11 [illegible]

12 [illegible]

[illegible]

[illegible]

[illegible]

[illegible]

[illegible]

[illegible]

[illegible]

189

[illegible]

190

[illegible]

191

[illegible]

192

[illegible]

193 [illegible]

194 [illegible]

195 [illegible]

196 [illegible]

197 [illegible]

198 [illegible]

199 [illegible]

200 [illegible]

201 [illegible]

202 [illegible]

203 [illegible]

204 [illegible]

205 [illegible]

206 [illegible]

207 [illegible]

208 [illegible]

209 [illegible]

210 [illegible]

211 [illegible]

212 [illegible]

213 [illegible]

214 [illegible]

215 [illegible]

216 [illegible]

217 [illegible]

218 [illegible]

219 [illegible]

220 [illegible]

221 [illegible]

222 [illegible]

223 [illegible]

224 [illegible]

225 [illegible]

226 [illegible]

227 [illegible]

228 [illegible]

229 [illegible]

230 [illegible]

231 [illegible]

232 [illegible]

233 [illegible]

234 [illegible]

235 [illegible]

236 [illegible]

237 [illegible]

238 [illegible]

239 [illegible]

240 [illegible]

241 [illegible]

242 [illegible]

243 [illegible]

244 [illegible]

245 [illegible]

246 [illegible]

247 [illegible]

248 [illegible]

249 [illegible]

250 [illegible]

251 [illegible]

252 [illegible]

253 [illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]

254 [illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]

255 [illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]

256 [illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]

257 [illegible]

258 [illegible]

259 [illegible]

260 [illegible]

261
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]

262
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]

263
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]

264
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]
[illegible]

265 [illegible]

[illegible]

[illegible]

[illegible]

[illegible]

[illegible]

Appendix 4. Works Cited in the _rdo rje 'chang rnam thar_ and in the _Milarepa rnam thar_ of rGyal Thang pa.

Folio 4: _Laṅkâvatâra Sûtra_ ("Having abandoned pure states, the Buddha was enlightened in the pleasant pure place called the Akaniṣṭha...")
Mahâyâna-sûtra-alaṃkâra IX, #60-66 (The Five Certainties)
Abhisamaya-alaṃkâra VII, 3 (the Saṃbhogakâya, with 32 and 80 marks)

Folio 6: _Mañjuśrî-nâma-saṃgîti_ VI, 18 ("A Master, possessing the Five Buddha Bodies...")
Tattva-nirdeśa Tantra (summary of the _yan lag bdun_)

Folio 7: _Saptâṅga_ of Vâgîśvarakîrti (?) (_yan lag bdun_)

Folio 9: _Târâ-abhydaya Tantra_ (The Eight Masteries)
Visuddha-cûḍâmanidhara of Ravigupta (The Eight Masteries)

Folio 10: _Vajraśekhara Tantra_ (Who is Vajradhara?)

Folio 11: _Vajraśekhara Tantra_ (Meaning of Holder of Vajra)
Vajra-pañjara (The form of Vajradhara)
Hevajra Tantra (Universality of Buddhahood, HVT II iv, 69; HVT II, xi, 8))
Tattva-nirdeśa Tantra (Buddhas are all one; distinctions appear because minds are diverse.)

Folio 12: _Śîtavanika Sûtra_ (Three classes of persons who assemble the Three Pitakas of the Three Yânas)
Hevajra Tantra (I am the teacher, the Doctrine, and the disciple...).(And: All beings arise from me... HVT I. viii, 41)

Folio 13: _Avadâna Śataka_ (The actions of sentient beings are inexhaustible...)

Folio 194: "A Sûtra"
Vajra-pañjara Tantra

Folio 200: _Ratnakûṭa_ (_dkon rtsegs_)

Folio 202: _Śata-sâhasrika PPM_ (_mdo sde 'bum_)

Folio 213: "The Empowerment of Lady Nairâtmyâ"
The _sñing bzhes_ (?)

Folio 220: the _Dohâ_ (?): ploughman and oxen as metaphor for _yuganaddha_.

Folio 233: A ritual similar to the _Bardo_ _Thoḍol_ cycle (?)

Folios 251-2: Five Deity Cakrasaṃvara _sâdhana_

Folio 252: Vajravârâhî _sâdhana_
Hevajra _sâdhana_